

Funded  
by the European Union  
and the Council of Europe



EUROPEAN UNION



COUNCIL OF EUROPE  
CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Implemented  
by the Council of Europe

Version 1, 3 September 2013

### Description of Action:

## Protection of the Rights of Entrepreneurs in the Russian Federation from Corrupt Practices (PRECOP RF)

Project title and number	2312/Protection of the Rights of Entrepreneurs in the Russian Federation from Corrupt Practices (PRECOP RF)
Project area	Russian Federation
Budget	1,300.000.Euro (EU Funding 86.81%; CoE Funding of 13.19%)
Funding	European Union / Council of Europe
Implementation	Council of Europe
Duration	36 Months ( 1 January 2013 – 31 December 2015)

6/15/13

For further information please contact:

Economic Crime and Cooperation Unit (ECCU)  
Action against Crime Department  
Directorate General of Human Rights and Rule of Law-DG I  
Council of Europe  
Tel: +33-3-8841-5599/2629  
Fax: +33-3-9021-5650  
[www.coe.int/corruption](http://www.coe.int/corruption)

## Contents

1	PROJECT SUMMARY	5
2	BACKGROUND	6
2.1	State of Affairs	6
2.2	Institutional framework	6
2.3	Legislative framework	7
2.4	International engagements	9
3	GOVERNMENT/SECTOR POLICY	9
3.1	Federal Ombudsman for the Rights of Entrepreneurs	9
3.2	Regional Ombudsmen for the Protection of Rights of Entrepreneurs	10
3.3	Interagency cooperation	10
3.4	Public Ombudsmen	10
3.5	Private sector initiatives	10
3.6	Legal associations	11
4	KEY ISSUES	11
5	INITIALLY IDENTIFIED NEEDS	11
5.1	Institutional and legislative analysis	12
5.2	Capacity Building/Training	12
5.3	Promotion of awareness/outreach	12
6	PROJECT STRATEGY	12
6.1	Overall Objective	12
6.2	Project Duration	12
6.3	Target group	12
6.4	Counterparts/stakeholders	13
7	THE INTERVENTION	13
7.1	Deliverables	14
7.2	Assumptions	15
7.3	Risks	15
7.4	Sustainability	16
7.5	Lessons Learnt	16
8	IMPLEMENTATION	16
8.1	Methods of implementation and reasons for the proposed methodology	16
8.2	Physical and non-physical means	17
8.3	Organisation and implementation procedures	18
8.4	Timetable	19
8.5	Costs and financing plan	19
9	MONITORING AND EVALUATION	19
9.1	Definition of indicators	19
9.2	Reports/evaluations	20
10	LOGICAL FRAMEWORK	22



1 PROJECT SUMMARY

Beneficiary Country	Russian Federation
Project title	Protection of the Rights of Entrepreneurs in the Russian Federation from Corrupt Practices
Duration	36 Months
Budget/funding	1,300.000 Euro : 1,128.475 Euro (86.81%) EU; 171 525,00 Euro (13.19%) CoE Joint Programme
Overall Objective	Facilitate the prevention of corrupt practices affecting the business sector in the Russian Federation
Project purpose	Strengthened mechanisms to protect the rights of entrepreneurs from corrupt practices
Expected Result 1	Institutions of regional and public Ombudsmen are informed about international standards and practices of comparable institutions (including in the context of competencies of the Ombudsman for the Protection of Entrepreneurs' Rights under the President of the Russian Federation)
Expected Result 2	Overview of good practices in Council of Europe (CoE) member-states and proposals for protecting whistle-blowers in the area of corruption are available
Expected Result 3	Proposals are available to strengthen measures to prevent the misuse of public authorities in corporate conflicts, eliminating competition and forced takeovers
Expected Result 4	Practice of pro bono legal assistance in the protection of the rights of entrepreneurs is expanded
Expected Result 5	Proposals are available on resolving systemic problems of entrepreneurship for the Experts' Council under the Ombudsman for the Protection of Entrepreneurs' Rights under the President of the Russian Federation
Expected Result 6	Awareness of the business community is raised with regard to the risks of infringement of entrepreneurial rights and possible methods for their protection
Expected Result 7	European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR) case law relevant to the infringement of entrepreneurs rights and related corrupt practices is made available and disseminated
Counterparts	Federal Business Ombudsman; Public and Regional Business Ombudsmen; Business Associations; Chambers of Commerce.
Contracting Authority	Delegation of the European Union to the Russian Federation
Implementation	Economic Crime Cooperation Unit, Department of Action against Crime, DG I-Human Right and Rule of Law, Council of Europe

642

## 2 BACKGROUND

### 2.1 State of Affairs

The Russian authorities have officially expressed concern that corruption and bureaucratic pressure on business is one of the main causes which hinders national economic growth and development in the country. It has also been recognized that raiding practices are carried out with the participation of bureaucratic structures or individual officials interested in gaining control of a business. In June 2012 the Russian President Vladimir Putin stated that "Instances when an entrepreneur faces a threat to his rights, bureaucratic pressure and corruption, administrative barriers – are problems that must be resolved expeditiously".<sup>1</sup> The newly appointed Federal Ombudsman for the Protection of the Rights of Entrepreneurs Boris Titov (hereinafter: the Business Ombudsman) has stated that "today the raiding of property through the abuse of criminal legislation, threat of imprisonment has become a norm and it is being done mostly by law enforcement officials".<sup>2</sup>

The World Bank survey on "Doing business", also known as Ease of Doing Business Index (EDBI) ranked the Russian Federation 118<sup>th</sup> in 2012 and 112<sup>th</sup> in 2013, out of 183 countries. The EDBI index takes the average of a country's rankings on 10 topics, made up of a variety of indicators. A low EDBI ranking essentially means that the regulatory environment of the country is not conducive to the operation of business (Source: <http://www.doingbusiness.org>).

Russian business associations are receiving numerous complaints from entrepreneurs from various regions of the Russian Federation, which testify to the fact that business raiding with the participation of corrupt officials is widespread. According to various estimates every second entrepreneur in Russia is confronted with obstruction by corrupt officials for the purpose of extortion. The number of complaints being filed by entrepreneurs is significantly lower than actual cases of extortion due to high risks of retaliation by officials, which entrepreneurs may face in case they file a formal complaint.

### 2.2 Institutional framework

Starting from 2003, various private sector associations have been proposed initiatives aimed at enhancing the role of business in anti-corruption efforts, and specifically to address significant problems such as raiding and illicit takeovers through abuse of Government and other law enforcement mechanisms. An association of small and medium-sized business in Russia – OPORA Rossii, created as early as 2003 a special Bureau for the protection of the rights of entrepreneurs and investors. In 2010 the Centre for public procedures "Business against Corruption" was created by the business association "Delovaya Rossia" to review entrepreneurs' complaints with regard to cases of corruption, extortion and raiding.

Since 2010, the Russian Government has begun taking a series of systemic steps to introduce specific anti-corruption mechanisms to normalize the business environment, to improve the investment climate and eliminate administrative barriers. By Government Resolution 1298-r dated 2 August 2010 a First Deputy Prime Minister of the Russian Federation was tasked to coordinate federal executive authorities in development of proposals to improve the investment climate, lowering of administrative barriers, development of small and medium-sized business, as well as to consider appeals from Russian and foreign investors. Support to these activities

<sup>1</sup> Speech of V.Putin at the St.Petersburg Global Economic Forum, June 21, 2012 (<http://www.kremlin.ru/news/15709>)

<sup>2</sup> Interview of B.Titov to Kommersant newspaper No. 124 (4909), 10.07.2012 (<http://www.kommersant.ru/doc/1977393>)

was provided by the staff in the Department of investment policies and development of state-private partnership in the Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation. The Deputy Plenipotentiary Representatives of the President in all the eight Federal Districts of the Russian Federation became regional Investment Ombudsmen.

Through Resolution 1298-r the Government also provided a special status to the abovementioned business associations in monitoring violations of entrepreneurs' rights and introducing proposals to take remedial action. In December 2011, the business community voiced a request for the establishment of a Governmental Business Ombudsman, in order to increase the effectiveness and institutionalize the existing initiatives. In February 2012, then Prime Minister Vladimir Putin supported the demand during the "Forum Russia-2012". On 7 May 2012, Presidential Decree No. 596 on the Main Directions of Development of Government Management was adopted, which *inter alia* referred to the creation of a special position of a Business Ombudsman.

The Federal Ombudsman for the Rights of Entrepreneurs was nominated on 22 June 2012 by Presidential Decree. The Ombudsman does not only deal with individual appeals and complaints from entrepreneurs, but is also responsible for elaborating legislative proposals aimed at reducing factors conducive to corrupt practices by State officials with regard to business.

Furthermore a Special Department for Supervising the Observance of the Rights of Entrepreneurs within the General Prosecutor's Office (GPO) of the Russian Federation was created on June 20, 2012. The key task of the Department is to monitor the conduct of law enforcement agencies for corrupt practices and prevent the abuse of their powers with regard to business.

### 2.3 Legislative framework

Federal Law No. 294 "On the protection of rights of legal persons and individual entrepreneurs in the course of government and municipal control (supervision)" was adopted on 26 December 2008. It introduced a new regulatory mechanism in the area of state and municipal control (supervision) of legal persons and individual entrepreneurs. In accordance with experts' assessments this Law has streamlined the relationship between government authorities and entrepreneurs in terms of planned and unscheduled inspections, it also instituted mandatory supervision of these inspections by the General Prosecutor's Office of the Russian Federation.

In recent years the Russian authorities have steadily been undertaking steps to reform criminal legislation in order to institute punishment for extortive practices on one hand, and on the other to ease adjudication for entrepreneurs. A Law dated 1 July 2010 (No 147-FZ) introduced amendments to the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation in order to address the pressing issue of corporate raiding - i.e., hostile takeovers of businesses by competitors.

On 4 May 2011, the Federal Law (No 97-FZ) "*On Amendments to the Criminal Code and the Code of Administrative Offences of the Russian Federation to Improve State Anti-Corruption Management*" was promulgated, providing for the possibility of punishment for a bribe in the form of a fine proportionate to the size of the bribe as an alternative to prison sentence. Depending on the gravity of the offense, a fine can range from 600 Euro to 12 million Euros.

The National Anti-Corruption Plan adopted by the Russian Government on 12 March 2012 contained a number of important initiatives in this area, most notably the creation of legislative

mechanisms to regulate lobbying as well as the development of an anti-corruption charter by Russian business.

On 3 December 2012, amendments to the basic Law on the Prevention of Corruption were adopted providing for anti-corruption measures to be taken by the private sector in the form of mandatory compliance programs, which should include:

- Designation of a unit or official responsible for the prevention of corruption or other illicit activity in or by the organization;
- Cooperation with law enforcement authorities;
- Development and implementation of standards and procedures aimed at ensuring good governance in the organization;
- Development of a code of ethics in the organization;
- Prevention of conflicts of interest;
- Prevention of off-the-books accounting practices and forgery of documentation.

These provisions of the law are underpinned by the Anti-Corruption Charter of Russian Business. It was signed by the 4 largest business associations in Russia on 24 September 2012. It is also open to signature by any business or entrepreneur operating in the Russian Federation. This Charter proposes *inter alia* the following anti-corruption principles and mechanisms for business:

- Implementation of internal anti-corruption programs by businesses, which should include codes of ethics, training programmes for staff, conflict of interest prevention. Such programs are to be based on internal anti-corruption risk assessments, to be undertaken by the company;
- Independent monitoring and evaluation of internal anti-corruption programs;
- Efficient internal financial control to prevent off-the-books and unofficial accounting practices, monitoring proper record-keeping, etc.;
- Publicity of anti-corruption measures;
- Whistle-blowing mechanisms;
- Refusal to accept a commercial advantage through illicit means;
- Anti-corruption safeguards in dealing with business partners and third persons;
- Transparency of procurement procedures;
- Cooperation with government authorities;
- Prevention of bribery of foreign public officials.

The legislative framework for the functioning of the Ombudsman institution is currently being formed, the Law on the Protection of the Rights of Entrepreneurs No. 78-FZ dated 7 May 2013 has been adopted. The Law (developed by the Government of the Russian Federation) sets the following functions for the Ombudsman:

- To protect of rights and lawful interests of entrepreneurs;
- To supervise the observance of the rights and lawful interests of entrepreneurs by government and local authorities;
- To facilitate the development of civil institutions, working toward the protection of the rights of entrepreneurs;
- To participate in the elaboration and implementation of government policies in the development of entrepreneurship and protection of the rights of entrepreneurs.



## 2.4 International engagements

The **Council of Europe**, over the past 8 years, has carried out in co-operation with the Russian Federation four relevant projects with funding from the European Union: "Harmonisation of Russian anti-Corruption Legislation with International Standards" Rucola 1 (2005); "Russian Federation – Development of legislative and other measures for the prevention of corruption" Rucola 2 (2007); the "Project on Improving legislation and practices on dealing with money laundering and financing of terrorism in the Russian Federation" MOLI-Russia I (2005–2006); and the "Project against Money Laundering and Terrorist Financing in the Russian Federation MOLI-Russia II (2007-2010)". The overall objective of these projects was to facilitate the adoption and efficient implementation of the Council of Europe Criminal Law Convention on Corruption (CETS No 173) and of the United Nations Convention against Corruption (UNCAC), as well as international anti-money laundering standards.

As far as the **relevant international standards and international treaty law** are concerned, Russia has ratified the CETS No 173 in October 2006. For the Russian Federation the Convention entered into force in February 2007. The Additional Protocol to the Criminal Law Convention on Corruption (CETS No 191) was signed by the Russian Federation in May 2009. UNCAC was ratified by Russia in May 2006.

In February 2007, Russia joined the Council of Europe's Group of States against Corruption (GRECO) and subsequently, in April 2007, took part in the Joint 1st and 2nd round of evaluations. The Evaluation Report was published in December 2008. Two years later, in December 2010 GRECO issued the Compliance Report concerning the recommendations made in the Evaluation Report. Addenda to the 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> Round Compliance Report for the Russian Federation were examined and adopted by GRECO in December 2012.

In 2011 Russia participated in a GRECO evaluation under the 3<sup>rd</sup> evaluation round, which focused on two topics, incriminations and transparency of political party financing. The Report was adopted in March 2012.

In May 2011, the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) invited the Russian Federation to join the OECD's Working Group on Bribery and to accede to the OECD's Convention on Combating Bribery of Foreign Public Officials. The Russian Federation joined the Convention in January 2012.

In recent years the Russian Federation has benefited from several projects implemented by the Center for International Private Enterprise (CIPE), which were aimed at strengthening the engagement and role of private sector associations in developing good governance and anti-corruption policies and mechanisms to improve business and investment climate. These Projects have been implemented mostly in partnership with the Russian Chamber of Commerce and Industry, as well as regional Chambers and business associations.

## 3 GOVERNMENT/SECTOR POLICY

### 3.1 Federal Ombudsman for the Rights of Entrepreneurs

The Business Ombudsman was officially nominated by Presidential Decree on 22 June 2012. The position has been initially set up in the President's Administration and the respective amendments to its register of official posts had been made. However the Law on the Protection

of the Rights of Entrepreneurs No. 78-FZ dated 7 May 2013 envisages that the Business Ombudsman will be established as a separate Government office (starting from 1 January 2014). The permanent staff (30 persons) of the Ombudsman is located in the Civil Chamber of the Russian Federation.

The Federal Ombudsman is supported in his activities by an Experts' Council which includes representatives of business, research community and the legal profession. The Experts' Council elaborates systemic legislative and institutional policy proposals related to the protection of rights of entrepreneurs in the Russian Federation.

### **3.2 Regional Ombudsmen for the Protection of Rights of Entrepreneurs**

The federal level initiative has been preceded by the establishment of regional Ombudsmen in several subjects of the Russian Federation (e.g. Ulyanovsk region in 2011) and is currently being replicated in most regions of the Russian Federation. Already, almost 50 such positions have been created across Russia. Some of them are based on the adoption of respective regional laws, and some are functioning without a regulatory framework on a *pro bono* basis. In accordance with the abovementioned draft law on the Business Ombudsman, the regional Ombudsmen may be established through the adoption of special regional laws and will be nominated by the Head of the Region in consultation with the Business Ombudsman under the President of the Russian Federation.

### **3.3 Interagency cooperation**

The Federal Ombudsman is actively working with a wide range of ministries and agencies, and has signed a number of bilateral agreements with them in order to institutionalize the mechanisms for cooperation. Such bilateral agreements have already been signed with the General Prosecutor's Office, the Ministry of Interior, the Federal Bailiff Service. The General Prosecutor's Office has also established an interagency working group on the protection of the rights of entrepreneurs, which includes the Business Ombudsman, representatives of the Ministry of Economic Development, the Chamber of Commerce and Industry, and leading business associations.

A bilateral agreement has also been signed between the Ombudsman and the Deputy Speaker of the State Duma *Vladimir Vasiliev*, who leads the "Civil control" project in the Duma to monitor and check mass-media publications which include allegations of corruption.

### **3.4 Public Ombudsmen**

The Business Ombudsman is supported in his activities by Public Ombudsmen, responsible for various economic sectors and administrative procedures (e.g. customs, land registration, construction, state contracts, and protection of investments abroad). The public ombudsmen also deal with appeals from entrepreneurs in these areas.

### **3.5 Private sector initiatives**

A range of non-government initiatives have been established by the business community to protect the rights of entrepreneurs from abuse by officials. Currently these also assist the Business Ombudsman in his functions. For example, the Centre for Civil Procedures "Business against Corruption" is an entity that processes and evaluates a large amount of appeals from entrepreneurs and forwards them to the Ombudsman for further consideration.

### 3.6 Legal associations

At present, the Ombudsman relies on the support by civil society organizations and pro bono work by lawyers and legal associations for the processing of individual complaints and appeals by entrepreneurs. Individual agreements with law firms and lawyers are then signed in order to formalize and recognize this pro bono contribution.

## 4 KEY ISSUES

The **Joint 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> Round GRECO Evaluation Report<sup>3</sup>** noted that corruption was a widespread, systemic phenomenon in the Russian Federation, which seemed to affect society as a whole and the public administration, including the institutions in place to counteract corruption (the police and the judiciary) and the business sector.

The Compliance Procedure Report noted that the Russian Federation had received a vast number of recommendations in the Joint First and Second Evaluation Round. Some of the recommendations required fundamental measures, including the creation of a clear basis for the National anti-corruption policy, legislative reforms and organisational changes in public administration, law enforcement, and the judiciary as well as in relation to civil society.

Among the issues that remain to be addressed (according to GRECO) is that more emphasis needs to be placed on **preventive measures outside the criminal justice area**, which would include work with the private sector. Another specific area is developing measures on reporting suspicions of corruption and protection of whistle-blowers.

Given the recent accession of the Russian Federation to the OECD Anti-Bribery Convention, there is a need to review the legal provisions in place and the capacity for their implementation in order to explore ways to involve the business community in the prevention of corruption. The Russian Federation has repeatedly taken stance at political leadership level in favour of increasing the involvement of the business associations in anti-corruption initiatives including in the regions.

## 5 INITIALLY IDENTIFIED NEEDS

In the past year the Russian Government has clearly identified the protection of the rights of entrepreneurs as one of its anti-corruption priorities. Therefore, co-operation with the newly created institutions of the Business Ombudsman and related structures can be expected to create a focused, immediate and sustainable outcome and provide timely leverage of international expertise to the anti-corruption effort in the Russian Federation and also to address the most pressing present-day problems seen by the Russian authorities as requiring immediate measures.

This project proposes to provide technical assistance and cooperation tools in addressing prevention of corruption through the institution of the Business Ombudsman and related initiatives to protect the business community from corrupt practices is proposed.

The project will address the following sectors:

---

<sup>3</sup> [http:// www.coe.int/greco](http://www.coe.int/greco)

SIB

## **5.1 Institutional and legislative analysis**

The Council of Europe will provide assistance in reviewing good practices of setting up referring to leading European experience.

Assistance will also include a comprehensive review of the broader framework of issues relevant for the protection of rights of entrepreneurs from corruption, particularly the abuse of authority in corporate conflicts, business integrity and development of incentives in pro bono services to the Ombudsmen. It is also planned to carry out an analysis and develop proposals for a proper whistle-blower protection system.

The Project will also aim to support to the Experts' Council under the Federal Ombudsman by providing up-to-date analysis of international practices on the issues under consideration by the Council.

## **5.2 Capacity Building/Training**

It is planned to organize institutional capacity building and creation of dedicated training programs based on analysis of national practice, and identification of typologies with the involvement of relevant international expertise for the staff of the Ombudsmen at the regional level. The current shortage of training material and reference sources for capacity building will be addressed by the provision of relevant handbooks, manuals and guidance material to be reproduced as the regional network of ombudsmen develops.

## **5.3 Promotion of awareness/outreach**

The action will provide assistance in the promotion of awareness among the business community about the Ombudsman institution, its mechanisms and procedures, as well as such transversal issues as ethical and professional standards when related to business compliance and integrity based on international good practices. A promotion of *pro bono* standards and practices among the legal community based on leading international experience will aim to extend the support and assistance of legal professionals in the activities of the Ombudsman.

# **6 PROJECT STRATEGY**

## **6.1 Overall Objective**

The project will contribute to the implementation of anti-corruption mechanisms to prevent corrupt practices affecting the business sector in the Russian Federation. Specifically, the project will strengthen the capacity of the Business Ombudsman institutions in the Russian Federation and other authorities involved in protecting the rights of entrepreneurs from corrupt practices in the Russian Federation.

## **6.2 Project Duration**

36 months (commencement - on 1 January 2013) with a proposed inception phase of 9 months.

## **6.3 Target group**

Given the overall objective of this Project, the primary target group will be the business community in the Russian Federation, as well as society as a whole in the way that it benefits

from the successful outcome of this action. The Project will also aim at representatives of the legal profession as a target group.

#### 6.4 Counterparts/stakeholders

The project will work with the key stakeholders involved in the protection of the rights of entrepreneurs from corrupt practices in the Russian Federation. Its main counterparts will be the Federal Business Ombudsman, regional Business Ombudsmen, as well as business and legal associations. Other stakeholders include the Chamber of Commerce and Industry, and relevant Government authorities where appropriate.

### 7 THE INTERVENTION

<b>Title</b>	<b>Protection of the rights of entrepreneurs in the Russian Federation from corrupt practices</b>
<b>Overall Objective</b>	Facilitate the prevention of corrupt practices affecting the business sector in the Russian Federation
<b>Purpose</b>	Strengthened mechanisms to protect the rights of entrepreneurs from corrupt practices
Expected Result 1	Institutions of regional and public Ombudsmen are informed about international standards and practices of comparable institutions (including in the context of competencies of the Ombudsman for the Protection of Entrepreneurs' Rights under the President of the Russian Federation)
Expected Result 2	Overview of good practices in CoE member-states and proposals for protecting whistle-blowers in the area of corruption are available
Expected Result 3	Proposals are available to strengthen measures to prevent the misuse of public authorities in corporate conflicts, eliminating competition and forced takeovers
Expected Result 4	Practice of pro bono legal assistance in the protection of the rights of entrepreneurs is expanded
Expected Result 5	Proposals are available on resolving systemic problems of entrepreneurship for the Experts' Council under the Ombudsman for the Protection of Entrepreneurs' Rights under the President of the Russian Federation
Expected Result 6	Awareness of the business community is raised with regard to the risks of infringement of entrepreneurial rights and possible methods for their protection
Expected Result 7	ECtHR-case law relevant to the infringement of entrepreneurs rights and related corrupt practices is made available and disseminated

## 7.1 Deliverables<sup>4</sup>

Under Expected Result 1 the deliverables will include

- A comparative study on the powers and competencies of a business ombudsman institution to be presented and discussed at an expert workshop;
- Training programmes and handbook for regional ombudsmen on the procedures, legal concepts, typologies drawn from experience at the federal level and international practices;
- Awareness raising (high-level) and training (expert-level) events for staff of regional ombudsmen based on the training programmes and handbooks.

Under Expected Result 2 the deliverables will include

- A comparative study on the regulatory framework concerning whistle-blowers;
- Concrete recommendations on the regulatory framework concerning whistle-blowers with input from an expert workshop.

Under Expected Result 3 the deliverables will include

- A comparative study on the misuses of public authorities corporate conflicts, eliminating competition, and forced takeovers;
- Concrete recommendations developed with input from an expert workshop.

Under Expected Result 4 the deliverables will include

- A comparative study on *pro bono* legal services;
- Concrete recommendations with input from two workshops;
- Awareness raising events for the legal profession on *pro bono* legal services.

Under Expected Result 5 the deliverables will include

- Up to 10 studies providing assessments and proposals on different areas under consideration by the Experts' Council with need for enhanced protection mechanisms for entrepreneurs.

Under Expected Result 6 the deliverables will include

- Information materials for entrepreneurs and business associations on the typologies of corruption risk, corrupt practices and possible protective mechanisms;
- Information materials containing recommendations on the principles of good governance in business (compliance, integrity, anti-corruption charter) as a mechanism to minimize risks of corruption.

Under Expected Result 7 the deliverables will include

- A comparative analysis on ECtHR-case law in the form of a practitioner's manual/reference source;
- Awareness raising events with business community, federal/regional ombudsman staff and legal professionals.

---

<sup>4</sup> Detailed information on the deliverables will be contained in the Workplan and Inception Report.

## 7.2 Assumptions

Political commitment from Russian authorities to further strengthen capacities of Business Ombudsman at the federal and regional level is the key assumption made under this Project. This assumption has been confirmed by official policy documents adopted by the Russian authorities and through the recent adoption of the legislative reforms.

It is assumed that Project stakeholders, and in particular the key institutions of Ombudsman in Russia, will be committed to the achievement of this Project's results. It is also assumed that suitable persons will be nominated to the Steering Committee.

These assumptions appear to be reasonable in the light of the positive previous experience in this regard under the Joint Programme in Russia through RUCOLA 1, RUCOLA 2, MOLI Russia I and MOLI Russia II projects.

## 7.3 Risks

The risk in this Project is one of the assumptions not holding true. This risk is however not considered to be high based on previous experience. More particularly:

- Lack of political support

Proposed response: This risk is relatively high in the light of previous experience; however it is not crucial for the achievement of all the expected results. Adoption of specific legislation or other normative legal acts by the Russian government cannot be influenced by the project management.

- Political controversy

Proposed response: This risk is also relatively high in the light of previous experience; however it is not likely to influence the results. If it materialises it may delay certain processes within the project or make its work more difficult, but within the scope of flexibility built in the Project and through ensuring professional management the Project Team shall be able to cope with any difficulties.

- Lack of co-ordination and of co-operative approach by stakeholders;

Proposed response: Experience from previous projects allows perceiving this risk as moderate and unlikely to prevent the project from achieving its results. Co-operation of stakeholders under other projects in the area of economic crime (such as RUCOLA 1, RUCOLA 2, MOLI RUSSIA) has been in so far very good. The project foresees further strengthening of an existing capacities and introducing better tools to be applied in terms of prevention and fight against corruption in a newly established sector such as the Business Ombudsman and its regional offices.

- Lack of government financial resources to consolidate achievements of the Project

Proposed response: The focus of the project being on capacity building, technical advice and training by nature thus does not require any substantial investments of the part of Government.

## 7.4 Sustainability

The project does not seek to create new structures but rather to support the newly established public services in efficiently carrying out their functions and at the same time to strengthen their capacities.

It is expected that the selected intervention logic will ensure the sustainability of results based on the assumption that the government's commitment to effectively prevent and control corruption will be maintained in the future.

Improvement in the legislative and organizational framework of the Ombudsman sector will set solid foundations for further developing the system.

By taking a focused approach to assisting a key institution, enjoying a high level of support from the President, as well as support from the business community the results should be sustainable. Much will, however, depend on whether the Russian authorities will be willing to use the deliverables of the project. This concern will be factored into project delivery, in that the project experts will be working closely with the respective counterparts to ensure the highest level of participation of the Russian side in the development and ownership of the deliverables.

## 7.5 Lessons Learnt

Previous experience of Council of Europe technical assistance to Russian authorities and countries in the region of Eastern Europe as well has been overall satisfactory. However, certain good practices and lessons learnt are worth of sharing and being kept under consideration for future actions in order to improve impact and quality of assistance. Those would include:

- Consideration of the historical, cultural and ethnic values and circumstances in the field where the project is implemented;
- Ensure local ownership through involvement to the maximum possible of the main stakeholders and beneficiaries;
- Capacity building of local staff and institutional management involved in project deliveries through direct and indirect "on site" participation;
- Ensure follow-up and information dissemination when delivering project results in order to maintain the momentum;
- Sufficient financial planning of support and management time for project team (in Russia and in Strasbourg) in order to ensure smooth and quality result oriented actions;
- Close coordination with EU Delegation in the country;
- Sharing information and planning with other governmental and non-governmental organisations in Russia and in the region in order to avoid duplication, but also ensure joint partnerships and coordination of efforts.

## 8 IMPLEMENTATION

### 8.1 Methods of implementation and reasons for the proposed methodology

The methodology of implementation of these activities, and thus of the project itself is more concretely laid out in the logical framework proposed below (see Section 10).

The project will seek to further strengthen the capacities of the newly established institutions of the Business Ombudsman and the regional ombudsmen. A set of training activities is proposed to enhance the capacities of the key institutions and professional groups to fulfil their roles provided for in the legislation and increase their efficiency. Transparency of all the processes as well as of



the ombudsman's role in the relevant cases will be an element of critical importance. Therefore the Project shall provide awareness raising events as far as concerns the role of the main target groups.

Following the reasons for the proposed methodology and approach, the modus of action includes a mixture of the following types/nature of tools for the implementation of the Project and specifically the proposed activities:

Expert advice/opinions – will be provided in writing, as necessary, to comment on the pieces of legislation or their drafts or other documents, by independent experts from the Council of Europe Member States via the CoE Secretariat including here national experts.

Round tables – allowing stakeholders/professional groups and individuals to look at ways in which policies and mechanisms can be reformed to reach certain objectives. They will also be used to contribute specialist knowledge to a broader debate on a given issue.

Workshops – allow a particular task to be undertaken involving multiple co-operating parties. Experts put their knowledge at the disposal of practitioners and officials. Workshops can also be used to provide specific advanced training.

Training courses – allow participants to acquire new knowledge and/or professional skills through interaction with a qualified trainer. Elements of self-education can be included.

Training of trainers – to enhance the sustainability of the Project's results the ToT approach shall be applied wherever possible throughout the Project.

Research – a way to get a comprehensive overview of a given issue to serve a basis for further analysis.

Translations – make important texts and information accessible in local languages and can be used as a tool in training activities and seminars.

Publication and dissemination of texts and/or audio-visual CD-ROMs – ensure that certain expertise or knowledge is made available to the widest possible audience.

## 8.2 Physical and non-physical means

To ensure the proper implementation of the Project throughout the period of 36 months, the following means will be made available:

- Premises and office equipment

The Council of Europe is expected to have an office presence in Moscow as of 2013 which will ensure that premises are available for the Project Team in Moscow. A monthly lump sum will be allocated under the budget to cover the administrative / overhead costs of the Project running and office maintenance in Moscow.

- Staff/Project Team

The following staff (Council of Europe Secretariat) will be funded under this Project:

- A Senior Project Officer – 100% time (Moscow based);
- A Project and Linguistic Assistant -100% (Moscow based); and
- A Senior Project Officer – 100% time (Strasbourg based);

The international and national project team members will be selected by the Council of Europe in a transparent procedure based on CoE's Human Resource rules and procedures. No permanent staff of the Council of Europe will be funded under this Project.

The Project Team will propose a Workplan detailing short-term consultants/experts/advisers (national and international) that will be needed for the implementation of project activities. The Council of Europe will ensure the active participation of local professional skills where available, and a suitable mix of Europe and local consultants/experts in the project team. All this information will be made available and provided to counterparts and EUD in Moscow at the end of the Inception Phase through the Inception Report.

- **Consultancy Services**

Given the nature of the activities undertaken, consultancy services will constitute a major input into the Programme's implementation where experts and advisers under short term contracts will be engaged to provide inputs for specific Workplan activities and in line with the project's Workplan and expected results.

International and national short-term Experts/Consultants should have the following qualifications and skills: very good knowledge and experience of dealing with reforms and actions related to good governance and anti-corruption measures, and measures promoting Ombudsman's role in the society; very good knowledge and experience of the role of the Business Ombudsman, judiciary and training aspects and training the trainers; very good knowledge of the relevant international standards in the aforementioned fields.

Local/national experts/consultants are entitled to be receiving fee for their services. All local experts are to be independent and free from conflicts of interests. Civil servants and other staff of the public administration of Russia shall in principle not be recruited as consultants within the project team. They may provide short-term inputs as necessary but in that case shall not be remunerated.

### **8.3 Organisation and implementation procedures**

The implementation of the Programme will be based on a contribution agreement between the Delegation of the European Union in Russia (the contracting authority) and the Council of Europe (the implementing agency). The Council of Europe will sign contracts with all consultants/experts, service providers and suppliers.

- The European Union Delegation in Moscow will be responsible for:
  - Providing funds for project implementation
  - Co-Chairing the Steering Committee
  - Exercise ex-post control over the expenditures on the contract
  - Approving progress reports and Workplans
  - Giving consent to procurement if provided in the contract
  - Approving budget modifications.
- The Steering Committee (SC)

The Steering Committee of this project is proposed to be consisting of representatives of EUD, Council of Europe and the Office of the Ombudsman for the Protection of the Rights of Entrepreneurs under the President of the Russian Federation.

The final list of government agencies and organizations to be included into the Steering Committee will be supplemented by the Russian side and approved at the end of the Inception Phase. Other relevant authorities related to project results and activities will also be invited to the Steering Committee meetings.

The Steering Committee will take strategic decisions and supervise the proper implementation of the Project. It will address any major issues that the project may face. The Steering Committee will be called to meet just before the launching event (start-up event) then on a regular 6-months basis and *ad hoc* (whenever such need arises). The responsibilities of the Steering Committee are the following:

- Monitoring the implementation of the project and discussing its achievements;
- Approving work plans and progress reports, including the inception and the final one;
- Assessing emerging issues for sound project implementation and approving the resulting guidelines for the Project Management;
- Approving the necessary departures from the original TOR or Workplan
- Approving specifications for procurement and procurement plans

The Steering Committee will be co-chaired by a National Project Coordinator (a representative of the Office of the Ombudsman for the Protection of Entrepreneurs' Rights under the President of the Russian Federation) and the representative of EUD in Moscow.

A Project Coordinator designated by the Business Ombudsman will be responsible, in co-operation with the Project teams in Moscow and in Strasbourg for the coordination of project activities.

#### **8.4 Timetable**

The envisaged duration of the Project is 36 months. An indicative Project timetable will be reflecting all approved Workplan activities at the inception phase and which will provide a tentative timeframe for all the activities planned under the Project. It will be used as a benchmark in the course of the implementation of the Project to assess the progress made.

#### **8.5 Costs and financing plan**

The total cost of the Project for the 36-month period is 1,300.000 Euro where 171.525 Euro will be provided by the Council of Europe contribution from the provision of funds under the Joint Programme agreement.

### **9 MONITORING AND EVALUATION**

#### **9.1 Definition of indicators**

Indicators, sources of verification as well as related assumptions are provided in the logical framework.

## 9.2 Reports/evaluations

- Reports

The Council of Europe will report on project implementation to the European Union Delegation (EUD) and national authorities in Russia.

All Reports must be approved by the Contracting Authority as stipulated in the applicable General Conditions or superseding provisions.

The daily implementation and reporting of specific activities of the project will be monitored and the responsibility of the Senior Project Officer in Strasbourg. The latter will ensure that reports are prepared and submitted as required, and provide all necessary support to the Project Team in Moscow. He/she will ensure timely feedback on behalf of Russian partners. The Council of Europe will submit the following reports:

Nature/Content	Type	Reporting Period	Recipients
Inception Report	The inception report will contain a descriptive part, a detailed Workplan and the names of the Project Team members as well as identified short term experts. In its elaboration, the Logical Framework Approach shall be followed linking the project objectives to expected results and the activities needed in order to achieve the results. It will contain the confirmation of the composition of the Steering Committee. It will also cover the project start-up activities and progress made in the inception phase.	At the end of the inception phase (after 9 months)	Submitted to: Office of the Federal Ombudsman for Rights of Entrepreneurs  EU Delegation  Adopted by the Steering Committee in the framework of the Launching event
Annual Progress Reports	These reports will list more in detail the activities undertaken and assess the progress toward achievement of project objectives. The update will stress particularly the achievement of results and identify also potential risks during the forehead implementation period. Update of the country situation will also be included, supported by case statistics.	To be submitted every 12 months not later than 30 days after the end of the reporting period.	Submitted to: Office of the Federal Ombudsman for Rights of Entrepreneurs  EU Delegation Approved by the Steering Committee
Final Report (Narrative and Financial)	The final report should follow the inception report format and include an in-depth assessment of project implementation results in terms of	Not later than 6 months after the end of the project implementation	Submitted to: Office of the Federal Ombudsman

English and Russian Versions	the level of achievement of the objectives. The final report will be complemented by an evaluation of the impact of the project aimed at identifying the impact and the achievements of the project at the end of it. The Final Report and the Evaluation Report will contain lesson learnt and suggestions that the beneficiary could consider in terms of follow up.	period and accompanying final payment request	for Rights of Entrepreneurs EU Delegation
------------------------------	--	---	---

▪ Evaluations

The contracting authority will monitor the project according to standard EU procedures. Project monitoring and evaluation will be based on periodic assessment of progress on delivery of specified project results and towards achievement of project objectives.

In addition, as part of standard Council of Europe implementation procedures, the project activities will be monitored and evaluated at several levels, as described above. In particular:

- at the political level: the project activities will be monitored within the framework of Council of Europe's usual monitoring procedures concerning the implementation of commitments entered into by the sides at the moment of Project commencement. In particular, the Programme will draw on the monitoring procedures of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, the Committee of Ministers.
- at policy level: the project activities will be monitored by the Project Steering Committee and by the Result Oriented Monitoring (ROM) if and when commissioned by EUD in Moscow
- at technical level: the Council of Europe will commission an external evaluation of the project 15 months prior to its scheduled end. The evaluators will be selected in consultation with the EU Delegation. The external evaluation will provide an assessment of the overall project progress from its mid-implementation period start until the end against the objectives and indicators of achievement established at its beginning, as well as its overall impact, by addressing i. a. the following points:
  - o Results;
  - o Effectiveness of implementation;
  - o Influence of external factors;
  - o Sustainability potential;
  - o Relationship with other projects/donor actions;
  - o Conclusions.

## 10 LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

Workplan and Calendar of activities will be established and agreed upon before the end of the inception phase (first nine months) and shall be adopted at the Launching (Start-up) event.

Level	Description	Indicators	Means of verification	Assumptions
Overall Objective	Facilitate the prevention of corrupt practices affecting the business sector in the Russian Federation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Investment and business climate improved</li> <li>- Clear contribution of proposed policies to decrease the level of corruption with regard to the business sector</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Indicators and surveys among entrepreneurs and society,</li> <li>- Indicators and surveys on investment and business climate;</li> <li>- Reports and statistics by Ombudsmen</li> <li>- Media response</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Framework on ombudsmen is implemented</li> <li>- Authorities cooperate and provide input to activities and make use of outputs</li> <li>- Businesses take part in activities, provide input, and make use of new tools</li> </ul>
Project Purpose	Strengthened mechanisms to protect the rights of entrepreneurs from corrupt practices	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Number of cases of abuse of authority against businesses</li> <li>- Number of policy proposals implemented</li> <li>- Awareness on Ombudsmen institutions and protection mechanisms raised</li> <li>- Capacities of key stakeholders increased</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Project Progress and activity reports</li> <li>- Official statistics of key agencies</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ombudsmen institutions, business and legal associations, and other stakeholders where possible, provide input to project activities and take part</li> </ul>
Level	Description	Indicators	Means of verification	Assumptions
Expected Result 1	Institutions of regional and public Ombudsmen are informed about international standards and practices of comparable institutions (including in the context of competencies of the Ombudsman for the Protection of Entrepreneurs' Rights under the President of the Russian Federation)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Number of stakeholders and potential multipliers reached by awareness raising and training events</li> <li>- Quantity and quality of implementation of mechanisms and procedures by regional ombudsmen based on federal model</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Project progress and activity reports (including feedback, statistics and reports from event and training participants, etc.)</li> <li>- Project evaluation</li> <li>- Official data from Ombudsman institutions</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Input on Russian framework is provided for by Ombudsmen institutions</li> <li>- Relevant stakeholders take part in workshops, trainees are selected appropriately</li> </ul>
Activities			Cooperating Institutions	

0162

<p><b>Activity 1.1</b></p>	<p>Comparative analysis of international and Russian experience in terms of powers, competencies and practices of a business ombudsman institution</p>	<p>The analysis is to be jointly prepared by local and international experts. Upon its completion a workshop will be organized with stakeholders to discuss findings and recommendations.</p> <p><b>Costs:</b> Short-term consultants' (STC) fees, STC per diems, international travel, workshop cost, translation/interpretation</p> <p><b>Inputs:</b> STC consulting/drafting, meetings and Project team</p>	<p>- Federal and public Ombudsmen</p>
<p><b>Activity 1.2</b></p>	<p>Awareness-raising and training activities for regional and public Ombudsmen on international standards and practices of comparable institutions (including in the context of competencies of the Ombudsman for the Protection of Entrepreneurs' Rights under the President of the Russian Federation) and typologies (to be drawn from Activity 3.1)</p>	<p>A training programme and handbook for regional ombudsmen will be developed by local experts and will serve as a basis for the awareness-raising/training activities. Training events will be organized in key Federal Districts (up to six 2-3 day trainings) and will each consist of an introductory high-level session for Regional Ombudsmen, representatives of regional authorities, and technical training session for staff of regional ombudsman offices</p> <p><b>Costs:</b> STC fees, STC per diems for participants to cover subsistence/accommodation, international and domestic travel, event organization cost, translation/interpretation, publication and dissemination cost</p> <p><b>Inputs:</b> STC consulting/drafting, meetings and Project team, study visit</p>	<p>- public and regional Ombudsmen staff, expert and law departments of Business associations</p> <p>- Chambers of commerce and industry (federal and regional)</p> <p>- Other regional authorities, as interested</p>
<p><b>Level</b></p> <p><b>Expected Result 2</b></p>	<p><b>Description</b></p> <p>Overview of good practices in CoE member-states and proposals for protecting whistle-blowers in the area of corruption are available</p>	<p><b>Indicators</b></p> <p>Quality and scope of proposals for protection of whistle blowers available and taken on board by policymakers</p> <p><b>Means of verification</b></p> <p>- Project progress and activity reports (including feedback, statistics and event reports etc.)</p> <p>- Analysis Report</p> <p>- Proposals developed (TPs) aimed at the regulation of whistle-blower protection</p>	<p><b>Assumptions</b></p> <p>- Input on framework in RF is provided by Russian authorities</p> <p>- Stakeholders take part in workshops</p>
<p><b>Activities</b></p>			<p><b>Cooperating Institutions</b></p>

Activity 2.1	Comparative analysis of practices in CoE member-states to protect whistle-blowers in the area of corruption	<p>Costs: STC fees, translation</p> <p>Inputs: STC consulting/drafting and Project team</p>	- Federal Ombudsman
Activity 2.2	Development of proposals to regulate whistle-blower protection in the Russian Federation	<p>The proposals will be prepared in the form of a technical paper jointly by international and local experts and will be discussed and finalized at an expert-level workshop and then further presented at a broader public event. A publication incorporating technical papers from Activity 2.1 and 2.2 will be prepared.</p> <p>Costs: STC fees, STC per diems, international travel, event organization cost of two events, translation/interpretation, publication and dissemination cost</p> <p>Inputs: STC consulting/drafting, meetings and Project team</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Federal Ombudsman</li> <li>- Other relevant authorities, as available</li> </ul>
Level	Description	<p>Indicators</p> <p>Quality and scope of proposals available and taken on board by policymakers</p> <p>Means of verification</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Project progress and activity reports (including feedback, statistics and event reports etc.)</li> <li>- Analysis Report</li> <li>- Proposals developed (TPs)</li> </ul>	Assumptions
Expected Result 3	Proposals are available to strengthen measures to prevent the misuse of public authorities corporate in conflicts, eliminating competition and forced takeovers		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Input on framework and typologies in RF is provided by Russian authorities</li> <li>- Stakeholders take part in workshops</li> </ul>
Activity 3.1	<p>Activities</p> <p>Comparative analysis of integrity and rule of law measures in CoE member-states and other international experience to prevent the misuse of public authorities in:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- corporate conflicts</li> <li>- eliminating competition</li> <li>- forced takeovers</li> </ul>	<p>Means</p> <p>The analysis is to be jointly prepared by local and international experts and will include an analysis of good practices, legislative and institutional frameworks as well as typologies.</p> <p>Costs: STC fees, translation</p> <p>Inputs: STC consulting/drafting and Project team</p>	<p>Cooperating Institutions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Federal Ombudsman</li> </ul>



<p><b>Activity 3.2</b></p>	<p>Development of proposals to strengthen integrity and rule of law measures to prevent the misuse of public authorities in:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- corporate conflicts</li> <li>- eliminating competition</li> <li>- forced takeovers</li> </ul>	<p>The proposals will be prepared in the form of a technical paper jointly by international and local experts and will be discussed and finalized at an expert-level workshop. A publication incorporating technical papers from Activity 3.1 and 3.2 will be prepared.</p> <p><b>Costs:</b> STC fees, STC per diems, international travel, event organization cost, translation/interpretation, publication and dissemination cost</p> <p><b>Inputs:</b> STC consulting/drafting, meetings and Project team</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Federal and regional Ombudsmen</li> <li>- Business associations</li> <li>- Other relevant authorities, as available</li> </ul>
<p><b>Level</b></p> <p><b>Expected Result 4</b></p>	<p><b>Description</b></p> <p>Practice of pro bono legal assistance in the protection of the rights of entrepreneurs is expanded</p>	<p><b>Indicators</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Number of pro bono agreements between the Ombudsman and legal professionals</li> <li>- Number of stakeholders and potential multipliers reached by awareness events</li> </ul> <p><b>Means of verification</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Project progress and activity reports (including feedback, statistics and reports from event and training participants, etc.)</li> <li>- Official data from Ombudsman institutions</li> <li>- Comparative Analysis</li> <li>- Proposals developed (TPs)</li> </ul>	<p><b>Assumptions</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Input on Russian framework is provided for by Ombudsmen and legal associations</li> <li>- Stakeholders take part in workshops</li> </ul>
<p><b>Activity 4.1</b></p>	<p><b>Activities</b></p> <p>Comparative analysis of international and Russian practices and principles for pro bono work, including issues of incentives, as well as professional standards</p>	<p><b>Means</b></p> <p>The analysis is to be jointly prepared by local and international experts.</p> <p><b>Costs:</b> STC fees, STC per diems, international travel, translation/interpretation</p> <p><b>Inputs:</b> STC consulting/drafting and Project team</p>	<p><b>Cooperating Institutions</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Federal Ombudsman</li> </ul>

642

FB

617

<p><b>Activity 4.2</b></p>	<p>Proposals for improvement of pro bono services of lawyers and legal associations and professional standards in this area</p>	<p>These proposals will be elaborated based on the results of Activity 4.1 in the course of two workshops with participation of international experts in the field of pro bono.</p> <p><b>Costs:</b> STC fees, STC per diems, international travel, event organization cost of two events, translation/interpretation, publication and dissemination cost</p> <p><b>Inputs:</b> STC consulting/drafting, meetings and Project team</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Federal Ombudsman</li> <li>- Business associations</li> <li>- Legal associations</li> </ul>
<p><b>Activity 4.3</b></p>	<p>Conducting seminars and awareness events for legal associations and professionals for purposes of sharing practices of pro bono service</p>	<p><b>Costs:</b> STC fees, STC per diems, per diems for accommodation and subsistence for participants, international travel, event organization cost of four events, translation/interpretation</p> <p><b>Inputs:</b> STC consulting/drafting, meetings and Project team, study visit</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Federal and regional Ombudsmen</li> <li>- Business associations</li> <li>- Legal associations</li> </ul>
<p><b>Level</b></p> <p><b>Expected Result 5</b></p>	<p><b>Description</b></p> <p>Proposals are available on resolving systemic problems of entrepreneurship for the Experts' Council under the Ombudsman for the Protection of Entrepreneurs' Rights under the President of the Russian Federation</p>	<p><b>Indicators</b></p> <p>Quality and scope of proposals available and taken on board by policymakers</p> <p><b>Means of verification</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Project progress and activity reports;</li> <li>- Data from Experts' Council</li> <li>- Research Studies</li> </ul>	<p><b>Assumptions</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Input on framework in RF is provided for by Ombudsmen and other stakeholders</li> </ul>
<p><b>Activity 5</b></p>	<p><b>Activities</b></p> <p>Preparation of research studies / recommendations on 5-10 issues relevant for the protection of rights of entrepreneurs from corruption identified in coordination with the Experts' Council</p>	<p><b>Means</b></p> <p>Research studies to be prepared on issues proposed by the Experts' Council. When necessary, results/recommendations are to be finalized in the course of workshops (up to 5 events).</p> <p><b>Costs:</b> STC fees, STC per diems, international travel, event organization cost of five events, translation/interpretation</p> <p><b>Inputs:</b> STC consulting/drafting, meetings and Project team</p>	<p><b>Cooperating Institutions</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Federal Ombudsman</li> <li>- Experts' Council</li> </ul>
<p><b>Level</b></p>	<p><b>Description</b></p>	<p><b>Indicators</b></p>	<p><b>Means of verification</b></p>
			<p><b>Assumptions</b></p>

Expected Result 6	Awareness of the business community is raised with regard to the risks of infringement of entrepreneurial rights and possible methods for their protection	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Number of stakeholders and potential multipliers reached by awareness events</li> <li>- Level of awareness within the business community</li> <li>- Quality of case-referrals by business to the Ombudsman</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Feedback by participants of awareness raising events</li> <li>- Official data from Ombudsman institutions</li> <li>- Surveys of the business community</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Stakeholders take part in workshops and other events</li> </ul>	
<b>Activities</b>					
Activity 6.1	Development of information materials for entrepreneurs and business associations on typologies of corruption risks, corrupt practices, and on possible protection mechanisms	<b>Means</b>			<b>Cooperating Institutions</b>
Activity 6.2	Provide a reference source and compile recommendations on good governance principles in business (compliance and integrity practices, anti-corruption charters, etc.) as a mechanism to reduce corruption risks	<p>Information material will be developed in the form of a handbook by local experts and shall include findings from Activity 3.1</p> <p><b>Costs:</b> STC fees, translation/interpretation, publication and dissemination cost</p> <p><b>Inputs:</b> STC consulting/drafting, meetings and Project team</p>	<p>Information material will be developed in the form of a handbook by local experts and shall include findings from Activity 3.1</p> <p><b>Costs:</b> STC fees, translation/interpretation, publication and dissemination cost</p> <p><b>Inputs:</b> STC consulting/drafting, meetings and Project team</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Federal and regional Ombudsmen</li> <li>- Business associations</li> </ul>	
Activity 6.3	Conducting seminars and other events for the business community to raise awareness of existing forms of participation of entrepreneurs in anti-corruption mechanisms and on implementation of good governance principles and compliance mechanisms	<p>A Handbook on good governance, compliance principles and practices will be developed jointly by international and national experts.</p> <p><b>Costs:</b> STC fees, translation, publication and dissemination cost</p> <p><b>Inputs:</b> STC consulting/drafting, meetings and Project team</p>	<p>A Handbook on good governance, compliance principles and practices will be developed jointly by international and national experts.</p> <p><b>Costs:</b> STC fees, translation, publication and dissemination cost</p> <p><b>Inputs:</b> STC consulting/drafting, meetings and Project team</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Federal and regional Ombudsmen</li> <li>- Business associations</li> </ul>	
<b>Level</b>	<b>Description</b>		<b>Indicators</b>	<b>Means of verification</b>	<b>Assumptions</b>

01/10

Expected Result 7	ECtHR-case law relevant to the infringement of entrepreneurs rights and related corrupt practices is made available and disseminated	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Quality of study and degree of reference to situation in RF</li> <li>- Number of stakeholders and potential multipliers reached by awareness events</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Activity reports</li> <li>- Review Technical Paper</li> <li>- User Review and compilation of ECtHR case law</li> <li>- Feedback by participants of awareness raising events</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Input on framework in RF is provided for by Ombudsmen</li> <li>- Stakeholders take part in workshops and provide input to the discussion of the study</li> </ul>	
<b>Activities</b>		<b>Means</b>			
<b>Activity 7.1</b>	Review of ECtHR-case law relevant to the area of infringement of the rights of entrepreneurs from corrupt practices	<p>This review is to be prepared in the format of a technical paper.</p> <p>Areas of case law to be selected based on typologies identified under Activity 3.1.</p> <p><b>Costs:</b> STC fees, translation, publication and dissemination cost</p> <p><b>Inputs:</b> STC consulting/drafting, meetings and Project team</p>			<p><b>Cooperating Institutions</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Federal and regional Ombudsmen</li> <li>- All other stakeholders relevant for providing input to the study</li> </ul>
<b>Activity 7.2</b>	Awareness-raising seminars with business community, federal and regional ombudsmen staff, legal professionals, etc. to disseminate results of ECtHR case law analysis	<p><b>Costs:</b> STC fees, STC per diems, per diems for participants to cover subsistence/accommodation, international and domestic travel, event organization cost, translation/interpretation, publication and dissemination cost</p> <p><b>Inputs:</b> STC consulting/drafting, meetings and Project team, study visit</p>			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Federal and regional Ombudsmen</li> <li>- Business associations</li> <li>- Legal associations</li> </ul>