

Strasbourg, 25 November 2014

Greco (2014) 14E

**65<sup>th</sup> GRECO Plenary Meeting**  
(Strasbourg, 6-10 October 2014)

**SUMMARY REPORT**

## **I. Opening of the meeting**

1. The 65<sup>th</sup> Plenary Meeting was chaired by Marin MRČELA, President of GRECO (Croatia) who opened the meeting by welcoming all participants, referring in particular to newly nominated representatives. Respects were paid to Mr Jean ALEGRE, former Head of Delegation of France, recently deceased. His commitment and active contribution to GRECO's work, along with his affability had all been highly appreciated within the group.
2. The list of participants appears in Appendix I.

## **II. Adoption of the Agenda**

When examining the most recent situation report submitted by the Slovak Republic it had become apparent that, due to the progress made, the Third Round compliance procedure in respect of that country was likely to be terminated at the present meeting. The interim compliance report originally foreseen on the draft agenda had therefore been drawn up as an addendum to the compliance report.

3. The agenda was adopted as it appears in Appendix II.

## **III. Information Items**

4. Delegations were asked to refer, in particular, to the information presented in the report of the 69<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the Bureau (document Greco (2014) E). The Bureau had met in Berne at the invitation of the Swiss authorities who were thanked warmly by the President for that initiative.

### *The President*

5. Malta had ratified the Additional Protocol to the Criminal Law Convention on Corruption (ETS 191) on 1 July 2014 and the same treaty had entered into force in respect of Poland on 1 August 2014.
6. The President had presented GRECO's activities at an event organised by The Classroom Law Project, an NGO on civic education (Portland, USA – 22 July 2014) and had spoken at the Conference on "The fight against corruption: international standards and national experiences" organised in the framework of Azerbaijan's Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe (Baku, 30 June – 1 July 2014).
7. An informal meeting of the presidents of the monitoring mechanisms of the Council of Europe would be held by the Secretary General in December.
8. Extensive discussions had been held in the Bureau on potential themes for GRECO's Fifth Evaluation Round. The Bureau had again placed emphasis on its belief that the theme chosen should be of political relevance. The report of Bureau 69 outlines the four options that had stood out. The Secretariat had been instructed to develop on the possible scope of those options and the challenges they might give rise to prior to further deliberations by Bureau 70 (October 2014).
9. The Bureau had been of the opinion that a closing conference should be organised at the end of the Fourth Evaluation Round.
10. The Bureau also wished to see GRECO's work on the gender dimensions of corruption – one of the first initiatives by a Council of Europe body in pursuance of the Organisation's gender mainstreaming policy – developed further, by holding a roundtable or conference as a follow-up to the ground breaking 2013 Prague Conference.

***Gender Equality Rapporteur – Helena Lišuchová (Czech Republic)***

11. A hearing organised jointly with the Committees on Equality and Non-Discrimination and on Rules of Procedure, Immunities and Institutional Affairs of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (PACE) on the “Gender Dimensions of Corruption” had been held on 1 October 2014, within the framework of PACE’s Anti-Corruption Platform. On that occasion, members of PACE had exchanged views with Gabriella BATTAINI-DRAGONI, Deputy Secretary General of the Council of Europe, Matthias KOPETZKY, member of the Board of the Institute of Internal Audit and Leader of the Anti-Fraud Study Group of Austria and GRECO’s Gender Equality Rapporteur. The aim was to illustrate with concrete examples why and how the integration of a gender perspective adds value to the prevention and fight against corruption. In a side meeting, the Deputy Secretary General had commended GRECO for its substantial contribution to the implementation of the Organisation’s Gender Equality Strategy and expressed her full support and her interest in participating in any further activities organised by GRECO on that topic. Ms LIŠUCHOVÁ would continue, on behalf of GRECO, to pursue cooperation with the Parliamentary Assembly – where the drawing up of a report and resolution was being considered – and the other organisations, principally UN bodies, that had shown an interest.

***Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (PACE) – Mr Robert NEIL, MP (United Kingdom)***

12. Awareness among PACE members had noticeably increased in recent times and GRECO reports were frequently quoted from during the Assembly’s debates. The Executive Secretary added that consideration of how the results of GRECO’s monitoring work might be made better known to national delegations sitting in the Assembly was ongoing – the hope being that they might choose to become more involved in their national parliaments in working towards implementation of GRECO’s recommendations.

***The Executive Secretary***

13. Delegations had received the Statutory Declaration by the Secretary General of the Council of Europe which presents his strategic vision for his second mandate. Corruption was among the main challenges referred to. Within the first of his seven imperatives for increased relevance and efficiency of the Organisation, figured the issue of amending the operational practices of monitoring mechanisms to ensure more effective and quicker responses to emergency situations and urgent requests from member States – the text presented to the plenary for approval under Item 12 of the agenda of the present meeting had been prepared with that in mind.

14. Copies had been provided of a letter to the Executive Secretary from the Chairman of the Democratic Party of Albania (opposition party) raising concerns about developments affecting the High Inspectorate for the Declaration and Audit of Assets (HIDAA) and of the response by the Head of Albania’s delegation in GRECO to the Executive Secretary who had been asked by the Bureau to ask the authorities of Albania to explain their position with regard to that matter. Further information was provided at the present meeting by the Head of Delegation of Albania under item 4 of the agenda.

15. The Bureau had proposed that the Deputy Secretary General be invited to contribute an article to GRECO’s next General Activity Report (2014) on the manipulation of sports results – notably in connection with the Council of Europe Convention on the Manipulation of Sports Competitions (CETS no. 215) which had been opened for signature in September 2014.

16. Copies were available: the Report of the Conference on Strengthening the Capacity of Parliamentarians, Judges and Prosecutors to Prevent Corruption in their own Ranks – Emerging trends from two years of GRECO Round IV Evaluations, that had been jointly organised by the Federal Ministry of Justice of Austria, the International Anti-Corruption Academy (IACA) and GRECO on 10-11 April 2014

(Laxenburg, Austria) and a publication by the International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance (International IDEA) entitled “Political Finance Regulations around the World: An Overview of the International IDEA Database”.

#### **IV. Fourth Evaluation Round**

Prevention of corruption in respect of members of parliament, judges and prosecutors

##### *Evaluation procedures*

17. The procedure for the detailed examination by the plenary of draft evaluation reports consists in paragraphs previously flagged by the Evaluation Team, the authorities or the Secretariat being read in full by the President and discussed by the experts from the delegations of all GRECO member States that make up the plenary, with the participation of the Evaluation Team that carried out the on-site visit and contributed to the drawing up of the draft report. Delegations may also take the floor to open a discussion on any other section. A second reading of revisions made in light of the first is carried out by the plenary before formal adoption of the text.

18. GRECO adopted Fourth Round Evaluation Reports – including formal recommendations – on **Azerbaijan** (Greco Eval IV Rep (2014) 2E – publication pending), **Germany** (Greco Eval IV Rep (2014) 1E – publication pending) and **Ireland** (Greco Eval IV Rep (2014) 3E – published on 21 November 2014). The deadline of 30 April 2016 was set for the submission of Situation Reports on measures taken to implement the recommendations in the three cases.

##### *Evaluators and Evaluation Teams*

19. GRECO took note of the President’s request to delegations to review the pool of evaluators constituted by member States at the opening of the Fourth Evaluation. It was important to ensure that the list is up-to-date, that the profiles correspond to the needs of the round and that the evaluators are available and aware of the tasks that will be assigned to them if they are selected to take part in an evaluation.

20. GRECO approved the composition of the evaluation teams responsible for the Fourth Round evaluations of Bosnia and Herzegovina, Cyprus, the Czech Republic, the Republic of Moldova, Romania and Turkey (Greco Eval IV (2014) 7 Rev).

##### *Rapporteurs*

21. GRECO approved the list of rapporteur countries for the Fourth Round compliance procedures regarding Finland, Iceland, Luxembourg and the Netherlands (Greco Eval IV (2014) 6 – Eng. Only).

#### **V. Third Evaluation Round**

Theme I “Incriminations” / Theme II “Transparency of party funding”

22. In a set of compliance reports, and *interim* compliance reports – in cases where Rule 32 has been applied – examined by the plenary, GRECO pronounced itself on the level of compliance of member States with its recommendations. A Situation Report submitted by the authorities of a member State provides the basis for the assessments made. Rapporteurs designated by other member States are associated with the preparation of the draft reports tabled.

##### *Compliance procedures*

23. GRECO adopted the 2<sup>nd</sup> Third Round Compliance Report on **Azerbaijan** (Greco RC-III (2014) 13E – publication pending), the 2<sup>nd</sup> Third Round Compliance Report on **Bulgaria** (Greco RC-III (2014) 12E –

published on 17 November 2014) and an Addendum to the 2<sup>nd</sup> Third Round Compliance Report on **Spain** (Greco RC-III (2014) 7E – publication pending). In accordance with Rule 31, paragraph 9 of the Rules of Procedure, GRECO requested that the Heads of delegation of the three countries submit additional information regarding further measures to implement GRECO's recommendations by 31 July 2015 at the latest.

24. Third Round compliance procedures were terminated with the adoption of the following reports: the 2<sup>nd</sup> Compliance Report on **Serbia** (Greco RC-III (2014) 15E – published on 16 October 2014), an Addendum to the 2<sup>nd</sup> Compliance Report on **Poland** (Greco RC-III (2014) 16E – publication pending) and an Addendum to the 2<sup>nd</sup> Compliance Report on the **Slovak Republic** (Greco RC-III (2014) 23E – published on 16 October 2014).

#### ***Rule 32 procedures – non-compliance***

25. In its 3<sup>rd</sup> *Interim* Third Round Compliance Report on **Denmark** (Greco RC-III (2014) 18E – published on 10 November 2014) and *Interim* Third Round Compliance Report on **Malta** (Greco RC-III (2014) 21E – publication pending) GRECO concluded that the level of compliance with its recommendations was still “globally unsatisfactory” in the meaning of Rule 31, paragraph 8.3 of the Rules of Procedure. The application of Rule 32 was therefore maintained and, pursuant to paragraph 2(i) of that rule, both member States were requested to provide a report on progress in implementing the pending recommendations by 31 July 2015.

26. Moreover, in the case of **Denmark**, the plenary considered requesting that the authorities receive a high-level mission (paragraph 2(iii) of Rule 32) in order to discuss on site, with all stakeholders, ways to expedite the legislative and policy changes highlighted in the 3<sup>rd</sup> *interim* report. Finally, it was agreed to postpone that decision until the examination of the progress report to be submitted by Denmark by 31 July 2015.

27. In the case of **Malta**, GRECO decided, pursuant to paragraph 2 (ii) a) of Rule 32, that a letter would be sent by the President to the Head of the Delegation – with a copy to the President of the Statutory Committee – underlining the need to take determined action in the country with a view to achieving tangible progress as soon as possible.

28. With the adoption of 3<sup>rd</sup> *Interim* Third Round Compliance Reports on **Belgium** (Greco RC-III (2014) 20E – publication pending) and **Germany** (GREO RC-III (2014) 19E – publication pending) GRECO discontinued the application of Rule 32 in both cases. In accordance with Rule 31, paragraph 8.2, the Heads of Delegation concerned were asked to submit reports on progress in implementing pending recommendations by 31 July 2015.

29. The President made a point of highlighting the significant implementation results achieved in the Third Round compliance procedures by Belgium, Germany, Poland, Serbia and the Slovak Republic, as well as the encouraging prospects of progress reported on, notably in the case of Denmark.

#### **VI. Publication, translation and availability of adopted reports ([www.coe.int/greco](http://www.coe.int/greco))**

30. Following previous decisions aimed at greater visibility of GRECO's work, members were reminded of the action to be taken when publishing an adopted report.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> GRECO asks its members to:

- agree a same-day publication date with the Secretariat
- clearly mark both the date of adoption and date of publication on the cover page
- make the national language version available and easily accessible on a domestic website
- notify the Secretariat of the location of the report by communicating the internet link to it
- include a link on the domestic website to the official language versions on GRECO's website.

31. It was noted that publication of the following reports was still outstanding: the Fourth Round Evaluation Report on Slovakia (adopted in October 2013) – this report was subsequently made public on 6 November 2014; the Third Round Compliance Report on Austria (adopted in March 2014), the Joint First and Second Round Evaluation Report on Belarus<sup>2</sup> (adopted in June 2012) and the Joint First and Second Round Compliance Report on Belarus (adopted in June 2014). In the case of Belarus – GRECO’s most recent member State – GRECO again urged the authorities to adhere to the long-standing practices of the group by lifting the confidentiality of those first two reports.

## **VII. Exchange of views with the Chair of the OECD Working Group on Bribery in International Business Transactions (WGB)**

32. The plenary held an exchange of views with Drago KOS, who had chaired GRECO between January 2003 and December 2011 and currently chaired the OECD WGB. From the unique perspective of his experience in both bodies, he shared with the plenary his views on their respective strengths, on features that might serve each as inspiration, future challenges and opportunities for cooperation.

33. The work of the WGB is delimited by the scope of one treaty, the OECD Convention on combating bribery of foreign public officials in international business transactions; it incriminates the active side (the giving) of bribes to foreign public officials. Its focus is therefore highly specific. It has two features that are missing from other international anti-corruption treaties covering the private sector: the principle of double jeopardy (offenders can be prosecuted in different jurisdictions), and its Article 5 on enforcement which states that the investigation and prosecution of the bribery of foreign public officials in international business transactions “shall not be influenced by considerations of national economic interest, the potential effect upon relations with another State or the identity of the natural or legal persons involved”. A 2009 Recommendation for further combating bribery of foreign public officials in international business transactions, supplements the convention and lays down in its annexes good practice guidance on implementing specific articles and such guidance on internal controls, ethics and compliance that define for businesses the characteristics of an effective compliance system.

34. The WGB clearly benefitted from significant political backing and from the attention, and therefore visibility, it gets from Transparency International. Moreover, in pursuance of the OECD’s aim to ensure a level playing field across major economies worldwide, it maintained strong exchanges with the G20 due to the fact that a number of major economies present in the G20 were still resistant to adhering to the OECD mechanism. Given GRECO’s broad thematic mandate, its very broad membership and geographic proximity of all members were to his mind clear advantages.

35. Mr KOS agreed to share with GRECO the results of the WGB’s current reflection process on the design of its Phase IV evaluation round. In the context of that work, he was hoping that the WGB would consider streamlining its highly complex system of reporting obligations – GRECO was fortunate to have clearer and easier to manage procedural rules governing its compliance procedures.

36. The margin for overlap – given the capital provided by the standard-setting work of the Council of Europe in a much broader range of areas from which GRECO can draw in its work – and, consequently, opportunities for joint action had always been and would continue to be extremely limited. Where pertinent, references to the findings of the WGB had been made in GRECO’s evaluation reports and both bodies followed each other’s work with interest. Opportunities for future exchanges of views would certainly be provided for.

---

<sup>2</sup> In February 2014, GRECO exceptionally published a summary of the Joint First and Second Round Evaluation Report on Belarus in an effort to pave the way for publication of the full report which can only happen with the authorisation of the national authorities:  
[http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/greco/news/News\(20140203\)Eval1&2Belarus\\_en.asp](http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/greco/news/News(20140203)Eval1&2Belarus_en.asp)

## **VIII. Follow-up to the report by the Secretary General of the Council of Europe on the State of democracy, human rights and the Rule of Law in Europe**

37. The Secretary General's report – published in April 2014 – had called on monitoring bodies to amend their operational practices to allow the Council of Europe to respond faster and more effectively to emergency situations and urgent requests from member States. The Secretary General would discuss the follow-up given to that call with the Presidents of Council of Europe monitoring bodies in December and then report to the May 2015 (Ministerial) Session of the Committee of Ministers.

38. GRECO dealt with this matter by laying down a framework (conditions and responsibilities) for conducting an ad hoc focused dialogue with a member State if controversial developments or otherwise urgent issues arise that are related to its monitoring mandate and the international anti-corruption standards under its purview (document Greco 2014) 10E Final).

39. GRECO nevertheless remarked that, while recognising the occasional need for rapid action in connection with corruption-related emergency situations and urgent requests by member States, it has a strong preference for dealing with such situations in the context of the established peer review procedures that have a clear regulatory basis and entail multiple layers of result validation as well as a high level of process ownership. In its opinion, hasty reactions to emerging issues will often not be based on a thorough analysis of the situation and are not always likely to achieve lasting results, besides being onerous in terms of financial and staff resources.

## **IX. Topical anti-corruption developments/events in member States**

40. A summary of the information provided by delegations under this item (Item 4) can be found in the Addendum to this report (Greco (2014) 14E Addendum).

## **X. Review of Council of Europe Conventions – response to the CDPC**

41. GRECO took note of the response sent on its behalf by the Bureau to a request from the Chair of the European Committee on Crime Problems (CDPC) for feedback on whether there was a need for a review of the Criminal Law Convention on Corruption and its Additional Protocol (ETS Nos. 173 and 191). That initiative stemmed from a decision by the Ministers' Deputies (1168<sup>th</sup> meeting – 10 April 2013).

42. In its response (document Greco 2014) 11E revised) GRECO invites the CDPC to take note of a number of observations and concludes that its monitoring work has not revealed any particular shortcomings in both texts that might need to be addressed at present nor any need for "promotional" action as both treaties have been ratified by a large majority of Council of Europe member States. GRECO does, however, think that it would be highly desirable if the CDPC would conduct a feasibility study on the advisability of amending the Criminal Law Convention, or complementing it with an Additional Protocol with a view to covering the non-profit sector (e.g. private associations – including those operating at international level, foundations, labour unions, charities, churches involved in service delivery to the community, etc.) which is a sector where corruption risks and the applicable legal framework have not received much attention so far.

## **XI. Miscellaneous**

43. With reference to information provided by the Head of the Delegation of Latvia in GRECO under Item 4, GRECO expressed concern regarding recent developments in Latvia and the possible dismantling of the Corruption Prevention and Combating Bureau (KNAB). It reiterated the position it has consistently expressed in its reports on Latvia as to the need to ensure that the KNAB works free of political interference so that it can perform its functions in an independent and impartial manner. The

Latvian Delegation was asked to provide a further update on this matter at the next plenary meeting (GRECO 66, 8-12 December 2014). Moreover, the Secretariat was asked to bring this information to the attention of the Secretary General of the Council of Europe and the plenary hoped that it would receive feedback on any initiative taken.

44. Several delegations expressed the wish to hold broader discussions regarding the preparation of GRECO's Fifth Evaluation Round. Some of the speakers referred to the need to also consider methodological/procedural issues in connection with any decision on the precise thematic scope of the round. As a consequence of those interventions there was agreement that a general brainstorming should be organised during GRECO 66.

## **XII. Adoption of decisions**

45. The decisions of the 65<sup>th</sup> Plenary Meeting were adopted as they appear in document Greco (2014) 13E.

## **XIII. Forthcoming meetings**

46. The Bureau would hold its 70<sup>th</sup> meeting in Strasbourg on 30 October 2014. GRECO's 66<sup>th</sup> Plenary Meeting would be held in Strasbourg on 8-12 December 2014. Unfortunately, those dates clash with the December meeting of the OECD Working Group on Bribery – the Executive Secretary explained that, given the constraints placed on hotel and meeting room availability during sessions of the European Parliament and the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, taking account of the meeting calendars of other organisations is not always an option available to GRECO's secretariat.



**APPENDIX I**  
**LIST OF PARTICIPANTS / LISTE DES PARTICIPANTS**

**ALBANIA / ALBANIE**

Ms Edlira NASI

Inspector/Coordinator, Unit for Internal Administrative Control and Anti-Corruption, General Directorate of Legal Issues, Monitoring of Programmes and Anti-corruption, Prime Minister's Office

Ms Ardiana HOBDAI

Permanent Representative of Albania to the Council of Europe

**ANDORRA / ANDORRE**

Ms Clàudia CORNELLA DURANY (Head of delegation)

Head of International Relations, Ministry of Finance, GOVERN D'ANDORRA

**ARMENIA / ARMENIE**

Ms Anna MARGARYAN

Chair of Criminal Law and Criminology, Yerevan State University

**AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE**

Mr Christian MANQUET (Head of delegation)

**Vice-President of GRECO / Vice-président du GRECO**

Head of Department, Directorate for Penal Legislation, Ministry of Justice

Ms Gertraud EPPICH (Evaluator – Germany)

Landesgericht Wiener Neustadt

**AZERBAIJAN / AZERBAIDJAN**

Mr Vusal HUSEYNOV (Head of delegation)

Senior Advisor, Law Enforcement Coordination Department, Administration of the President of the Republic, Secretary of the Commission for Combating Corruption

Mr Kamran ALIYEV

Deputy Prosecutor General, Director, Anti-Corruption Directorate, General Prosecutor's Office

Mr Elnur MUSAYEV

Senior Prosecutor, Anticorruption Department, General Prosecutor's Office

Mr Fuad MURADOV

Member of Parliament

Mr Javid HUSEYNOV

Head of Apparatus of the Judicial Legal Council

**BELARUS**

Mr Sergey AZEMSHA

Public Prosecutor of Gomel Region

**BELGIUM / BELGIQUE**

M. Frederik DECRUYENAERE (Chef de délégation)

Attaché au Service des Infractions et Procédures Particulières, Service Public Fédéral Justice (SPF Justice)

M. Guido HOSTYN

Premier conseiller de direction - Secrétaire de la Commission de contrôle des dépenses électorales, Sénat

M. Paul MULS

Premier conseiller de direction - Secrétaire de la commission de contrôle des dépenses électorales, Chambre des représentants

**BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE-HERZEGOVINE**

Mr Vjekoslav VUKOVIC (Head of delegation)

Assistant Minister, Sector for Fight against Terrorism, Organised Crime and Drugs Abuse, Ministry of Security

**BULGARIA / BULGARIE**

Mr Georgi RUPCHEV (Head of delegation + evaluator - Azerbaijan)  
Head of Criminal Law Division, Directorate of International Cooperation and European Affairs, Ministry of Justice

**CROATIA / CROATIE**

Mr Marin MRČELA  
**President of GRECO / Président du GRECO**  
Justice at the Supreme Court

Mr Dražen JELENIĆ (Head of delegation + evaluator - Azerbaijan)  
Deputy State Attorney General

Mr Djuro SESSA (evaluator – Germany)  
Associate Justice at the Supreme Court

**CYPRUS / CHYPRE**

Mr Philippos KOMODROMOS (Head of delegation)  
Counsel of the Republic, Office of the Attorney General of Cyprus

**CZECH REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE TCHEQUE**

Ms Helena LIŠUCHOVÁ (Head of delegation + evaluator - Azerbaijan)  
Head of the International Cooperation Department, Ministry of Justice

Mr Václav MLYNÁŘÍK  
Security Expert, Security Policy Department, Ministry of the Interior

**DENMARK / DANEMARK**

Ms Marie TULLIN (Head of delegation)  
Senior Prosecutor, State Prosecutor for Serious Economic and International Crime

**ESTONIA / ESTONIE**

Mr Urvo KLOPETS  
Advisor, Analysis Division, Criminal Policy Department, Ministry of Justice

Ms Kätlin-Chris KRUUSMAA  
Advisor, Analysis Division, Criminal Policy Department, Ministry of Justice

**FINLAND / FINLANDE**

Mr Mika AALTO (Head of delegation)  
Ministerial Adviser, Ministry of Justice, Department of Criminal Policy

**FRANCE**

M. François BADIE  
Chef du Service Central de Prévention de la Corruption (SCPC), Ministère de la Justice

M. Yves Marie DOUBLET (évaluateur – Allemagne)  
Directeur adjoint, Assemblée Nationale, Service des affaires juridiques, Division contrôle et études juridiques, Division de la Réglementation, du Contrôle et des Marchés

**GEORGIA / GEORGIE**

Ms Rusudan MIKHELIDZE  
Director of Analytical Department, Secretariat of the Anti-Corruption Council, Ministry of Justice

Ms Natalia BARATASHVILI  
Coordinator of Anti-Corruption Issues, Analytical Department, Secretariat of the Anti-Corruption Council, Ministry of Justice

**GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE**

Mr Markus BUSCH (Head of delegation)  
Head of Division, Economic, Computer, Corruption-related and Environmental Crime, Federal Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection

Mr Stefan SINNER  
Head of Division PM1, Remuneration of Parliamentarians, Administration of the *Bundestag*

Mr Frank RAUE  
Deputy Head of Division PM1, Remuneration of Members, Administration of the *Bundestag*

Ms Sabine HILGENDORF-SCHMIDT  
Head of Division, Law concerning Judges, Remuneration of Judges, Training, Federal Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection

Mr Ralf ROTHER  
Attorney General of the Land Berlin

Mr Michael WISSER  
Director General Parliamentary Affairs and Spokesman, German Bundesrat

Ms Barbara Agnes REEVES and Mr Christopher James YIANNI  
Interpreters

**GREECE / GRECE**

Ms Panagiota VATIKALOU  
Investigative Judge, Court of First Instance of Chania

**HUNGARY / HONGRIE**

Ms Nóra BAUS  
Anti-corruption officer, Department for European Cooperation, Ministry of the Interior

**ICELAND / ISLANDE**

**Apologised / excusée**

**IRELAND / IRLANDE**

Mr Andrew MUNRO (Head of delegation)  
Principal Officer, Criminal Law Reform Division, Department of Justice and Equality

Ms Claire MARTINEZ  
Government Reform Unit, Department of Public Expenditure and Reform

Mr Martin SWITZER  
Justice Attaché, Deputy to the Permanent Representative of Ireland to the Council of Europe

Mr Jim O'KEEFFE (evaluator – Azerbaijan)  
Member of Standards in Public Office Commission

Ms Evelyn O'CONNOR  
Government Reform Unit, Department of Public Expenditure and Reform

Mr Justice Donal O'DONNELL  
Judge of the Supreme Court

Mr Conan MCKENNA  
Assistant Secretary General, Department of Justice and Equality

Mr Francis CASSIDY  
Office of the Director of Public Prosecutions

Mr Brian MCKEVITT  
Assistant Principal, Standards in Public Office Commission

**ITALY / ITALIE**

Ms Vania MAFFEO  
Professor of Law, University of Naples “Federico II”

**LATVIA / LETTONIE**

Mr Jaroslavs STRELČENOKS (Head of delegation)  
Director, Corruption Prevention and Combating Bureau

**LIECHTENSTEIN**

Mr Patrick RITTER (Chef de délégation)  
Deputy Director, Office for Foreign Affairs

**LITHUANIA / LITUANIE**

Mr Paulius GRICIUNAS (Head of delegation)  
Vice Minister, Ministry of Justice

**LUXEMBOURG**

Mme Doris WOLTZ (Chef de délégation)  
Procureur d'Etat adjoint, Tribunal d'Arrondissement de Luxembourg

**MALTA / MALTE**

Mr Peter GRECH  
Attorney General

Ms Victoria BUTTIGIEG  
Assistant Attorney General, Office of the Attorney General

Mr Antoine DALLI (evaluator – Ireland)  
Internal Audit and Investigations Department (IAID), Cabinet Office, Office of the Prime Minister

**REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA / REPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA**

Mme Cornelia VICLEANSCHI (Chef de délégation)  
Procureur, Chef de la Section Générale, Bureau du Procureur Général

**MONACO**

M. Jean-Marc GUALANDI  
Conseiller Technique, Service d'Information et de Contrôle sur les Circuits Financiers (SICCFIN), Département des Finances et de l'Economie

**MONTENEGRO**

Ms Vesna RATKOVIC (Head of delegation)  
Director, Directorate for Anti-Corruption Initiative

**NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS**

Mr Don O'FLOINN (Head of delegation)  
Senior Policy Advisor, Ministry of Security and Justice, Law Enforcement Department

Mr Richard HAGEDOORN  
Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations

Ms Catharina Anna (Kitty) NOOY (evaluator – Ireland)  
Chief District Prosecutor, National Integrity Programme Manager, Public Prosecution Service

**NORWAY / NORVEGE**

Mr Jens-Oscar NERGARD  
Senior Adviser, Ministry of Local Government and Modernisation

**POLAND / POLOGNE**

Ms Alicja KLAMCZYNSKA  
Chief specialist, European Criminal Law Division, Criminal Law Department, Ministry of Justice

Mr Adrian GRYCUK (evaluator – Poland)  
Senior Economic Policy Analyst, Bureau of Research, Chancellery of the Sejm (Lower Chamber of the Parliament), Social, Economic & EU Policies Division

**PORTUGAL**

Mr Daniel MARINHO PIRES  
Legal Adviser, Directorate General for Justice Policy, International Affairs Department, Ministry of Justice

**ROMANIA / ROUMANIE**

Mr Andrei FURDUI  
Legal Advisor, National Office for Crime Prevention and Asset Recovery, Ministry of Justice

Ms Oana Andrea SCHIMIDT HAINEALA  
Prosecutor, Member of the Superior Council of Magistracy

**RUSSIAN FEDERATION / FEDERATION DE RUSSIE**

Mr Aleksandr BUKSMAN (Head of delegation)  
First Deputy Prosecutor General, Prosecutor General's Office

Mr Aslan YUSUFOV

Deputy Head of Directorate, Head of Section of supervision over implementation of anti-corruption legislation  
Prosecutor General's Office

Mr Pavel VOLCHIKHIN

Deputy to the Permanent Representative of the Russian Federation to the Council of Europe

**SAN MARINO / SAINT MARIN**

Mr Eros GASPERONI (Head of delegation)  
First Secretary, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Mr Matteo FORCELLINI

Trainee, Permanent Representation of San Marino to the Council of Europe

**SERBIA / SERBIE**

Mr Jovan COSIC  
Head of Department for Normative Affairs, Ministry of Justice

Mr Vladan JOKSIMOVIC

Deputy Director of Anti-Corruption Agency

**SLOVAK REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE**

Ms Alexandra KAPIŠOVSKÁ  
Legal Adviser, Ministry of Justice

Ms Eva CHMELOVA

Ministry of the Interior

**SLOVENIA / SLOVENIE**

Mr Matjaž MEŠNJAK  
Adviser, Public Integrity and Prevention, Commission for the Prevention of Corruption

Ms Katja KOLMAN

Trainee, Permanent Representation of Slovenia to the Council of Europe

**SPAIN / ESPAGNE**

Mr Rafael VAILLO RAMOS  
Technical Adviser, DG for International Cooperation, Ministry of Justice

**SWEDEN / SUEDE**

Mr Walo VON GREYERZ  
Legal Adviser, Ministry of Justice, Division for Criminal Law

**SWITZERLAND / SUISSE**

M. Ernst GNAEGI (Chef de délégation)  
Chef de l'unité du droit pénal international, Office fédéral de la Justice

M. Jean-Christophe GEISER (membre de la délégation + évaluateur - Allemagne)  
Conseiller scientifique, Office fédéral de la justice

**“THE FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA” / « L'EX-RÉPUBLIQUE YOUGOSLAVE DE MACÉDOINE »**

Ms Aneta ARNAUDOVSKA (Head of delegation)  
Judge, Director of the Academy for Judges and Public Prosecutors

**TURKEY / TURQUIE**

Mr Harun MERT (Head of delegation)  
Judge, Deputy General Director, General Directorate of International Law and Foreign Relations, Ministry of Justice

**UKRAINE**

Ms Nataliya KYRYCHENKO  
Office of the President

**UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI**

Mr David MEYER (Head of delegation)  
Head of International Relations, Law Rights and International Division, Ministry of Justice

Ms Fiona SALEM

Senior Adviser, International Relations, Law, Rights and International Justice Policy Group, Ministry of Justice

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA / ETATS-UNIS D'AMERIQUE**

Ms Jane LEY  
Senior Anticorruption Advisor, International Narcotics and Law Enforcement Bureau, U.S Department of State

Mr Michael OLMSTED

Senior Counsel for the European Union, U.S. Mission to the European Union

Mr Noel L. HILLMAN (evaluator – Ireland)

US District Court Judge, District of New Jersey

**EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON CRIME PROBLEMS (CDPC) / COMITE EUROPEEN POUR LES PROBLEMES CRIMINELS (CDPC)**

Ms Helena LIŠUCHOVÁ (Head of delegation)  
Head of International Cooperation Department, Ministry of Justice

**EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON LEGAL CO-OPERATION (CDCJ) / COMITE EUROPEEN DE COOPERATION JURIDIQUE (CDCJ)**  
**Apologised / excusé**

**PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE /  
ASSEMBLEE PARLEMENTAIRE DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

Mr Robert NEILL (United Kingdom)  
Member of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights

**COUNCIL OF EUROPE DEVELOPMENT BANK / BANQUE DE DEVELOPPEMENT DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**  
**Apologised / excusée**

**OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS**

**UNITED NATIONS – UNITED NATIONS OFFICE ON DRUGS AND CRIME (UNODC) /  
NATIONS UNIES – OFFICE DES NATIONS UNIES CONTRE LA DROGUE ET LE CRIME (ONU DC)**  
**Apologised / excusées**

**ORGANISATION FOR ECONOMIC CO-OPERATION AND DEVELOPMENT (OECD) /  
ORGANISATION DE COOPERATION ET DE DEVELOPPEMENT ECONOMIQUES (OCDE)**  
**Apologised / excusée**

**INTERNATIONAL ANTI-CORRUPTION ACADEMY /  
L'ACADEMIE INTERNATIONALE DE LUTTE CONTRE LA CORRUPTION (IACA)**  
**Apologised / excusée**

**ORGANIZATION OF AMERICAN STATES (OAS) / ORGANISATION DES ETATS AMERICAINS (OEA)**  
**Apologised / excusée**

**GRECO EVALUATION TEAMS**  
**Fourth Round Evaluation report on Germany /**  
**Rapport d'Evaluation du Quatrième Cycle sur l'Allemagne**

M. Yves Marie DOUBLET

Directeur adjoint, Assemblée Nationale, Service des affaires juridiques, Division contrôle et études juridiques, Division de la Réglementation, du Contrôle et des Marchés

Ms Gertraud EPPICH

Landesgericht Wiener Neustadt

M. Jean-Christophe GEISER

Conseiller scientifique, Office fédéral de la justice

Mr Djuro SESSA

Associate Justice at the Supreme Court

**Fourth Round Evaluation report on Azerbaijan /  
Rapport d'Évaluation du Quatrième Cycle sur l'Azerbaïdjan**

Mr Dražen JELENIĆ  
Deputy State Attorney General

Mr Jim O'KEEFFE  
Former Member of Parliament and State Minister

Ms Helena LIŠUCHOVÁ  
Head of the International Cooperation Department, Ministry of Justice

Mr Georgi RUPCHEV  
Head of Criminal Law Division, Directorate of International Cooperation and European Affairs, Ministry of Justice

**Fourth Round Evaluation report on Ireland /  
Rapport d'Évaluation du Quatrième Cycle sur l'Irlande**

Mr Antoine DALLI  
Internal Audit and Investigations Department (IAID) , Cabinet Office, Office of the Prime Minister

Mr Adrian GRZYCUK  
Senior Economic Policy Analyst, Bureau of Research, Chancellery of the Sejm (Lower Chamber of the Parliament), Social, Economic & EU Policies Division

Mr Noel L. HILLMAN  
US District Court Judge, District of New Jersey, Mitchell H. Cohen Courthouse, One John F. Gerry Plaza

Ms Catharina Anna (Kitty) NOOY  
Chief District Prosecutor, National Integrity Programme Manager, Public Prosecution Service

**RAPPORTEURS**

**Third Round – Second Compliance Reports /  
Troisième Cycle – Deuxièmes Rapports de Conformité**

**Azerbaijan / Azerbaïdjan**

Mr Patrick RITTER (Head of delegation) - Liechtenstein  
Mr Rafael VAILLO RAMOS - Spain / Espagne

**Bulgaria / Bulgarie**

Ms Olena TYSHCHENKO - Ukraine  
Mr Walo VON GERYERTZ - Sweden / Suède

**Serbia / Serbie**

Mr Markus BUSCH - Germany / *Allemagne* (Theme I only / *uniquement Thème I*)

**Third Round – Addenda to Compliance Reports /  
Troisième Cycle – Addenda aux rapports de conformité**

**Poland / Pologne**

Mr Peter GRECH - Malta / *Malte*  
Mr Vusal HUSEYNOV - Azerbaijan / *Azerbaïdjan*

**Spain / Espagne**

Mr Urvo KLOPETS - Estonia / *Estonie*  
Mrs Vania MAFFEO - Italy / *Italie*

**Third Round - Interim Compliance Reports /  
Troisième Cycle - Rapports de conformité intérimaires**

**Belgium / Belgique**

Ms Clàudia CORNELLA DURANY - Andorra / *Andorre*  
Ms Doris WOLTZ - Luxembourg

**Denmark / Danemark**

Ms Edlira NASI – Albania / *Albanie*  
Mr Don O'FLOINN - Netherlands / *Pays-Bas*

**Germany / Allemagne**

Mr Aslan YUSUFOV - Russian Federation / *Fédération de Russie*  
Mr Christian MANQUET - Austria / *Autriche*

**Malta / Malte**

Mr Philippos KOMODROMOS - Cyprus / Chypre

Ms Alexandra KAPISOVSKA - Slovak Republic / République slovaque

**Slovak Republic / République slovaque**

Mr Christian MANQUET - Austria / Autriche

Mr Jaroslavs STRELCEK - Latvia / Lettonie

**EXCHANGE OF VIEWS / ECHANGE DE VUES**

Mr Drago KOS, Chair of the OECD Working Group on Bribery / Président du Groupe de travail de l'OCDE sur la corruption

**COUNCIL OF EUROPE SECRETARIAT / SECRETARIAT DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

Mr Wolfgang RAU, Executive Secretary of GRECO / Secrétaire Exécutif du GRECO

Ms Elspeth REILLY, Personal Assistant to the Executive Secretary / Assistante Particulière du Secrétaire Exécutif

**Administrative Officers / Administrateurs**

M. Björn JANSON

M. Christophe SPECKBACHER

Ms Laura SANZ-LEVIA

Ms Sophie MEUDAL-LEENDERS

Mr Michael JANSSEN

Ms Lioubov SAMOKHINA

**Central Office / Bureau Central**

Ms Penelope PREBENSEN, Administrative Assistant / Assistante Administrative

Mme Laure PINCEMAILLE, Assistant / Assistante

Mme Marie-Rose PREVOST, Assistant / Assistante

**Webmaster**

Ms Simona GHITA, Directorate General 1 - Human Rights and Rule of Law / Direction générale des droits de l'Homme et état de droit

Mme Marie-Rose PREVOST, GRECO

**Interpreters / Interprètes**

Ms Chloé CHENETIER

Ms Isabelle MARCHINI

Ms Julia TANNER



**APPENDIX II**  
**AGENDA**

1.	Opening of the meeting	<b><u>9.30 am</u></b>	Ouverture de la réunion	<b><u>09h30</u></b>
2.	Adoption of the agenda		Adoption de l'ordre du jour	
3.	Information from the President and the Executive Secretary		Communication du Président et du Secrétaire Exécutif	
4.	Topical anti-corruption developments/events in member States		Développements/événements anti-corruption d'actualité dans les Etats membres	
5.	<b>First reading</b> Evaluation Report - Fourth Round <b>Germany</b> ..... <b>Monday</b> <b>Azerbaijan</b> ..... <b>Tuesday</b> <b>Ireland</b> ..... <b>Wednesday</b>		<b>Première lecture</b> Rapport d'Evaluation - Quatrième Cycle <b>Allemagne</b> ..... <b>Lundi</b> <b>Azerbaïdjan</b> ..... <b>Mardi</b> <b>Irlande</b> ..... <b>Mercredi</b>	
6.	<b>Adoption</b> 2 <sup>nd</sup> Compliance Report – Third Round <b>Bulgaria</b> <b>Azerbaijan</b> <b>Serbia</b>		<b>Adoption</b> 2 <sup>e</sup> Rapport de Conformité - Troisième Cycle <b>Bulgarie</b> <b>Azerbaïdjan</b> <b>Serbie</b>	
7.	<b>Adoption</b> Addendum to the 2 <sup>nd</sup> Compliance Report - Third Round <b>Poland</b> <b>Slovak Republic</b> <b>Spain</b>		<b>Adoption</b> Addendum au 2 <sup>e</sup> Rapport de Conformité - Troisième Cycle <b>Pologne</b> <b>République Slovaque</b> <b>Espagne</b>	
8.	<b>Adoption</b> <i>Interim</i> Compliance Report - Third Round <b>Belgium</b> <b>Denmark</b> <b>Germany</b> <b>Malta</b>		<b>Adoption</b> Rapport de Conformité <i>intérimaire</i> - Troisième Cycle <b>Belgique</b> <b>Danemark</b> <b>Allemagne</b> <b>Malte</b>	
9.	<b>Composition of evaluation teams</b> Fourth Round evaluations: Bosnia and Herzegovina, Cyprus, Czech Republic, Republic of Moldova, Romania, Turkey (Bureau 69 proposals for approval)		<b>Composition d'équipes d'évaluation</b> Evaluations du Quatrième Cycle : Bosnie-Herzégovine, Chypre, République Tchèque, République de Moldova, Roumanie, Turquie (propositions du Bureau 69 pour approbation)	
10.	<b>Selection of rapporteur countries</b> Fourth Round Compliance Procedures: Finland, Iceland, Luxembourg, Netherlands (Bureau 69 proposals for approval)		<b>Sélection des pays rapporteurs</b> Procédures de conformité du Quatrième Cycle : Finlande, Islande, Luxembourg, Pays-Bas (propositions du Bureau 69 pour approbation)	
11.	<b>Exchange of views</b> Drago KOS, Chair of the OECD Working Group on Bribery	<b>Thursday, <u>2.30 pm</u></b>	<b>Echange de vues</b> Drago KOS, Président du Groupe de travail de l'OCDE sur la corruption	<b>Jeudi, <u>14h30</u></b>

12. <b>Follow-up to the Report by the Secretary General on the state of democracy, human rights and the rule of law in Europe</b> Ad hoc focused dialogue – framework (conditions and responsibilities) (proposal by Bureau 69 for approval)	<b>Suites à donner au Rapport du Secrétaire général sur la situation de la démocratie, des droits de l'homme et de l'Etat de droit en Europe,</b> Dialogue ciblé ad hoc – cadre (conditions et responsabilités) (proposition du Bureau 69 pour approbation)
13. <b>Second reading and adoption</b> Evaluation Reports - Fourth Round <b>Germany</b> <b>Azerbaijan</b> <b>Ireland</b>	<b>Deuxième lecture et adoption</b> Rapports d'évaluation - Quatrième Cycle <b>Allemagne</b> <b>Azerbaïdjan</b> <b>Irlande</b>
	<b>Friday</b>
	<b>Vendredi</b>
14. Miscellaneous	Divers
15. Adoption of decisions	Adoption des décisions
16. Dates of next meetings	Dates des prochaines réunions
17. Close of the meeting	Fin de la réunion
	<b>Friday, <u>1 pm</u></b>
	<b>Vendredi, <u>13h00</u></b>