



DIRECTORATE GENERAL OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND LEGAL AFFAIRS DIRECTORATE OF MONITORING

Strasbourg, 10 May 2010

Greco (2010) 8E

**46<sup>th</sup> Plenary Meeting of GRECO** (Strasbourg, 22 – 26 March 2010)

**SUMMARY REPORT** 

## I. Opening of the Plenary Meeting

- 1. The 46<sup>th</sup> Plenary Meeting was chaired by Mr Drago KOS (President of GRECO, Slovenia).
- 2. The President opened the meeting by welcoming all representatives, referring in particular to those who had been newly nominated. He warmly greeted Liechtenstein, which had joined as GRECO's 47<sup>th</sup> member State on 1 January 2010.
- 3. The list of participants appears in Appendix I to this report.

## II. Adoption of the agenda

4. The agenda was adopted as it appears in <u>Appendix II</u> to this report.

## III. Information provided by the President, delegations and the Executive Secretary

- 5. The Head of Liechtenstein's delegation to GRECO was invited to take the floor. He expressed his authorities' satisfaction that Liechtenstein would now participate in GRECO's unique evaluation process. The accession of Liechtenstein was further confirmation of the country's commitment to the prevention and fight against corruption through enhanced international cooperation. Having signed the Criminal Law Convention on Corruption (ETS 173) and its Additional Protocol (ETS 191), Liechtenstein intended to complete the ratification process by the end of 2010. Consideration was also being given to signing and ratifying the Civil Law Convention on Corruption (ETS 174). The country would deposit its instrument of ratification of the United Nations Convention against Corruption (UNCAC) in the coming weeks. GRECO was also informed of Liechtenstein's significant support to the work of the International Center for Asset Recovery (ICAR) at the Basel Institute on Governance. The ICAR was an important partner in the implementation of the Stolen Asset Recovery Initiative of the World Bank (STAR Initiative). Liechtenstein's financial centre implemented smooth functioning systems to prevent and sanction money laundering, corruption and terrorist financing and banking secrecy was lifted in criminal cases. Liechtenstein considered multilateralism to be the most efficient and sustainable strategy in the fight against corruption and looked forward to participating actively in GRECO's evaluation and monitoring process.
- 6. The **President** informed the plenary that, on 28 January, he had participated as a speaker in a meeting of the Committee on Economic Affairs and Development of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe on links between corruption and poverty.
- 7. As previously announced, he had prepared following a request from the Enlarged Partial Agreement on Sport of the Council of Europe (EPAS) a draft Recommendation on the fight against manipulation of sports results (match fixing) for consideration by EPAS. GRECO would be asked for an opinion on the draft Recommendation after its examination and adoption by EPAS which was scheduled in May. The President also referred to draft legislation on corruption and fraud in sport that was being prepared by the German Land of Bavaria which constituted an important development in fields that were not yet dealt with in any international legal instrument.
- 8. The President thanked the Austrian authorities for having honoured him with the Honorary Golden order of Merit for his international work in the anti-corruption field. On that occasion, GRECO had again been in the spotlight. Moreover, he was pleased to announce that a new draft anti-corruption law had been submitted to the

Parliament of Slovenia and it was hoped that the law would be adopted in April or May as it would give further powers to the Commission for the Prevention of Corruption – including responsibility for holding a register of lobbyists.

- 9. He referred briefly to the results of the last Bureau meeting which were detailed in document Greco (2009) 25E, and mentioned that the Bureau had agreed that, time permitting, the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) and the International Chamber of Commerce (ICC) would be invited for exchanges of views with GRECO in 2010 and that "lobbying" and "prevention of corruption in the judiciary" would be suitable topics for future *tours de table*.
- 10. The **Executive Secretary** informed the plenary that copies were available to participants of the text of a law passed by Luxembourg on 3 March 2010 on criminal responsibility of legal persons that was designed to provide follow-up to a Second Round recommendation addressed to the authorities of the country. A report by the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe on Lobbying in a democratic society (Doc. 11937) was also available. It contained a recommendation to the Committee of Ministers to elaborate a European Code of Conduct on Lobbying. The latter document might be of relevance to the discussion on GRECO's Fourth Evaluation Round to be held later in the week.
- 11. Over the period June December 2009, the Secretariat had collected references to GRECO in the press in order to see if efforts to enhance GRECO's visibility initiated in response to a request from the Committee of Ministers to GRECO's President some time ago could be considered as having been successful. One hundred and ten references to GRECO's work (mainly in response to the publication of evaluation reports) had been identified. It was planned at a later stage to make a similar count of references to GRECO on the Internet.
- 12. The Executive Secretary informed the plenary that during the Chairmanship of the 
  "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe (May November 2010), a conference in which GRECO 
  experts would certainly be involved was planned. The head of the country's 
  delegation to GRECO further informed the plenary that the theme would be 
  Integrative cooperation between the international and national actors in the fight 
  against corruption with a focus on asset recovery and confiscation as well as 
  transparency of Public Administration. The conference would be held at the end 
  of October 2010 in Skopje.
- 13. The agreement between Belarus and the Council of Europe concerning immunities and privileges of GRECO representatives and evaluators which had been drawn up following ratification by Belarus of the Criminal and Civil Law Convention on Corruption (ETS 173 and 174) had been signed in January by the Minister of the Interior of Belarus and the Deputy Secretary General of the Council of Europe. The agreement needed to be ratified by the Parliament of Belarus. Subsequently, the country's accession to GRECO could, in principle, become effective.
- 14. The Council of Europe Development Bank (CEB) had expressed an interest in appointing a representative in GRECO. The CEB subsidised activities related to housing for low income groups, improvement of living conditions in urban and rural areas and also ran projects related to the environment and certain public sector infrastructure activities with a social vocation. Moreover, the CEB attached great importance to internal integrity measures and had put in place a series of such measures. It was an organ of the Council of Europe and as such there would be no legal obstacle to it being represented in GRECO in the same way as the CDPC or the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe were. The Governor of the CEB would address a request to the Secretary General and the Bureau was of the opinion that there would be no reason not to accept such a request.

15. Finally, the Executive Secretary informed the plenary that GRECO's President had been invited to make a keynote address at an event entitled "Fighting Corruption at Local and Regional Level" (Messina, 7 May 2010) organised by the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe.

## IV. Joint First and Second Evaluation Rounds

- 16. The draft Joint First and Second Round Compliance Report on **Switzerland** had been prepared, on the basis of a Situation Report submitted by the authorities of the country, in consultation with Rapporteurs designated on behalf of Belgium and Monaco. The Rapporteurs communicated their observations on the draft report to the plenary and a detailed reading of it followed.
- 17. GRECO adopted the Joint First and Second Round Compliance Report on Switzerland (Greco RC I/II Rep (2009) 2E) and invited Switzerland to authorise its publication as soon as possible. The deadline fixed for the submission of additional information regarding the implementation of one outstanding recommendation was 30 September 2011.

#### V. Second Evaluation Round

- 18. GRECO examined the draft Addendum to the Second Round Compliance Report on **Greece**. The draft was based on information provided by the authorities of the country as required by the conclusions of GRECO's Second Round Compliance Report. Following a detailed reading, GRECO adopted the Addendum to the Second Round Compliance Report on Greece (Greco RC-II (2007) 14E Addendum). In its Conclusion, GRECO regretted the lack of action take to implement outstanding recommendations and asked the Greek authorities to submit additional information on their implementation by 30 September 2010, in accordance with Rule 31, paragraph 9.1 of the Rules of Procedure. GRECO decided that the additional information would be examined by GRECO 49 [29 November 3 December 2010] in a Second Addendum to the Second Round Compliance Report on Greece.
- 19. GRECO examined the draft Addendum to the Second Round Compliance Report on **Ireland**. The draft was based on information provided by the authorities of the country as required by the conclusions of GRECO's Second Round Compliance Report. Following a detailed reading, GRECO adopted the Addendum to the Second Round Compliance Report on Ireland (Greco RC-II (2007) 11E Addendum) and thus concluded the Second Round compliance procedure in respect of that country.
- 20. GRECO invited the authorities of Greece and Ireland to authorise publication of the reports mentioned above as soon as possible.
- 21. Moreover, note was taken of information provided orally by the Head of the delegation of the Slovak Republic concerning a draft law on corporate liability which was undergoing a second reading in Parliament and constituted a step towards implementation of GRECO's Second Round recommendation on the subject.

## VI. Third Evaluation Round

22. The plenary carried out an in-depth reading of the draft Third Round Evaluation Reports on **Turkey** and **"the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia"** with the participation of the Evaluation Teams that had carried out on-site visits to Ankara and Skopje. Before adoption, the reports underwent a second reading of

drafts which had been revised in the light of the discussions held during the first reading.

- 23. GRECO adopted the Third Round Evaluation Reports on Turkey (Greco Eval III Rep (2009) 5E Themes I and II) and "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (Greco Eval III Rep (2009) 6E Themes I and II). Both countries were invited to authorise publication of their respective reports<sup>1</sup> as soon as possible and the deadline fixed for submission of Situation Reports on implementation of the recommendations addressed to them was 30 September 2011 in both cases.
- 24. The plenary also examined the draft Third Round Compliance Reports on **Estonia**, **Iceland**, **the Slovak Republic**, **Slovenia** and the **United Kingdom** which had been prepared, on the basis of Situation Reports submitted by the authorities of the countries concerned, in consultation with Rapporteurs designated on behalf of Hungary and the United States of America for Estonia; Croatia and Sweden for Iceland; Austria and Latvia for the Slovak Republic; Finland and Germany for Slovenia and on behalf of Bulgaria and Ireland for the United Kingdom. The Rapporteurs communicated their observations on the draft compliance reports and a detailed reading of the reports followed.
- 25. GRECO adopted the Third Round Compliance Reports on Estonia (Greco RC-III (2010) 2E), Slovenia (Greco RC-III (2009) 1E) and the United Kingdom (Greco RC-III (2009) 3E) and fixed the deadline for the submission of additional information regarding the further implementation of recommendations at 30 September 2011 in all three cases.
- 26. When adopting the Third Round Compliance Reports on Iceland (Greco RC-III (2010) 2E) and the Slovak Republic (Greco RC-III (2010 3E), GRECO concluded that the current very low level of compliance with recommendations was "globally unsatisfactory" in the meaning of Rule 31, paragraph 8.3 of the Rules of Procedure and therefore decided to apply Rule 32, paragraph 2(i) and asked the authorities of both countries to provide a report on progress in implementing outstanding recommendations as soon as possible and by 30 September 2010 at the latest, for examination by GRECO 49 [29 November 3 December 2010].
- 27. GRECO noted with satisfaction that the authorities of the Slovak Republic authorised publication of the report addressed to them, and those of Estonia, Iceland<sup>2</sup>, Slovenia and the United Kingdom were invited to do so as soon as possible.
- 28. Finally, as regards Third Round procedures, GRECO approved the list of rapporteur countries for compliance procedures regarding Latvia and Poland (Greco Eval III (2010) 3E). Thus, Denmark and the Czech Republic would designate rapporteurs for Latvia, and Malta and Azerbaijan for Poland.

#### VII. Fourth Evaluation Round

29. The plenary discussed the merits of the various components of the thematic proposal for GRECO's Fourth Evaluation Round submitted by Bureau 52 (Greco (2010) 6E Revised), as well as other proposals made by delegations, including in particular the fact that the theme "corruption prevention in the judiciary" had a clear place alongside one or several of the other themes. The need to revisit at some stage themes dealt with in previous evaluation rounds, placing a clear stress on effective implementation of standards, was also raised. It was then

<sup>2</sup> The Third Round Compliance Report on Iceland was subsequently published on 4 May 2010.

5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Third Round Evaluation Report on Turkey was subsequently published on 20 April 2010.

decided that, in order to ensure an in-depth analysis within the framework of GRECO's new evaluation round, its thematic scope should focus on no less than two and no more than three themes to be selected from the following list:

## Corruption prevention in

- a. parliamentary assemblies
- b. public administration
- c. the private sector
- d. the Judiciary.
- 30. At the close of the discussion, GRECO decided to ask the Bureau to present possible options in a summary document which would include references to the relevant Council of Europe standards and would also explain the rationale for the reference to Human Rights in the Bureau's thematic proposal presented to the current meeting. As a concern for the protection of Human Rights clearly underwrote all of GRECO's work, it was felt that including specific references to that aspect under each individual topic to be addressed in the new evaluation round might be superfluous. A decision on the themes for the Fourth Evaluation Round would be taken at GRECO 47 (7-11 June 2010). Following the example of the very successful manner in which the Third Evaluation Round had been prepared, further work would be entrusted to a working party that should be tasked, in particular, with preparing a draft questionnaire and considering practicalities of the evaluations.

## VIII. Round table on recent developments regarding anti-corruption institutions

31. GRECO heard presentations made by speakers (cf. List of Participants – Appendix I) representing the Anti-Fraud Office of Catalonia – an independent body attached to the Parliament of Catalonia with wide powers and a mandate to prevent and investigate corruption in the public sector of Catalonia, and the Anti-Corruption and Economic Crime Agency of Kazakhstan – an agency (with a central office and sixteen regional divisions) that reports directly to the President and is responsible for the prevention, detection and investigation of corruption offences. A representative of the UNODC outlined for the plenary the principle characteristics of the mechanism for the review of implementation of the United Nations Convention against Corruption and advances made in the practical arrangements for the first review cycle. The presentations were followed by comments and questions from the floor. The Secretariat was asked to prepare and publish a summary record of the round table.

## IX. Rules of Procedure

- 32. GRECO adopted a revision of Rule 31 Compliance procedure (Greco (2010) 3E Final). Rule 31 revised transformed the 'Addendum stage' of the compliance procedure (as regulated by Rule 31, paragraphs 9.1 and 9.2) into a fully-fledged 'second compliance report stage'. This revision would notably provide for the involvement of rapporteurs (up until now the drawing-up of addenda to compliance reports had been the sole responsibility of the Secretariat) and the possibility to apply Rule 32 (non-compliance procedure) also at this stage.
- 33. It was agreed that Rule 31 as revised would not apply to compliance procedures within the framework of evaluation rounds preceding the Third Evaluation Round.

## X. Tenth General Activity Report (2009)

- 34. GRECO adopted its Tenth General Activity Report (2009) (Greco (2010) 1E Final) including a feature article on Experience with the criminal offence of trading in influence in France, drawn up by Marc SEGONDS, Agrégé of the law faculties, ETFI-Wesford and Armand RIBEROLLES, magistrat and instructed the Secretariat to forward it to GRECO's Statutory Committee and to the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe, in accordance with Article 8, paragraph 1, iii of the Statute.
- 35. The President looked forward to presenting the report to the Committee of Ministers at the 1087<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Ministers' Deputies on 9 June 2010. It would subsequently be made public. He thanked the two French experts for their valuable contribution and members were invited to translate the feature article into their national languages and to make it available to interested circles and the public at large. Moreover, with reference to the section of the report devoted to GRECO's 10<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Conference, he reiterated his gratitude to the authorities of Monaco and Slovenia for the financial support they had provided for the holding of the event.

## XI. Recommendation 1896 (2010) of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe on Judicial Corruption

- 36. At their 1077<sup>th</sup> Meeting (24 February 2010) the Ministers' Deputies decided to communicate Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 1896 (2010) to GRECO for information and possible comments.
- 37. GRECO adopted Comments (Greco (2010) 4E Final) on Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 1896 (2010), which had been prepared by its Bureau, and instructed the Secretariat to transmit them to the Committee of Ministers. In the comments GRECO stresses in particular how often it has observed that the impartiality, integrity and trustworthiness of the justice system are issues of great concern in a number of its member States. Referring to Committee of Ministers Resolution 97 (24) on the Twenty Guiding Principles against Corruption, the attention of the Committee of Ministers is drawn to the multifaceted recommendations GRECO has issued in this field. GRECO also welcomes the proposed elaboration of a model code of conduct directed at judicial officials, along the lines of the model code of conduct for public officials appended to Committee of Ministers Recommendation No. R(2000)10. Finally, GRECO concurs with the Parliamentary Assembly in stressing the need for closer cooperation between GRECO and the relevant institutions of the European Union in order to quard against duplications and to promote synergies.

#### XII. Miscellaneous

- 38. The plenary discussed the issue of enhanced cooperation with the European Union (an issue also raised by the Parliamentary Assembly in its Recommendation 1896 (2010) to the Committee of Ministers) in light of its GRECO 45 decisions regarding the Stockholm Programme and recent information as detailed below.
- 39. The Executive Secretary had been informed that an external consultancy would carry out, on behalf of the European Commission, an impact assessment study for strengthening the fight against corruption at European Union Level with particular focus on periodical evaluation. The aim was to analyse appropriate approaches which would allow the EU to evaluate the enforcement of anti-corruption instruments adopted by the member States of the European Union.

- 40. The President reminded the plenary of the text of the Stockholm Programme and of GRECO's response to it in its 45<sup>th</sup> Plenary Meeting Decisions. GRECO had expressed its willingness to contribute to the development of a comprehensive anti-corruption policy of the European Union, in line with the invitation addressed by the European Council to the Commission and had welcomed, in particular, the invitation by the European Council to the Commission to submit a report, in 2010, to the Council on the modalities for the Union to accede to GRECO. GRECO had, moreover, expressed its willingness, in that context, to discuss such modalities with the competent services of the European Union in light of GRECO's Statute, the Criminal Law Convention on Corruption (ETS 173) and the Civil Law Convention on Corruption (ES (174), which already provided for the possibility of European Union participation in GRECO.
- 41. As regards references that had been made in the meantime to a new European Union mechanism for the periodical evaluation of anti-corruption efforts, the President encouraged EU member States all of which were members of GRECO to clarify their position with respect to such an initiative bearing in mind the impact an additional layer of anti-corruption monitoring would have on the States concerned.

## XIII. Adoption of decisions

42. The decisions of the 46<sup>th</sup> Plenary Meeting were adopted, as they appear in document Greco (2010) 7E.

## XIV. Forthcoming meetings

43. GRECO noted that the Bureau would hold its 53<sup>rd</sup> meeting in Strasbourg on 30 April 2010 and that the 47<sup>th</sup> Plenary Meeting would be held in Strasbourg on 7–11 June 2010.

## **APPENDIX I**

### LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

#### **ALBANIA / ALBANIE**

Mr Ivi KASO (Head of delegation)

Director, Department of Internal, Administrative Control and Anti-corruption, Council of Ministers

Mrs Helena PAPA

Inspector, Department of Internal Administrative Control and Anti-Corruption, Council of Ministers

### ANDORRA / ANDORRE

M. Sergi ALIS SOULIÉ (Chef de délégation)

Présidence du gouvernement

M. Gérard ALIS EROLES

Avocat, Présidence du gouvernement

## ARMENIA / ARMENIE

Mr Karen GEVORGYAN

Deputy Dean of International Relations, Faculty of Law, Yerevan State University

#### **AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE**

Mr Christian MANQUET (Head of delegation)

Head of Unit, Directorate for Penal Legislation, Federal Ministry of Justice

Mr Andreas ULRICH

Federal Chancellery, Constitutional Service

#### AZERBAIJAN / AZERBAIDJAN

Mr Inam KARIMOV (Head of delegation)

Chief Adviser, Law Enforcement Coordination Department, Administration of the President of the Republic, Secretary of the Commission for Combating Corruption

### **BELGIUM / BELGIQUE**

M. Frederik DECRUYENAERE (Chef de délégation)

Attaché au Services des infractions particulières, Direction Générale des Droits et Libertés fondamentales, Service public fédéral Justice (SPF Justice)

M. Paul MULS

Premier conseiller de direction, Secrétaire de la commission de contrôle des dépenses électorales Chambre des représentants

## **BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE-HERZEGOVINE**

Mr Vjekoslav VUKOVIC (Head of delegation)

Assistant Minister of Security of Bosnia and Herzegovina, Council of Ministers of Bosnia and Herzegovina, Ministry of Security

#### **BULGARIA / BULGARIE**

Ms Irena BORISOVA

Head of Department of International Cooperation and Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters Ministry of Justice

## CROATIA / CROATIE

Mr Marin MRČELA (Head of delegation)

Justice of the Supreme Court

## CYPRUS / CHYPRE

Mr Philippos KOMODROMOS (Head of delegation)

Counsel of the Republic, Law Office of the Republic of Cyprus

## CZECH REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE TCHEQUE

Ms Helena LIŠUCHOVÁ (Head of delegation)

Legal Expert, Department for International Programmes and Cooperation, Ministry of Justice

Ms Marta LÉBLOVÁ

Public Administration Section, Minstry of the Interior

#### **DENMARK / DANEMARK**

Mr Flemming DENKER - Apologised / Excusé

Deputy Director, Public Prosecutor for Serious Economic Crime

## **ESTONIA / ESTONIE**

Ms Mari-Liis SÖÖT (Head of delegation)

Head of Criminal Statistics and Analysis Division, Criminal Policy Department, Ministry of Justice

Ms Paloma KRÖÖT TUPAY

Legal Policy Department, Ministry of Justice

Mr Tanel KALMET

Criminal Policy Department, Ministry of Justice

#### FINLAND / FINLANDE

Mr Kaarle J. LEHMUS (Head of delegation)

Inspector General of the Police, National Police Board

Mr Jussi AALTONEN

Senior Adviser, Ministry of Justice

#### **FRANCE**

M Jean ALEGRE (Chef de délégation)

Chargé de mission auprès du directeur des affaires juridiques, Ministère des Affaires étrangères et européennes

M. Michel BARRAU

Chef du Service Central de Prévention de la Corruption, Service Interministériel placé auprès du Ministère de la Justice

## **GEORGIA / GEORGIE**

Mr Vakhtang LEJAVA (Head of delegation) - Apologised / Excusé

Chief Advisor, Prime Ministers Office, Deputy Head of the Anti-corruption Council of Georgia State Chancellery

## **GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE**

Mr Matthias KORTE (Head of delegation)

Head of Division, Ministry of Justice

Ms Nora KAISER

Deputy Head of Division, Economic Crime, Computer Crime, Corruption-related Crime and Environmental Crime, Federal Ministry of Justice

### **GREECE / GRECE**

Ms Panagiota VATIKALOU

Judge of First Instance

Mr Dimosthenis STIGAS

Investigative Judge of the First Instance for crime of corruption in the public sector

## **HUNGARY / HONGRIE**

Mr Ákos KARA (Head of delegation)

Deputy Head of Department, Ministry of Justice and Law Enforcement

Ms Viktória SOÓS

Ministry of Justice and Law Enforcement

## **ICELAND / ISLANDE**

Mr Björn THORVALDSSON

Assisting Prosecutor, Unit for Investigation and Prosecution of Economic Crime, National Commissioner of the Police

Mr Agust Geir AGUSTSSON

Director General of the Administration Department, Prime Minister's Office

#### **IRELAND / IRLANDE**

Ms Aileen HARRINGTON

Assistant Principal Officer, Criminal Law Reform, Department of Justice, Equality and Law Reform

#### ITALY / ITALIE

Mr Silvio BONFIGLI

Magistrate, Anticorruption and Transparency Service

Mr Fabrizio GANDINI

Magistrate, Magistrate attached to Office I, Directorate General of Penal Law

#### LATVIA / LETTONIE

Mr Alvis VILKS (Head of delegation)

Deputy Director, Corruption Prevention and Combating Bureau

#### **LIECHTENSTEIN**

Mr Peter C. MATT (Head of delegation)

Diplomatic Officer, Office for Foreign Affairs

## LITHUANIA / LITUANIE

Ms Aušra BERNOTIENE (Head of delegation)

Director, Department of International Law, Ministry of Justice

#### **LUXEMBOURG**

M. Jean BOUR (Chef de délégation)

Procureur d'Etat, Parquet du Tribunal d'Arrondissement de Diekirch

#### **MALTA / MALTE**

Mr Leonard CARUANA

Advocate, Attorney General's Office, The Palace

### **MOLDOVA**

Mme Cornelia VICLEANSCHI (Chef de délégation)

Procureur, Chef de la Section Générale, Bureau du Procureur Général

## **MONACO**

M. Frédéric COTTALORDA

Chef de Section, Service d'Information et de Contrôle sur les Circuits Financiers (SICCFIN), Département des Finances et de l'Economie

## **MONTENEGRO**

Mr Dušan DRAKIC

Advisor, Directorate for Anti-Corruption Initiative

#### **NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS**

Mr Bastiaan WINKEL-BOER (Head of delegation)

Policy Advisor, Ministry of Justice

Mr Harry DE WIT

Policy advisor, Directorate Public Sector Employment, Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations

#### **NORWAY / NORVEGE**

Mr Atle ROALDSØY (Head of delegation)

Senior Adviser, Ministry of Justice, Police Department

Mr Christian Fredrik HORST

Deputy Director General, Ministry of Government Administration and Reform

Mr Jens-Oscar NERGÅRD

Senior Adviser, Ministry of Government Administration and Reform

### **POLAND / POLOGNE**

Mr Cezary MICHALCZUK (Head of delegation)

Prosecutor, National Prosecutor's Office, Bureau of International Legal Cooperation, Ministry of Justice

Mr Paweł WOJTUNIK

Head of the Central Anti-corruption Bureau (CBA)

Mr Krzysztof KRAK

Director of Analysis, Central Anti-corruption Bureau (CBA)

#### **PORTUGAL**

Mr João RIBEIRO (Head of delegation)

Director of the International Affairs Department, Directorate General for Justice Policy, Ministry of Justice

Ms Ines MARINHO

Legal advisor, Directorate General for Justice Policy, Ministry of Justice

## **ROMANIA / ROUMANIE**

Ms Anca CHELARU (Head of delegation)

Deputy Director, Department for Relations with the Public Ministry, Prevention of Crime and Corruption, Ministry of Justice and Citizens Freedoms

## **RUSSIAN FEDERATION / FEDERATION DE RUSSIE**

Mr Aleksandr BUKSMAN (Head of delegation)

First Deputy Prosecutor General, Prosecutor General's Office

Mr Aslan YUSUFOV

Deputy Head of Directorate, Head of Section of supervision over implementation of anti-corruption legislation, Prosecutor General's Office

Mr Andrei ILYIN

Deputy Head of Section, Office of the Representative of the Russian Federation at the European Court of Human Rights, Ministry of Justice

Mr Konstantin KOSORUKOV

Deputy to the Permanent Representative of the Russian Federation to the Council of Europe

#### REPUBLIC OF SERBIA / REPUBLIQUE DE SERBIE

Ms Zorana MARKOVIC (Head of delegation)

Director of the Agency for the Fight against Corruption

## SLOVAK REPUBLIÇ / REPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE

Mr Vladimír KOTULIČ (Head of delegation)

Deputy Director, International Police Cooperation Bureau

Ms Alexandra KAPIŠOVSKÁ

Main State Counsellor, Ministry of Justice

## **SLOVENIA / SLOVENIE**

Mr Drago KOS

## President of GRECO / Président du GRECO

Chairman, Commission for the Prevention of Corruption

Ms Sandra A. BLAGOJEVIC

Assistant Head, Sector for Integrity, Commission for the Prevention of Corruption

Ms Vita HABJAN

Assistant Head, Sector for Prevention, Commission for the Prevention of Corruption

Mr Goran KLEMENCIC

State Secretary, Ministry of the Interior

### **SPAIN / ESPAGNE**

Mr Rafael VAILLO

Technical Counsellor, D.G. for International Cooperation, Ministry of Justice

Mr Fernando JIMENEZ SANCHEZ

Department of Political Science and Public Administration, University of Murcia

## **SWEDEN / SUEDE**

Mr Olof NYMAN

Legal Adviser, Division for Criminal Law, Ministry of Justice

#### **SWITZERLAND / SUISSE**

M Ernst GNAEGI (Chef de délégation)

Chef de l'unité du droit pénal international, Office fédéral de la Justice

M. Olivier GONIN

Collaborateur scientifique, Unité du droit pénal international, Office fédéral de la justice

M. Jean-Christophe GEISER

Collaborateur scientifique, Office fédéral de la justice

Mr Jacques RAYROUD

Procureur fédéral, Ministère public de la Confédération

Mme Corinne RASCHLÉ

Head of Legal service of the Federal office of personnel

## "THE FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA" / "L'EX-RÉPUBLIQUE YOUGOSLAVE DE MACÉDOINE"

Ms Slagjana TASEVA (Head of delegation)

Professor in Criminal Law, Dean of the Faculty of Law, "First Private University, European University - the Republic of Macedonia"

Ms Zagorka TNOKOVSKA

Minstry of Justice

Mr Aleksandar NOVAKOVSKI

Presdident of the State Election Commission

Mr Todor VITLAROV

Member of the Public Prosecutors Council

## **TURKEY / TURQUIE**

M. Ergin ERGÜL (Chef de délégation)

Directeur Général Adjoint, Direction Générale du Droit International et des Relations Extérieures Ministère de la Justice

Mr Mete DEMIRCI

Inspector, Prime Minister's Office

Mr Ahmet ULUTAS

Examining Judge, Ministry of Justice

Mr Ömer Faruk GENCKAYA

Lecturer, Marmara University Vocational School, Local Administrations Programme (VSLAP)

Ms. Buket KABAKCI

Deputy to the Permanent Representative of Turkey to the Council of Europe

#### **UKRAINE**

Mr Ruslan RIABOSHAPKA (Head of delegation)

Head of the Department of Legal Issues, Law Enforcement Activity and Fight against Crime Ministry of Justice

## **UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI**

Mr Matthew PYNE

Criminal Law Policy Unit, Ministry of Justice

Ms Anna HODGSON

Crown Prosecution Service (CPS), CPS Policy

## UNITED STATES OF AMERICA / ETATS-UNIS D'AMERIQUE

Mr Richard M. ROGERS (Head of delegation)

Senior Counsel to the Assistant Attorney General, Criminal Division, Department of Justice

Mr Robert LEVENTHAL

Director, Anticorruption and Governance Initiatives, Bureau for International Narcotics and Law Enforcement Affairs, U.S. Department of State

Ms Jane LEY

Deputy Director, US Office of Government Ethics

# PRESIDENT OF THE STATUTORY COMMITTEE OF GRECO / PRÉSIDENT DU COMITÉ STATUTAIRE DU GRECO Apologised / Excusé

# PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / ASSEMBLEE PARLEMENTAIRE DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE Apologised / Excusé

## REPRESENTATIVE OF THE CDCJ / REPRÉSENTANT DU CDCJ Apologised / Excusé

## REPRESENTATIVE OF THE CDPC / REPRÉSENTANT DU CDPC

Mr Damir VEJO

Head of the Department for Organised Crime and Corruption, Ministry of Security of Bosnia and Herzegovina

## **OBSERVER UNITED NATIONS – UNODC / OBSERVATEUR NATIONS UNIES – ONUDC**Ms Elsa GOPALA-KRISHNAN

OBSERVER OECD / OBSERVATEUR OCDE Apologised / Excusé

#### GRECO EVALUATION TEAMS / EQUIPES D'EVALUATION DU GRECO

## Third Round Evaluation report on TURKEY / Rapport d'Evaluation du Troisième Cycle sur la TURQUIE

## Theme I - Incriminations

Mr Fabrizio GANDINI (Italy / Italie)

Magistrate, Magistrate attached to Office I, Directorate General of Penal Law

Mr Kazimir ÅBERG (Sweden / Suède) – **Apologised / Excusé** Judge, Court of Appeal in Stockholm

## Theme II - Party Funding / Financement des partis politiques

Mr Inam KARIMOV (Azerbaijan / Azerbaïdjan)

Chief Adviser, Dpt of Coordination of Law Enforcement Bodies, Executive Office of the President of the Republic, Secretary of the Commission for Combating Corruption

Mr Fernando JIMENEZ SANCHEZ (Spain / Espagne)

Department of Political Science and Public Administration, University of Murcia

Ms Patricia PEÑA (Consultant / Consultante)

Manager, Acting Director, Canadian International Development Agency, Democratic Governance and Human Rights Division

# Third Round Evaluation report on "THE FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA"/ Rapport d'Evaluation du Troisième Cycle sur « L'EX-REPUBLIQUE YOUGOSLAVE DE MACEDOINE »

#### Theme I - Incriminations

Ms Anna HODGSON (United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni) Crown Prosecution Service (CPS), CPS Policy

Mr José Santiago TORRES PRIETO (Spain / Espagne) Magistrate, Madrid District Court nº 32

#### Transparency of Political Funding / Transparence du financement politique

Mr Karen GEVORGYAN (Armenia / Arménie)

Deputy Dean of International Relations, Faculty of Law, Yerevan State University

Mr Jussi AALTONEN (Finland / Finlande) Senior Adviser, Ministry of Justice

M. Frank ENGEL (Luxembourg) – **Apologised / Excusé** Juriste, membre du Parlement européen

#### **RAPPORTEURS**

## Joint First and Second Round Compliance Report / Rapport de Conformité des Premier et Deuxième Cycles Conjoints

## Switzerland / Suisse

M Frederik DECRUYENAERE (Belgium / Belgique)

M. Frédéric COTTALORDA (Monaco)

### Third Round Compliance Reports / Rapports de Conformité du Troisième Cycle

## Estonia / Estonie

Ms Jane LEY (United States of America / Etats-Unis d'Amérique) Mr Akos KARA (Hungary / Hongrie)

## Iceland / Islande

Mr Marin MRČELA (Croatia / Croatie) Mr Olof NYMAN (Sweden / Suède)

#### Slovak Republic / Slovaquie

Mr Christian MANQUET (Austria / Autriche) Mr Alvis VILKS (Latvia / Lettonie)

#### Slovenia / Slovénie

Mr Matthias KORTE (Germany / Allemagne) Mr Jussi AALTONEN (Finland / Finlande)

## United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni

Ms Irena BORISOVA (Bulgaria / Bulgarie) Mr David WADDELL (Ireland / Irlande)

#### **ROUND TABLE / TOUR DE TABLE**

## **Antifraud Office of Catalunya**

Mr David MARTÍNEZ MADERO Director

## United Nations - UNODC/ Nations Unies - ONUDC

Ms Elsa GOPALA-KRISHNAN

#### Kazakhstan

Mr Kairat KOZHAMZHAROV, Chairman, Anti-Corruption and Economic Crime Agency of Kazakhstan Ms Dinara MYKTYBAYEVA, Chairman's counselor Mr Serik DILDABAYEV, Chairman's counselor

Ms Aigul SHAIMOVA, Deputy Head of Legal and International Cooperation Department Ms Natalya MALYARCHUK, Chairman's interpreter

#### COUNCIL OF EUROPE SECRETARIAT / SECRETARIAT DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Mr Wolfgang RAU, Executive Secretary of GRECO / Secrétaire Exécutif du GRECO

## Assistant / Assistante

Ms Elspeth REILLY, Personal Assistant to the Executive Secretary / Assistante Particulière du Secrétaire Exécutif

## Administrative Officers / Administrateurs

Mr Björn JANSON

M. Christophe SPECKBACHER

Ms Laura SANZ-LEVIA

Ms Sophie MEUDAL-LEENDERS

Mr Michael JANSSEN

Ms Aleksandra KURNIK

## Central Office / Bureau Central

Ms Penelope PREBENSEN, Administrative Assistant / Assistante Administrative Mme Laure PINCEMAILLE, Assistant / Assistante Mme Marie-Rose PREVOST, Assistant / Assistante

## Webmaster

Ms Simona GHITA, Directorate General of Human Rights and Legal Affairs / Direction générale des droits de l'Homme et des affaires juridiques Mme Marie-Rose PREVOST, GRECO

#### **Interpreters / Interpretes**

Mme Sally BAILEY M. Grégoire DEVICTOR Mme Isabelle MARCHINI

## **APPENDIX II**

#### **AGENDA**

- 1. Opening of the meeting / Ouverture de la réunion **09h30**
- 2. Adoption of the agenda / Adoption de l'ordre du jour
- 3. Information from the President, Delegations and the Executive Secretary (including on Bureau 52) / Informations du Président, des Délégations et du Secrétaire Exécutif (y compris sur Bureau 52)
- 4. **First reading** of draft Third Round Evaluation Reports on: / **Première lecture** des projets de Rapports d'Evaluation du Troisième Cycle sur :
  - Turkey / Turquie (Monday / lundi)
  - "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" / « l'ex-République yougoslave de Macédoine » (Tuesday / mardi)
- 5. Examination and adoption of the Joint First and Second Round Compliance Report on **Switzerland** / Examen et adoption du Rapport de Conformité des Premier et Deuxième Cycles d'Evaluation Conjoints sur la **Suisse**
- 6. Examination and adoption of the Addenda to the Second Round Compliance Reports on **Greece** and **Ireland** / Examen et adoption des Addenda aux Rapports de Conformité du Deuxième Cycle sur la **Grèce** et l'**Irlande**
- 7. Examination and adoption of the Third Round Compliance Reports on **Estonia**, **Iceland**, **Slovakia**, **Slovenia** and the **United Kingdom** / Examen et adoption des Rapports de Conformité du Troisième Cycle sur l'**Estonie**, l'**Islande**, la **Slovaquie** la **Slovénie** et le **Royaume-Uni**
- 8. Round table on recent developments regarding anti-corruption institutions / Tour de table sur les développements récents en ce qui concerne les institutions anti-corruption (Thursday / jeudi, 10h30)

## Speakers/Intervenants:

- David Martínez Madero, Director, Anti-Fraud Office of Catalonia (Spain) / Directeur, Bureau Anti-fraude de Catalogne (Espagne)
- Eduardo Vetere, Vice President of International Association of Anti-Corruption Authorities (IAACA), Former Director of the Division for Treaty Affairs, UNODC / Viceprésident, Association internationale des autorités anti-corruption (IAACA), Ancien Directeur de la Division des Traités, ONUDC
- representatives from the Anti-corruption Agency of Kazakhstan / Représentants de l'Agence Anti-corruption du Kazakhstan
- 9. Fourth Evaluation Round Finalisation of themes (Bureau 52 proposal) / Quatrième Cycle d'Evaluation Finalisation des thèmes (proposition du Bureau 52)
- 10. Revision of Rule 31 of the Rules of Procedure (Bureau 52 proposal in light of Decision 13 by GRECO 45) / Révision de l'Article 31 du Règlement Intérieur (proposition du Bureau 52 à la lumière de la décision 13 du GRECO 45)
- 11. Adoption of Tenth General Activity Report 2009 (approved by Bureau 52) / Adoption du Dixième rapport général d'activités 2009 (approuvé par le Bureau 52)

- 12. Recommendation 1896 (2010) of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe on "Judicial Corruption" Adoption of comments (approved by Bureau 52) / Recommandation 1896 (2010) de l'Assemblée parlementaire du Conseil de l'Europe sur la « corruption judiciaire » Adoption de commentaires (approuvés par le Bureau 52)
- 13. Third Round Compliance Procedure regarding Latvia and Poland Selection of rapporteur countries (Bureau 52 proposals) / Procédure de conformité du Troisième Cycle à l'égard de la Lettonie et la Pologne Sélection de (pays) rapporteurs (propositions du Bureau 52)
- 14. **Second reading** and adoption of the draft Third Round Evaluation Reports on Turkey and "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (**Friday**) / **Deuxième lecture** et adoption des projets de Rapports d'Evaluation du Troisième Cycle sur la Turquie et « l'ex-République yougoslave de Macédoine » (**vendredi**)
- 15. Miscellaneous / Divers
- 16. Adoption of decisions / Adoption des décisions
- 17. Dates of next meetings / Dates des prochaines réunions