



COUNCIL OF EUROPE    CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Strasbourg, 20 August 2007

MIN-LANG/PR (2007) 1  
Addendum 1

**THE EUROPEAN CHARTER FOR REGIONAL OR MINORITY LANGUAGES**  
**(MIN-LANG)**

**Third Periodical Report**  
**presented to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe**  
**in accordance with Article 15 of the Charter**

**GERMANY**

***Questions submitted to the***  
***Government of Germany regarding its 3<sup>rd</sup> Periodical Report***

**COMMITTEE OF EXPERTS  
OF THE  
EUROPEAN CHARTER FOR REGIONAL OR MINORITY LANGUAGES**

Comments/questions submitted to the Government of Germany regarding its Third Periodical Report

After a preliminary examination of the Third Periodical Report by Germany, it was found that additional information on several aspects of the report would be needed before the Committee of Experts could undertake a more detailed evaluation as required by the Charter.

The German Government is therefore invited to reply to the following questions in order to allow the Committee of Experts to complete its examination. This questionnaire will additionally serve as a working document during the Committee of Experts' forthcoming on-the-spot visit to Germany.

The structure of this document follows the Outline for Periodical Reports to be submitted by Contracting Parties (printed in boxes). The questions the Committee of Experts would like the authorities to reply to (presented in numerical order) are inserted into the original text of that Outline. General questions are listed at the beginning of the respective article. If the context requires to quote articles of Part III completely, the provisions accepted by Germany are underlined.

## PRELIMINARY SECTION

1. Please provide the necessary background information, such as the relevant historical developments in the country, an overview of the demographic situation with reference to the basic economic data for the regions, as well as information on the constitutional and administrative structure of the State.

**Question no. 1.** Please provide information on the demographic development in the Sorbian language areas in Saxony and Brandenburg (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 10).

3. Please indicate the number of speakers for each regional or minority language. Specify the criteria for the definition of “speaker of regional or minority language” that your state has retained for this purpose.

**Question no. 2.** Have the *Länder* of northern Germany taken any measures to collect more reliable and up-to-date data with respect to the situation of the Low German language (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 10 and 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 16)?

5. Please provide recent general statements on the policy of your State concerning the protection of regional or minority languages where it may be of use to supplement the above four points.

### Romany language

**Question no. 3.** Since the Framework agreement was concluded between the *Land* of Rhineland-Palatinate with the Association of German Sinti and Roma in 2005, has there been a meeting between the State Chancellery and the Land association of German Sinti and Roma on how to implement the programmes (see 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 15a)?

**Question no. 4.** Has the Land association submitted any application for project funding?

*General issue:*

**Question no. 5.** Has the Ministry of the Interior adopted a decision on the possibility to create a brochure on languages protected by the Charter (see 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 23)?

## PART I

1. It is understood that full details of the measures taken to implement the recommendations of the Committee of Ministers will appear in the body of the report. Nevertheless, please summarise those measures for each recommendation.

**Recommendation 5:** “take resolute action to establish a structured policy for making it practically possible to use regional or minority languages in dealings with the administration and, where relevant, in the courts”;

**Question no. 6.** The German authorities consider that this recommendation is too demanding given the budgetary constraints faced by public budget and that it would meet with resistance. Have any concrete proposals been made to the *Länder*, has any concrete action plan been expressly refused? Have any of the *Länder* authorities officially expressed resistance to such a policy (as stated in the 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report)?

## PART II

1. Please indicate what measures your State has taken to apply Article 7 of the Charter to the regional or minority languages referred to in paragraphs 1 and 3 of Part I above, specifying the different levels of government responsible.

### *Article 7 - Objectives and principles*

1. *In respect of regional or minority languages, within the territories in which such languages are used and according to the situation of each language, the Parties shall base their policies, legislation and practice on the following objectives and principles:*

- a. *the recognition of the regional or minority languages as an expression of cultural wealth;*

**Question no. 7.** Are there constitutional provisions devoted to Sater Frisian or Romany in any of the *Länder*? Are there other *Länder* where Low German is traditionally spoken, which recognise in their constitution the protection and promotion of Low German (like the *Länder* of Mecklenburg-Vorpommern or Schleswig-Holstein)?

- b. *the respect of the geographical area of each regional or minority language in order to ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of the regional or minority language in question;*

### **Sorbian**

**Question no. 8.** As regards the envisaged restructuring of the rural counties and non-district municipalities of the Free State of Saxony, has any decision been taken yet? If so, how have the interests of Sorbian-speakers been taken into consideration? (see 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 34)?

**Question no. 9.** During the second monitoring round, the Committee of Experts received reports on possible resettlements due to lignite mining in the region (Lower Lusatia in Brandenburg). Have any such resettlements taken place?

- f. *the provision of appropriate forms and means for the teaching and study of regional or minority languages at all appropriate stages;*

### **Low German**

**Question no. 10.** Please report on any joint initiative in the field of education between the *Länder* where Low German is spoken (but not covered by Part III).

### **Sater Frisian**

**Question no. 11.** Have any measures been taken to develop the teaching of Sater Frisian at primary and secondary levels of education? Have the authorities considered the possibility of extending the scope of Part III protection for Sater Frisian under Germany's instrument of ratification to Article 8, paragraph 1.b and c.?

- h. *the promotion of study and research on regional or minority languages at universities or equivalent institutions;*

### **Low German**

**Question no. 12.** The Committee of Experts considered that increasing inter-Land co-operation in this area would be particularly useful (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 41). Have any initiatives been taken at university level, especially between institutes of higher education in North Rhein/Westphalia, Saxon-Anhalt and Brandenburg (where Part II applies)?

## **Romany**

### **Question no. 13.**

Please give information on the outcome of the cooperation projects with the university of Hamburg (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 39)?

3. *The Parties undertake to promote, by appropriate measures, mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country and in particular the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to regional or minority languages among the objectives of education and training provided within their countries and encouragement of the mass media to pursue the same objective.*

**Question no. 14.** According to the authorities, several initiatives have been undertaken (3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 56) and material has been produced for schools and educational institutes. Please indicate in which federal states such initiatives took place (other than Baden-Württemberg?).

4. *In determining their policy with regard to regional or minority languages, the Parties shall take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the groups which use such languages. They are encouraged to establish bodies, if necessary, for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to regional or minority languages.*

**Question no. 15.** Please clarify how the umbrella organisation of Low German is involved in policy-making regarding the Low German language (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 42).

**Question no. 16.** During the second monitoring cycle, the Federal Commissioner for Matters relating to Repatriates and National Minorities informed the Committee of Experts that consultative Committees (*Beratende Ausschüsse*) for issues concerning the North Frisian speakers would be set up. Has this been achieved (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 43)?

## PART III

For each regional or minority language chosen at the moment of ratification, as follows from paragraph 2 of Article 2 of the Charter, please indicate in which way the paragraphs and/or sub-paragraphs have been implemented (see Appendix).

When indicating the measures taken in order to implement each paragraph or sub-paragraph chosen, please specify the relevant legal provision and the territory where they are applicable.

### Danish in the Danish language area in Land Schleswig-Holstein

#### Article 8 - Education

##### *Paragraph 1*

*With regard to education, the Parties undertake, within the territory in which such languages are used, according to the situation of each of these languages, and without prejudice to the teaching of the official language(s) of the State:*

- i) to set up a supervisory body or bodies responsible for monitoring the measures taken and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of regional or minority languages and for drawing up periodic reports of their findings which will be made public.*

**Question no. 17.** Has the Ministry of Education in Schleswig-Holstein considered incorporating their relevant findings on Danish education in the next Report on Minorities (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 56)?

#### Article 10 - Administrative Authorities and Public Services

##### *Paragraph 1*

*Within the administrative districts of the State in which the number of residents who are users of regional or minority languages justifies the measures specified below and according to the situation of each language, the Parties undertake, as far as this is reasonably possible:*

- a v) to ensure that users of regional or minority languages may validly submit a document in these languages;*

**Question no. 18.** Have the authorities taken any measures to ensure that documents in Danish can be submitted to administrative authorities in practice (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, paras. 58 – 60)?

#### Article 11 - Media

##### *Paragraph 1*

*The Parties undertake, for the users of the regional or minority languages within the territories in which those languages are spoken, according to the situation of each language, to the extent that the public authorities, directly or indirectly, are competent, have power or play a role in this field, and respecting the principle of the independence and autonomy of the media:*

- b ii) to encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of radio programmes in the regional or minority languages on a regular basis;*

**Question no. 19.** Have the German authorities taken any measures to encourage and/ or facilitate the broadcasting of radio programmes in Danish on a regular basis?

**Question no. 20.** Are there currently any programmes broadcast regularly in Danish on the Open Channel broadcasting radio station, as required by Section 2, para. 1 of the OK Act (see 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 1026a)?

- c ii) *to encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of television programmes in the regional or minority languages on a regular basis;*

**Question no. 21.** Have the German authorities taken any measures to encourage and/ or facilitate the broadcasting of television programmes in Danish on a regular basis?

**Question no. 22.** Has a contract between the broadcasters and the cable providers been negotiated so that Danish programmes can continue to be received through the cable network (see 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 1027a.)?

- d *to encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in the regional or minority languages;*

**Question no. 23.** Have any television programmes or other audiovisual works been produced in Danish under the ULR project (see 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 1028)?

## **Article 12 - Cultural Activities and Facilities**

### *Paragraph 3*

*The Parties undertake to make appropriate provision, in pursuing their cultural policy abroad, for regional or minority languages and the cultures they reflect.*

**Question no. 24.** The 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report states that language groups may be able to file applications to obtain federal grants for cultural activities abroad (see para. 1038). The Committee of Experts explains in the 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report that this undertaking concerned above all the way in which the country presented its own linguistic and cultural heritage abroad (see examples given in para. 80). Have the German authorities on the federal level taken any steps in this sense to ensure that the existence of regional or minority languages in Germany is reflected when presenting and promoting Germany abroad (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 81)?

## **Article 13 - Economic and Social Life**

### *Paragraph 1*

*With regard to economic and social activities, the Parties undertake within the whole country:*

- c *to oppose practices designed to discourage the use of regional or minority languages in connection with economic or social activities;*

**Question no. 25.** Please provide information on whether the new anti-discrimination legislation creates specific mechanisms to oppose certain kind of practices envisaged by this undertaking (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 83).

**Sorbian (Upper Sorbian and Lower Sorbian) in the Sorbian language area in the Länder of Brandenburg and Saxony)**

**Article 8 - Education**

*Paragraph 1*

*With regard to education, the Parties undertake, within the territory in which such languages are used, according to the situation of each of these languages, and without prejudice to the teaching of the official language(s) of the State:*

*a*

- i) to make available pre-school education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
- ii) to make available a substantial part of pre-school education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
- iii) to apply one of the measures provided for under i and ii above at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient; or*

**Question no. 26.** Within the framework of the positive new developments stated in the 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report (see para. 2003), have the German authorities found a solution to redress the lack of qualified teachers at certain pre-schools (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 90)?

*b*

- i) to make available primary education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
- ii) to make available a substantial part of primary education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
- iii) to provide, within primary education, for the teaching of the relevant regional or minority languages as an integral part of the curriculum; or*
- iv) to apply one of the measures provided for under i to iii above at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient;*

**Question no. 27.** Have the German authorities found a solution to the problem of the absence of a guideline for the minimum number of pupils to set up an Upper-Sorbian class (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 94)?

**Free State of Saxony**

**Question no. 28.** Have the German authorities reduced the minimum number of pupils required to open and maintain an Upper-Sorbian class within secondary education?

**Art. 8, para 1, sub-para. (d) - Technical and Vocational Education -**

- i) to make available technical and vocational education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
- ii) to make available a substantial part of technical and vocational education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
- iii) to provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of the relevant regional or minority languages as an integral part of the curriculum; or*
- iv) to apply one of the measures provided for under i to iii above at least to those pupils who, or where appropriate whose families, so wish in a number considered sufficient;*

**Question no. 29.** Are the pilot projects supported by Domowina linked to the funds for the additional apprenticeships in Sorbian companies or does Domowina receive specific state-funded support for these projects (see 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 2015)?



- i) *to set up a supervisory body or bodies responsible for monitoring the measures taken and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of regional or minority languages and for drawing up periodic reports of their findings, which will be made public.*

### **Brandenburg**

**Question no. 30.** Please provide copies of, or Internet links to (at least some of the) relevant documents that the Ministry of Education published with regard to the supervision of Lower Sorbian education (see 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 2022).

#### *Paragraph 2*

*With regard to education and in respect of territories other than those in which the regional or minority languages are traditionally used, the Parties undertake, if the number of users of a regional or minority language justifies it, to allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of the regional or minority language at all the appropriate stages of education.*

**Question no. 31.** Have the German authorities examined whether the number of users of Upper Sorbian in Dresden justifies the offer of education in or of this language (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 116)?

### **Article 10 - Administrative Authorities and Public Services**

#### *Paragraph 1*

*Within the administrative districts of the State in which the number of residents who are users of regional or minority languages justifies the measures specified below and according to the situation of each language, the Parties undertake, as far as this is reasonably possible:*

- a iv) *to ensure that users of regional or minority languages may submit oral or written applications in these languages;"*

**Question no. 32.** Have the German authorities taken any measures to ensure that there are sufficient numbers of Upper and Lower Sorbian-speaking civil servants available, as well as providing training opportunities for civil servants to improve their Upper-Sorbian language skills (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, paras. 125 and 204)?

#### *Paragraph 3*

*With regard to public services provided by the administrative authorities or other persons acting on their behalf, the Parties undertake, within the territory in which regional or minority languages are used, in accordance with the situation of each language and as far as this is reasonably possible:*

- b) *to allow users of regional or minority languages to submit a request and receive a reply in these languages; or*

**Question no. 33.** Please provide information on the practical implementation of this undertaking with regard to Upper-Sorbian (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 134).

**Question no. 34.** Have the measures envisaged by the Saxon State Ministry of the Interior been put into practice (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 135)? If so, please provide more details.

## Article 11 - Media

### Paragraph 1

The Parties undertake, for the users of the regional or minority languages within the territories in which those languages are spoken, according to the situation of each language, to the extent that the public authorities, directly or indirectly, are competent, have power or play a role in this field, and respecting the principle of the independence and autonomy of the media:

- b ii) to encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of radio programmes in the regional or minority languages on a regular basis;

**Question no. 35.** Have the authorities undertaken any measures to encourage and/ or facilitate the broadcasting of programmes on public radio in Upper and Lower Sorbian?

- c ii) to encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of television programmes in the regional or minority languages on a regular basis;

**Question no. 36.** Have the authorities undertaken any measures to encourage and/ or facilitate the broadcasting of programmes on public television in Upper and Lower Sorbian?

## Article 12 - Cultural Activities and Facilities

### Paragraph 3

The Parties undertake to make appropriate provision, in pursuing their cultural policy abroad, for regional or minority languages and the cultures they reflect.

**Question no. 37.** See question n° 24, for both Lower and Upper Sorbian.

## North Frisian in the North Frisian speech area in Schleswig-Holstein

### Article 8 - Education

#### Paragraph 1

With regard to education, the Parties undertake, within the territory in which such languages are used, according to the situation of each of these languages, and without prejudice to the teaching of the official language(s) of the State:

- a
  - (i) to make available pre-school education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or
  - (ii) to make available a substantial part of pre-school education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or
  - (iii) to apply one of the measures provided for under i and ii above at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient; or
  - (iv) if the public authorities have no direct competence in the field of pre-school education, to favour and/or encourage the application of the measures referred to under i to iii above;

**Question no. 38.** Has the planned transfer of nursery school funding from the Land Government to the local level taken place? If so, have the authorities ensured that these changes did not have a negative impact on the provision of pre-school education in North Frisian (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 242)?

**Question no. 39.** Please provide updated information on the new law on day-care centres (Kindertagesstättengesetz): has it been adopted and does it make special provision for North Frisian teaching (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 244)?

b

- (i) to make available primary education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or
- (ii) to make available a substantial part of primary education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or
- (iii) to provide, within primary education, for the teaching of the relevant regional or minority languages as an integral part of the curriculum; or
- (iv) to apply one of the measures provided for under i to iii above at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient;

**Question no. 40.** Have the German authorities made North Frisian teaching available at least as an optional subject in the normal curriculum?

- i to set up a supervisory body or bodies responsible for monitoring the measures taken and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of regional or minority languages and for drawing up periodic reports of their findings which will be made public.

**Question no. 41.** Have the Schleswig-Holstein authorities appointed a staff member of the North Frisian Institute to monitor and report on the relevant developments in North Frisian education (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 269)?

#### **Article 8, para. 2**

##### *Paragraph 2*

*With regard to education and in respect of territories other than those in which the regional or minority languages are traditionally used, the Parties undertake, if the number of users of a regional or minority language justifies it, to allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of the regional or minority language at all the appropriate stages of education.*

**Question no. 42.** Have the German authorities looked into the possibility of offering education in North Frisian in other areas where a sufficient number of North Frisian-speakers live (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 273)?

#### **Article 11 - Media**

##### *Paragraph 1*

*The Parties undertake, for the users of the regional or minority languages within the territories in which those languages are spoken, according to the situation of each language, to the extent that the public authorities, directly or indirectly, are competent, have power or play a role in this field, and respecting the principle of the independence and autonomy of the media:*

- b (ii) to encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of radio programmes in the regional or minority languages on a regular basis;

**Question no. 43.** The Committee of Experts welcomes the new web radio programme in the North Frisian language. Please provide information on how this project is maintained financially.

**Question no. 44.** With regard to Offener Kanal, see question n° 20 (see also 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 3030b.).

- e (ii) to encourage and/or facilitate the publication of newspaper articles in the regional or minority languages on a regular basis;

**Question no. 45.** Have the German authorities taken any steps to encourage and/ or facilitate the publication of newspaper articles in North Frisian on a regular basis?

## Article 12 - Cultural Activities and Facilities

### Paragraph 3

The Parties undertake to make appropriate provision, in pursuing their cultural policy abroad, for regional or minority languages and the cultures they reflect.

**Question no. 46.** See question n° 24.

## Article 13 - Economic and Social Life

### Paragraph 1

With regard to economic and social activities, the Parties undertake within the whole country:

- c to oppose practices designed to discourage the use of regional or minority languages in connection with economic or social activities;

**Question no. 47.** See question n° 25.

## Article 14 - Transfrontier Exchanges

The Parties undertake:

- a to apply existing bilateral and multilateral agreements which bind them with the States in which the same language is used in identical or similar form, or if necessary to seek to conclude such agreements, in such a way as to foster contacts between the users of the same language in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education;

## Sater Frisian (Seelterfräisk) in the Sater Frisian speech area (Seelterlound) in Lower Saxony

### Article 8 - Education

#### Paragraph 1

With regard to education, the Parties undertake, within the territory in which such languages are used, according to the situation of each of these languages, and without prejudice to the teaching of the official language(s) of the State:

- a
  - (i) to make available pre-school education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or
  - (ii) to make available a substantial part of pre-school education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or
  - (iii) to apply one of the measures provided for under i and ii above at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient; or
  - (iv) if the public authorities have no direct competence in the field of pre-school education, to favour and/or encourage the application of the measures referred to under i to iii above;

**Question no. 48.** Have the authorities encouraged, through adequate institutional and financial support, the provision of at least a substantial part of pre-school education in Sater Frisian to those pupils whose families so request?

## Article 10 - Administrative Authorities and Public Services

### Paragraph 1

*Within the administrative districts of the State in which the number of residents who are users of regional or minority languages justifies the measures specified below and according to the situation of each language, the Parties undertake, as far as this is reasonably possible:*

- a (v) to ensure that users of regional or minority languages may validly submit a document in these languages;*

**Question no. 49.** Have the authorities examined the possibility of issuing directives or formal guidance to administrative authorities and public services, with a view to encouraging the speakers to use Sater Frisian (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 339)?

## Article 11 - Media

### Paragraph 1

*The Parties undertake, for the users of the regional or minority languages within the territories in which those languages are spoken, according to the situation of each language, to the extent that the public authorities, directly or indirectly, are competent, have power or play a role in this field, and respecting the principle of the independence and autonomy of the media:*

- e (ii) to encourage and/or facilitate the publication of newspaper articles in the regional or minority languages on a regular basis;*

**Question no. 50.** Please provide information as to how often articles in Sater Frisian appear in the newspapers listed in the 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report (see para. 3543).

## Article 12 - Cultural Activities and Facilities

### Paragraph 3

*The Parties undertake to make appropriate provision, in pursuing their cultural policy abroad, for regional or minority languages and the cultures they reflect.*

**Question no. 51.** Have the German authorities, both on the Land and federal level, made any appropriate provision with regard to the fulfilment of this undertaking? Does the *Land* Lower Saxony still support the Inter-Frisian Council as a way to make provision for Sater Frisian (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 388)?

## Article 13 - Economic and Social Life

### Paragraph 1

*With regard to economic and social activities, the Parties undertake within the whole country:*

- (c) to oppose practices designed to discourage the use of regional or minority languages in connection with economic or social activities;*

**Question no. 52.** See question n° 25.

## Low German

### Article 8 - Education

#### Article 8

##### Paragraph 1

*With regard to education, the Parties undertake, within the territory in which such languages are used, according to the situation of each of these languages, and without prejudice to the teaching of the official language(s) of the State:*

- a (i) *to make available pre-school education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
- (ii) *to make available a substantial part of pre-school education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
- (iii) *to apply one of the measures provided for under i and ii above at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient; or*
- (iv) *if the public authorities have no direct competence in the field of pre-school education, to favour and/or encourage the application of the measures referred to under i to iii above;*

#### Bremen

**Question no. 53.** Please give more details on the extent to which Low German is used in pre-schools, for example in those areas bordering the *Land* of Lower Saxony: Is Low German also employed as the language of instruction (see 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 5003)?

#### Mecklenburg-Western Pomerania

**Question no. 54.** Please provide more detailed information on the extent to which pre-school education is available in Low German (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 549).

**Question no. 55.** Please provide information on whether the authorities of Mecklenburg-Western Pomerania have taken account of the Low German language in the framework of the reorganisation of pre-school education (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 550)?

#### Lower Saxony

**Question no. 56.** Please provide information on the extent to which Low German is used in pre-schools outside Ostfriesland in practice (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 613).

- b (iii) *to provide, within primary education, for the teaching of the relevant regional or minority languages as an integral part of the curriculum; or*

#### Free Hanseatic City of Bremen

**Question no. 57.** Have new guidance materials for the curriculum on the Low German language in primary education been issued (see 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 5010)? If so, please provide more details.

#### Free and Hanseatic City of Hamburg

**Question no. 58.** Have the authorities of the City of Hamburg pursued their efforts to increase the provision for the teaching of Low German within primary education, including the allocation of regular school hours to Low German?

#### Schleswig-Holstein

**Question no. 59.** Please provide information on the results of the surveys that have been conducted on the implementation of the Decree on Low German (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 678).

**Question no. 60.** The 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report refers to a questionnaire that was sent to the headmasters of all schools in 2006 (see para. 5013). Has the evaluation been completed? If so, please provide some information.

- c (i) *to make available secondary education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
- (ii) *to make available a substantial part of secondary education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
- (iii) *to provide, within secondary education, for the teaching of the relevant regional or minority languages as an integral part of the curriculum; or*

#### Free and Hanseatic City of Hamburg

**Question no. 61.** Have the authorities of the City of Hamburg pursued their efforts with a view to making the teaching of Low German within secondary education more systematic with regular school hours allocated to Low German?

#### Schleswig-Holstein

**Question no. 62.** Please provide information on the results of the surveys that have been conducted to assess the extent of Low German instruction within secondary education (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 682).

- d (iii) *to provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of the relevant regional or minority languages as an integral part of the curriculum; or*

#### Free and Hanseatic City of Hamburg

**Question no. 63.** Have the authorities of the City of Hamburg explored ways to offer teaching of Low German within technical and vocational education, notably in schools for trainees of the restaurants/ catering trade and the social care sector (2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 479)?

- e (ii) *to provide facilities for the study of these languages as university and higher education subjects; or*

#### Lower Saxony

**Question no. 64.** Have the professors in the field of German philology at Oldenburg University been appointed yet? If so, has one of them been assigned a focus on Low German research (see 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 5035)?

- (i) *to set up a supervisory body or bodies responsible for monitoring the measures taken and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of regional or minority languages and for drawing up periodic reports of their findings which will be made public.*

#### Mecklenburg-Western Pomerania

**Question no. 65.** Have there been any developments regarding the Low German Consultative Council (*Niederdeutsch-Beirat*) taking over a supervisory role with regard to Low German education (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 566)?

### **Article 10 - Administrative Authorities and Public Services**

#### *Paragraph 1*

*Within the administrative districts of the State in which the number of residents who are users of regional or minority languages justifies the measures specified below and according to the situation of each language, the Parties undertake, as far as this is reasonably possible:*

- a (v) *to ensure that users of regional or minority languages may validly submit a document in these languages;*

#### Free Hanseatic City of Bremen

**Question no. 66.** Please state if there is any practical implementation of this undertaking. If so, please provide examples (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 414).

Free and Hanseatic City of Hamburg

**Question no. 67.** Please state if there is any practical implementation of this undertaking. If so, please provide examples (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 491).

Lower Saxony

**Question no. 68.** Please provide detailed information concerning the measures taken by the *Land* of Lower Saxony to ensure that documents in Low German may be submitted within its administrative districts, and practical examples of this possibility being used by the speakers (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 626).

c        *to allow the administrative authorities to draft documents in a regional or minority language.*

Mecklenburg-Western Pomerania

**Question no. 69.** Please provide some examples on the drafting of documents in Low German. Are, for example, legal texts, announcements, information documents etc. drafted in Low German?

Free Hanseatic City of Bremen

**Question no. 70.** Apart from the publication of a Low German version of the Constitution of Bremen, have any other documents been drafted and published by the administrative authorities in practice? If so, please provide examples (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 416).

City of Hamburg

**Question no. 71.** Have any documents been drafted and published by the administrative authorities in practice? If so, please provide examples (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 495).

Lower Saxony

**Question no. 72.** Have any documents been drafted and published by the administrative authorities in practice? If so, please provide examples.

Schleswig-Holstein

**Question no. 73.** Have any documents (eg legal texts, announcements, information documents) been drafted and published in Low German by the administrative authorities in practice? If so, please provide examples.

*Paragraph 2*

*In respect of the local and regional authorities on whose territory the number of residents who are users of regional or minority languages is such as to justify the measures specified below, the Parties undertake to allow and/or encourage:*

a        *the use of regional or minority languages within the framework of the regional or local authority;*

Free Hanseatic City of Bremen

**Question no. 74.** Is Low German used within the framework of the regional or local authorities in Bremen? If so, please provide examples.

City of Hamburg

**Question no. 75.** Is Low German used within the framework of the regional or local authorities in Hamburg, other than for marriage ceremonies? If so, please provide examples.

Lower Saxony

**Question no. 76.** Is Low German used within the framework of the regional or local authorities in Lower Saxony, other than in Ostfriesland and in Ammerland (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 631)? If so, please provide examples.



- b *the possibility for users of regional or minority languages to submit oral or written applications in these languages;*

Free Hanseatic City of Bremen

**Question no. 77.** Please state whether the possibility to submit written documents in Low German is made use of in practice. If so, please provide examples.

**Question no. 78.** Have any measures been taken by the authorities with a view to encouraging Low German speakers to avail themselves of this possibility?

**Question no. 79.** Have the relevant authorities been informed of their obligations under the Charter?

Free and Hanseatic City of Hamburg

**Question no. 80.** Please state whether the possibility to submit written documents in Low German is made use of in practice. If so, please provide examples.

Lower Saxony

**Question no. 81.** Please state whether the possibility to submit written documents in Low German is made use of in practice. If so, please provide examples.

**Question no. 82.** Have any measures been taken by the authorities with a view to encouraging Low German speakers to avail themselves of this possibility?

Schleswig-Holstein

**Question no. 83.** Has the Land Government pursued its plan to discuss the scope for the implementation of this provision with the association of local authorities (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 700)? If so, please provide more information.

- c *the publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in the relevant regional or minority languages;*
- d *the publication by local authorities of their official documents also in the relevant regional or minority languages;*

Lower Saxony

**Question no. 84.** Have any official documents been published by the local or regional authorities?

- e *the use by regional authorities of regional or minority languages in debates in their assemblies, without excluding, however, the use of the official language(s) of the State;*

Lower Saxony

**Question no. 85.** Please provide updated information on the district councils (*Kreistage*) that use Low German in debates in their assemblies. Have the central authorities taken any measures to encourage the use of Low German by regional authorities in debates in their assemblies?

*Paragraph 4*

*With a view to putting into effect those provisions of paragraphs 1, 2 and 3 accepted by them, the Parties undertake to take one or more of the following measures:*

- c *compliance as far as possible with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of a regional or minority language to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used.*

Free and Hanseatic City of Hamburg

**Question no. 86.** Please provide information about the practical results of the initiatives of District Council Offices mentioned in the 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report (see para. 504).

Lower Saxony

**Question no. 87.** Have the authorities taken any measures to develop a policy to ensure compliance with possible requests from Low German speakers to be appointed in the territory in which their knowledge of Low German could be most useful?

Schleswig-Holstein

**Question no. 88.** Have the authorities taken any measures to develop a policy to ensure compliance with possible requests from Low German speakers to be appointed in the territory in which their knowledge of Low German could be most useful?

**Article 11 - The media**

*Paragraph 1*

*The Parties undertake, for the users of the regional or minority languages within the territories in which those languages are spoken, according to the situation of each language, to the extent that the public authorities, directly or indirectly, are competent, have power, or play a role in this field, and respecting the principle of the independence and autonomy of the media:*

- b ii to encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of radio programmes in the regional or minority languages on a regular basis;*

Free and Hanseatic City of Hamburg

**Question no. 89.** Have any steps been made to encourage and/ or facilitate the broadcasting of programmes in Low German on private radio?

Mecklenburg-Western Pomerania

**Question no. 90.** Please provide more detailed information with regard to the use of Low German on the radio channel *Antenne Mecklenburg-Vorpommern* (see 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 5118).

**Question no. 91.** Are there programmes in Low German on the 'Open Channels' in Mecklenburg-Western Pomerania (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 584)? If so, please provide more detailed information.

Schleswig-Holstein

**Question no. 92.** Are there currently programmes in Low German on the 'Open Channels' or on private radio stations in Schleswig-Holstein (see 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 5121)? If so, please provide more detailed information.

- c ii to encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of television programmes in the regional or minority languages on a regular basis;*

Free and Hanseatic City of Hamburg

**Question no. 93.** Have any steps been made to encourage and/ or facilitate the broadcasting of programmes in Low German on private television?

Mecklenburg-Western Pomerania

**Question no. 94.** Please provide information on the current extent of Low German programmes on private television programmes. For example, are there programmes in Low German on the 'Open Channel' in Neubrandenburg and Schwerin (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 588)?

Lower Saxony

**Question no. 95.** Have any steps been made to encourage and/ or facilitate the broadcasting of programmes in Low German on private television?

Schleswig-Holstein

**Question no. 96.** Have any steps been made to encourage and/ or facilitate the broadcasting of programmes in Low German on private television?

- d *to encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in the regional or minority languages;*

Free Hanseatic City of Bremen

**Question no. 97.** Are there any specific measures aimed at encouraging and/ or facilitating the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Low German in Bremen, for example in the form of technical support, direct or indirect financial support (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 436)?

Free and Hanseatic City of Hamburg

**Question no. 98.** Are there any specific measures aimed at encouraging and/ or facilitating the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Low German in the City of Hamburg, for example in the form of technical support, direct or indirect financial support (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 514)?

Lower Saxony

**Question no. 99.** Are there any specific measures aimed at encouraging and/ or facilitating the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Low German in Lower Saxony, for example in the form of technical support, direct or indirect financial support?

Schleswig-Holstein

**Question no. 100.** Are there any specific measures aimed at encouraging and/ or facilitating the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Low German in Schleswig-Holstein, for example in the form of technical support, direct or indirect financial support?

- e (ii) *to encourage and/or facilitate the publication of newspaper articles in the regional or minority languages on a regular basis;*

Free Hanseatic City of Bremen

**Question no. 101.** Have any audiovisual productions in Low German been subsidised recently by *nordmedia*?

- f (ii) *to apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in the regional or minority languages;*

Schleswig-Holstein

**Question no. 102.** Have the authorities considered ways in which the existing promotion schemes could be adapted with a view to ensuring that Low German productions can qualify for financial assistance more regularly (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 721)?

- g *to support the training of journalists and other staff for media using regional or minority languages.*

**Question no. 103.** Have the authorities of the Free Hanseatic City of Bremen taken any measures aimed at supporting the training of journalists and other staff for media using Low German?

## Article 12 - Cultural Activities and Facilities

### Paragraph 1

*With regard to cultural activities and facilities – especially libraries, video libraries, cultural centres, museums, archives, academies, theatres and cinemas, as well as literary work and film production, vernacular forms of cultural expression, festivals and the culture industries, including inter alia the use of new technologies – the Parties undertake, within the territory in which such languages are used and to the extent that the public authorities are competent, have power or play a role in this field:*

- b to foster the different means of access in other languages to works produced in regional or minority languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling activities;*
- c to foster access in regional or minority languages to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronization and subtitling activities;*

### Schleswig-Holstein

**Question no. 104.** Please clarify whether translations are carried out from or into Low German (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 723).

**Question no. 105.** Do the authorities foster access in standard German to works produced in Low German, and access in Low German to works produced in standard German, by aiding and developing means other than translations, such as dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling activities (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 723).

- d to ensure that the bodies responsible for organising or supporting cultural activities of various kinds make appropriate allowance for incorporating the knowledge and use of regional or minority languages and cultures in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing;*

### Free Hanseatic City of Bremen

**Question no. 106.** Please provide information, including practical examples, on the ways in which bodies responsible for cultural activities make appropriate allowance for Low German (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 451).

### Free and Hanseatic City of Hamburg

**Question no. 107.** Please provide information, including practical examples, on the ways in which bodies responsible for cultural activities make appropriate allowance for Low German.

- e to promote measures to ensure that the bodies responsible for organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of the regional or minority language concerned, as well as of the language(s) of the rest of the population;*

### Free Hanseatic City of Bremen

**Question no. 108.** Have the authorities of the Free Hanseatic City of Bremen provided any incentives for the direct participation of Low German-speakers in providing facilities and planning cultural activities?

- f to encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of a given regional or minority language in providing facilities and planning cultural activities;*

### Free and Hanseatic City of Hamburg

**Question no. 109.** Have the Hamburg authorities taken any measures with a view to providing incentives for direct participation by representatives of Low German-speakers (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 529)?

*Paragraph 3*

*The Parties undertake to make appropriate provision, in pursuing their cultural policy abroad, for regional or minority languages and the cultures they reflect.*

**Question no. 110.** See question n° 24.

**Article 13 - Economic and Social Life**

*Paragraph 1*

*With regard to economic and social activities, the Parties undertake within the whole country:*

- c to oppose practices designed to discourage the use of regional or minority languages in connection with economic or social activities;*

**Question no. 111.** See question n° 25.

- d to facilitate and/or encourage the use of regional or minority languages by means other than those specified in the above sub-paragraphs.*

Free and Hanseatic City of Hamburg

**Question no. 112.** Have the Hamburg authorities taken any measures to facilitate and/ or encourage the use of Low German with regard to social and economic activities (for examples, see para. 540 of the 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report)?

Schleswig-Holstein

**Question no. 113.** Have the authorities of Schleswig-Holstein taken any measures to facilitate and/ or encourage the use of Low German with regard to social and economic activities (for examples, see para. 738 of the 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report)?

**Art. 13, para. 2**

*Paragraph 2*

*With regard to economic and social activities, the Parties undertake, in so far as the public authorities are competent, within the territory in which the regional or minority languages are used, and as far as this is reasonably possible*

- c to ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the possibility of receiving and treating in their own language persons using a regional or minority language who are in need of care on grounds of ill-health, old age or for other reasons;*

Free Hanseatic City of Bremen

**Question no. 114.** Have the German authorities adopted a structured policy with a view to making more systematic the possibility for the persons concerned to be received and treated in Low German in social care facilities in Bremen?

Free and Hanseatic City of Hamburg

**Question no. 115.** Have the German authorities adopted a structured policy with a view to making more systematic the possibility for the persons concerned to be received and treated in Low German in social care facilities?

Mecklenburg-Western Pomerania

**Question no. 116.** Have the German authorities adopted a structured policy with a view to making more systematic the possibility for the persons concerned to be received and treated in Low German in social care facilities?

## Schleswig-Holstein

**Question no. 117.** Have the German authorities adopted a structured policy with a view to making more systematic the possibility for the persons concerned to be received and treated in Low German in social care facilities?

## Romany in Hesse

### Article 8 Education

#### Paragraph 1

*With regard to education, the Parties undertake, within the territory in which such languages are used, according to the situation of each of these languages, and without prejudice to the teaching of the official language(s) of the State:*

- a
  - (i) *to make available pre-school education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
  - (ii) *to make available a substantial part of pre-school education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
  - (iii) *to apply one of the measures provided for under i and ii above at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient; or*
  - (iv) *if the public authorities have no direct competence in the field of pre-school education, to favour and/or encourage the application of the measures referred to under i to iii above;*
- b
  - (i) *to make available primary education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
  - (ii) *to make available a substantial part of primary education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
  - (iii) *to provide, within primary education, for the teaching of the relevant regional or minority languages as an integral part of the curriculum; or*
  - (iv) *to apply one of the measures provided for under i to iii above at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient;*
- c
  - (i) *to make available secondary education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
  - (ii) *to make available a substantial part of secondary education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
  - (iii) *to provide, within secondary education, for the teaching of the relevant regional or minority languages as an integral part of the curriculum; or*
  - (iv) *to apply one of the measures provided for under i to iii above at least to those pupils who, or where appropriate whose families, so wish in a number considered sufficient;*
- d
  - (i) *to make available technical and vocational education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
  - (ii) *to make available a substantial part of technical and vocational education in the relevant regional or minority languages; or*
  - (iii) *to provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of the relevant regional or minority languages as an integral part of the curriculum; or*
  - (iv) *to apply one of the measures provided for under i to iii above at least to those pupils who, or where appropriate whose families, so wish in a number considered sufficient;*
- e
  - (i) *to make available university and other higher education in regional or minority languages; or*
  - (ii) *to provide facilities for the study of these languages as university and higher education subjects; or*
  - (iii) *if, by reason of the role of the State in relation to higher education institutions, sub-paragraphs i and ii cannot be applied, to encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in regional or minority languages or of facilities for the study of these languages as university or higher education subjects;*

**Question no. 118.** Please state whether the new “education plan for children aged 0 to 10 years” is being applied to the Romany language (see 3<sup>rd</sup> periodical report, para. 4006a).

- h to provide the basic and further training of the teachers required to implement those of paragraphs a to g accepted by the Party;*

**Question no. 119.** Do the authorities undertake any measures to ensure the training of teachers with regard to Romany at all levels of education?

**Question no. 120.** Has the possibility to recruit Romany-speakers as teachers who did not pass the state examination been put into practice (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 753)?

## **Article 10 - Administrative Authorities and Public Services**

### *Paragraph 2*

*In respect of the local and regional authorities on whose territory the number of residents who are users of regional or minority languages is such as to justify the measures specified below, the Parties undertake to allow and/or encourage:*

- (e) the use by regional authorities of regional or minority languages in debates in their assemblies, without excluding, however, the use of the official language(s) of the State;*
- (f) the use by local authorities of regional or minority languages in debates in their assemblies, without excluding, however, the use of the official language(s) of the State;*

**Question no. 121.** Have the authorities encouraged the use of Romany in debates in the assemblies of the regional or local authorities? Have any practical arrangements been made which would enable speakers to make use of such a possibility (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 760)?

### *Paragraph 3*

*With regard to public services provided by the administrative authorities or other persons acting on their behalf, the Parties undertake, within the territory in which regional or minority languages are used, in accordance with the situation of each language and as far as this is reasonably possible:*

- c to allow users of regional or minority languages to submit a request in these languages.*

**Question no. 122.** Have measures of any kind been taken to encourage Romany-speakers to submit requests in Romany?

### *Paragraph 4*

*With a view to putting into effect those provisions of paragraphs 1, 2 and 3 accepted by them, the Parties undertake to take one or more of the following measures:*

- c compliance as far as possible with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of a regional or minority language to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used.*

**Question no. 123.** Have the authorities taken any measures to develop a policy to ensure compliance with possible requests from Romany-speakers to be appointed in the territory in which their knowledge of Romany could be most useful?

## Article 11 - Media

### *Paragraph 1*

*The Parties undertake, for the users of the regional or minority languages within the territories in which those languages are spoken, according to the situation of each language, to the extent that the public authorities, directly or indirectly, are competent, have power or play a role in this field, and respecting the principle of the independence and autonomy of the media:*

- g to support the training of journalists and other staff for media using regional or minority languages.*

**Question no. 124.** Does the Documentation and Cultural Centre support the training of journalists and other staff for media within the meaning of this undertaking (see 2<sup>nd</sup> evaluation report, para. 773)?

## Article 12 - Cultural Activities and Facilities

### *Paragraph 2*

*In respect of territories other than those in which the regional or minority languages are traditionally used, the Parties undertake, if the number of users of a regional or minority language justifies it, to allow, encourage and/or provide appropriate cultural activities and facilities in accordance with the preceding paragraph.*

**Question no. 125.** Have the *Land* authorities made appropriate provision, in pursuing their cultural policy abroad, for the Romany language and the culture it reflects?