

## *Steering Committee on Media and Information Society*

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

19/12/2014

7th meeting

18-21 November 2014  
(Strasbourg, Agora Building, Room G03)

### Meeting report

#### 1. Opening of the meeting

1. The Steering Committee on Media and Information Society (CDMSI) held its 7<sup>th</sup> meeting in Strasbourg (18-21 November 2014), chaired by Ms Maja Rakovic (Serbia). The gender distribution among 71 attendants was 27 women (38%) and 44 men (62%).

#### 2. Adoption of the agenda

2. The CDMSI adopted the agenda with some additions to points 9.3, 12.3 and 2.5. (including two points of information from Latvia, comments on a recommendation of the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities, new requests for observer status ). The adopted agenda appears in Appendix I and the list of participants appears in Appendix II.

#### 3. Information by the Chair and the Secretariat

3. Mr. Jan Kleijssen, Director of Information Society and Action against Crime, informed the CDMSI about the Secretary General's priorities related to the work of the CDMSI concerning media freedom and safety of journalists. He encouraged the CDMSI to finalise the draft recommendation on network neutrality, underlining the human rights perspective of the work of the Council of Europe. He invited the CDMSI members to make proposals on the new Internet Governance Strategy 2016-2019.

4. The CDMSI took note of the information provided by the Secretariat and CDMSI members on the setting up of a Freedom of Expression Platform to promote the protection of journalism and safety of journalists, whose implementation would be launched at a conference organised by the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (PACE) on 4 December in Paris. The Secretariat also informed the CDMSI, about a memorandum of understanding between the Council of Europe and potential NGO partners, as well as about a Seminar and Interregional Dialogue on the protection of journalists held on 3 November 2014 in Strasbourg.

5. The Secretariat informed the CDMSI on a comparative study on the laws and practices in respect of filtering, blocking and taking down of illegal content on the Internet in all 47 member states, which will be carried out at the initiative of the Secretary General of the Council of Europe.

#### 4. Follow-up on the implementation of Council of Europe adopted standards in member states regarding the information society

6. The CDMSI discussed the content of a questionnaire on the implementation of Committee of Ministers' guidelines on eradicating impunity for serious human rights violations in the context of safety of journalists. It agreed that the Secretariat should prepare a list of more concrete questions by 15 January 2015 on the basis of discussions in the Committee and the list of CM standards related to safety of journalists.

7. The CDMSI agreed to appoint Ms Malgorzata Pek (Poland) and Ms Christina Lamprou (Greece) as rapporteurs for the preparation of the implementation item on safety of journalists for the next CDMSI meeting. In particular, the rapporteurs will review the questionnaire, which will be sent to the Bureau and thereafter to the CDMSI by 22 January 2015.

#### 5. Media

8. The CDMSI took note of the information provided by the Secretariat on the progress of the work by the Committee of Experts on protection of journalism and safety of journalists and other media actors (MSI-JO). The CDMSI discussed, exchanged views and gave specific guidance regarding a preliminary draft recommendation on protection of journalism and safety of journalists and other media actors, in particular on the style and the format of the text which should be amended and kept in line with CDMSI standards. The Chair invited comments by CDMSI delegations to be submitted to the Secretariat by 22 December 2014. The CDMSI asked MSI-JO to prepare a revised draft for the next CDMSI meeting.

9. The Secretariat informed the CDMSI on the implementation of the Recommendation CM (2013)<sup>1</sup> on gender equality and media, notably on the compilation of good practices from member states and on the preparation of a handbook which was developed together with responsible DG II colleagues of the Equality Division.

#### 6. Information Society and Internet Governance

10. The CDMSI took note of the information provided by the Chair of the MSI-INT and the Secretariat on the progress of the work of the Committee of Experts on cross-border flow of Internet traffic and Internet freedom (MSI-INT).

#### *Standard setting activities*

11. The CDMSI took note of the process and the progress of the work on the draft Recommendation CM/Rec\_\_ of the Committee of Ministers to member States on protecting and promoting the right to freedom of expression and the right to private life with regard to network neutrality. At its 6<sup>th</sup> meeting in (20-23 May 2014), the CDMSI agreed to approve the draft recommendation subject to no objection or comments requiring changes by 23 June 2014. Delegations submitted proposals for changes by this deadline and one delegation objected to the draft recommendation. The Bureau agreed to extend the deadline for comments until 11 July 2014 at the request of some delegations.

12. Based on the comments received by that date<sup>1</sup> the Bureau endorsed a revised version of the draft recommendation and agreed to circulate it to the CDMSI with a deadline for comments or objections by 19 September 2014. The Bureau then considered the comments submitted by delegations by that deadline<sup>2</sup> at its 6<sup>th</sup> meeting (24-25 September 2014), endorsed the draft recommendation and encouraged the CDMSI to finalise it at its next plenary meeting.

13. During the meeting the CDMSI extensively discussed and worked on the text on the basis of proposals for amendments submitted by delegations, notably Estonia, Sweden and the

<sup>1</sup> CDMSI(2014)Misc2 rev 2 of 26 September 2014

<sup>2</sup> CDMSI(2014)Misc2 rev 2, date of 29 September 2014

United Kingdom. The Russian Federation expressed its disagreement with the usage of the phrase “sexual orientation” in the text.

The CDMSI agreed on the draft recommendation as it appears in Appendix III. In the absence of objections submitted by delegations by 15 December 2014, the draft recommendation will be submitted to the Committee of Ministers for possible adoption.<sup>3</sup>

*Committee of Experts on cross-border flow of Internet traffic and Internet freedom (MSI-INT)*

14. The CDMSI took note of the work on the draft Recommendation CM/Rec\_\_ of the Committee of Ministers to member states on free transboundary flow of information on the Internet as proposed and finalised by the MSI-INT. The Bureau had reviewed the draft recommendation at its 6<sup>th</sup> meeting and introduced some changes. The CDMSI discussed and revised the text. The Russian Federation delegation expressed its disagreement with the phrase “sexual orientation”. The CDMSI agreed that in the absence of objections submitted by delegations by 15 December 2014, the draft recommendation (Appendix IV) will be submitted to the Committee of Ministers for possible adoption.<sup>4</sup>

15. The CDMSI took note of the information provided by the Chair of the MSI-INT Mr Oliver Schenk and the Secretariat on the elements for a draft recommendation CM/Rec\_\_of the Committee of Ministers to member States on Internet freedom. The MSI-INT agreed on a preliminary draft recommendation which aims at encouraging member State to implement human rights standards online and includes a list of indicators on Internet freedom. The CDMSI congratulated the Committee of Experts and the Secretariat for the excellent work and gave its support for the approach taken by the MSI-INT. The Chair invited comments on the preliminary draft recommendation by delegations to be submitted to the Secretariat by 22 December 2014.

16. The Secretariat informed the CDMSI on the discussion elements for a Report on freedom of assembly, expression and access to content on the Internet and a proposal for further action, prepared by the Secretariat at the request of the MSI-INT, to examine the legal framework of the freedom of assembly and the freedom of expression. The Chair invited comments by delegations to be submitted to the Secretariat by 22 December 2014.

17. The CDMSI designated Mr Vlasios Doumptotis (Greece) as new member of the MSI-INT following the departure of Mr Johan Hallenborg (Sweden) due to his change of functions.

*Internet governance strategy*

18. The CDMSI took note of the information provided by the Secretariat and discussed the state of implementation of the Internet Governance Strategy 2012-2015 which had been updated after 2013. This topic is a priority for the Secretary General and a subject of interest for the European Union. The CDMSI agreed that comments by delegations should be sent by 22 December 2014 to the Secretariat. The CDMSI took also note of information provided by the Secretariat on elements for a new strategy 2016-2019, discuss them and agreed that comments by delegations should be sent by 22 December 2014 to the Secretariat. A first draft of the strategy 2016-2019, prepared by the Secretariat, should be discussed at the next meeting of the Bureau of CDMSI.

*Cooperation and outreach activities*

19. The CDMSI took note of the information provided by the Bulgarian delegation about EuroDIG 2015 which will take place from 4 to 5 June 2015 in Sofia. The CDMSI invited

---

<sup>3</sup> As regards the term “sexual orientation” used in the general principles of the recommendation, in the meeting the Russian Federation stated that the general clause on anti-discrimination already covers this possible ground of discrimination and given the absence of any explicit definition or provision relating to such a group or such persons as separate rights holders under international human rights law.

<sup>4</sup> *ibid*

members of the Committee to participate and make proposals for workshops. The Bulgarian delegation would co-ordinate contributions.

20. In respect of the Expert Report commissioned by the Council of Europe "ICANN's procedures and policies in the light of human rights, fundamental freedoms and democratic values", the CDMSI heard a presentation by the Secretariat and noted that the Governmental Advisory Committee of ICANN had discussed the expert report which had formed the basis for cross-community discussions. The CDMSI agreed that a drafting committee should be created to prepare a possible Council of Europe declaration based on the report with a view to advancing the further discussions in ICANN on the implementation of the report's recommendations.

21. The CDMSI took note of the information provided by the Secretariat and CDMSI members on the NETMundial: Global multi-stakeholder meeting on the future of Internet governance (Sao Paolo, 23-24 April 2014); the World Summit on the Information Society (WSIS) +10 Review Process and the Global Commission on Internet Governance. The CDMSI had an exchange of views on how to promote European values globally, notably in the context of the UN WSIS +10 Review, IGF and ICANN on the basis of the Council of Europe Internet Governance Strategy. In this context, under its existing terms of reference, the CDMSI decided to prepare (a) draft declaration(s) on these issues for possible adoption by the Committee of Ministers.

## 7. Cooperation activities

22. The Secretariat informed the CDMSI on finalised and ongoing projects in the fields of media and Internet governance, in particular the implementation of the Recommendation CM/Rec(2014)6 of the Committee of Ministers to member States on a guide to human rights for Internet users.

## 8. Data protection

23. The CDMSI took note of the information provided by Mr Jean-Philippe Walter, Chair of the T-PD and by the Secretariat, on the draft Recommendation CM/Rec(2014)\_\_\_ of the Committee of Ministers to member states on the processing of personal data in the context of employment (Appendix V), proposed by the Consultative Committee of Convention ETS No 108 of the Council of Europe for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data (T-PD). The draft Recommendation is the revision of an existing recommendation on the same subject adopted in 1989 and takes into account the growing use of information technologies in the context of employment and the need to protect employee's dignity and human rights against the monitoring of their activities. The explanatory memorandum prepared by the Secretariat explains the progress of the work and will further include the comments of the Russian Federation delegation as regards to the storage of personal data. The CDMSI agreed on some changes to the draft and decided to submit the draft recommendation to the Committee of Ministers for possible adoption. The Chair of the T-PD and the Secretariat also informed the CDMSI on the work programme of the T-PD for 2015, which will mainly focus on topics such as the police guidelines, medical data and big data, as well as on the last meeting of the Ad hoc Committee on Data Protection (CAHDATA) on 1-3 December 2014, entrusted with the task to adopting an amending Protocol to Convention 108.

## 9. Information about work of other organisations and other CoE bodies

24. The CDMSI took note of the information on the Recommendation 364(2014) "The role of regional media as a tool for building participatory democracy" adopted by the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities. The CDMSI agreed that the Secretariat will draft a reply on the basis of written comments to be provided by delegations by 1 December 2014. The draft reply will be considered by the Bureau and the CDMSI via e-mail.

## 10. Budget and administrative matters

25. Mr. Jan Kleijssen, Director of Information Society and Action against Crime, informed the CDMSI on the zero-nominal growth budget decision of the Committee of Ministers for 2015 and of the necessity for the CDMSI to prioritise its activities.

26. He also informed the CDMSI on two administrative decisions: Mr. Jan Malinowski had been appointed new Executive Secretary of the Pompidou Group, while Mr. Patrick Penninckx would take up the position of Head of the Information Society Department, both as of 1 December 2014. Mr. Kleijssen thanked Mr Malinowski for his work for the Committee and welcomed Mr. Penninckx who introduced himself to the CDMSI members. The CDMSI expressed its deep appreciation of Jan Malinowski's great contribution towards advancing the work of the committee and in raising awareness on human rights issues in the information society and the relevance of the Council of Europe's expertise in this field on a regional and global level. The committee wished him well in his future work. The CDMSI welcomed Patrick Penninckx as the new Head of the Information Society Department.

## 11. Priorities of CDMSI work and working methods

27. In order to ensure delivery of its Terms of Reference, the CDMSI agreed, on the basis of Resolution CM/Res(2011)24, to create five drafting committees on: media pluralism and transparency of media ownership; gender equality dimension in the media coverage of election campaigns; professional and ethical journalism and hate speech; public service media; surveillance issues. The Bureau will make a proposal regarding the scope of work, objectives and timetable of these drafting committees on the basis of information provided by the Secretariat until 15 January 2015. The drafting committees should be operational from mid-January. As participation is limited to CDMSI members, external experts cannot be members of these committees.

## 12. Other questions

28. In respect of observer status requests, the CDMSI agreed to admit the Internet Watch Foundation as an observer. Noting the criteria it has applied in the past, in particular with regard to representation at European level, the CDMSI did not grant at this stage observer status to International Press Club Prague. The CDMSI took note of the applications for observer status from the Internet Rights and Principles Coalition and the European Media Platform and agreed to invite these two organisations to present their applications at the next meeting of the CDMSI.

## 13. Elections of Chair and Vice-Chair

29. The CDMSI elected Ms Maja Rakovic (Serbia) as Chairperson for a second term of office expiring on 31 December 2015, and Ms Elfa Ýr Gylfadóttir (Iceland) as Vice Chairperson for a first term of office expiring on 31 December 2015. Both were elected with a large majority.

## 14. Any other business

## 15. Adoption of the abridged report

30. Noting the absence of a quorum, the CDMSI finalised the abridged report of the meeting and agreed that in the absence of reactions by 24 November 2014 it will be considered as adopted by the plenary.

## Appendix I

28/10/2014

7th meeting

CDMSI (2014)OJ2rev3

18 – 21 November 2014

(Strasbourg, Agora building, Room G03)

## Annotated agenda

1. Opening of the meeting
2. Adoption of the agenda

Notes and expected action	Adopt the agenda and its order of business.
---------------------------	---

3. Information by the Chair and the Secretariat

- 3.1 *Council of Europe action to strengthen the protection of freedom of expression*

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">SG/Inf(2014)2</a>	<i>Setting up of a Freedom of Expression Platform to promote the protection of journalism and safety of journalists - Proposals by the Secretary General to the Committee of Ministers</i>
<a href="#">SG/Inf (2014)37</a>	<i>Internet-based Platform to promote the protection of journalism and safety of journalists</i>
<u>Report</u>	<a href="#">Round Table on Safety of Journalists</a> – From commitment to action, 19 May 2014 – Strasbourg
<a href="#">SG(2014)1-FINAL</a>	<i>Report by the Secretary General of the Council of Europe 'State of Democracy, Human Rights and Rule of Law in Europe'</i>
	<i>Information on a comparative study on the laws and practices in respect of filtering, blocking and taking down of illegal content on the Internet in all 47 member States</i>
	<i>Commissioner for Human Rights issue paper on the Rule of Law on the Internet and in the wider digital world (subject to publication, foreseen for September)</i>
	<i>UNESCO Concept Note: Research project on the safety of journalists as potential indicator of rule of law, democracy and development</i>
<u>Agenda</u>	<a href="#">Seminar</a> and Inter-regional Dialogue on the protection of journalists
<u>Website</u>	3rd UN-Inter-Agency Meeting on the Safety of Journalists and the Issue of Impunity (Strasbourg, 4 November 2014)
Notes and expected action	Take note of the information provided by the Secretariat and discuss.

### 3.1 **Human rights of Internet users**

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">CM/Rec(2014)6</a>	<i>Recommendation CM/Rec(2014)6 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on a Guide to human rights for Internet users</i>

<a href="#">Website link</a>	<i>Rights of Internet Users</i>
<a href="#">CDMSI(2014)Misc7</a>	<i>Progress Report on Implementation of the CM Recommendation on a Guide to Human Rights for Internet Users</i>
Notes and expected action	<i>Take note of the information provided by the Secretariat.</i>

4. Follow-up on the implementation of Council of Europe adopted standards in member states regarding media and information society

<i>Documents</i>	
<a href="#">CDMSI(2014)006</a>	<i>Implementation of adopted standards</i>
<a href="#">CDMSI(2014)012</a>	<i>List of CM standards related to safety of journalists</i>
<a href="#">CDMSI(2014)Misc6rev</a>	<i>Questions for CDMSI members on the implementation of the <a href="#">guidelines of the CM</a> on eradicating impunity for serious human rights violations, in the context of safety of journalists (30 March 2011)</i>
<a href="#">CM/Del/Dec(2012)1131</a>	<i>Follow-up to the thematic debate: "Media freedom"</i>
Notes and expected action	Take note of the information provided by the Secretariat and discuss the questionnaire submitted by the Bureau following a proposition by the Secretariat. Nomination of a thematic rapporteur on the topic of safety of journalists.

5. Media

#### *Standard setting activities*

- 5.1. *Committee of experts on protection of journalism and safety of journalists (MSI-JO)*

<i>Documents</i>	
<a href="#">ToR</a>	<i>Terms of reference of the MSI-JO</i>
<a href="#">MSI-JO(2014)01</a>	<i>Agenda of the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the MSI-JO ( 6-7 October 2014)</i>
<a href="#">MSI-JO(2014)08</a>	<i>Draft report of the 2<sup>st</sup> meeting of the MSI-JO (6-7 October 2014)</i>
<a href="#">A/HRC/27/L.7</a>	<i>United Nations: 27/...The safety of journalists</i>
<a href="#">MSI-JO(2014)09rev</a>	<i>MSI-JO preliminary draft recommendation prepared by Tarlach McGonagle, Rapporteur MSI-JO</i>
<a href="#">MSI-JO(2014)Misc1</a>	<i>Russian declaration on draft recommendation on protection of journalism and safety of journalists</i>
<a href="#">MSI-JO (2014)04</a>	<i>Proposal for collection of good practices, information document (prepared by Secretariat)</i>
Notes and expected action	Take note of the information provided by the Secretariat and discuss the preliminary draft Recommendation on protection of journalism and safety of journalists with a view to giving guidance to MSI-JO.

- 5.2 *Hate speech*

<i>Documents</i>	
<a href="#">Campaign</a>	<i>No Hate Speech campaign</i>
<a href="#">DDCP-YD/CHS (2014)2rev</a>	<i>Hate speech draft strategic objectives</i>
	<i>Presentation to CDMSI by young activist and Ms Bridget O'Loughlin, Campaign Co-ordinator of the No Hate Speech Movement (to be confirmed)</i>
Notes and expected action	Take note of the information provided by the Secretariat and discuss possible follow-up.

- 5.3 *Gender equality and the media*

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">CM/Rec(2013)01</a>	<i>Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers to member States on gender equality and media</i>
<a href="#">GEC (2014)14</a>	<i>Handbook on the application of Recommendation CM/Rec(2013)1 of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on gender equality and media</i>
<a href="#">CM(2013)136final Report</a>	<i>Gender Equality Strategy 2014-2017 UNESCO Global Forum on Media &amp; Gender – Report by Margaret Gallagher <a href="#">Gender Equality and the Media</a> at national level – <a href="#">Compilation of good practices</a> in member States</i>
Notes and expected action	Take note of the information provided by the Secretariat and discuss on the possible creation of a working group on gender equality and media.

#### 5.4 Transparency of media ownership

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">Resolution 2</a>	<i>Belgrade Resolution on Preserving the essential role of media in the digital age</i>
<a href="#">10 recommendations</a>	<i>Ten recommendations on transparency of media ownership, paper by Access Info</i>
<a href="#">Conference</a>	<i>Conference on transparency of media ownership – Brussels, 24 September 2013</i>
<a href="#">Presentation</a>	<i>Presentation by Fiona Harrisson (Access Info)</i>
<a href="#">Agenda</a>	<i>Regional Conference Transparency in Media Ownership and Preventing Media Concentration, 25-26 September 2014, Skopje</i>
<a href="#">Agenda</a>	<i>Digital Agenda for Europe (New meeting)- Exchange of best practices on transparency of media ownership, Brussels, 3 October 2014</i>
<a href="#">AS/Cult/Inf(2014)04</a>	<i>PACE Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media, Background Report: The Unbearable lightness of Media Ownership Transparency, Peggy Valcke (Expert, Professor of Law at KU Leuven), 24 September 2014</i>
Notes and expected action	Take note of the information provided by the Secretariat, notably expert report prepared in the PACE. Discuss the possible creation of a working group on the issue of transparency of media ownership.

#### 5.5 Public service media

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">Declaration</a>	<i>Declaration of the Committee of Ministers on Public Service Media Governance</i>
<a href="#">CM/Rec(2012)1</a>	<i>Recommendation CM/Rec(2012)1 of the Committee of Ministers to member States on public service media governance</i>
<a href="#">Resolution 2</a>	<i>Belgrade Resolution on Preserving the essential role of media in the digital age</i>
Notes and expected action	Discuss possible action with regard to public service media matters.

### 6. Information Society and Internet Governance



## Standard setting activities

### 6.1. Network neutrality

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">CDMSI(2014)005Rev7</a>	<i>Draft Recommendation CM/Rec(2014)___of the Committee of Ministers to member States on protecting and promoting the right to freedom of expression and the right to private life with regard to network neutrality</i>
<a href="#">CDMSI(2014)Misc2rev2</a> <a href="#">CDMSI(2014)Misc2rev2 addendum</a>	<i>Compilation of comments by CDMSI members</i>
Notes and expected action	Discuss and approve the draft Recommendation CM/Rec(2014) of the Committee of Ministers to member States on protecting and promoting the right to freedom of expression and the right to private life with regard to network neutrality with a view to transmission to the Committee of Ministers for possible adoption.

### 6.2 Committee of Experts on cross-border flow of Internet traffic and Internet freedom (MSI-INT)

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">MSI-INT(2014)10</a>	<i>Report of the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the MSI-INT (3-4 July 2014)</i>
<a href="#">MSI-INT(2014)06rev2</a>	<i>Draft recommendation CM/Rec(2014)___ of the Committee of Ministers to member states on free transboundary flow of information on the Internet</i>
<a href="#">MSI-INT(2014)13</a>	<i>Elements for a draft Recommendation CM/Rec ...of the Committee of Ministers to member states on Internet Freedom</i>
<a href="#">MSI-INT(2014)08</a>	<i>Report on freedom of assembly, expression and access to content on the Internet and proposals for further action – discussion elements for a structure proposal prepared by the Secretariat</i>
CDMSI(2014)017	<i>Information document on candidates for one member of the MSI-INT (not on line)</i>
<a href="#">Resolution 1</a>	<i>Belgrade Resolution on Internet Freedom</i>
Notes and expected action	Discuss and approve the draft recommendation CM/Rec (2014) of the Committee of Ministers to member States on free transboundary flow of information on the Internet with a view to transmission to the Committee of Ministers for possible adoption. Take note of information provided by the Secretariat and the Chair of the MSI-INT on the state of play with regard to the draft recommendation on Internet freedom and the report on freedom of assembly, expression and access to content on the Internet and discuss. Designate one member of the MSI-INT.

### 6.3 Council of Europe Internet Governance Strategy 2012-2015 and new Internet Governance Strategy 2016-2019

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">CDMSI(2014)16</a>	<i>Oversight of the Internet Governance Strategy 2012-2015</i>
<a href="#">CDMSI(2014)Misc4rev</a>	<i>Discussion elements for Internet Governance Strategy (2016-2019)</i>
<a href="#">Website</a>	<i>World Forum for Democracy (Strasbourg, 3-9 November 2014)</i>
Notes and expected action	Consider the report on the Internet Governance Strategy 2012-2015. Discuss comments on elements for the Internet governance strategy 2016-2019 and its implementation.

## Cooperation and outreach activities

#### 6.4 European Dialogue on Internet Governance (EuroDIG – 12-13 June 2014, Berlin) and Internet Governance Forum (IGF, Istanbul, 2-5 September 2014)

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">EuroDIG programme</a>	EuroDIG 2014
<a href="#">Messages</a>	EuroDIG Messages from Berlin
<a href="#">IGF Programme paper</a>	IGF 2014
<a href="#">Summary</a>	IGF Chair's summary
Notes and expected action	Take note of information from the Secretariat.

#### 6.5 ICANN

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">DGI(2014)12</a>	<i>Council of Europe Expert Report: ICANN's procedures and policies in the light of human rights, fundamental freedoms and democratic values</i>
<a href="#">CDMSI(2014)Misc3</a>	<i>Comments received on Council of Europe expert report on ICANN's procedures and policies in the light of human rights, fundamental freedoms and democratic values</i>
Notes and expected action	Discuss shortly on the Expert Report on ICANN's procedure and policies in the light of human rights, fundamental freedoms and democratic values.

#### 6.6 Other activities

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">NETmundial Multistakeholder Statement</a>	<i>NETmundial: Global multi-stakeholder meeting on the future of Internet governance (São Paulo, 23-24 April 2014)</i>
<a href="#">WSIS + 10 Open Consultation Process</a>	<i>World Summit on Information Society (WSIS) +10 Review Process</i>
<a href="#">GCIC</a>	<i>Global Commission on Internet Governance</i>
Notes and expected action	Take note of the information provided by the Secretariat and consider possible follow-up discussion.

#### 7. Cooperation activities

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">MEDIA.COOP(2014)04</a>	<i>Accomplished and ongoing projects in the field of media and freedom of expression</i>
<a href="#">MEDIA.COOP(2014)02</a>	<i>Ongoing and planned cooperation activities in the field of Internet governance</i>
Notes and expected action	Take note of the state of play and of the information provided by the Secretariat.

#### 8. Data protection

##### Standard setting activities

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">T-PD (2014) WP rev</a>	<i>Work programme of the T-PD for 2014-2015</i>
<a href="#">T-PD(2014)RAP31Abr_rev</a>	<i>Abridged Report of the 31st Plenary meeting of the T-PD (2-4 June 2014)</i>
<a href="#">T-PD(2014)08</a>	<i>T-PD Draft Recommendation on the processing of personal data in</i>

	<i>the context of employment (Presentation by T-PD Chair to CDMSI plenary)</i>
<a href="#">Explanatory memorandum</a>	<i>Recommendation CM/REC(2014)...of the Committee of Ministers to member states on the processing of personal data in the context of employment</i>
<a href="#">T-PD(2014)09</a>	<i>Secretariat note: Revision of the Recommendation No. R (89) 2 on the protection of personal data used for employment purposes</i>
<a href="#">ToR CAHDATA</a>	<i>Terms of reference of the ad hoc Committee on data protection (CAHDATA)</i>
<a href="#">CAHDATA(2014)3</a>	<i>Working document – Convention 108 with Additional Protocol and Modernisation proposals</i>
<a href="#">CAHDATA (2014)RAPO2Abr</a>	<i>Abridged Report of the 2nd meeting (28-30 April 2014)</i>
Notes and expected action	Take note of the state of play and the information provided by the Secretariat. Examine the text of the T-PD draft Recommendation on the processing of personal data in the context of employment with a view to approval and transmit it to the Committee of Ministers for possible adoption.

## 9. Information about the work of other organisations and other CoE bodies

### 9.1 Participation of CDMSI in events and meetings

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">Agenda</a>	<i>New Media Literacy Leonardo da Vinci project – Seminar (Bratislava, 29-30 May 2014)</i>
<a href="#">Agenda</a>	<i>Day of General Discussion “Digital media and children’s rights”, held on the 12th of September in Geneva.</i>
	<i>EU Side event on Freedom of Expression Online, Warsaw 22 September 2014</i>
<a href="#">Agenda</a>	<i>EPRA Tbilisi, 8-10 October 2014</i>
<a href="#">Agenda</a>	<i>Conference on “Orbital Slots and Spectrum Use in an Era of Interference” organised by the French Institute for International Relations (IFRI), Brussels, 9 October 2014</i>
Notes and expected action	Take note of the information provided by the Bureau members.

### 9.2 Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (PACE)

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">CDMSI(2014)009rev</a>	<i>CDMSI comments on <a href="#">PACE Recommendation 2041(2014)</a> Improving user protection and security in the cyberspace</i>
<a href="#">AS/Inf(2014)14</a>	<i>List of documents under preparation in the PACE Committee on culture Science, Education and Media</i>
<a href="#">CM/AS(2014)Rec2036</a>	<i>Reply adopted by the Committee of Ministers to “Revision of the European Convention on Transfrontier Television” Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 2034 (2014)</i>
Notes and expected action	Take note of the information provided by the Secretariat.

## 10. Budget and administrative matters

## 11. Priorities of CDMSI work and working methods

<u>Documents</u>	
------------------	--

<a href="#">Belgrade Political declaration and resolutions</a>	<i>Council of Europe Conference of Ministers responsible for Media and Information Society – Freedom of Expression and Democracy in the Digital Age – Opportunities, Rights, Responsibilities. Adopted Political Declaration and Resolutions</i>
<a href="#">CM(2013)162</a>	<i>Council of Europe Conference of Ministers responsible for Media and Information Society (Belgrade, 7-8 November 2013) – Report of the Secretary General</i>
<a href="#">CM decisions</a>	<i>Council of Europe Conference of Ministers responsible for Media and Information Society (Belgrade, 7-8 November 2013) – Decisions of the Committee of Ministers</i>
<a href="#">CDMSI(2014)011</a>	<i>Priorities of CDMSI, information document</i>
Notes and expected action	Discuss possible themes for hearings. Discuss and agree on the creation of informal working groups on the following themes: professional and ethical journalism; gender equality dimension in the media coverage of electoral campaigns. Consider possible informal working groups on surveillance issues, public service media and hate speech.

## 12. Other questions

### 12.1 Application for observer status by Internet Watch Foundation

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">Application letter</a>	<i>Application letter</i>
<a href="#">Memo IWF</a>	<i>Memorandum of Association of Internet Watch Foundation</i>
<a href="#">Service Level Agreement Association ACPO/IWF</a>	<i>Service level agreement</i>
<a href="#">Annual report 2013</a>	<i>IWF annual report</i>
<a href="#">Human Rights Audit (2014)</a>	<i>2014 Audit</i>
<a href="#">Letter</a>	<i>Complementary information concerning IWF's application for observer status</i>
Notes and expected action	Discuss with a view to reaching a conclusion on this application.

### 12.2 Application for observer status by Press Club Prague

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">Application letter</a>	<i>Application letter</i>
Notes and expected action	Discuss with a view to reaching a conclusion on this application.

## 13. Elections of Chair and Vice-chair

<u>Documents</u>	
<a href="#">CDMSI(2014)Misc9</a>	<i>Elections of Chair and Vice-Chair</i>

## 14. Any other business

## 15. Adoption of abridged report

## LIST OF PARTICIPANTS / LISTE DES PARTICIPANTS

Total number of participants/ *nombre total de participants* : 71  
 Gender distribution – 44 men (62%) / 27 women (38%)  
*Parité hommes / femmes - 44 hommes (62%) / 27 femmes (38%)*

## ALBANIA/ALBANIE

Mr/M. Glevin Dervishi

Albanian Ministry of Foreign Affairs / *Ministère des affaires étrangères d'Albanie*

## AUSTRIA/AUTRICHE

Mr/M. Matthias Traimer

Federal Chancellery, Head of Department, Media Affairs and Information Society, Federal Chancellery, Constitutional Service

*Chancellerie fédérale, Chef de service, Média et Société de l'Information, service constitutionnel de la Chancellerie fédérale*

## AZERBAIJAN

Ms/Mme. Jeyran Amiraslanova

Chief Advisor for Public and Political Issues, Office of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan

*Conseiller en chef pour les questions publiques et politiques, Bureau du Président de la République d'Azerbaïdjan*

## BELGIUM/BELGIQUE

Apologised / *Excusé*

## BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA/BOSNIE-HERZEGOVINE

Mr/M. Emir Povlakic

Head of Division for Licensing, Digitalization and Coordination in Broadcasting, Communications Regulatory Authority

*Chef de division, Licences, numérisation et coordination, Autorité de régulation des communications et de la radiodiffusion*

## BULGARIA/BULGARIE

Ms/Mme. Bissera Zankova, Media Expert – Consultant / *Consultante, expert en médias*

Ministry of Transport, IT and Communications / *Ministère des transports, des technologies de l'information et des communications*

## CROATIA/CROATIE

Mr Milan F. Zivkovic

Head Advisor for Communication Policy, Ministry of Culture

*Conseiller en chef pour les politiques de communication, Ministère de la culture*

Ms/Mme. Vesna Roller

The Council for Electronic Media / *Conseil pour les médias électroniques*

## CYPRUS/CHYPRE

Ms/Mme. Eleonora Gavrielides

Ministry of Interior / *Ministère de l'intérieur*

## CZECH REPUBLIC/REPUBLIQUE TCHEQUE

Mr Artuš Rejent

Media and Audio-Visual Department, Ministry of Culture / *Service médias et audio-visuel, Ministère de la culture*

## DENMARK/DANEMARK

Ms/Mme. Katja Just Maarbjerg (19th–21/11/2014)

Ministry of Culture / *Ministère de la culture*

## ESTONIA/ESTONIE

Mr/M. Indrek Ibrus

Senior specialist of audiovisual affairs, Estonian Ministry of Culture

*Spécialiste des affaires audio-visuelles, Ministère de la culture d'Estonie*

## FINLAND/FINLANDE

Commercial Secretary, Information Society and ICT, Ministry for Foreign Affairs  
*Secrétaire commercial, Société et technologies de l'information, Ministère des affaires étrangères*

## FRANCE

Ms/Mme. Joanna Chansel  
 Ministry of Culture and Communications / *Ministère de la culture et de la communication*

Mr/M. Julien Plubel

Ministry for Foreign Affairs, Directorate for cultural, university and research co-operation, External audio-visual department / *Ministère des Affaires étrangères, Direction de la coopération culturelle, universitaire et de la recherche, Pôle de l'audiovisuel extérieur*

## GEORGIA/GEORGIE

Ms/Mme. Irine Bartaia  
 Deputy Director, Department of International Law, Ministry of Foreign Affairs  
*Directeur adjoint, service des législations internationales, Ministère des Affaires étrangères*

## GERMANY/ALLEMAGNE

Mr/M. Oliver Schenk (18–19/11/2014)  
 Division K 31, International Media Co-operation, Federal Government Commissioner for Culture and the Media / *Division K 31, Coopération internationale pour les médias, Commissaire du gouvernement fédéral pour la culture et les médias*

Mr/M. Jan Wiegandt (20-21/11/2014)

Vertretung des Landes Rheinland-Pfalz to the EU/ *Représentation de l'Etat de Rhénanie Palatinat auprès de l'UE*

Ms/Mme. Annick Kuhl

EU Representation of the Free State of Bavaria to the EU / *Représentation de l'Etat libre de Bavière auprès de l'UE*

## GREECE/GRECE

Ms/Mme. Christina Lamprou  
 Head of the Department of Audiovisual Affairs, Directorate of Mass Media - General Secretariat of Information and Communication  
*Chef du service des affaires audio-visuelles, Direction des médias de masse – Secrétariat général de l'information et de la communication*

## HUNGARY/HONGRIE

Mr/M. György Ocskó  
 International Legal Adviser, National Media and Infocommunications Authority  
*Conseiller juridique international, Autorité nationale des médias et de l'info-communication*

Mr/M. János Auer

Member of the Media Council of the National Media and Infocommunications Authority  
*Membre du Conseil pour les médias de l'Autorité nationale des médias et de l'info-communication*

## ICELAND/ISLANDE

Ms/Mme Elfa Ýr Gylfadóttir  
 Media Commission, Ministry of Education, Science and Culture  
*Commission des médias, Ministère de l'éducation, des sciences et de la culture*

## IRELAND/IRLANDE

Mr/M. Éanna O'Conghaile  
 Principal Officer, Broadcasting Policy Division, Department of Communications, Energy & Natural Resources  
*Officier principal, Division des politiques de radio-diffusion, Service de la communication, de l'énergie et des ressources naturelles*

Mr Richard Browne,

Department of Communications, Energy & Natural Resources / *Service de la communication, de l'énergie et des ressources naturelles*

## ITALY/ITALIE

Mr/M. Pierluigi Mazzella

Director General, Agency for the right to university education, Professor of Information and Communication, University of Rome  
*Directeur général, Agence pour les droits à l'éducation universitaire, Professeur en information et communication, Université de Rome*

## LATVIA/LETTONIE

Mr/M. Andris Mellakauls  
 Information Space Integration, Ministry of Culture / *Intégration de l'espace de l'information, Ministère de la culture*

## LITHUANIA/LITUANIE

Ms/Mme. Vida Česnaitė  
 Department advisor, Ministry of culture, Information Society Development Division  
*Conseiller, Ministère de la culture, Division du développement de la société de l'information*

## LIECHTENSTEIN

Mr/M. Claudio Nardi,  
 Officer for Foreign Affairs / *Officier pour les affaires étrangères*

## MALTA/ MALTE

Ms/Mme. Nancy Caruana,  
 Ministry for the Economy, investment and Small Business, Office of the Permanent Secretary  
*Ministère de l'économie, de l'investissement et des petites entreprises, Bureau du secrétaire permanent*

## MONACO

Mr/M. Serge Robillard,  
 Head of Division, Digital Communications Directorate / *Chef de Division, Direction des Communications Électroniques*

## MONTENEGRO

Mr/M. Ranko Vujovic,  
 Executive Director, UNEM / *Directeur exécutif, UNEM*

## REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA / REPUBLIQUE MOLDAVE

Ms/Mme. Ana Taban,  
 Head of Information and Media Outreach Office, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and European Integration  
*Chef du bureau de l'information et du développement des médias, Ministère des affaires étrangères et de l'intégration européenne*

## THE NETHERLANDS/PAYS-BAS

Ms/Mme. Pien van den Eijnden (18-20/11/2014)  
 Legal Adviser, Constitutional Affairs, Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations  
*Conseiller juridique, Affaires constitutionnelles, Ministère de l'intérieur*

## NORWAY/NORVEGE

Mr/M. Olav Guntvedt  
 Assistant Director General, Department of Media Policy and Copyright, Ministry of Culture  
*Directeur général adjoint, Service des politiques des médias et du droits d'auteur, Ministère de la culture*

## POLAND/POLOGNE

Ms/Mme. Małgorzata Pek  
 Deputy Director of Strategy Department, Office of the National Broadcasting Council  
*Directrice adjointe du service de la stratégie, Conseil national de la radiodiffusion*

Mr/M. Maciej Gron

Director of the Department of Information Society, Ministry of Administration and Digitization  
*Directeur du Service de la société de l'information, Ministère de l'administration et de la numérisation*

## PORTUGAL

Mr/M. Pedro Ruivo  
 GMCS, Cabinet pour les Médias ("Gabinete para os Meios de Comunicação Social")  
*GMCS, Bureau des médias*

## ROMANIA / ROUMANIE

Ms/Mme. Delia Mucica,

Ministry of Culture and National Heritage / *Ministère de la culture et du patrimoine*  
 RUSSIAN FEDERATION / FEDERATION RUSSIE  
 Mr/M. Alexander Surikov  
 Deputy Director, Department of Information and Press, Ministry of Communication  
*Directeur adjoint, Service de l'information et de la presse, Ministère de la communication*

## SERBIA/SERBIE

Ms/Mme. Maja Rakovic,  
 1st Adviser, Serbian Embassy in France / *1er conseiller, Ambassade de Serbie en France*

Ms/Mme. Maja Zaric,  
 Adviser, Sector for International Relations, EU integration and projects, Ministry of Culture and Information  
*Conseiller, Secteur des relations internationales, de l'intégration dans l'UE et des projets, Ministère de la culture et de l'information*

## SLOVENIA/SLOVENIE

Mr/M. Skender Adem  
 Undersecretary, Ministry of Culture / *Sous-secrétaire, Ministère de la culture*

## SLOVAKIA/SLOVAQUIE

Ms/M. Ivana Maláková,  
 Head of Unit Media Law and Audiovisual Unit Media, Audiovisual and Copyright Department, Ministry of Culture  
*Chef d'unité, Unité législation des médias et de l'audiovisuel, Service de l'audiovisuel et du droit d'auteur, Ministère de la culture*

## SWEDEN

Mr/M. Christoffer Lärkner  
 Department of Culture / *Service de la culture*

## SWITZERLAND

Mr/M. Thomas Schneider  
 International Affairs, Federal Office of Communication, Federal Department for the environment, transport, energy and communication  
*Affaires internationales, Office fédéral de la communication, Service fédéral pour l'environnement, les transports, l'énergie et les communications*

Mr/M. Frédéric Riehl  
 Head of International Affairs, Federal Office of Communication, Federal Department for the environment, transport, energy and communication  
*Chef des affaires internationales, Office fédéral de la communication, Service fédéral pour l'environnement, les transports, l'énergie et les communications*

„Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia“ / „Ex république yougoslave de Macédoine“

Ms/Mme. Vesna Poposka  
 Head of International PR Department, Government of the Republic of Macedonia  
*Chef du service des relations publiques internationales, Gouvernement de la République de Macédoine,*

## TURKEY/TURQUIE

Mr/M. Mehmet Bora Sönmez  
 Media Expert, Radio and Television Supreme Council / *Expert des médias, Conseil supérieur de la radio et de la télévision*

Mr/M. Nurullah Öztürk,  
 Member of the Supreme Council, Radio and Television Supreme Council / *Membre du Conseil supérieur de la radio et de la télévision*

## UKRAINE

Ms/Mme. Olga Herasymiuk,  
 First Deputy Chair of the National Council of Ukraine for Television and Radio Broadcasting  
*Première vice-présidente du Conseil national d'Ukraine pour la télévision et la radio et télédiffusion*  
 Ms/Mme. Larysa Vasylenko  
 Head of International Relations Division of the National Television and Radio Broadcasting Council



*Chef de la division des relations internationales du Conseil national d'Ukraine pour la télévision et la radio et télédiffusion*

UNITED KINGDOM/ROYAUME-UNI

Mr/M. Mark Carvell

Media Team, Department for Culture, Media and Sport / *Equipe Médias, Service de la culture, des médias et des sports*

\* \* \*

OBSERVERS/PARTICIPANTS

BELARUS

Ms/Mme. Maria Vanshina

Deputy Head of Communication Department, Head of Press Service, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

*Chef adjoint du service de la communication, chef du service de presse, Ministère des affaires étrangères*

BLACK SEA BROADCASTING REGULATORY AUTHORITIES FORUM (BRAFA)

Dr Hamit Ersoy

Secretary General / *Secrétaire général*

EUROPEAN AUDIO VISUAL OBSERVATORY/OBSERVATOIRE EUROPEEN DE L'AUDIO VISUEL

Ms/Mme. Nikoltchev Susanne,

Executive Director / *Directrice exécutive*

EUROPEAN ASSOCIATION FOR VIEWERS INTERESTS (EAVI)

Ms/Mme. Krstina Stoycheva

EUROPEAN UNION/UNION EUROPEENNE

Mr/M. Maciej Tomaszewski (20–21/11/2014)

Policy officer – international, DG Connect, Unit D1, European Commission

*Responsable des politiques – international, DG Connect, Unité D1, Commission Européenne*

EUROPEAN BROADCASTING UNION (EBU) / [UNION EUROPEENNE DE RADIO-TELEVISION \(UER\)](#)

Ms/Mme Anne-Catherine Berg,

Legal Adviser, Legal Department / *Conseiller juridique, Service juridique*

Mr/M. Giacomo Mazzone,

Head of Institutional Relations, Public Affairs & Communications / *Chef des relations institutionnelles, des affaires publiques et de la communication*

EuroSPA

Mr/M. Michael Rotert

Honorary Spokesman / *Porte-parole honoraire*

ASSOCIATION OF EUROPEAN JOURNALISTS (AEJ) / MEDIA FREEDOM REPRESENTATIVE

Mr/M William Horsley (18–20/11/2014)

Media Freedom Representative / *Représentant pour la liberté des médias*

EUROPEAN NEWSPAPER PUBLISHERS ASSOCIATION (ENPA) / ASSOCIATION EUROPEENNE DES EDITEURS DE JOURNAUX

Mr/M. Holger Rosedal,

Head of Legal Department / *Chef du service juridique*

CONFERENCE OF INTERNATIONAL NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANISATIONS OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / CONFÉRENCE DES ORGANISATIONS INTERNATIONALES NON GOUVERNEMENTALES DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Mr/M. Didier Schretter

Member of the Standing Committee, Vice-chair Education and Culture Committee

*Membre du comité permanent, vice-président du Comité de l'éducation et de la culture*

COPEAM

Ms/Mme. Alessandra Paradisi

## HOLY SEE / SAINT SIEGE

Dr Michael Lukas

Episcopal Press Office / *Bureau de presse épiscopal*

## I CANN

Mr/M. Nigel Hickson (20–21/11/2014)

VP, IGO Engagement / *Vice-président, Engagement IGO*

## ORGANIZATION FOR SECURITY AND COOPERATION IN EUROPE (OSCE)

Dr. Juan (Joan) Barata Mir,

Principal Advisor, Representative on Freedom of Media

*Conseiller principal, Représentant pour la liberté des médias*

## CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE OF THE CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF INDIVIDUALS WITH REGARD TO AUTOMATIC PROCESSING OF PERSONAL DATA / COMITE CONSULTATIF DE LA CONVENTION POUR LA PROTECTION DES PERSONNES A L'EGARD DU TRAITEMENT AUTOMATISE DES DONNEES A CARACTERE PERSONNEL (T-PD)

Mr/M. Jean-Philippe Walter, Chairman / *Président*

## MEXICO / MEXIQUE

Mr/M. Diego Sandoval Pimentel

*Deputy Permanent Representative of Mexico to the Council of Europe / Adjoint à l'Observateur Permanent du Mexique auprès du Conseil de l'Europe*

## PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / ASSEMBLEE PARLEMENTAIRE DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Mr/M. Rüdiger Dossow

*Secretary of the Committee on Culture, Science and Education / Secrétaire du Comité de la culture, de la science, de l'éducation et des médias*

\* \* \*

## INTERPRETERS / INTERPRETES

Ms/Mme Sarah Adlington

Ms/Mme Gillian Wakenhut

Ms/Mme Bettina Ludewig

Mr/M. Jean-Louis Wunsch

\* \* \*

## SECRETARIAT

Mr/M. Jan Kleijssen, Director of Information Society and Action against Crime, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / *Directeur de la Société de l'information et de la lutte contre la criminalité, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit*Mr/M. Jan Malinowski, Head of Information Society Department, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / *Chef du service Société de l'information, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit*Mr/M. Patrick Penninckx, Executive Secretary, Cooperation Group to Combat Drug Abuse and Illicit Trafficking in Drugs, Directorate General of Human Rights and Rule of Law / *Secrétaire exécutif, Groupe de coopération pour la lutte contre l'abus et le trafic de drogue, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit*Ms/Mme. Silvia Grundmann, Head of Media Division, Directorate General of Human Rights and Rule of Law, Secretary to the Steering Committee on Media and Information Society / *Chef de la division médias, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit, Secrétaire du Comité directeur pour les médias et la société e l'information*Ms/Mme. Onur Andreotti, Administrator, Media Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / *Administratrice, division médias, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit*Mr/M. Luca Belli, Administrator, Information Society Unit, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / *Administrateur, Unité société de l'information, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit*Ms/Mme Ana Gascón-Marcén, Administrator, Information Society Unit, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / *Administratrice, Unité société de l'information, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit*

Mr/M. Lee Hibbard, Administrator, Information Society Unit, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / *Administrateur, Unité société de l'information, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit*

Ms/Mme Elvana Thaçi, Administrator, Media Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / *Administratrice, division médias, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit*

Ms/Mme. Loreta Vioiu, Administrator, Information Society Unit, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / *Administratrice, Unité société de l'information, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit*

Ms/Mme Maria Michaelidou, Programme Advisor, Data Protection Unit, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / *Conseillère de programme, Unité protection des données, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit*

Ms/Mme Anne Boyer-Donnard, Principal Administrative Assistant, Media Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / *Assistante administrative principale, Division médias, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit*

Ms/Mme. Giovanna Langella, Principal Administrative Assistant, Media Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / *Assistante administrative principale, Division médias, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit*

Ms/Mme.Sarah Gregg, Assistant, Information Society Unit, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / *Assistante, Unité société de l'information, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit*

Ms/Mme.Krystyna Khokhlova, Assistant, Media Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / *Assistante, Division médias, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit*

Ms/Mme. Julia Whitham, Assistant, Media Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / *Assistante, Division médias, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit*

Mr/M.Naser Bislimi, Trainee, Media Division, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / *Stagiaire, Division médias, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit*

## Appendix III

Draft Recommendation CM/Rec(2014)\_\_\_of the Committee of Ministers to member States on protecting and promoting the right to freedom of expression and the right to private life with regard to network neutrality

1. In information society, the exercise and enjoyment of the right to freedom of expression, including the right to receive and impart information and ideas as well as their participation in democratic life is increasingly reliant upon accessibility and quality of an Internet connection.

2. Providers of Internet access services have the ability to manage information and data flows (Internet traffic) transiting through the networks that they operate. They may engage in Internet traffic management for specific legitimate purposes such as to preserve the integrity and security of the network. They may also take action to prevent access to, or the dissemination of, unlawful or harmful content, for example through self-regulatory systems in co-operation with public authorities. However, other interferences with Internet traffic may affect the quality of the Internet service delivered to users and may result in blocking, discrimination or prioritisation of specific types of content, applications or services. Moreover, some of the techniques used in this context permit inspection or monitoring of communications, which can undermine users' trust in the Internet.

3. These matters raise concerns in respect of the protection and promotion of the right to private life and the right to freedom of expression, which are guaranteed respectively by articles 8 and 10 of the European Convention on Human Rights (ETS No. 5, hereinafter the ECHR), as well as in the light of the Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data (ETS No.108). In addition, there are implications for access to diverse and pluralistic information and public service media content on the Internet, which are fundamental for democracy and cultural diversity. The right to freedom of expression, including the right to receive and impart information is not an absolute right. However, any restrictions to this right must meet the requirements of Article 10, paragraph 2 of the ECHR.

4. The principle of network neutrality underpins non-discriminatory treatment of Internet traffic and users' access to information and services of their choice. It reinforces the full exercise and enjoyment of the right to freedom of expression since Article 10 of the ECHR applies not only to the content of information but also to the means of its dissemination. Also, the principle of network neutrality supports technological innovation and economic growth.

5. The Committee of Ministers recalls Article 1 of the Statute of the Council of Europe and relevant Council of Europe standard-setting instruments<sup>5</sup>. With a view to protecting and promoting the right to private life and the right to freedom of expression in full compliance with Articles 8 and 10 of the ECHR as well as to promoting the full delivery of the public service value of the Internet, the Committee of Ministers recommends that member states:

- take all the necessary measures, in co-operation with all relevant stakeholders, to safeguard the principle of network neutrality in their policy frameworks having due regard to the guidelines set out in this recommendation;
- promote these guidelines in other international and regional fora that deal with the issue of network neutrality.

---

<sup>5</sup> Declaration of the Committee of Ministers on protecting the role of the media in democracy in the context of media concentration (31 January 2007); Recommendation Rec(2007)3 on the remit of public service media in the information society; Recommendation CM/Rec(2007)16 on measures to promote the public service value of the Internet; Recommendation CM/Rec(2008)6 on measures to promote the respect for freedom of expression and information with regard to Internet filters; Declaration of Committee of Ministers on network neutrality (29 September 2010); Declaration by the Committee of Ministers on Internet governance principles (21 September 2011); Recommendation CM/Rec (2014)6 to member States on a Guide to human rights for Internet users.

## Guidelines on network neutrality

### 1. General principles

1.1. In the exercise of their right to freedom of expression, in compliance with Article 10 of the ECHR, Internet end-users have the right to access and distribute information, applications and services and to use devices of their choice. This right must be enjoyed without discrimination on any ground such as gender, sexual orientation, race, colour, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, association with a national minority, property, birth or other status.

1.2. Internet traffic should be treated equally, without discrimination, restriction or interference irrespective of the sender, receiver, content, application, service or device. This is understood as the network neutrality principle for the purpose of this recommendation.

1.3. Internet users' freedom of choice should not be restricted by favouring or hindering the transmission of Internet traffic associated with particular content, services, applications or devices or traffic associated with services provided on the basis of exclusive arrangements or tariffs.

1.4. The network neutrality principle should be applied to all services that provide Internet connectivity to Internet users (Internet access services) irrespective of the infrastructure or the network used for Internet connectivity and regardless of the underlying technology used to transmit signals.

### 2. Traffic management

2.1. Providers of Internet access services should not restrict Internet users' freedom of choice by blocking, slowing down, altering, degrading or discriminating against specific content, applications or services.

2.2. Internet traffic management measures, wherever applicable, should be non-discriminatory, transparent, necessary and proportionate:

in giving effect to a court order or an order of a regulatory authority

- to preserve the integrity and security of the network, services provided via the network and end-users' terminal equipment;
- to prevent the transmission of unsolicited communications for marketing purposes to end-users who have given their prior consent to such restrictive measures;
- to minimise the effects of temporary or exceptional network congestion, provided that equivalent types of traffic are treated equally;
- in fulfilling contractual obligations with an end-user to deliver a guaranteed level of quality of service to that end-user provided that this does not impair the quality of open Internet access and does not constitute a discriminatory or anti-competitive practice.

2.3. Internet traffic management measures should be maintained no longer than strictly necessary and traffic management policies should be subject to periodic review by competent authorities within each member state.

### 3. Pluralism and diversity of information

3.1. Internet service providers should not discriminate against traffic from other providers of content, applications and services which compete with their own content, applications and services. This requires that traffic management decisions be strictly dissociated from content-related decision-making processes of the operator in the spirit of the 2007 Committee of Ministers Declaration on protecting the role of the media in democracy in the context of media concentration.

3.2. Preferential treatment of traffic on the basis of arrangements between Internet service providers and providers of content, applications and services should not diminish or affect the affordability, performance or quality of users' access to the Internet. Such arrangements should not have a negative impact on users' ability to access and use information, diverse and pluralistic content that is publicly available, applications and services of their choice.

3.3. In managed networks, states may consider imposing reasonable, transparent and proportionate obligations to carry content which meets general interest objectives.

#### 4. Privacy

4.1. Traffic management measures should involve processing of personal data only to the extent that is necessary and proportionate to achieve the purposes set out in the second section and should be in accordance with applicable legislation on the right to private life and personal data protection.

4.2. Some techniques for the purpose of Internet traffic management are capable of assessing the content of communications. The way in which such techniques are used can be an interference with the right to private life. Therefore, such use must be fully in line with Article 8 of the ECHR, be tested against applicable legislation on the right to private life and personal data protection and reviewed by a competent authority within each member state in order to assess compliance with legislation.

#### 5. Transparency

5.1. Internet service providers should provide users with clear, complete and publicly available information with regard to any traffic management practices that they have applied which might affect users' access to and distribution of content, applications or services. Internet users should be enabled to obtain information from Internet service providers about Internet traffic management and Internet speeds.

5.2. Competent authorities within each member state should monitor and report on Internet traffic management practices. Reports should be prepared in an open and transparent manner and made available to the public for free.

#### 6. Accountability

6.1. Internet service providers should put in place appropriate, clear, open and efficient procedures to respond within reasonable time limits to complaints of Internet users alleging breaches of the principles included in the foregoing provisions. Internet users should be enabled to refer the matter to competent authorities within each member state.

6.2. States should ensure in their policy frameworks the accountability of Internet service providers with regard to respect for the principle of network neutrality. Accountability also includes that appropriate mechanisms are in place to respond to network neutrality complaints.

## APPENDIX IV

Draft Recommendation CM/Rec(2014)\_\_\_of the Committee of Ministers to member States on free transboundary flow of information on the Internet

1. The right to freedom of expression, including the right to receive and impart information and ideas without interference and regardless of frontiers constitutes a cornerstone of democratic society and is one of the basic conditions for its sustainability and progress and for the development of every human being. The provisions on rights and freedoms set out in the European Convention on Human Rights (hereinafter the ECHR) and Article 19 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights apply equally online and offline. Article 10 of the ECHR applies not only to the content of information but also to the means of its dissemination or hosting, since any restriction imposed on the means necessarily interferes with the right to receive and impart information.

2. Similarly, the right to freedom of assembly and association, as guaranteed by Article 11 of the ECHR, is also fundamental to democracy. In addition, safeguarding the right to private life as enshrined in Article 8 of the ECHR and ensuring the protection of personal data in accordance with the Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data (ETS No. 108, hereinafter Convention 108) underpins the exercise of the right to freedom of expression and contributes to the free flow of information on the Internet.

3. The unimpeded transboundary flow of information is critical for the full realisation of these rights and freedoms, safeguarding pluralism and diversity of information, the development of culture and innovation and economic growth. National policies or measures, commercial activities or technological practices which interfere, whether deliberately or inadvertently, with Internet traffic or which place restrictions on Internet content or services within one state may have a bearing beyond that state's frontiers on the exercise of the right to freedom of expression and the right to freedom of association. Consequently, the exercise of national sovereignty may be affected.

4. Multiple states may claim jurisdiction over the same information and services on the Internet, which may leave individuals subject to inconsistent or conflicting rules. The variety/diversity of national laws on illegal content and services, as well as the application of competing and conflicting national laws, creates a complex legal environment which can make it difficult for individuals to claim the protection to which they are entitled under Article 10 of the ECHR. Developments in technology, for example content delivery networks and the growth of services that store and process data in remote locations rather than in locations proximate to the information owner or custodian/recipient (cloud services) will also increase complexities.

5. There is a need to promote a common international understanding, to consolidate norms and adhere to best practices on free transboundary flow of information on the Internet while ensuring full compliance with international agreements on the protection of children online, combatting cybercrime, protection of personal data and other relevant agreements. State action in this context should rely on Recommendation CM/Rec(2011)8 of the Committee of Ministers which sets out a commitment of member states to protect and promote the universality, integrity and openness of the Internet. This includes state responsibility to ensure that actions within one state do not interfere with access to information in other states or negatively impact the transboundary Internet traffic. States should also have due regard to other Council of Europe standards which are referenced in the appendix of this recommendation as well as to the value of self-regulation. This contributes to the elaboration of best practices and new models of behaviour that promote the unhampered flow of information, opinion and ideas on the Internet.

6. Therefore, the Committee of Ministers recommends that member states, when developing and implementing Internet-related policies at national level and within the international community:

- promote and protect free transboundary flow of information having due regard to the principles of this recommendation, in particular by ensuring that these principles are reflected in regulatory frameworks or policies and in practice;
- encourage private sector actors, civil society and technical communities to support and promote the implementation of the principles included in this recommendation.



*Appendix*

## Relevant Council of Europe standards

- Council of Europe Convention on the Protection of Children against Sexual Exploitation and Sexual Abuse (CETS No.201)
- Convention on Cybercrime (ETS No. 185) and Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalisation of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems (ETS No. 189)
- Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data (ETS No. 108) and Additional Protocol to the Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data, regarding supervisory authorities and transborder data flows (ETS No. 181)
- Recommendation CM/Rec(2011)8 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on the protection and promotion of the universality, integrity and openness of the Internet
- Recommendation CM/Rec(2009)5 on measures to protect children against harmful content and behaviour and to promote their active participation in the new information and communications environment
- Declaration on protecting the dignity, security and privacy of children on the Internet (20 February 2008)
- Recommendation CM/Rec(2008)6 on measures to promote the respect for freedom of expression and information with regard to Internet filters
- Recommendation CM/Rec(2007)16 on measures to promote the public service value of the Internet
- Declaration on network neutrality (29 September 2010)

## APPENDIX V

Draft Recommendation CM/Rec(2014)\_\_\_ of the Committee of Ministers to member states on the processing of personal data in the context of employment

## INDEX

## PREAMBLE

## APPENDIX:

## Part I – General principles

1. Scope
2. Definitions
3. Respect for human rights, dignity and fundamental freedoms
4. Application of data protection principles
5. Collection and storage of data
6. Internal use of data
7. Communication of data and use of ICTs for the purpose of employee representation
8. External communication of data
9. Processing of sensitive data
10. Transparency of processing
11. Right of access, rectification and to object
12. Security of data
13. Preservation of data

## Part II - Particular forms of processing

14. Use of Internet and electronic communications in the workplace
15. Information systems and technologies for the monitoring of employees, including video surveillance
16. Equipment revealing employees' location
17. Internal reporting mechanism
18. Biometric data
19. Psychological tests, analysis and similar procedures
20. Other processing posing specific risks to employees' rights
21. Additional safeguards

DRAFT RECOMMENDATION CM/REC(2014)... OF THE COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS TO MEMBER STATES ON THE PROCESSING OF PERSONAL DATA IN THE CONTEXT OF EMPLOYMENT.

*(Adopted by the Committee of Ministers on ... 2014 at the ... meeting of the Ministers' Deputies)*

The Committee of Ministers, under the terms of Article 15.b of the Statute of the Council of Europe,

Considering that the aim of the Council of Europe is to achieve a greater unity among its members;

Aware of the increasing use of new technologies and means of electronic communication in the relations between employers and employees, and the corresponding advantages thereof;

Believing, however, that the use of data processing methods by employers should be guided by principles designed to minimise any risks that such methods might pose to employees' rights and fundamental freedoms, in particular their right to privacy;

Bearing in mind the provisions of the Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data of 28 January 1981 (hereunder referred to as "Convention 108") and of its Additional Protocol regarding Supervisory Authorities and Transborder Data Flows of 8 November 2001, and the desirability of articulating the application to the employment sector;

Recognising also that the interests to be borne in mind when developing principles for the employment sector are individual or collective, private or public;

Considering that personal data in official documents held by a public authority or a public body may be disclosed by the authority or body in accordance with the domestic law to which the public authority or body is subject, thus reconciling access to such official documents with the right to the protection of personal data [in accordance with the principles of the present Recommendation];

Aware of the different traditions which exist in member states with respect to the regulation of different aspects of employer-employee relations, and noting that law is only one of the means to regulate such relations;

Aware of the changes which have occurred internationally in the employment sector and related activities; notably due to the increased use of information and communication technologies (ICTs) and the globalisation of employment and services;

Considering that, in light of such changes Recommendation No. 89 (2) on the protection of personal data used for employment purposes should be revised so that they continue to provide an adequate level of protection for individuals in the employment sector;

Recalling that Article 8 of the European Convention on Human Rights protects the right to private life, including activities of a professional or business nature, as interpreted by the European Court of Human Rights;

Recalling the applicability of the existing principles set out in other relevant Recommendations of the Council of Europe, in particular Recommendation CM/Rec(2010)13 of the Committee of Ministers to member States on the protection of individuals with regard to automatic processing of personal data in the context of profiling, Recommendation R(97)5 on the protection of medical data and Recommendation R(92)3 on genetic testing and screening for health care purposes;

Recalling the 'Guiding principles for the protection of individuals with regard to the collection and processing of data by means of video surveillance' adopted by the European Committee on Legal Co-operation (CDCJ) of the Council of Europe in May 2003, referred to in Resolution 1604 (2008) of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, which are especially relevant;

Recalling the European Social Charter (CETS No.: 163), as revised on 3 May 1996, and the International Labour Office's 1997 Code of Practice on the Protection of Workers' Personal Data;

Recommends that governments of member States:

- ensure that the principles contained in the Appendix to the present Recommendation, which replaces the above-mentioned Recommendation (89)2, are reflected in the application of domestic legislation on data protection in the employment sector, as well as in other branches of the law which have a bearing on the use of personal data for employment purposes,
- for this purpose, ensure that the present Recommendation and its Appendix are brought to the attention of the authorities established under domestic data protection legislation which are competent to supervise the implementation of such legislation;
- promote acceptance and implementation of the principles contained in the Appendix to the present Recommendation by means of complementary instruments such as, codes of conducts, to ensure that the principles are well known, understood and applied by all employment sector participants, including representative bodies of both employers and employees, and are taken into account in the design and use of ICTs in the employment sector.

Appendix to the Recommendation

## Part I – General principles

### 1. *Scope*

1.1. The principles set out in the present Recommendation apply to any processing of personal data for employment purposes in both the public and private sectors.

1.2. Unless domestic law provides otherwise, the principles of the present Recommendation also apply to the activities of employment agencies, whether in the public or private sector, which process personal data so as to enable one or more concurrent contracts of employment, including part-time contracts, to be established between individuals concerned and prospective employers, or to help employers discharge their duties relating to those contracts.

### 2. *Definitions*

For the purposes of the present Recommendation:

'Personal data' means any information relating to an identified or identifiable individual ("data subject");

'Data processing' means any operation or set of operations which is performed upon personal data, and in particular the collection, storage, , preservation, alteration, retrieval, disclosure, making available, erasure or destruction of data, or the carrying out of logical and/or arithmetical operations on data; where no automated processing is used, data processing means the operations carried out within a structured set established according to any criteria which allows for the search of personal data;

'Information systems' means any device or group of inter-connected or related devices, one or more of which, pursuant to a program, performs automated processing of computer data, as

well as computer data stored, processed, retrieved or transmitted by them for the purpose of their operation, use, protection or maintenance;

'Employment purposes' concerns the relations between employers and employees which relate to recruitment, fulfilment of the contract of employment, management, including discharge of obligations laid down by law or laid down in collective agreements, planning and the efficient running of an organisation and termination of the employment relationship. The consequences of the contractual relationship may extend beyond the term of the contract of employment;

'Employer' means any natural or legal person, public authority or agency that has an employment relationship with an employee or is considering such a relationship in respect of a job applicant and has the legal responsibility for the undertaking or establishment;

'Employee' means any natural person concerned engaged by an employer under an employment relationship.

### 3. *Respect for human rights, dignity and fundamental freedoms*

Respect for human dignity, privacy and the protection of personal data should be safeguarded in the processing of personal data for employment purposes, notably to allow for the free development of employees' personality as well as for possibilities of individual and social relationship on the workplace.

### 4. *Application of data processing principles*

4.1. Employers should minimise the processing of personal data to only the data necessary to the aim pursued in the individual cases concerned.

4.2. Employers should develop appropriate measures, to ensure that they respect in practice the principles and obligations relating to data processing for employment purposes. At the request of the supervisory authority, employers should also be able to demonstrate their compliance with such principles and obligations. These measures should be adapted to the volume and nature of the data processed, the type of the activities being undertaken, and should also take into account possible implications on fundamental rights and freedoms of employees.

### 5. *Collection and storage of data*

5.1. Employers should collect personal data directly from the data subject concerned. When it is necessary and lawful to process data collected from third parties, for example to obtain professional references, the data subject should be duly informed in advance.

5.2. Personal data collected for employment purposes should be relevant and not excessive, bearing in mind the type of the employment as well as the changing information needs of the employer.

5.3. Employers should refrain from requiring or asking an employee or a job applicant access to information that he or she shares with others online, notably through social networking.

5.4. Health data may only be collected for the purposes set out in principle 8.2 of the present Recommendation.

5.5. The storage of personal data for employment purposes is permissible only if the data have been collected in accordance with the requirements outlined in principles 4, 9 and 14 to 20 and only for the time necessary to pursue the legitimate aim of the processing. When evaluation data are stored relating to the performance or potential of an employee, such data should only be processed for the purpose of assessing professional skills.

## 6. *Internal use of data*

- 6.1. Personal data collected for employment purposes should only be processed by employers for such purposes.
- 6.2. Employers should adopt data protection policies, rules and/or other instruments on internal use of personal data in compliance with the principles of the present Recommendation.
- 6.3. Under exceptional circumstances, where data are to be processed for employment purposes other than the purpose for which they were originally collected, employers should take adequate measures to avoid misuse of the data for this different purpose and inform the employee. Where important decisions affecting the employee are to be taken, based on the processing of that data, the employee should be informed accordingly.
- 6.4. Without prejudice to principle 8, in the event of corporate changes, mergers and acquisitions, particular consideration should be given to the principles of proportionality and purpose specification in the subsequent use of the data. Every substantive change in the processing should be communicated to the persons concerned.

## 7. *Communication of data and use of ICTs for the purpose of employee representation*

- 7.1. In accordance with domestic law and practice, or the terms of collective agreements, personal data may be communicated to employee's representatives, but only to the extent that such data are necessary to allow them to properly represent his or her interests or if such data are necessary for the fulfillment and supervision of obligations laid down in collective agreements.
- 7.2. In accordance with domestic law and practice, the use of information systems and technologies for the communication of data to employees' representatives should be subject to appropriate agreements that set out, in advance, transparent rules prescribing their use and safeguards to protect confidential communications, in accordance with principle 10.

## 8. *External communication of data*

- 8.1. Personal data collected for employment purposes should only be communicated to public bodies acting in their official functions, and for the purposes of carrying them out, and only within the limits of employers' legal obligations or in accordance with other provisions of domestic law.
- 8.2. The communication of personal data to public bodies for purposes other than the exercise of their official functions or to parties other than public bodies, including entities in the same group, should only take place:
- a. where it is necessary for employment purposes, the purposes are not incompatible with the purposes for which the data was originally collected and the employee concerned or his or her representatives, as the case may be, are informed of this in advance; or
  - b. with the express, free and informed consent of the employee concerned; or
  - c. if the communication is provided for by domestic law and in particular for the purpose of discharging legal obligations or in accordance with collective agreements.
- 8.3. The provisions governing the disclosure of personal data to ensure transparency in the public sector (government and other public authority/ body), including monitoring the correct

use of public resources and funds, should provide appropriate safeguards for the employees right to privacy and protection of personal data.

8.4. Employers should take appropriate measures to ensure that, only relevant, accurate and up-to-date data are communicated externally, particularly in relation to data that is posted online and accessible to a wider public.

## 9. *Processing of sensitive data*

9.1. The processing of sensitive data referred to in Article 6 of Convention 108 is only permitted in particular cases, where it is indispensable for the specific employment recruitment or to fulfill legal obligations related to the employment contract within the limits laid down by domestic law and in accordance with appropriate safeguards, complementing those set out in Convention 108 and in the present Recommendation. Appropriate safeguards should be aimed at preventing the risks that the processing of such sensitive data may present to the interests, rights and fundamental freedoms of the employee concerned, notably a risk of discrimination. Processing of biometric data should be possible under conditions provided in Principle 18 of the present Recommendation.

9.2. In accordance with domestic law, an employee or a job applicant may only be asked questions concerning his or her state of health and/or be medically examined in order to:

- a. indicate his or her suitability for present or future employment;
- b. fulfill the requirements of preventive medicine;
- c. guarantee an appropriate rehabilitation or comply with any other work environment requirements;
- d. safeguard the vital interests of the data subject or other employees and individuals;
- e. enable social benefits to be granted; or
- f. satisfy judicial procedures.

9.3. Genetic data cannot be processed for instance to determine the professional suitability of an employee or a job applicant, even with the consent of the person concerned. The processing of genetic data may only be permitted in exceptional circumstances, for example to avoid any serious prejudice to the health of the data subject or third parties, and only if it is provided for by domestic law and subject to appropriate safeguards.

9.4. Health data and - where their processing is lawful - genetic data should only be collected from the employee where it is provided for by law, and subject to appropriate safeguards.

9.5. Health data covered by the obligation of medical confidentiality should only be accessible to and processed by personnel who are bound by such an obligation or by other rules of professional secrecy or confidentiality. Such data must:

- a. relate directly to the ability of the employee concerned to exercise his or her duties;  
or
- b. be necessary in support of measures to protect the health of the employee; or
- c. be necessary to prevent risks to others.

Where such data are communicated to employers, this processing should be performed by a person with the relevant authorisation, such as someone in personnel administration or responsible for health and safety at work, and the information should only be communicated if

it is indispensable for decision-making by the personnel administration and in accordance with provisions of domestic law.

9.6. Health data covered by the obligation of medical confidentiality and - where their processing is lawful - genetic data, where appropriate should be stored separately from other categories of personal data held by employers. Technical and organisational security measures should be taken to prevent persons who do not belong to the employer's medical service having access to the data.

9.7. Health data related to third parties should not be processed under any circumstances unless full, unambiguous, free and informed consent is given, or such processing is authorised by a data protection supervisory authority, or it is mandatory according to domestic law.

## 10. *Transparency of processing*

10.1. Information concerning personal data held by employers should be made available either to the employee concerned directly or through the intermediary of his or her representatives or brought to his or her notice through other appropriate means.

10.2. Employers should provide employees with the following information:

- the categories of personal data to be processed and a description of the purposes of the processing,
- the recipients, or categories of recipients of the personal data,
- the means the employees have of exercising the rights set out in principle 11 of the present Recommendation, without prejudice to more favorable ones provided by domestic law or in their legal system,
- any other information necessary to ensure fair and lawful processing.

10.3 In this context, a particularly clear and complete description must be provided of the categories of personal data that can be collected by ICTs, including video-surveillance and their possible use. This principle also applies to the particular forms of processing provided for in Part II of the present Recommendation.

10.4 The information should be provided in an accessible format and kept up to date. In any event, such information should be provided before an employee carries out the activity or action concerned, and made readily available also through the information systems normally used by the employee.

## 11. *Right of access, rectification and to object*

11.1. An employee should be able to obtain, upon request, at reasonable intervals and without excessive delay, confirmation of the processing of personal data relating to him or her. The communication should be in an intelligible form, include all information on the origin of the data, as well as any other information that the controller is required to provide to ensure the transparency of processing, notably information provided in principle 10.

11.2. An employee should be entitled to have personal data relating to him or her rectified, blocked or erased, if they are inaccurate and/or if the data have been processed contrary to the law or the principles set out in the present Recommendation. He or she should also be entitled to object at any time to the processing of his or her personal data unless the processing is necessary for employment purposes or otherwise provided by law.

11.3. The right of access should also be guaranteed in respect of evaluation data, including where such data relate to assessments of the performance, productivity or capability of the employee, at least when the assessment process has been completed, without prejudice to the right of defence of employers or third parties involved. Although such data cannot be corrected



by the employee, purely subjective assessments should be open to challenge in accordance with domestic law.

11.4. An employee should not be subject to a decision significantly affecting him or her, based solely on an automated processing of data without having his or her views taken into consideration.

11.5. An employee should also be able to obtain, upon request, knowledge of the reasoning underlying the data processing, the results of which are applied to him or her.

11.6. Derogations to the rights referred to in paragraphs 10, 11.1, 11.2, 11.4 and 11.5 may be permitted if provided for by law and are a necessary measure in a democratic society, to protect State security, public safety, important economic and financial interests of the State or the prevention and suppression of criminal offences, the protection of the data subject or the rights and freedoms of others.

11.7. Furthermore, in the case of an internal investigation conducted by an employer, the exercise of the rights referred to in paragraphs 10, 11.1 to 11.5 may be deferred until the closing of the investigation if the exercise of those rights would prejudice the investigation.

11.8. Unless provisions of domestic law provide otherwise, an employee should be entitled to choose and designate a person to assist him or her in the exercise of his or her right of access, rectification and to object or to exercise these rights on his or her behalf.

11.9. Domestic law should provide a remedy where access to data is refused, or requests for rectification or erasure of any of the data is denied.

## 12. *Security of data*

12.1. Employers, or entities which may process data on their behalf, should implement adequate technical and organisational measures in response to periodic reviews of the organisation's risk assessment and security policies and update them as appropriate. Such measures should be designed to ensure the security and confidentiality of personal data processed for employment purposes against accidental or unauthorised modification, loss or destruction of personal data, as well as against unauthorised access, dissemination or disclosure of such data.

12.2. In accordance with domestic law, employers should ensure adequate data security when using ICTs for any operation of processing of personal data for employment purposes, including their storage.

12.3. The personnel administration, as well as any other person engaged in the processing of the data, should be kept informed of such measures, of the need to respect them and of the need to maintain confidentiality about such measures as well.

## 13. *Preservation of data*

13.1. Personal data should not be retained by employers for a period longer than is justified by the employment purposes outlined in Principle 2 or is required by the interests of a present or former employee.

13.2. Personal data submitted in support of a job application should normally be deleted as soon as it becomes clear that an offer of employment will not be made or is not accepted by the job applicant. Where such data are stored with a view to a further job opportunity, the person concerned should be informed accordingly and the data should be deleted if requested by the person concerned.

13.3 Where it is required to store data submitted for a job application for the purpose of bringing or defending legal actions or any other legitimate purpose, the data should be stored only for the period necessary for the fulfillment of such purpose.

13.4 Personal data processed for the purpose of an internal investigation carried out by employers which has not led to the adoption of negative measures in relation to any employee should be deleted after a reasonable period, without prejudice to the employee's right of access until such deletion.

## Part II - Particular forms of processing

### 14. *Use of Internet and electronic communications in the workplace*

14.1 Employers should avoid unjustifiable and unreasonable interferences with employees' right to private life. This principle extends to all technical devices and ICTs used by an employee. The persons concerned should be properly and periodically informed, through a clear privacy policy, in accordance with principle 10 of the present Recommendation. The information provided should be kept up to date and should include the purpose of the processing, the preservation or back-up period of traffic data and the archiving of professional electronic communications.

14.2. In particular, in the event of processing of personal data relating to Internet or Intranet pages accessed by the employee, preference should be given to the adoption of preventive measures, such as the use of filters which prevent particular operations, and to the grading of possible monitoring on personal data, giving preference for non-individual random checks on data which are anonymous or in some way aggregated.

14.3. Access by employers to the professional electronic communications of their employees who have been informed in advance of the existence of that possibility can only occur, where necessary, for security or other lawful reason. In case of absent employees, employers should take the necessary measures and foresee the appropriate procedures aimed at enabling access to professional electronic communications only when such access is of professional necessity. Access must be undertaken in the least intrusive way possible and only after having informed the employees concerned.

14.4. The content, sending and receiving of private electronic communications at work should not be monitored under any circumstances.

14.5. On employee's departure from an organisation, employers should take the necessary organisational and technical measures to automatically deactivate the employee's account. If employers need to recover the contents of an employee's account for the efficient running of the organisation, they should do so before his or her departure and when feasible, in his or her presence.

### 15. *Information systems and technologies for the monitoring of employees, including video surveillance*

15.1. The introduction and use of information systems and technologies for the direct and principal purpose of monitoring employees' activity and behaviour should not be permitted. Where their introduction and use for other legitimate purposes, such as to protect production, health and safety or to ensure the efficient running of an organisation has an indirect consequence the possibility of monitoring employees' activity, it should be subject to the additional safeguards set out in principle 21, in particular the consultation of employees' representatives.

15.2. Information systems and technologies that indirectly monitor employees' activities and behaviour should be specifically designed and located so as not to undermine their fundamental rights. The use of video surveillance for monitoring locations that are part of the most personal area of life of employees is not permitted in any situation.

15.3. In the event of dispute or legal proceedings, employees should be able to obtain copies of the recordings made, when appropriate and in accordance with the domestic law. The storage of the recording should be limited in time.

#### 16. *Equipment revealing employees' location*

16.1. Equipment revealing employees' location should be introduced only if it proves necessary to achieve the legitimate purpose pursued by employers and their use should not lead to a continuous monitoring of an employee. Notably, monitoring should not be the main purpose, but only an indirect consequence of an action needed to protect production, health and safety or to ensure the efficient running of an organisation. Given the potential to violate the rights and freedoms of persons concerned by the use of these devices, employers should ensure all necessary safeguards for the employees' right to privacy and protection of personal data, including the additional safeguards provided for in principle 21. In accordance with principles 4 and 5, employers should pay special attention to the purpose for which such devices are used and to the principles of minimisation and proportionality.

16.2. Employers should apply appropriate internal procedures relating to the processing of these data and should notify the persons concerned in advance in respect of the internal procedures.

#### 17. *Internal reporting mechanism*

Where employers are obliged by law or internal rules to implement internal reporting mechanisms, such as hotlines, they should secure the protection of personal data of all parties involved. In particular, employers should ensure the confidentiality of the employee who reports on illegal or unethical conduct (e.g. a whistleblower). Personal data of the parties involved should be used solely for the purpose of appropriate internal procedures relating to the report and as required by the law or as may be required for subsequent judicial proceedings.

Under exceptional circumstances, employers may enable anonymous reporting. Internal investigations should not be carried out on the sole basis of an anonymous report, except where it is duly substantiated and relates to serious infringements of domestic law.

#### 18. *Biometric data*

18.1. The collection and further processing of biometric data should only be undertaken when it is necessary to protect the legitimate interests of employers, employees or third parties, only if there are no other less intrusive means available and only if accompanied by appropriate safeguards, including the additional safeguards provided for in principle 21.

18.2. The processing of biometric data should be based on scientifically recognised methods and should be subject to the requirements of strict security and proportionality.

#### 19. *Psychological tests, analysis and similar procedures*

19.1. Recourse to psychological tests, analysis and similar procedures performed by specialised professionals, subject to medical confidentiality, that are designed to assess the character or personality of an employee or a job applicant should only be allowed if legitimate

and necessary for the type of activity performed in the job and if domestic law provides appropriate safeguards.

19.2. The employee or the job applicant should be informed in advance of the use that will be made of the results of these tests, analysis or similar procedures and, subsequently, the content thereof. Principles 11.1 and 11.2 apply accordingly.

## 20. *Other processing posing specific risks to employees' rights*

20.1. Employers, or where applicable processors, should carry out a risk analysis of the potential impact of any intended data processing on the employees' rights and fundamental freedoms and design data processing operations in such a way as to prevent or at least minimise the risk of interference with those rights and fundamental freedoms.

20.2. Unless domestic law or practice provides other appropriate safeguards, the agreement of employees' representatives should be sought before the introduction or adaptation of ICTs where the analysis reveals such risks.

## 21. *Additional safeguards*

For all particular forms of processing, set out in Part II of the present Recommendation, employers should ensure that appropriate measures are taken to secure, in particular, the respect of the following safeguards:

- a. Inform the employees before the introduction of information systems and technologies enabling the monitoring of their activities. The information provided should be kept up to date and should be undertaken taking into account principle 10 of the present Recommendation. The information should include the purpose of the operation, the preservation or back-up period, as well as the existence or not of the rights of access and rectification and how those rights may be exercised;
- b. Take appropriate internal procedures relating to the processing of that data and notify employees in advance;
- c. Before any monitoring can occur, or in circumstances where such monitoring may change, employees' representatives should be consulted in accordance with domestic law or practice. Where the consultation procedure reveals a possibility of infringement of employees' right to respect for privacy and human dignity, the agreement of employees' representatives should be sought;
- d. Consult, in accordance with domestic law, the national supervisory authority on the processing of personal data.