



Strasbourg, 30 April 2014

CAHDATA (2014)RAP02Abr

AD HOC COMMITTEE ON DATA PROTECTION

(CAHDATA)

2nd meeting

Agora – Strasbourg
28 – 30 April 2014

ABRIDGED REPORT

Directorate General of Human Rights and Rule of Law

The Ad hoc Committee on data protection (CAHDATA), set up by the Committee of Ministers under Article 17 of the Statute of the Council of Europe and in accordance with Resolution CM/Res(2011)24 on intergovernmental committees and subordinate bodies, their terms of reference and working methods, held its 2nd meeting in Strasbourg on 28-30 April 2014 with Mr Seamus Carroll (Ireland) in the Chair. The list of participants¹ is set out in Appendix 1.

The CAHDATA:

1. Adopted the agenda as set out in Appendix 2 to this report;
2. Carried out an in depth reading of the modernisation proposals of the Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data (Convention 108) as contained in the working document CAHDATA(2014)1 and discussed, article by article, the proposed text and related amendments, textual changes and adjustments with a view to the production of a new version of the working document for the next CAHDATA meeting;
3. Examined the information elements on the evaluation and follow-up mechanism;
4. Took note of the draft explanatory report based on the proposals adopted by the Consultative Committee of Convention 108 and instructed its Secretariat to update the draft text in light of the discussions held during the meeting;
5. Decided to hold its third and last meeting on 1-3 December 2014.

¹ 81 participants: 45 men and 36 women.

APPENDIX 1



Strasbourg, le 30 April / avril 2014

CAHDATA(2014) LP_FIN

AD HOC COMMITTEE ON DATA PROTECTION COMITE AD HOC SUR LA PROTECTION DES DONNEES (CAHDATA)

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS / LISTE DES PARTICIPANTS

**2nd meeting / 2^{ème} réunion
Strasbourg, 28-30 April / avril 2014**

**Council of Europe / Conseil de l'Europe
Agora building / bâtiment
Salle / Room G03**

Directorate General / Direction Générale
Human Rights and Rule of Law / Droits de l'Homme et Etat de droit

MEMBERS / MEMBRES

ALBANIA / ALBANIE (apologised / excusé)

ANDORRA / ANDORRE (apologised / excusé)

ARMENIA / ARMÉNIE

Vahagn Harutyunyan, Deputy - Head of Division of Struggle against High-tech Crimes, General Department of Combat Against Organized Crime, Republic of Armenia Police, 130 Nalbandyan St. Yerevan

AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE

Natalie Fercher, LL.M., Federal Chancellery – Constitutional Service, Directorate Data Protection, Ballhausplatz 2, 1010 Wien

AZERBAIJAN / AZERBAÏDJAN

Samir Akhundov, Senior specialist, Ministry of National Security of the Republic of Azerbaijan

BELGIUM / BELGIQUE

Joëlle Jouret, SPF Justice, Attachée, Direction générale de la législation et des libertés et droits fondamentaux, Service des droits de l'homme, Cellule vie privée, 115, boulevard de Waterloo, 1000 Bruxelles

Valérie Verbruggen, Conseiller Juridique, Commission de la protection de la vie privée, Rue de la presse 35, 1000 Brussels

BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE HERZEGOVINE

Vesna Pehar, Assistant Director, Department for International Cooperation and Public Relations, Personal data protection Agency, Vilsonovo setaliste 10, 71000 Sarajevo

BULGARIA / BULGARIE

Ventislav Karadjov, Chairman of the Commission for Personal Data Protection of the Republic of Bulgaria, 2, Professor Tsvetan Lazarov blvd., 1592 Sofia

CROATIA / CROATIE

Dubravka Dolenc, Deputy Director of the Personal Data Protection Agency

Sanja Silaj Zeman, Head of Department for International Cooperation and European and Legal Affairs

CYPRUS / CHYPRE (apologised / excusé)

CZECH REPUBLIC / RÉPUBLIQUE TCHÈQUE (apologised / excusé)

DENMARK / DANEMARK

Katrin Thorsvig Hansen, The Danish Ministry of Justice, Division of Administrative Law Slotsholmsgade 10, DK-1216 Copenhagen K

ESTONIA / ESTONIE

Merili Oja, Ministry of Justice, Departement for legal politics, Adviser of division for public law

FINLAND / FINLANDE

Leena Vettenranta, Senior Specialist (Data Protection)
Ministry of Justice, P.O. Box 25, FIN-00023 Government

FRANCE

Catherine Pozzo di Borgo, Commissaire du Gouvernement adjoint auprès de la CNIL, Services du Premier Ministre, 66 rue de Bellechasse 75007 Paris

GEORGIA / GÉORGIE

Tamar Kaldani, Personal Data Protection Inspector, 7, Ingorokva Str., 0105, Tbilisi

Nino Sarishvili, Head of International Relations and Communications Department, Office of the Personal Data Protection Inspector, 7, Ingorokva Str., 0105, Tbilisi Georgia

GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE

Rainer Stentzel, Leiter der Projektgruppe, Reform des Datenschutzes in Deutschland und Europa
Bundesministerium des Innern, Fehrbelliner Platz 3, 10707 Berlin

Elena Bratanova, Federal Ministry of the Interior, Project Group on Data Protection Reform in Germany and Europe, Directorate-General V (Public Law, Constitutional Law, Administrative Law)
Fehrbelliner Platz 3, 10707 Berlin

GREECE / GRÈCE (apologised / excusé)**HUNGARY / HONGRIE**

Katinka Bojnar, Hungarian National Authority for Data Protection and Freedom of Information, H-1125 Budapest, Szilágyi Erzsébet fasor 22/C

ICELAND / ISLANDE (apologised / excusé)**IRELAND / IRLANDE**

Seamus Carroll [Chair of / Président du CAHDATA], Principal Officer, Civil Law Reform Division, Department of Justice and Equality, Bishop's Square, Redmond's Hill, Dublin 2

Noreen Walsh, Civil Law Reform Division, Department of Justice and Equality, Bishop's Square Redmond's Hill, Dublin 2

ITALY / ITALIE

Alessandra Pierucci, Garante per la Protezione dei Dati Personali, Piazza di Monte Citorio 121 00186 Rome

LATVIA / LETTONIE

Jekaterina Macuka, Head of Division of Policy development and Religion Affairs, Sectorial policy department, Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Latvia, Brivibas bulvaris 36, Riga, LV-1536

LIECHTENSTEIN

Philipp Mittelberger, Datenschutzbeauftragter, Stabsstelle für Datenschutz (Data Protection Office), Haus Wille, Kirchstrasse 8, 9490 Vaduz

LITHUANIA / LITUANIE

Povilas Drižas, Senior Expert of the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Lithuania

LUXEMBOURG

Gérard Lommel, Président de la Commission Nationale pour la protection des données
41 rue de la Gare, 1611 Luxembourg

MALTA / MALTE

Ingrid Camilleri B.A., Head of Legal Unit, Office of the Data Protection Commissioner, 2 Airwars House, High Street Sliema SLM 16

REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA / RÉPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA

Nicolae Lungu, Head of the Legal Affairs Division and Public Relation for the National Center for the Data Protection

MONACO

Isabelle Rouanet-Passeron, Conseiller Technique, Département de l'Équipement, de l'Environnement et de l'Urbanisme, 98000 Monaco

MONTENEGRO

Aleksa Ivanovic, member of the Council of the Agency for Personal data Protection and Free Access to Information, kralja Nikole, 2, Podgorica, 81000 Montenegro

NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS

Heleen L. Janssen, Senior legal specialist, Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations, Department of Constitutional Affairs and Legislation, PO box 20011, 2500 EA Den Haag

Lotte Valkenburg, Ministry of Security and Justice, Legislation Department, PO Box 20301 The Hague

NORWAY / NORVÈGE

Mari Vindedal Strand, Higher Executive Officer, Ministry of Justice and Public Security, Legislation Department

POLAND / POLOGNE

Marcin Olender, Head of UE and International Affairs Unit, Information Society Department, Ministry of Administration and Digitization, ul. Królewska 27, 00-060 Warszawa

PORTUGAL

João Pedro Cabral, Legal Adviser, Directorate General of Justice Policy, Ministry of Justice, Avenida D. João II, n.º1.08.01 E, Torre H, Pisos 2/3, 1990-097 Lisboa

ROMANIA / ROUMANIE

Alexandru George Grigore, expert, The National Authority for the Supervision of Personal Data Processing

Eugen Dobreanu, 1st Secretary, Department for Legal Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Romania

RUSSIAN FEDERATION / FÉDÉRATION DE RUSSIE

Igor Milashevskiy, Advisor to the Minister of communication and mass communications of the Russian Federation

Alexandra Aronova, Counselor of the Department for regulation of radio frequencies and communication networks, Ministry of communication and mass communications of the Russian Federation

SAN MARINO / SAINT MARIN (apologised / excusé)

SERBIA / SERBIE (apologised / excusé)

SLOVAK REPUBLIC / RÉPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE

Stanislav Ďurina, Head of the International Relations Department, Office for Personal Data Protection of the Slovak Republic, Hraničná 12, 820 07 Bratislava 27

SLOVENIA / SLOVÉNIE

Peter Pavlin, Secretary, Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Slovenia, Directorate for Legislation in the Justice Area - Department for Punitive Law and Human Rights, Župančičeva ulica 3, SI-1000 Ljubljana

SPAIN / ESPAGNE

Agustín Puente Escobar, Director, Agencia Española De Protección De Datos, State Attorney - Head of the Legal department, C/Jorge Juan, 6, 28001 Madrid

SWEDEN / SUÈDE

David Harrby, Legal Adviser, Division for Constitutional law, Ministry of Justice

SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

Monique Cossali Sauvain, [Vice chair of / vice-présidente du CAHDATA], La cheffe, Département fédéral de justice et police DFJP, Office fédéral de la justice OFJ, Domaine de direction Droit public, Unité Projets et méthode législatifs, Bundesrain 20, 3003 Berne

“THE FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA” / « L’EX-RÉPUBLIQUE YOUGOSLAVE DE MACÉDOINE »

Igor Kuzevski, Head of Unit for Public Sector Inspection Supervision, Directorate for Personal Data Protection, Goce Delcev 18, 1000 Skopje

TURKEY / TURQUIE

Izzettin Üsümez, Judge, General Directorate of International Law and foreign relations, Mustafa Kemal Mah. 2151 Cad. No. 34/A 06520, Söğütözü, Ankara

UKRAINE

Markiyan Bem, Head of the Department for Personal Data Protection of the Secretariat of the Ukrainian Parliament Commissioner for Human Rights

UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI

John Bowman, Head of EU Data Protection Policy, Ministry of Justice, 102 Petty France, London SW1H 9AJ

URUGUAY

Maria José Viega, Head, Citizen Rights Division, Regulatory and Control Unit of Personal Data, Andes 1365 F7, Montevideo

PARTICIPANTS

THE CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE OF CONVENTION 108 (T-PD) / LE COMITE CONSULTATIF DE LA CONVENTION 108 (T-PD)

Jean-Philippe Walter, [Chair of the / Président du T-PD], Préposé suppléant, Préposé fédéral à la protection des données et à la transparence, Chancellerie fédérale, Feldeggweg 1, 3003 Berne

THE EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON LEGAL CO-OPERATION (CDCJ) / LE COMITE EUROPEEN DE COOPERATION JURIDIQUE (CDCJ)

Pekka Nurmi, Special expert

EUROPEAN UNION / UNION EUROPEENNE

EUROPEAN COMMISSION / COMMISSION EUROPEENNE

Bruno Gencarelli, Deputy Head of Unit, Directorate C: fundamental rights and Union citizenship, Unit C3 Data Protection, 1049 Bruxelles, Belgium

Thomas Zerdick, Head of Sector, Directorate C: fundamental rights and Union citizenship, Unit C3 Data Protection, 1049 Bruxelles, Belgium

Katerina Dimitrakopoulou, Policy Officer, Directorate C: fundamental rights and Union citizenship, Unit C3 Data Protection, 1049 Bruxelles, Belgium

Luisella Pavan-Woolfe, Head of the European Union Delegation to the Council of Europe
18, Boulevard de l'Orangerie, Strasbourg

Giovanni Carlo Bruno, Deputy to the Head of Delegation, European Union Delegation to the Council of Europe, 18, Bld de l'Orangerie, F-67000 Strasbourg

COUNCIL OF THE EUROPEAN UNION / CONSEIL DE L'UNION EUROPEENNE

Christina Strömholm, Council of the European Union, General Secretariat - DG D 2b, Fundamental Rights and Criminal Justice, Office JL 20 MN 41, Rue de la Loi, 175, BE- 1048 Bruxelles

EUROPEAN DATA PROTECTION SUPERVISOR (EDPS) / LE CONTRÔLEUR EUROPEEN DE LA PROTECTION DES DONNÉES (CEPD) (apologised / excusé)

EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT / PARLEMENT EUROPEEN

Anže Erbežnik, Administrator, Secretariat, Committee on Civil Liberties, Justice and Home Affairs
European Parliament, Brussels, Belgium

JAPAN

Takaaki Shintaku, Consul, Consulat Général du Japon, "Tour Europe" - 20, place des Halles - 67000 Strasbourg

MOROCCO / MAROC

Saïd Ikhrai, Commission nationale pour le contrôle des données à caractère personnel (CNDP),
Bd An-Nakhil / Bd Mehdi Ben Barka - Hay Ryad, BP 6838 – Rabat Instituts, 10 000 RABAT, Maroc

Sami Marrakchi, MP, Chef du Service des Conventions Multilatérales, Direction des Affaires, Juridiques et des Traités, Ministère des Affaires étrangères et de la Coopération

MEXICO / MEXIQUE

Santiago Oñate Laborde, Observateur Permanent / Permanent Observer, Mission Permanente du Mexique auprès du Conseil de l'Europe / Permanent Mission of Mexico to the Council of Europe, 8, Boulevard du Président Edwards, 67000 Strasbourg, France

Diego Sandoval-Pimentel, Deputy to the Permanent Observer of Mexico to the Council of Europe
8, Boulevard du Président Edwards, 67000 Strasbourg, France

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA (USA) / ETATS-UNIS D'AMERIQUE

Lara A. Ballard, Special Advisor for Privacy and Technology, U.S. Department of State, 2201 C Street NW, Washington, DC 20520,

OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS

BENIN

Pascal Affo, Ministre Conseiller, Affaires Politiques et Juridiques, Ambassade du Bénin, 87 Avenue Victor Hugo, 75 116 Paris

BURKINA FASO

Ouedraogo Ahmed Hissène Ange Marie Noël, Secrétaire général de la Commission de l'informatique et des libertés, 01 BP 1606 Ouagadougou 01

GABON

Blaise Lionel Memiaghe, Président de la CNPDCP/Gabon, BP: 23589 Libreville

TUNISIA / TUNISIE

Mohamed Kadhem Zinelabidine, Magistrat, Membre permanent auprès de l'Instance Nationale de Protection des Données Personnelles, 1 rue Mohamed Moalla, Mutuelleville, 1002 Tunis

FRENCH-SPEAKING ASSOCIATION OF PERSONAL DATA PROTECTION AUTHORITIES / ASSOCIATION FRANCOPHONE DES AUTORITÉS DE PROTECTION DES DONNÉES PERSONNELLES (AFAPDP)

Mohamed Kadhem Zinelabidine, Tunis, Tunisie

INTERNATIONAL COMMISSION ON CIVIL STATUS (ICCS)/ COMMISSION INTERNATIONALE DE L'ÉTAT CIVIL (CIEC)

Jonathan Sharpe

INTERNATIONAL COMMITTEE OF THE RED CROSS / COMITÉ INTERNATIONAL DE LA CROIX-ROUGE

María Teresa Dutli, International Committee of the Red Cross, Regional Legal Adviser for Europe, 10bis, Passage d'Enfer, 75014 Paris, France

Massimo Marelli, Lawyer/Head of Data Protection Project, Communication & Information Management Department, ICRC Geneva

INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE OF DATA PROTECTION AND PRIVACY COMMISSIONERS / CONFERENCE INTERNATIONALE DES COMMISSAIRES A LA PROTECTION DES DONNEES ET DE LA VIE PRIVEE

Laurent Lim, CNIL, Juriste chargé de mission, Service des affaires européennes et internationales

INTERNET SOCIETY / SOCIETE DE L'INTERNET (ISOC)

Christine Runnegar, Director, Public Policy

SCIENTIFIC EXPERT / EXPERTE SCIENTIFIQUE

Cécile de Terwangne, Professeur à la Faculté de Droit, Directrice de recherche au CRIDS (Centre de Recherches Informatique, Droit et Société), Facultés Universitaires Notre-Dame de la Paix (FUNDP) Rempart de la Vierge n°5, 5B-5000 Namur, Belgique

SECRETARIAT

**DIRECTORATE GENERAL – HUMAN RIGHTS AND RULE OF LAW /
DIRECTION GENERALE - DROITS DE L'HOMME ET ÉTAT DE DROIT**

Philippe Boillat, Director General / Directeur général

Information Society Department / Service de la société de l'information

Jan Malinowski, Head/Chef de service

Data Protection Unit / Unité de la protection des données

Sophie Kwasny, Secretary of the CAHDATA / Secrétaire du CAHDATA

Maria Michaelidou, Programme Advisor / Conseillère de programme

Szilvia Simond, Assistant / Assistante

Laurane Raimondo, study visitor / visiteur d'études

**DIRECTORATE OF LEGAL ADVICE AND PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW /
DIRECTION DU CONSEIL JURIDIQUE ET DU DROIT INTERNATIONAL PUBLIC**

Jenny Sandvig, trainee / stagiaire

INTERPRETERS /INTERPRETES

Lucie De Burlet
Chloé Chenetier
Jean-Jacques Pedussaud

APPENDIX 2

AGENDA

I. OPENING OF THE 2nd CAHDATA MEETING

- CAHDATA(2013)RAP01Abr Abridged Report of the 1st CAHDATA meeting (12-14 November 2013)
- CAHDATA(2014)ToR Terms of Reference 2014

II. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

III. STATEMENT BY THE SECRETARIAT

IV. MODERNISATION OF CONVENTION 108

- CAHDATA(2014)01 Working Document on Convention 108 with Additional Protocol and Modernisation proposals
- CAHDATA(2014)02 Compilation of replies to the Working Document on Convention 108 with Additional Protocol and Modernisation Proposals
- T-PD-BUR(2013)03Rev5 Draft Explanatory report of the modernised version of Convention 108
- T-PD-BUR(2013)02Rev5 Information elements on the evaluation and follow-up mechanism

V. OTHER BUSINESS