



STEERING COMMITTEE FOR CULTURE

CDCULT(2011)18

30 May 2011

10th Plenary Session
Strasbourg, 3 - 4 May 2011

Plenary Session Report

A. OPENING

1. Opening of the meeting, adoption of the agenda and welcome by the Director of Culture and Cultural and Natural Heritage

The Chair of the Committee, Ms Christine Merkel, opened the CDCULT session and delegates adopted the agenda of the 10th plenary meeting. They thanked the Chair for her opening statements to the Session.

The Director of Culture and Cultural and Natural Heritage, Mr Robert Palmer, informed the Committee on the programme and budgetary developments related to the cultural sector, as well as recent achievements, which include an increasing number of Joint Programmes with the European Union. He provided examples of these Joint Programmes on intercultural dialogue and Roma issues. He outlined the potential for future projects on cultural policy. The Committee thanked the Director for his very informative intervention.

2. Address by the Director General of Education, Culture and Heritage, Youth and Sport/Coordinator for Intercultural Dialogue

The Chair of the Committee, Ms Christine Merkel, gave the floor to the Director General of Education, Culture and Natural Heritage, Youth and Sport. The Director General's speech covered the reform process, the organisation's priorities for 2012-13, especially in the cultural sector, as well as major forthcoming events. On this last point she included the publication of a report by the Group of Eminent Persons entitled "Living together: Combining diversity and freedom in 21st-century Europe". The report covers, inter alia, the issues of integration of migrants and intercultural dialogue. Additionally, it notes the importance of the Intercultural Cities project. The Committee thanked the Director General for her substantive intervention.

3. Report by the Chair on her Chairmanship over the last year

The Chair of the Committee summarized progress made during her first term in office. She elaborated upon the unique approach adopted by the Council of Europe to enhance governance and broaden cultural policies. She provided concrete examples of the Committee's continual efforts to optimize projects and noted the increasing global reach and impact of initiatives such as the Compendium, the Cultural Policy Reviews and the Intercultural Cities project.

4. Elections

The Committee renewed Ms Christine M. Merkel from Germany as the CDCULT Chair and elected a new Vice-Chair, Ms Jasminka Lokas Strpic from Croatia (both the Chair and the Vice-Chair were elected for a term of office ending 31 December 2011). The CDCULT also elected Ms Ekaterina Selezneva from the Russian Federation and Ms Barbara Zeches from Luxembourg as new Bureau members (both Bureau members were elected for a term of office ending 31 December 2011).

B. NEW STRUCTURES, PRIORITIES AND WORKING RELATIONS FOR THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE'S INTERGOVERNMENTAL WORK IN THE FIELD OF CULTURE

5. Review of intergovernmental committee structures

Delegates heard presentations on the review of the intergovernmental Committee structures of the Council of Europe. The aim of the exercise is to rationalise the committee configuration to ensure more relevance, coherence and efficiency. One target being to reduce the number of steering committees, generally with overarching responsibility for covering a priority sector. These committees would exercise a true steering role: putting forward priorities in their sectors, reviewing working methods, etc. It is against this background that CDCULT and CDPATEP will be combined to form a new structure.

Delegates thanked the Director General, Director, and Chair for the clarity and comprehensiveness of their presentations on the issue of reform of the intergovernmental working mechanisms. The Chair of the Committee, invited delegations to provide comments and ask questions regarding this important agenda point. Many delegations expressed their support for the ongoing reform at the Council of Europe. They stated their belief that culture had an important role and place in the political architecture of the organisation and that the reform process had confirmed this. The delegates representing Italy and Bosnia and Herzegovina asked for further clarification on the future role of intergovernmental Committees.

Some delegations suggested possible titles for the new structure. The Netherland's proposal of "Steering Committee for Culture and Heritage" was supported by Moldova. The Russian Federation put forth the suggestion of "Steering Committee for Culture". The general consensus reached among delegates was that the proposed name put forth by the Secretariat, "Steering Committee for Cultural Diversity and Intercultural Dialogue", may not fully reflect the remit of the committee and possibly limit its future activities, priorities, as well as vision. Many delegations felt that it was of paramount importance to concentrate on a sound set of procedures or 'Terms of Reference' and choose a name which would reflect the mandate of the committee, which should be broad.

The Director General, Ms Gabriella Battaini Dragoni, took the floor to clarify points raised by the delegates. She stated that a new Committee represented a unique opportunity to review the Council of Europe's ongoing commitment in the cultural policy field. She raised the point that it was important to await the report of the Eminent Persons before going into the details of the mandate of the new Committee. She proposed a meeting of the Bureau of both Committees in summer or early autumn in order to formulate the new terms of reference.

C. CULTURAL POLICY WORK PROGRAMME

6. Activities related to cultural policy

6.1. Cultural Policy Review and Analysis in Turkey and the Russian Federation

The Council of Europe Secretariat presented the findings of the Cultural Policy Review-Progress report (CDCULT(2011)06). This provided an overview of the progress which has been made on the Cultural Policy Reviews for Turkey and the Russian Federation. The Committee noted that the Turkey exercise should be concluded in spring 2012, following a second visit of experts later in 2011, and that the Review in the Russian Federation had begun in spring 2011.

The Russian Federation's delegate, Ms Ekaterina Selezneva, reported on regions participating in the exercise (Omsk, Ulyanovsk, Perm) and expressed the hope that the Cultural Policy Review would be finalised in 2012, so as to provide input to the forthcoming Ministerial Conference planned for autumn 2012 in Moscow.

The Moldova representative and the delegate from Azerbaijan informed the Committee about their government's intention to undergo a new cultural policy review, as the previous ones would benefit from an update.

The Maltese Delegate, Mr Adrian Mamo, informed the Committee that the Maltese government has implemented its new cultural policy. He thanked the Council of Europe for contributing its expertise during the formulation of the new cultural policy, which was greatly appreciated by the Maltese Government.

The European Cultural Foundation noted that the innovative methodology used in carrying out Turkey's cultural policy review, with a national report and a "civic perspective report" being generated at the same time in the country under review, may be able to be adopted by other member states in the future. The Chair of the Committee thanked the European Cultural Foundation for its long-standing efforts in cultural policy and action Europe-wide.

The Committee invited the countries which had not yet undergone a cultural policy review to consider doing so in the future.

6.2. Compendium and CultureWatchEurope (CWE)

The Council of Europe Secretariat provided an overview of recent developments on the CultureWatchEurope initiative. It presented a copy of the reader on the CWE conference 2010 on "Culture and the Policies of Change" to all delegates and announced a forthcoming high-level CultureWatchEurope conference on the enhanced governance of culture and the implementation of change (Slovenia, November 2011). The CDCULT thanked the Slovenian Authorities for offering to host the event. Committee members suggested that the survey findings on cultural budgets and the financial crisis could be used as a backbone to the debates at the 2011 CultureWatchEurope conference. The Secretariat also drew the Committee's attention to the fact that in the second half of 2011, the awaited CultureWatchEurope joint access platform comprising Compendium, Herein and the European Audiovisual Observatory's information tools will be operational, offering new interactive features for governments as well as civil society partners.

The Polish delegate expressed her government's intent to participate in the survey on cultural budgets and the financial crisis. She requested further clarification pertaining to the figures required to complete the survey. The Georgian delegate invited other member states to take

part in the survey in the future. He also suggested that it may be beneficial to have the results of the survey translated into national languages.

The Director of Culture and Cultural and Natural Heritage, Mr Robert Palmer, expressed a cautionary note: when interpreting the survey findings, one would need to take into account the relatively low overall response rate. He invited CDCULT delegates to support the CultureWatchEurope initiative in the future, either through voluntary contributions or by hosting the annual conference.

Following a Secretariat presentation, the Committee welcomed recent Compendium developments including expansion to 45 signatories of the European Cultural Convention and a new international dimension, in the form of a world-wide database on cultural policies that is overseen by the International Federation of Arts Councils and Culture Agencies (IFACCA). The Council of Europe would maintain its role as editor, together with ERICarts, of the European Compendium system and take on the role of representative with an advisory function on a future Board overseeing the development of the international cultural policy database.

The Committee learned about current efforts being made at extending the group of collaborating authors by launching a call for interested cultural policy experts, so as to meet the Compendium project's expectations for a high level of excellence and given the growing depth and breadth of the database. This effort will complement the current system of recruitment of authors in consultation with national authorities and provide an enlarged pool from which to draw expertise to meet and manage the complexity of the activity. Participating states will be informed of new experts suggested to join the "national Compendium team".

The Greek Delegate informed the Committee of her Ministry's current work on updating the Compendium profile. The Committee noted voluntary contributions in 2010 to the Compendium by Azerbaijan, Cyprus, Estonia, Finland, France, Hungary, Switzerland and Goldsmiths University of London and thanked respective Delegations. Further contributions and support to the system were encouraged in line with the resource mobilisation policy agreed upon by the CDCULT in 2009.

6.3. Mapping on Cultural Rights Issues

The CDCULT, at its plenary session in May 2010, asked the Secretariat to undertake a mapping on cultural rights issues with a view to possible future Council of Europe action, and to report back to the Committee at its 2011 Plenary Session. At the 10th plenary session in May 2011, the Council of Europe Secretariat informed the delegates on the progress made and the next steps envisaged on the mapping cultural rights initiative. The Secretariat drew the Committee's attention to two documents, a compilation of the recent jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights (ECHR) and a report published by the Freiburg Observatory of Diversity and Cultural Rights. It noted that both texts underline the pertinence of cultural rights debates in Europe. They make reference to the multiple challenges our diverse societies are facing as well as the fact that "living together" has become an important issue. The Secretariat also pointed out that the organization's Group of Eminent Persons is currently compiling a major report on "Living together in the 21st Century". The report is expected to be delivered by mid-May 2011 and may orient future Council of Europe activities on the management of cultural diversity,

including cultural rights issues. The Committee noted that it may be beneficial for the Secretariat to conduct further analyses on the topic of cultural rights. It mandated the Bureau to study the possibility of setting up a transversal and multidisciplinary working group at the Council of Europe on this matter in the future.

The Belgian Delegate, Ms France Lebon, as well as the Croatian delegate, Ms Jasminka Lokas Strpic, shared the Secretariat's view on the centrality of the cultural rights theme. The Belgian delegate also noted the transversality of cultural rights, which may include related work in the field of education.

The Director of Culture and Cultural and Natural Heritage, Mr Robert Palmer, called upon delegates to consider discussing this theme in line with their government's ministries. He also invited one or more of the 50 delegates to take a lead role on this issue in the future as a possible next step. The Georgian delegate expressed his government's intention to do so and the Azerbaijani delegate stated that Ambassador Arif Mammadov, Permanent Representative of Azerbaijan and the GR-C Chair, would strongly support future work on cultural rights.

6.4. Review of the European Convention on Cinematographic co-production

The Council of Europe Secretariat made reference to the discussions that took place at the last CDCULT plenary session (May 2010) on the possibility of revising the European Convention on Cinematographic co-production. The Secretariat called upon delegates to consider a number of points which may enhance the functioning of the convention in the future and make it more responsive to recent developments. These include promoting the use of performance indicators; better response to technological change; reducing the potential for member states to interpret the convention in a manner that differs from what was originally laid out in the convention; increasing the possibility of slate funding; as well as opening the convention to third parties.

The Italian and Finnish delegates expressed their interest in revising the Convention. The Italian delegate notified the Committee of her Government's readiness to nominate an expert to take part in the revision process. The Moldovan delegate informed the delegates that his country is currently ratifying the convention. It is also developing a new strategy in the cinematographic area and is in the process of drafting a new law. The Committee called upon delegates to consider supporting the revision process of the convention in the future either through voluntary funding or contributions in kind.

In reply to a number of questions on this issue, the Director of Culture and Cultural and Natural Heritage underlined that the revision of the European Convention on Cinematographic Co-production would involve a three-step process. He outlined the following procedure: (1) a study which could be carried out by a specialized agency or organization to shed light on the need and possible areas for revision; (2) the results of the study's recommendations would be analyzed by a group of experts who would prepare, if necessary, proposals for revision; (3) approval of the revisions (either in the form of amendments to the Convention or an additional Protocol) by the CDCULT and subsequently, by the Committee of Ministers. The Director reiterated that CDCULT delegates will have ample opportunity to get involved in the decision making process on the revision of the Convention.

6.5. Update on the European Audiovisual Heritage Convention

The Council of Europe Secretariat provided delegates with background information on the European Audiovisual Heritage Convention, as well as its recent developments. The Secretariat noted that the European Audiovisual Heritage Convention was opened for signature in 2011 and today has 17 signatories. It drew the Committee's attention to the fact that the Council of Europe has been invited to contribute to a European Commission study called "Challenges of the digital era for film heritage institutions".

The Hungarian delegate, Mr Ivan Ronai, informed the Committee of his government's readiness to host the second meeting of the Standing Committee of the European Convention for the Protection of Audiovisual Heritage in 2011. The Swiss delegate suggested that the Council of Europe Secretariat undertake a mapping and send out a questionnaire in order to gain a better understanding of the reasons why member states have not yet ratified the Convention. The Committee also approved the Secretariat's proposal to circulate a comprehensive information collection grid in order to pull together the latest data on the protection of the audiovisual heritage from all the member states and to contribute to further promotion of the European Convention for the Protection of the Audiovisual Heritage.

6.6. Plans for a Conference of Ministers of Culture in 2012, hosted by the Russian Federation

The Committee held a debate to clarify the practical aspects of a possible 2012 Ministerial Conference on culture. The Russian delegate notified the Committee that her government was prepared to host the Ministerial conference in October 2012, in Moscow. She suggested that the conference may cover the theme of cultural policy and cultural rights. The Finnish Delegate underlined the importance of the Ministerial conference in creating momentum for culture. He drew the Committee's attention to the potential challenge of organizing the event jointly, involving both former CDCULT and CDPATEP members. The Director of Culture and Cultural and Natural Heritage noted that the procedures will vary depending on the format chosen for the event, i.e. whether it will be a Ministerial or informal conference. He advised delegates that preparations should start quickly if the format of a formal conference of Ministers of Culture was chosen. The Bureau of the CDCULT, at its forthcoming meeting on 8 July, would study the issue in more detail.

D. INTERCULTURAL DIALOGUE WORK PROGRAMME

7. Activities related to Intercultural Dialogue

7.1. Intercultural Cities; and related SPARDA and MARS Joint Programmes

The Council of Europe Secretariat reported on the Intercultural Cities initiative, a joint action with the European Commission. It noted that, while the Intercultural Cities Pilot phase tested the conceptual framework of intercultural integration, its objective in 2010 was to finalize a series of tools which will enable other cities to implement the intercultural approach. The Secretariat noted that the Intercultural Cities network had expanded from 11 to 22 cities. Additionally, two national networks have been set up in Italy and Ukraine.

The Committee invited delegates to consider becoming members of the Intercultural Cities learning community in the future. They noted that for the period 2011-2012 the cities' contributions, as well as those put forth by the Council of Europe and the European Commission, will be the main sources of funding for the programme. The Committee also called upon delegates to consider participating in the intercultural cities index questionnaire in the future. The Azerbaijani delegate informed the Committee that her government would be interested in participating in the Intercultural Cities programme.

The Council of Europe Secretariat provided an overview of the Joint CoE/European Commission programme called "Shaping perceptions and attitudes to realize the diversity advantage" (SPARDA). It noted that SPARDA builds upon previous Council of Europe work in the field of integration and intercultural dialogue, in particular the White paper on Intercultural Dialogue, the Intercultural Cities European Commission/Council of Europe joint action as well as the "Speak Out Against Discrimination" campaign. The Secretariat also drew the delegate's attention to the programme's beneficiaries along with its expected results.

The Secretariat presented the joint action between the Council of Europe and the European Commission entitled "Media Against Racism in Sport" (MARS). It noted that this programme's approach of working with media professionals and organizations builds upon other initiatives including the "Speak Out Against Discrimination Campaign". The Committee was informed of the programme's beneficiaries in addition to its expected results.

The representative from the European Commission stated that the Commission is pleased with the running and results of the Intercultural Cities, MARS and SPARDA programmes. The European Commission is looking forward to future joint work on the issue of integration of migrant communities. The Finnish Delegate expressed his government's satisfaction with the implementation of previous reflections and concepts which were initially included in the White Paper as recommendations, now being put into practice via the Intercultural Cities and related programmes.

The Director of Culture and Cultural and Natural Heritage, Mr Robert Palmer, emphasized the interdisciplinary nature of the Intercultural Cities, SPARDA and MARS programmes. He invited delegates to consider informing their colleagues and relevant bodies in their country.

7.2. Council of Europe Cultural Routes and the new Partial Agreement; and related Study on Cultural Routes and Tourism

The Council of Europe Secretariat outlined the objectives of the jointly launched Council of Europe and European Commission study on European Cultural Routes impact on small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) innovation, competitiveness and clustering. The Committee thanked the Secretariat and asked for the results of the study to be disseminated once available.

The Secretariat informed the Committee that the Enlarged Partial Agreement on Cultural Routes came into force in January 2011. The partial agreement's main objective is to shape a shared cultural space through the development of cultural routes, seeking to raise awareness

about heritage, through education, networking, quality and sustainable cross-border tourism as well as other related activities.

The delegates from the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia and Moldova expressed their government's intention to become members of the Enlarged Partial Agreement. The Swiss delegate, Mr David Vitali, also expressed his government's interest in the programme.

7.3. Council of Europe Art Exhibitions and Cultural Events

The Secretariat informed the Committee that, since the last CDCULT meeting, the exhibition series has been re-focused on themes which deal with recent developments across Europe, and explicitly those related to the CoE's core values. The Secretariat elaborated on the following two key themes: "Critique and Crisis: Art in Europe, 1945-2012: A Question of Values"; and "Art, Power and Freedom in Europe and Beyond, 1940-2012". Subsequently, the Cultural Event Label and its four projects awarded in 2011 were presented to the Committee: "Artistic encounters: Voices in the night"; "European Divas 60+"; "Binauralmedia"; and the 2nd Roma Pavilion at the Venice Biennale.

The Italian delegate stated that her government will provide support to the Italian part of the Critique and Crisis Exhibition, in particular concerning the State indemnity. The Russian and Croatian delegates expressed their concern as the financial support for the exhibition has not yet been assured. The Russian delegate noted that a symposium or conference may be a way to make progress and find new partners for this ambitious exhibition project.

The Director of Culture and Cultural and Natural Heritage pointed out the fact that the exhibition on "A Question of Values" is still in its conceptual phase. He seconded the suggestion put forth by the Russian delegate of finding new partners as a possible way of securing the viability of the exhibition in the future.

The Italian delegate confirmed her Ministry's intention to support the Venice Biennale Pavilion project. The Swiss delegate raised the point of whether the Council of Europe would not rather consider awarding labels to art exhibitions which meet the organization's political criteria, instead of providing financial support to them. The Director, in response to the Swiss delegate's question, noted that exhibitions give visibility to the Council of Europe and its values at very little financial cost. He suggested that the Bureau could discuss this point further at its meeting in July.

7.4. Artists for Dialogue

The Council of Europe Secretariat noted that Artists for Dialogue is a follow up to the commitments of the White Paper on Intercultural Dialogue as well as the Baku Declaration for the Promotion of Intercultural Dialogue. The Secretariat informed the Committee about the ongoing pilot projects which are part of this initiative: "FaNaNat – festival on artistic creativity of women"; "Artists for Dialogue through Music"; and "Then and now. Beyond Borders and differences – short films on different systems of belief". The Secretariat informed the Committee of its intention to contact potential funders as well as member states who may wish to help raise resources and develop partnerships for the Artists for Dialogue initiative in

the future. The Azerbaijani delegate informed the Committee of her Government's intention to fund a Mugam Fusion concert in either London or Paris in 2012. The Committee thanked the Azerbaijani delegate for her ongoing support to the Artists for Dialogue initiative.

7.5. Report on the World Forum for Intercultural Dialogue, Baku, April 2011

The Azerbaijani delegate informed the Committee about the World Forum for Intercultural Dialogue, which took place in Baku in April 2011. She noted her Government's intention to host another Forum for Intercultural Dialogue in the near future. The Committee thanked the Azerbaijani delegate for her concise overview as well as her Government's intention to host further fora. It called upon the Azerbaijani delegate to provide a written report of the April event and to distribute it to the rest of the Committee.

7.6. European Academic Network on Romani Studies

The Secretariat apprised the Committee of the progress on setting up the European Academic Network on Romani Studies, which is a joint programme between the Council of Europe and the European Commission with the aim of facilitating intercultural dialogue and supporting efforts to promote social inclusion of Roma citizens in Europe. It will raise the visibility of existing research and foster cooperation with policymakers by providing evidence for better conceived policy initiatives. Moreover, it will provide a reference for young researchers in need of guidance. The network will involve renowned academics working in Romani studies but will be open to all experts with related expertise based on relevant and transparent criteria. The network's activities will consist of: an annual scientific conference; a gathering of network members and smaller seminars; a database which will contain pertinent research; an annual publication, as well as a website. The Croatian delegate expressed her government's interest in the new network and informed the Committee that her country is also running activities in this area.

E. PROPOSED FUTURE ACTIVITIES IN THE FIELD OF CULTURE

8. Exchange of Views on proposed future activities in the field of Culture

The Chair of the Committee, Ms Christine M. Merkel, suggested that there was no need to hold a debate on the proposed future activities in the field of culture, as this point had been discussed on the first day as point 2 on the agenda, following the Director General's and the Director's interventions.

9. Preparations for the 10th Meeting of the CDCULT Bureau (Summer 2011)

The Committee agreed that a CDCULT Bureau meeting will be held on 8 July 2011. The Committee proposed to the Bureau that the meeting should cover the following topics: new structures for the Council of Europe's intergovernmental activities in the field of culture, including the new Terms of Reference; the revision of the European Convention on Cinematographic co-production; possible future work on the cultural rights issue; the

Organisation's Art Exhibitions initiative; as well as the forthcoming Ministerial Conference on Culture in autumn 2012.

10. Any other business

The Committee thanked the Council of Europe Secretariat including the Director General, Ms Gabriella Battaini Dragoni, the Director, Mr Robert Palmer, the Secretary of the Committee, Ms Kathrin Merkle, as well as her assistant, Ms Sarah Humble for their consistent efforts in the preparation of the meeting as well as their expertise offered throughout the CDCULT meetings.

F. CLOSING OF THE MEETING

The Committee adopted the list of decisions taken during the 10th Plenary Session and invited the Council of Europe Secretariat to distribute the list to all delegates as soon as it was finalized.