DIRECTORATE OF HUMAN RIGHTS

DEPARTMENT FOR THE EXECUTION OF JUDGMENTS OF THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS



H/Exec(2015)3 - 3 February 2015

Mikheyev v. Russian Federation (No. 77617/01) group of cases

Overview of individual measures

Memorandum prepared by the Department for the Execution of Judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

The opinions expressed in this document are binding on neither the Committee of Ministers nor the European Court

This document contains an overview of the current situation and the progress made so far with respect to the individual measures in the cases supervised by the Committee of Ministers in the *Mikheyev* group against the Russian Federation. It also indicates the information currently awaited from the Russian authorities.

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Mikheyev 77617/01 26/04/2006	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's torture in the Leninskiy police department (Nizhniy Novgorod) in 1998 with the aim of extracting a confession. Unable to withstand the torture, the applicant jumped out of the window, broke his spine and became disabled as a result. Procedural violation of Article 3: the investigator failed to question several witnesses; a number of investigative measures were taken very belatedly; decisions to close and re-open the investigation were taken on several occasions being based on the same grounds; lack of independence and consistency of the investigation. Violation of Article 13: lack of a civil remedy with respect to compensation.	Two police officers involved were tried and convicted by the decision of the Leninskiy District Court of Nizhniy Novgorod under Article 286 § 3 (a) and (e) (abuse of official power associated with the use of violence and entailing serious consequences). They were sentenced to four years' imprisonment with a subsequent three years' prohibition on serving in the law- enforcement agencies. The judgement was upheld by the Nizhniy Novgorod Regional Court on 30/11/2005 and became final on 27/01/2006. The Deputy Public Prosecutor of the Nizhniy Novgorod Region, who was allegedly involved in the events at issue, was discharged on 01/04/2002 and passed away on 20/04/2002.	N/A
Menesheva 59261/00 09/06/2006	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's torture in the Zheleznodorozhnyy district police station (Rostov-on-Don) in 1999 with the aim of extracting information concerning a suspect. Procedural violation of Article 3: the investigation was opened only four years after the events and it failed to establish the circumstances of the case despite ample documentary evidence in the case-file. Violation of Article 13: lack of a civil remedy with respect to compensation. Violation of Article 5: unlawful detention in police station. Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 6 (lack of adversarial proceedings).	Disciplinary sanctions were imposed on the police officers concerned. On 24/11/2006, the investigation was reopened. <u>Information is awaited on the outcome of the</u> <u>investigation.</u>	Information is awaited as to whether the applicant has sought a reopening of the domestic proceedings against him.
Sheydayev 65859/01 23/05/2007	Violation of Article 3: the applicant's torture in the Derbent town police station (Republic of Dagestan) in 1999 with the aim of extracting a confession.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Maslova and Nalbandov 839/02 07/07/2008	Substantive violation of Article 3: rape and torture of the first applicant and ill-treatment of the second applicant in the Nizhegorodskiy district department of interior in 1999.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
	<i>Procedural violation of Article 3:</i> the prosecution authorities committed procedural errors leading to the stalemate in the criminal proceedings.		
	Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 38 § 1 (a).		
Akulinin and Babich 5742/02 02/01/2009	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicants' torture in Fili-Davydkovo police station (Moscow) in September 2000.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
	<i>Procedural violation of Article 3:</i> delay in opening the pre-investigation inquiry; failure by the prosecution authorities to examine medical evidence and to order a forensic examination; selective assessment of evidence and its credibility by the prosecution; lack of effective participation by the applicants in the inquiry; lack of independent assessment of evidence by the domestic courts.		
Belousov 1748/02 06/04/2009	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's torture in the Koptevo police station (Moscow) in December 1999 which resulted in his disability.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
	<i>Procedural violation of Article 3:</i> delay by the investigation in requesting the applicant's medical expert examination; protraction in the criminal proceedings; lack of thorough examination of the applicant's injuries and selective assessment of evidence and its credibility by the prosecution.		
	Violation of Article 5: absence of arrest record.		

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Nadrosov 9297/02 26/01/2009	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the Proletarskiy district police station (Rostov-on-Don) in October 2000. Procedural violation of Article 3: lack of thorough examination of the applicant's injuries; the prosecution's failure to request a medical expert examination of the applicant; the applicant's right to participate effectively	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
Oleg Nikitin 36410/02 06/04/2009	 in the investigation was not secured due to the lack of victim status; lack of independent assessment of evidence by the domestic courts. Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill-treatment in the Frunzenskiy district police station (Ivanovo) in October 2001. 	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
	<i>Procedural violation of Article 3:</i> delay in opening an investigation into the applicant's allegations and lack of effective participation by the applicant in the inquiry.		
Samoylov 64398/01 06/04/2009	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's torture in the Komsomolskaya Metro police station in February 1999. Procedural violation of Article 3: the main investigative	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
	steps were either taken with delays or not taken at all, such as the applicant's medical examination, questioning of witnesses and examination of the crime scene.		
Barabanshchikov 36220/02 08/04/2009	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the Oktyabrskiy district police station (Lipetsk) in August 2001. Procedural violation of Article 3: lack of thorough	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
	examination of the applicant's injuries; selective assessment of evidence and its credibility by the prosecution; lack of examination of the crime scene; lack of independent assessment of evidence by the domestic courts.		

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Denisenkov and Bogdanchikov 3811/02 12/05/2009	Substantive violation of Article 3: the first applicant's ill- treatment in the Khamovniki police station (Moscow) in March 2011.Procedural violation of Article 3: the investigator's failure to request the applicant's medical expert examination and to question witnesses; selective and inconsistent assessment of evidence by the investigator; lack of effective participation by the applicant in the investigation; lack of independent assessment of evidence by the domestic courts.Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 3 (conditions of detention).	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
Polonskiy 30033/05 14/09/2009	groups: ritidic o (contained or detorition). Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's torture in the police department no. 2 (Volgograd) in January 2003. Procedural violation of Article 3: delays in the investigation; lack of thorough assessment of evidence by the investigators; failure by the prosecution to bring charges despite the fact that the corroborating evidence had been discovered and the police officers accused by the applicant had been identified. Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 5 (length of pre-trial detention) and Article 6 (length of criminal proceedings against the applicant).	On 11 May 2010, the police officer responsible for the applicant's torture, Mr T., was charged under Article 286 § 3 (a) and (6) (abuse of official power associated with the use of violence and the use of arms or special equipment). On 20 October 2011, the first-instance court convicted Mr T. as charged and sentenced him to 3 years and 2 months' imprisonment. By its final decision of 6 February 2012, the appeal court commuted the sentence and replaced the imprisonment sentence with a suspended imprisonment sentence with the same term.	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Vladimir Fedorov 19223/04 30/10/2009	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the Rudnichniy district police department (Prokopyevsk, Kemerovo region) in March 2003. <i>Procedural violation of Article 3:</i> the initial investigative steps were taken by the police department whose employees were implicated in the applicant's ill- treatment; delays in the investigation; the investigators' failure to request a medical expert examination of the applicant and to search the premises where the applicant was ill-treated; the investigators' failure to look for corroborating evidence and their deferential attitude to the police officers; selective and inconsistent assessment of evidence.	In January 2010, the investigation was reopened. Information is awaited on the outcome of the investigation.	N/A
Gladyshev 2807/04 30/10/2009	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill-treatment in the Manturovo police station (Kostroma) in May 2001. Procedural violation of Article 3: repeated remittals of the case for further investigation; the investigation into allegations of ill-treatment was conducted by the same investigator who conducted the investigation of the criminal case against the applicant; the investigators' failure to look for corroborating evidence and their deferential attitude to the police officers; selective and inconsistent assessment of evidence; lack of effective judicial review of the investigation. Violation of Article 6: use of the applicant's statements obtained under duress in trial.	In 2010, the investigation was resumed. <u>Information is awaited on the outcome of the</u> <u>investigation.</u>	In 2010, the Presidium of the Supreme Court quashed the applicant's conviction by way of supervision review and remitted the case to the appeal court for fresh consideration. <u>Information is awaited on the outcome of the</u> <u>reopened criminal proceedings against the</u> <u>applicant.</u>

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Yevgeniy Kornev 30049/02 30/10/2009	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the police station of organised crime unit of Kurgan in August 2001.Procedural violation of Article 3: despite being notified about the applicant's injuries, the prosecutor's office did not take any action until the applicant lodged a formal complaint seven months later; the investigation was limited to the questioning of the police officers involved; the prosecutor failed to request the applicant's medical expert examination; no efforts were made to establish the cause of the applicant's injuries; lack of effective judicial review.Other violations examined in the context of other	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	Information is awaited as to whether the applicant has sought a reopening of the domestic proceedings against him.
Antipenkov 33470/03 15/01/2010	groups: Article 6 (the applicant's absence at the supervisory-review hearing). Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill-treatment in the Dyatkovskiy district police station (Bryansk) in December 2002. Procedural violation of Article 3: failure to conduct a thorough evaluation of the quantity and nature of the applicant's injuries; serious delay in requesting the applicant's expert examination; selective and inconsistent assessment of evidence by the investigator; the investigators' failure to look for corroborating evidence and their deferential attitude to the police officers; reluctance of the investigating authorities' to make any attempt to bring to account those responsible.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
Toporkov 66688/01 01/01/2010	Procedural violation of Article 3: the investigation was limited to questioning some of the police officers; selective assessment of evidence and its credibility; failure to request a medical expert opinion; lack of thorough assessment of evidence by the domestic courts.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Maksimov 43233/02 18/06/2010	Procedural violation of Article 3: delays in opening the criminal investigation; initial investigative steps were taken by the police whose employees were allegedly implicated in the events; no medical expert examination of the applicant was conducted; selective and inconsistent assessment of evidence by the investigating authorities; the investigators failed to identify possible witnesses and to look for other corroborating evidence; lack of effective judicial review.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
Lopata 72250/01 13/10/2010	 Procedural violation of Article 3: the applicant's medical examination was conducted in the presence of a police officer; the medical expert opinion was flawed; the investigator failed to question the applicant; the police officers and other possible witnesses; lack of thorough assessment of evidence by the domestic courts. Violation of Article 34: pressure exerted upon the applicant by the prison officer with respect to his application lodged with the Court. 	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	The applicant's complaint about the pressure exerted upon him by the prison officer after he lodged an application with the Court was sent to the Investigative Committee for verification. <u>Information on the outcome is</u> <u>awaited.</u>
Sherstobitov 16266/03 22/11/2010	Application lodged with the coult.Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the Kirovskiy district police station (Krasnoyarsk) in January 2002.Procedural violation of Article 3: delays in opening of the investigation and conducting the applicant's forensic examination; the expert examination was limited and based only on medical documents; the inquiry was suspended and resumed on several occasions without making progress; failure to question a number of witnesses; the investigators did not take into account the trial court's findings that the applicant's confession had been dictated to him by the police officers.Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 5 (unlawfulness and length of pre-trial detention) and Article 6 (length of the criminal proceedings against the applicant).	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Nikiforov 42837/04 22/11/2010	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's torture in the Nerekhta district police station (Kostroma region) in December 2003. Procedural violation of Article 3: no criminal proceedings were instituted into the applicant's allegations; the pre-investigation inquiry was closed and reopened on several occasions; the investigators failed to take main investigative measures, such as examination of the crime scene and confrontation with the police officers.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
Dmitrachkov 18825/02 16/12/2010	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the Buzuluk police station (Orenburg region). Procedural violation of Article 3: selective and inconsistent assessment of evidence by the investigators; failure to identify possible witnesses; the initial investigative steps were taken by the police department whose employees were implicated in the applicant's ill-treatment; failure to question the police officers in person; lack of effective judicial review.	In April 2011, the investigation was reopened. <u>Information is awaited on the outcome of the</u> <u>investigation.</u>	N/A
Tigran Ayrapetyan 75472/01 16/12/2010	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's torturein the Otradnoye district police station (Moscow) inFebruary 2001.Procedural violation of Article 3: delays in opening theinvestigation; loss of the applicant's medicaldocuments; at the initial stage, the applicant did notenjoy victim status in the criminal proceedings and hadlimited access to the criminal case-file.Other violations examined in the context of othergroups: Article 38 § 1 (a).	According to the Russian authorities, one of the four officers who allegedly tortured the applicant was acquitted by a final decision of the Moscow City Court in 2006. As to the three others police officers, the authorities noted that the criminal prosecution is not possible due to the expiration of the limitations period. <u>A copy of the investigating authorities' decision</u> <u>concerning the refusal to open criminal</u> <u>proceedings into the applicant's allegations due to</u> <u>the expiration of the limitation period appears</u> <u>necessary.</u>	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Beloborodov 11342/05 21/01/2011	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in Leninskiy district police station (Orsk) in April 2004. Procedural violation of Article 3: the investigation was confined to the questioning of the police officers; insufficient efforts to establish the facts, in particular the case of the applicant's injuries.	In April 2011, the investigation was reopened. Information is awaited on the outcome of the investigation.	N/A
Aleksandr Sokolov 20364/05 04/02/2011	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's torture in the Sovetskiy district police station (Lipetsk) in February 2004. Procedural violation of Article 3: pre-investigation inquiry resulted in refusal to open criminal proceedings which deprived the applicant of the right to participate effectively in the investigation; the scope of the inquiry was limited and the main investigative steps were not taken; the investigator was not independent from those who were implicated into the events because the applicant was questioned by the investigator in presence of the police officers and the inquiry into ill- treatment was conducted by the same investigator who was in charge of the criminal case against the applicant. Violation of Article 5: unrecorded detention in police	In July 2011, the investigation was resumed. <u>Information is awaited on the outcome of the</u> <u>investigation.</u>	N/A
Ivan Kuzmin 30271/03 25/02/2011	station. Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the Promyshlenniy district (Stavropol) in June 2001. Procedural violation of Article 3: length of the investigation. Violation of Article 5: unrecorded detention in police custody. Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 6 (length of the criminal proceedings against the applicant).	In February 2011, the investigation was resumed. <u>Information is awaited on the outcome of the</u> <u>investigation.</u>	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Kopylov 3933/04 21/02/2011	 Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's repeated torture between January and April 2001 in the Dolgorukovskoye police station (Lipetsk region). Procedural violation of Article 3: delays in opening and conduct of the investigation; the investigation was conducted by the prosecutor's office whose officials (Mr A. and Mr I) were implicated in the applicant's ill-treatment; the scope of the criminal proceedings was limited to the conduct of the police officers and <u>no</u> independent investigation was conducted in respect of Mr A. and Mr I. to verify their role in the events complained of; imposition of lenient sentences on the police officers which were manifestly disproportionate to the gravity of the acts committed by them and fostered the sense of impunity. Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill-treatment (excessive use of force) by the escorts during his delivery to a court hearing in June 2002. Procedural violation of Article 3: the applicant's forensic medical examination was not conducted; failure to establish the exact sequence of the events and to address the discrepancies in witness testimony; the applicant and other co-defendants were never questioned; failure to conduct face-to face confrontations, to identify other possible witnesses and to examine the location where the events took place; the proportionality of the force used was not assessed; lack of effective judicial review. 	 In December 2007, the first-instance court sentenced the police officers to imprisonment ranging from 4 years to 5 years and 8 months. In June 2008, the appeal court, by its final decision, commuted the sentences. It sentenced six defendants to imprisonment ranging from 2 years and 6 months to 3 years and 3 months. The remaining four defendants were sentenced to suspended imprisonment from 1 year and 6 months to 2 years and 6 months. Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation in respect of Mr A. and Mr I. Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the applicant's ill-treatment by the escorts. 	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Georgiy Bykov 24271/03 21/02/2011	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the Sovetskiy district police department (Voronezh) in July 2001. Procedural violation of Article 3: delays in opening and conduct of the investigation; the initial investigative steps were taken by the police itself; failure to question the police officers and to request the applicant's forensic examination; selective and inconsistent assessment of evidence by the investigating authorities; lack of effective judicial review.	According to the information provided by the Russian authorities, on 24 August 2011, the investigator refused to open criminal proceedings into allegations of ill-treatment due to the lack of <i>corpus delicti</i> . The investigator's decision was sent to the prosecutor's office for verification. Information is awaited on subsequent developments.	N/A
Shanin 24460/04 27/04/2011	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the Achinsk police station (Krasnoyarsk region) in July 2002. Procedural violation of Article 3: the applicant's right to participate effectively in the inquiry was not secured due to the lack of victim status; delays in conducting the inquiry.	According to the information provided by the authorities, on 12 August 2011, the investigator refused to open criminal proceedings into allegations of ill-treatment due to the lack of <i>corpus delicti</i> . It is recalled in this connection that the European Court found it established that the applicant had been beaten by police officers. <u>Consequently, information is awaited on</u> subsequent developments.	N/A
Kapanadze 19120/05 10/05/2011	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the Shatskoye police station (Tula region) in April 2003. Procedural violation of Article 3: limited scope of the investigation; the initial investigation was conducted by the investigator who had been allegedly present during the applicant's ill-treatment in the police station; lack of effective judicial review.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Dolgov 22475/05 10/05/2011	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the Shatskoye police station (Tula region) in April 2003. Procedural violation of Article 3: limited scope of the investigation; lack of effective judicial review. Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 5 (unlawfulness of pre-trial detention).	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
Eldar Imanov and Azhdar Imanov 6887/02 20/06/2011	 In respect of the first applicant: Substantive violation of Article 3: the first applicant's ill- treatment in the Nizhnevartovsk police station no. 1 (Khanty-Mansiysk region) in September 1998. Procedural violation of Article 3: delays in opening the criminal proceedings; failure to take all the necessary measures to identify and punish those responsible for the ill-treatment. In respect of the second applicant: Substantive violation of Article 3: the second applicant's ill-treatment in the Nizhnevartovsk police station no. 1 (Khanty-Mansiysk region) in September 1998. Procedural violation of Article 3: delay in conducting the applicant's medical expert examination; limited scope of the pre-investigation inquiry; the applicant's right to participate effective in the investigation was not secured due to the lack of victim status. Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 3 (conditions of detention). 	 In respect of the first applicant: The authorities submitted that the investigation was suspended for failure to identify the perpetrators. <u>Information is awaited on subsequent</u> developments. In respect of the second applicant: The authorities submitted that the prosecution became time-barred. <u>A copy of the investigator's decision concerning</u> the refusal to open criminal proceedings into the applicant's allegations due to the expiration of the limitation period appears necessary. 	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Nikolay Fedorov 10393/04 05/07/2011	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment (excessive use of force) in the Rudnyanskiy district police station (Smolensk Region) in June 2003. <i>Procedural violation of Article 3:</i> delays in the inquiry; lack of thorough medical examination; limited scope of the investigation.	In October 2010, the investigation was resumed. Information is awaited on the outcome of the investigation.	N/A
Shishkin 18280/04 07/10/2011	 Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's repeated torture at the Dolgorukovskoe police station in January and February 2001. Procedural violation of Article 3: delays in opening and conducting the investigation; imposition of lenient sentences on the police officers. Procedural violation of Article 3: excessive use of force during the escort to the courtroom in June 2002: no forensic medical examination was carried; failure to establish the exact sequence of events and to address the discrepancies in the testimonies; the prosecutor's decision refusing to open criminal proceedings against the escorts was scarcely reasoned; lack of effective judicial review. Violation of Article 6: use of evidence obtained under duress. Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 6 (lack of legal assistance). 	 1) On 28 December 2007, the first-instance court found the policemen guilty of abuse of authority associated with the use of violence and entailing grave consequences (Article 286 § 3 (a, b, c) of the Criminal Code). The court sentenced the defendants to terms of imprisonment ranging from 4 years to 5 years and 8 months, with a subsequent three-year prohibition on serving in law-enforcement agencies. On 2 June 2008, the appeal court upheld the conviction but decided to commute the sentences and eliminate the prohibition on holding certain offices. It sentenced six defendants to imprisonment ranging from 2 years and 6 months to 3 years and 3 months. The remaining four defendants were sentenced to imprisonment ranging from 1 year and 6 months to 2 years and 6 months, but their sentences were suspended and they were placed on probation for two years. 2) According to the authorities, in May 2012, the investigator refused to open criminal proceedings into the applicant's allegations of ill-treatment during the escort due to the lack of <i>corpus delicti</i>. <u>Information is awaited on subsequent</u> developments. 	Information is awaited as to whether the applicant has sought a reopening of the domestic proceedings against him.

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Naboyshchikov 21240/05 27/01/2012	Substantive violation of Article 3: the excessive use of force against the applicant in October 2003 by the officer of the Rostov extra-departmental guard unit of the North Caucasus Railway, namely the applicant's wounding by firing two rifle shots at his legs which resulted in one of his legs being amputated.	In April 2012, the investigation was resumed. Information is awaited on the outcome of the investigation.	N/A
	<i>Procedural violation of Article 3:</i> some investigative measures were not carried out, such as the examination of the knife for fingerprints; the applicant's right to effectively participated in the investigation was not secured.		
Cherkasov 7039/04 18/01/2012	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the Ramonskiy district department of the interior (Voronezh region) in August 2004. Procedural violation of Article 3: delays in opening the investigation; failure to examine the police officers and	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
	some other witnesses; failure to request medical examinations.		
Filatov 22485/05 08/02/2012	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the Pervorechenskiy district police station of Vladivostok in November 2002.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
	<i>Procedural violation of Article 3:</i> the investigation was closed and re-opened on several occasions; the decisions concerning the refusal to open criminal proceedings did not contain any reference to the available medical evidence; limited scope of the investigation.		

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Kondratishko and others 3937/03 08/03/2012	Substantive violation of Article 3: the third applicant's ill- treatment in the Bezhitskiy district police station (Bryansk) in March 1999.Procedural violation of Article 3: no consideration was given to the medical evidence and to witness statements; no attempt was made to establish the cause of the injuries.Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 3 (conditions of detention).	According to the information submitted by the authorities, on 20 July 2012, the investigator refused to open criminal proceedings due to the expiration of the limitation period. <u>A copy of the investigator's decision is awaited.</u>	N/A
Vanfuli 24885/05 08/03/2012	 Procedural violation of Article 3: delays in opening and conduct of the criminal investigation; lack of diligence in the examination of the case; failure to establish the factual circumstances and the cause of the applicant's injuries. Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Articles 6 § 3 (c) and 6 § 3 (d) (lack of legal assistance and impossibility to examine witnesses). 	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	Information is awaited as to whether the applicant has sought a reopening of the domestic proceedings against him.
Aleksandra Dmitriyeva 9390/05 03/02/2012	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment during arrest by officers of the district department of the Interior of St Petersburg in December 2001.Procedural violation of Article 3: criminal proceedings were opened against one officer only; failure to carry out important investigative steps and to establish the circumstances of the case; loss of evidence.Violation of Article 5: unlawful detention in police custody.Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 3 (conditions of detention), Article 8 (unlawful entry into the applicant's apartment), Article 13.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Dmitriyev 13418/03 24/04/2012	 Procedural violation of Article 3: criminal proceedings were opened against one officer only; a failure to carry out important investigative steps and to establish the circumstances of the case; loss of evidence. Violation of Article 5: unlawful detention in police custody. Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 8 (unlawful entry into the applicant's apartment). 	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
Alchagin 20212/05 17/04/2012	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the Priobskiy police station (Biysk) in October 2003. Procedural violation of Article 3: the authorities disregarded the medical evidence and failed to obtain additional evidence.	On 21 June 2012, the pre-investigation inquiry was resumed. <u>Information is awaited on the outcome of the</u> <u>investigation.</u>	N/A
Kolpak 41408/04 13/06/2012	Procedural violation of Article 3: delays in conducting the criminal inquiry; the inquiry was limited to the questioning of the police officers involved; failure to question the applicant and other important witnesses; the applicant and his lawyer were unable to access the materials of the inquiry.	On 5 December 2012, the Supreme Court quashed the decisions concerning the refusal to open criminal proceedings and ordered to conduct an additional inquiry. <u>Information is awaited on the outcome of the</u> investigation.	N/A
Valyayev 22150/04 14/05/2012	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's torture by officers of the PereslavI-Zalesskiy police station in July 2000. Procedural violation of Article 3: the investigating authorities disregarded the medical report and did not include it in the inquiry file; failure to undertake the necessary investigative steps.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
A.A. 49097/08 17/04/2012	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the police station of Khasavyurt in April and May 2006.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
	<i>Procedural violation of Article 3:</i> delays in conducting the criminal inquiry; the applicant's right to participate effectively in the investigation was not secured; failure to examine the medical evidence and to question the police officers involved.		
Nechto 24893/05 04/06/2012	Procedural violation of Article 3: delays in opening the criminal inquiry into the applicant's allegations of ill-treatment and in conducting main investigative steps.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	Information is awaited as to whether the applicant has sought a reopening of the domestic proceedings against him.
	Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 6 (lack of legal assistance and absence of prosecution witnesses).		
Kuzmenko 18541/04 20/06/2012	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the police station of the town of Orsk (Orenburg region) in September 2001.Procedural violation of Article 3: serious procedural errors leading to the acquittal of the police officer involved, in particular defective indictment brought by the prosecution with the limited scope of accusations.	On 17 March 2003, the first-instance court acquitted the police officer involved. On 22 April 2003, the appeal court upheld the decision.	According to the information submitted by the Russian authorities, following the Court's judgment, the applicant requested the re- opening of the civil case whereby her tort action had been previously dismissed. On 6 October 2011, the court partially granted the applicant's civil claims and awarded her compensation.
Chumakov 41794/04 24/09/2012	 Procedural violation of Article 3: the initial inquiry was superficial; a number of investigative steps were not taken; the authorities failed to elucidate the discrepancies in the investigation. Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 5 (unlawful and unjustified pre-trial detention periods). 	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Kazantsev 14880/05 03/07/2012	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the police station of Pokachi in June 1999. Procedural violation of Article 3: the inquiry into the applicant's allegations of ill-treatment was carried out by the same official who was in charge of the applicant's prosecution; failure to question an eye- witness and to establish the cause of the applicant's injuries, the applicant's right to effectively participate in the inquiry was not secured.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
Mogilat 8461/03 24/09/2012	Procedural violation of Article 3: delays in conducting investigative measures; the inquiry into the applicant's allegations of ill-treatment was carried out by the same official who was in charge of the applicant's prosecution; inadequate medical examination of the applicant; failure to elucidate the discrepancies.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
Nitsov 35389/04 24/09/2012	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the police station of the Kirov Regional department of the interior in August 2003. Procedural violation of Article 3: the inquiry was limited to interviewing the police officers involved and no confrontations were made; the applicant was unable to effectively participate in the inquiry; failure to question important witnesses.	On 1 March 2004, the decision not to institute criminal proceedings was quashed and the criminal investigation was opened. Information is awaited on the outcome of the investigation.	N/A
Salikhov 23880/05 03/08/2012	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the Uysk police station in June 2004.Procedural violation of Article 3: the inquiry was limited to the statements of the police officers; failure to establish the cause of the applicant's injury; link between the officials responsible for the investigation and those allegedly involved in the ill-treatment.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Makhashevy 20546/07 17/12/2012	Substantive violation of Article 3 in conjunction with Article 14: the applicants' torture based on racial discrimination in the police station of the Nalchik department of the interior in November 2004. Procedural violation of Article 3 in conjunction with Article 14: delays in conducting investigative measures; failure to undertake important investigative steps; failure to investigate possible racist motives behind the events.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
Yudina 52327/08 10/10/2012	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment during the search of her house by police officers of the Kiselevsk town department of the interior in December 1998. Procedural violation of Article 3: the inquiry was discontinued and re-opened on numerous occasions; the inquiry was pending for many years without bringing any tangible results.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
Kleyn and Aleksandrovich 40657/04 03/08/2012	<i>Procedural violation of Article 2:</i> failure to open criminal case, limiting the applicants' right to effectively participate in the proceedings.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
Borodin 41867/04 06/0/2013	 Procedural violation of Article 3: ineffective investigation into the applicant's allegations of ill- treatment in police custody in September 1999: length of the investigation. Substantive violation of Article 3: the excessive use of force against the applicant during the escort in October 2002. Procedural violation of Article 3: the investigating authorities failed to assess whether the force used was necessary in the circumstances; the national courts failed to question the applicant and the police office involved. 	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Ablyazov 22867/05 18/03/2013	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the police station of the Oktyabrskiy district of Orsk in July 2003. Procedural violation of Article 3: the applicant's complaints about ill-treatment did not receive due attention; his complaint was assigned to the investigator who was among the alleged perpetrators; protractions in the inquiry which resulted in the prosecution being time-barred.	It follows from the Court's judgment that in October 2008, the investigator refused to open criminal proceedings because of the expiration of the limitation period.	N/A
Grigoryev 22663/06 23/01/2013	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment during his arrest by officers from the Savelovskiy district police station (Moscow) in February 2002.Procedural violation of Article 3: delays in opening the criminal inquiry and in taking investigative measures; the inquiry was discontinued and resumed on several occasions; failure to establish the cause of the injuries and to assess the proportionality of the force used.Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 6 (length of the criminal proceedings	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
Mityaginy 20325/06 04/03/2013	against the applicant). Procedural violation of Article 3: delays in institution of criminal investigation; the investigation was suspended and resumed on several occasions; protractions in the investigation.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Tangiyev 27610/05 29/04/2013	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's torturein the police station of Staropromyslovskiy district ofGrozny and detention centre of the ORB-2 (operativeinvestigation bureau) in April 2003.Procedural violation of Article 3: delays in conductingthe inquiry, in particular the applicant's forensicexamination; failure to take into account the availablemedical evidence and to question the medicalpersonnel or the applicant's relatives who were presentduring the arrest; ineffectiveness of the judicial review.Violation of Article 6: use in trial of the applicant'sconfession obtained under torture.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	According to the information provided by the authorities, following the Court's judgment, the Supreme Court of the Chechen Republic re-opened the criminal proceedings against the applicant and the applicant's confession obtained under duress was excluded from trial. In the context of the new proceedings, the trial was conducted with the participation of a jury which, on 23 September 2014, found the applicant guilty. <u>Copies of the domestic courts' decisions</u> <u>delivered following the European Court's</u> judgment are awaited.
Markaryan 12102/05 09/09/2013	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment during arrest and in the police station no. 2 in the town of Shakhty in May 2003. Procedural violation of Article 3: the investigating authorities mainly relied on the statements of the police officers; delay in questioning important witnesses; failure to elucidate contradictions of the witness statements.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Ochelkov 17828/05 11/07/2013	 Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the police station no. 1 in Zavolzhye (Nizhniy Novgorod region) in January 2002. Procedural violation of Article 3: failure to establish the cause of the applicant's injuries; the investigator in its decision did not correctly reflect the statements of the hospital personnel; the applicant's first medical examination was deficient; an additional examination was conducted belatedly; inconsistent and selective assessment of evidence by the investigating authorities; the applicant's right to effectively participate in the investigation was not secured. Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the Balakninskiy police station in February 2003. Procedural violation of Article 3: the inquiry was discontinued and re-opened on several occasions; failure to elucidate the discrepancies in the statements of the police officers; deficient medical examination of the applicant; the applicant's right to effectively 	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into both incidents of ill-treatment.	N/A
Samartsev 44283/06 02/08/2013	 participate in the investigation was not secured. 1) Procedural violation of Article 3: ineffective investigation into allegations of ill-treatment in May 2005: limited scope of the inquiry; the applicant was not given an opportunity to participate in the inquiry; lack of effective judicial review. 2) Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in June 2005 in the police station of the town of Neberezhnye Chelny (Republic of Tatarstan). Procedural violation of Article 3: the inquiry was limited; failure to question the doctors and the applicant's cellmates; failure to establish the cause of the applicant's injuries. Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 3 (conditions of detention). 	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into both incidents of ill-treatment.	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Davitidze 8810/05 07/10/2013	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment during his arrest by officers of the Obruchevskiy police station (Moscow) in August 2003. Procedural violation of Article 3: no medical examination was conducted; failure to establish the cause of the injuries; delays in the investigation.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
Nasakin 22735/05 09/12/2013	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in police custody in Krasnodar in August 2003.Procedural violation of Article 3: delay in opening the inquiry; limited scope of the investigation; lack of effective judicial review.Violation of Article 6: use in trial of the applicant's confession obtained under torture.Other violations examined in the context of other groups: Article 5 (unlawful pre-trial detention).	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	Information is awaited as to whether the applicant has sought a reopening of the domestic proceedings against him.
Keller 26824/04 17/02/2014	 Positive violation of Article 2: the authorities' failure to protect the applicant's son who died as result of unsuccessful escape by jumping out of the window of the police station in the town of Ivanovo in September 2000. Procedural violation of Article 3: ineffective investigation into the origin of the applicant's son's injuries: serious delays in conducting an inquiry and collecting evidence. 	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A
Aleksandr Novoselov 33954/05 28/02/2014	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's torture by police officers from the Nizhniy Novgorod regional department of the interior in April 2004. Procedural violation of Article 3: the inquiry was limited; the authorities failed to question all the police officers involved and conduct confrontations; a number of witnesses were not questioned at all.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A

Case name Application no. Date of definite judgment	Violations found by the European Court	Criminal proceedings into the allegations of ill- treatment/torture	Other individual measures (for instance, re-opening of criminal proceedings against the applicant in case of unfair trial)
Ryabtsev 13642/06 24/03/2014	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment during his arrest by officers from the Perm Leninskiy district department of the interior in February 2004.Procedural violation of Article 3: repeated remittals of the case for further investigation and the prosecutor's reluctance to follow the domestic courts' indications; failure to question important witnesses; delays in conducting investigative steps; failure to establish the cause of certain injuries and to address the proportionality of the force used.Violation of Article 6: use in trial of the applicant's confession obtained under duress.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	Information is awaited as to whether the applicant has sought a reopening of the domestic proceedings against him.
Velikanov 4124/08 30/04/2014	Substantive violation of Article 3: the applicant's ill- treatment in the detention facility of the Shchelkovo office of the interior of the Moscow region in March 2003. Procedural violation of Article 3: the authorities disregarded the medical evidence and failed to establish the cause of the applicant's injuries; no attempts were made to identify the police officers involved; the inquiry was discontinued and resumed on several occasions without any effort to conduct a thorough inquiry.	Information is awaited on the progress of the investigation into the allegations of ill-treatment.	N/A