

Strasbourg, 1st July 2012

CDDH(2012)R75

STEERING COMMITTEE FOR HUMAN RIGHTS (CDDH)

REPORT

75th meeting

Strasbourg, 19-22 June 2012

Summary

The Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH), at its 75th meeting, (Strasbourg, 19 – 22 June 2012), in particular:

- (i) Adopted opinions on two Parliamentary Assembly recommendations (see Appendix III);
- (ii) Organized its work on follow-up to the Brighton Declaration following the decisions taken at the 122nd session of the Committee of Ministers (see item 3);
- (iii) Adopted its Final Report on a simplified procedure for amendment of certain provisions of the ECHR (see item 4 and Addendum I);
- (iv) Took note of the progress of work in Drafting Group "A" concerning the national reports on implementation of the Interlaken and Izmir Declarations and the effects of entry into force of Protocol No. 14 to the ECHR (see item 5);
- (v) Organized its work with a view to negotiations on the accession of the EU to the ECHR following the Ministers' Deputies decisions of 13 June 2012 (see item 6);
- (vi) Gave guidance to the work in progress in its Drafting Group on the human rights of the elderly (CDDH-AGE) and for the work in progress on corporate social responsibility in the field of human rights (item 7);
- (vii) Exchanged views on the work underway in its Committee on bioethics (DH-BIO) (see item 8);
- (viii) Exchanged views with the Chairperson of the Gender Equality Committee (GEC) on work in progress (see item 9);
- (ix) Adopted its response on the modernization of the data protection convention (ECTS 108) (see item 11 and <u>Addendum II</u>);
- (x) Exchanged views in preparation of its contribution to the 31st Conference of Council of Europe Ministers of Justice (Vienna, 19-21 September 2012) (see item 10);
- (xi) Gave guidance to the follow-up work concerning two Committee of Ministers' Recommendations (see item 15.2);
- (xii) Confirmed the designations of the Chairpersons of the DH-BIO and the GEC (see <u>Appendix VIII</u>) and of the experts representing the Steering Committee in other bodies (see Appendix VII);
- (xiii) Adopted the calendar of its meetings and of those of its subordinate bodies (see Appendix IX).

* * *

Appendices

- I. List of participants
- II. Agenda (as adopted)
- III. Opinions of the CDDH on PACE Recommendations
- IV. Decisions taken at the 122nd session of the Committee of Ministers (follow-up to the Brighton Conference)
- V. CDDH terms of Reference on the accession of the EU to the ECHR
- VI. Declaration made by the representative of the Russian Federation
- VII. Experts representing the CDDH in other bodies
- VIII. Composition of the Bureau and Chairpersons of subordinate bodies
- IX. Calendar of meetings of the CDDH and its subordinate bodies

Addenda

<u>Addendum I</u>: CDDH Final Report on a simplified procedure for amendment of certain provisions of the Convention

<u>Addendum II</u>: Reply of the CDDH following the request of the T-PD Bureau concerning the modernisation of the Convention for data protection (STCE 108)

* * *

CDDH(2012)R75

Introduction

The CDDH held its 75th meeting from 19 to 22 June 2012 with Mr Derek 1. WALTON (United Kingdom) in the Chair. The list of participants appears at Appendix I. The agenda, as adopted, appears at Appendix II. The Committee took note of the general background information document prepared by the Secretariat (CDDH(2012)006) and of the report of the last meeting of its Bureau (CDDH-BU(2012)R85).

Item 1: Opening of the meeting, adoption of the agenda and the order of **business**

| Draft agenda | CDDH(2012)OJ002 |
|--|-----------------|
| Draft order of business | CDDH(2012)OT002 |
| Reference document | CDDH(2012)006 |
| Report of the 74 th CDDH meeting (7-10 February 2012) | CDDH(2012)R74 |

The CDDH approved the draft agenda and the draft order of business. It authorised the Representatives from the European Confederation of Trade Unions (CES/ETUC) and from the Conference of European Churches (KEK) to participate in the discussions on certain items of the meeting agenda.

Item 2: Recommendations of the Parliamentary Assembly

| Reference document | CDDH(2012)006 |
|--|---------------|
| Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012) | CDDH(2012)R85 |
| Draft texts prepared by the Secretariat | CDDH(2012)013 |

- In the light of the draft prepared by the Secretariat notably on the basis of contributions sent by experts (CDDH(2012)013), the CDDH exchanged views on three recommendations transmitted by the Committee of Ministers for information and possible comments. In particular:
 - Concerning Recommendation 1994(2012) on an additional protocol to the European Convention on Human Rights on national minorities, the CDDH approved, with some amendments, the elements presented by the Secretariat. The CDDH's opinion, as adopted, appears in Appendix III.
 - Concerning Recommendation 1995(2012) on the International Convention for the Protection of all Persons from Enforced Disappearance, the CDDH took note that the elements presented by the Secretariat reflect in particular the relevant work

¹ Following Declaration CM(2009)68 - "Making gender equality a reality" and practical proposals

elaborated by the Bureau of the Steering Committee on the media and new communication services (CDMC, document CDMC-BU(2010)001), the list of participants includes gender distribution figures for participants.

- undertaken by the CDDH on the fight against impunity. It amended and approved these elements. The CDDH's opinion, as adopted, appears in <u>Appendix III</u>.
- Concerning Recommendation 1996(2012) on equality between women and men: a condition for the success of the Arab Spring, the CDDH took note that the GEC intends to submit elements following discussions at its 1st meeting (6-8 June 2012). These will be examined by the CDDH via electronic means, with a view to their adoption by silent procedure and transmission to the Committee of Ministers before 31 July 2012, it being understood that in absence of consensus, the CDDH would refrain from expressing an opinion and only take note of the Recommendation.
- 4. Furthermore, the CDDH took note of the results concerning other Assembly Recommendations (1990, 1991 and 1993), reproduced in doc. CDDH(2012)004) on which it had also been consulted by the Committee of Ministers. The CDDH exchanged views on the method it had had to follow in order to transmit to the Deputies, within the allotted time, the comments prepared by its subordinate bodies concerning these texts and considered that it would be necessary to avoid this type of situation in future.

<u>Item 3</u>: Follow-up to the High-level Conference on the future of the European Court of Human Rights (Brighton, 18-20 April 2012)

| Reference document | CDDH(2012)006 |
|--|---------------|
| Report of the 74 th CDDH meeting (7-10 February 2012) | CDDH(2012)R74 |
| Brighton Declaration | CDDH(2012)007 |
| Decisions taken at the 122 nd session of the Committee of Ministers (23 May | CDDH(2012)008 |
| 2012) | |
| Follow-up to the High-level Conference on the future of the European Court of | CDDH(2012)009 |
| Human Rights (Brighton, 18-20 April 2012) (document prepared by the | |
| Secretariat) | |

5. The CDDH exchanged views on the follow-up to be given to the Brighton Declaration and the decisions taken by the Committee of Ministers at its 122nd Session, taking account notably of the Bureau meeting report (doc. CDDH-BU(2012)R85) and document CDDH(2012)009REV. It agreed on the working methods and work programme set out in document CDDH(2012)009REV. Drafting Groups, whose composition should vary according to the issues being addressed, would be established by the DH-GDR, with no more than two active at during any one period. Their meetings should as far as possible be prepared in writing. Issues to be addressed by Drafting Groups (GT-GDR-) C, D, E and F, including procedure and working methods, would first be discussed in the plenary Committee of experts on the reform of the Court (DH-GDR), which would give guidance. The DH-GDR would also co-ordinate the work of the Drafting Groups, although the overall calendar of meetings would be supervised by the CDDH. The CDDH already anticipated difficulties in respecting the deadline of 15 October 2013; it will have to review the situation as it developed and make any necessary requests to the Committee of Ministers at the appropriate time. It noted with appreciation the Court's willingness to provide information on relevant matters, including interim measures (notably on how

many were granted and how the Court dealt with underlying applications) and the possible representative application procedure (notably on how the Court had dealt with the numerous similar recent applications against Hungary), which would be dealt with in the relevant Drafting Group before the end of the year.

- 6. As regards Drafting Group "B" (GT-GDR-B), the CDDH again underlined the importance of preparing the meetings in advance: all relevant comments and suggestions should be made in writing to the Secretariat (david.milner@coe.int) by 15 August 2012; the Secretariat would thereafter process and distribute all contributions received. GT-GDR-B was required to produce two draft protocols to the Convention. Both protocols would require explanatory reports: the Secretariat should prepare drafts at the appropriate time for approval by the GT-GDR-B, although if necessary this latter should give priority to work on the protocols themselves.
 - i. "Protocol No. 15" would contain five amendments, four of which were expected to be relatively straightforward; the Secretariat would present draft text for these to the first meeting. The fifth (adding a reference to subsidiarity and the doctrine of the margin of appreciation to the Convention's preamble) was more challenging: the CDDH considered that the final text should stay within the consensus of the Brighton Declaration, respect the balance of the existing preamble and be comprehensible to the general public. Experts were invited to submit written proposals as to the wording of this amendment in particular. Transitional provisions would also be required for certain amendments. As regards possible consequential amendments concerning the change in the procedure for relinquishment of jurisdiction from chambers to the Grand Chamber, States were invited to make any proposals in writing in advance of the meeting.
 - ii. "Protocol No. 16" would require preparatory work, which should be based on written contributions, before drafting could begin. The experts from the Netherlands and Norway were invited to submit a joint proposal to this end; it being understood that written contributions from other experts were also encouraged. The Brighton Declaration should be the starting point, taking account also of the CDDH's report on advisory opinions ² and the Court's Reflection Paper. GT-GDR-B should focus on modalities before elaborating a draft protocol; if it suggested options, the DH-GDR should seek to select one, if not the CDDH may be called upon to decide the matter, if necessary by vote.

<u>Item 4</u>: Work undertaken by the Committee of Experts on a simplified amendment procedure (DH-PS)

Reference document Report of the 4th DH-PS meeting (14-16 May 2012) CDDH(2012)006 DH-PS(2012)R4

² See doc. CDDH(2012)R74 Addendum I, in particular Appendix V.

³ See Court doc. # 3853038.

DH-PS(2012)R4 Addendum

7. The CDDH examined the draft CDDH Final Report prepared by the Committee of experts on a simplified procedure for amendment of certain provisions of the Convention (DH-PS). In doing so, it took particular account of certain circumstances that had arisen since the DH-PS' last meeting, in particular the letter dated 12 June 2012 sent by the President of the Court to the CDDH Chairman and the decisions taken at the 122nd Session of the Committee of Ministers (23 May 2012). It then revised and adopted the Final Report as it appears at Addendum I.

<u>Item 5</u>: Work undertaken by drafting group "A" on the reform of the Court (GT-GDR-A)

Reference document Report of the 1st GT-GDR-A meeting (14-16 March 2012) CDDH(2012)006 GT-GDR-A(2012)R1

8. The CDDH took note of the work undertaken by GT-GDR-A at its first meeting. It endorsed the proposed working methods, notably the focus on certain specific issues and the use of rapporteurs to prepare related parts of the final report on implementation of the Interlaken and Izmir Declarations. It noted that for both this report and that on the effects of the entry into force of Protocol No. 14 on the Court's situation, the outcome would depend on the quality of information received: for the former, the national reports on implementation of the Interlaken and Izmir Declarations; and for the latter, data from the Court and the report of the French *Cour des Comptes* on the Court. The Chairman informed the CDDH that both of the two member States yet to submit their reports on implementation of the Interlaken and Izmir Declarations had indicated that they would do so shortly.

<u>Item 6</u>: Accession of the European Union to the European Convention on Human Rights

Reference document Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012) CDDH(2012)006 CDDH(2012)R85

- 9. The Chairman presented the decisions taken by the Committee of Ministers' Deputies on 13 June instructing the CDDH to pursue negotiations with the European Union, in an ad hoc group 47+1, with a view to finalising the legal instruments setting out the modalities of accession of the EU to the European Convention on Human Rights. The CDDH agreed on a number of practical arrangements required for the functioning of the group (see §§ 11-13). The representative of the European Commission, as the negotiator for the European Union, indicated his assent to these decisions.
- 10. Bearing in mind the Deputies' decision, which instructed the CDDH to report directly and regularly to them on the negotiations, the CDDH agreed to authorise the 47

representatives of the member States participating in the negotiation meetings to report directly to the Committee of Ministers' Deputies on interim matters. As regards the submission of the final text of the legal instruments, however, it was agreed that it should be submitted first to an ordinary meeting of the CDDH, which would transmit it to the Committee of Ministers.

- 11. As regards the composition of the ad hoc group, the CDDH agreed to apply the same solution adopted in the former CDDH-UE group, and to restrict the presence of observers to the representatives of the Registry of the European Court of Human Rights and of the Committee of Legal Advisers on Public International Law (CAHDI). With respect to the publicity of working documents and to the possible participation of other observers, and in particular of representatives of the civil society, to the meetings of the ad hoc group, the CDDH noted that a certain degree of publicity and of participation of civil society during the negotiation would be desirable, and agreed that such issues should be discussed within the ad hoc group.
- 12. The CDDH identified the following dates for the first two meetings of the ad hoc group: 17-19 September and 7-9 November, in Strasbourg, for three full days.
- 13. Finally, Ms Tonje MEINICH (Norway) was appointed as Chairperson of the ad hoc group.
- 14. Some delegations underlined that the negotiation should not be limited to the amendment proposals put forward by the European Union. The statement of the representative of the Russian Federation appears in <u>Appendix VI</u> to the present meeting report (English only).
- 15. The CDDH and the representative of the European Commission agreed to hold a first meeting of the ad hoc group in the margins of the CDDH meeting. A report of the meeting of the group will be made available.

Item 7: Development and promotion of human rights

7.1 Rights of older persons (CDDH-AGE)

Reference document Report of the 1st CDDH-AGE meeting (21-23 March 2012) CDDH(2012)006 CDDH-AGE(2012)R1

- 16. Mr Jakub WOLASIEWICZ (Poland), Chairperson of the Drafting Group on the rights of the elderly (CDDH-AGE), reported to the CDDH on the results of the first meeting, which was held on 21-23 March 2012. The CDDH subsequently exchanged views with Professor Frédéric MEGRET (McGill University, Montréal, Canada), on the human rights of older persons in general and on the conclusions of the first meeting of the CDDH-AGE in particular.
- 17. As to the nature of the future non-binding instrument, the CDDH considered it premature to decide whether it should take the form of a recommendation or of

guidelines, but agreed that the instrument should in any event be focussed on practical measures, be accompanied by a guide of good practices and be drafted in language understandable to the general public.

- 18. The CDDH endorsed the approach to the scope of the proposed instrument suggested by the CDDH-AGE in its meeting report (CDDH-AGE(2012)R1). In particular, it expressed support for the idea not to limit the scope to single aspects or to particular categories, but to consider all issues that could have an impact on the enjoyment of human rights by older persons. It stressed the need to focus on issues not already adequately covered elsewhere. The CDDH invited the CDDH-AGE to continue its work on the basis of the list of issues identified at its first meeting (see Appendix III to the CDDH-AGE meeting report), provided that dealing with such issues would cover existing gaps and add value. It also suggested exploring other themes, such as advocacy on behalf of older persons, work-related issues and questions concerning older persons' right to liberty.
- 19. The CDDH refrained from giving guidance as to whether a definition should be included in the instrument, but stated that if a definition were to be included it should support an approach based on the concept of vulnerability, in combination with other elements such as age, health or the fact of being retired. Finally, the CDDH agreed with the CDDH-AGE that for the future work of the drafting group, the term "the elderly" in the English version of the name of the group and in its documents should be replaced by "older persons".

7.2 Corporate social responsibility in the field of human rights

Reference document Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012) Document prepared by the Secretariat CDDH(2012)006 CDDH(2012)R85 CDDH(2012)12

- 20. The Secretariat presented its preliminary study on "corporate social responsibility in the field of human rights: existing standards and outstanding issues" (document CDDH(2012)012). The Committee then exchanged views on possible ways to involve of the Council of Europe in this field with Mrs Lene Wendland (Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, Geneva), who presented the relevant international standards and work, in particular the "UN Guiding Principles for the Implementation of the UN 'Protect, Respect and Remedy' Framework". The CDDH stressed the central place of the UN Guiding Principles, which were an authoritative reference point, already reflected as such in the work of other international organisations, and that any Council of Europe work should be coherent with them and should aim to enhance their effectiveness.
- 21. The CDDH instructed the Secretariat to submit a draft study on the feasibility and added value of standard-setting or other work in this field for consideration and possible adoption at its next meeting.

22. In view of the elaboration of the study, the CDDH asked the Secretariat to explore the feasibility and added value of the various options for Council of Europe involvement suggested by Mrs Wendland in her presentation, namely: reaffirming the UN Guiding Principles; providing sectorial guidance; providing thematic guidance; focusing on vulnerable groups; elaborating on the implications of the principle of access to effective remedy; addressing legal/governance gaps not covered by the UN Guiding Principles. The Secretariat was also asked to explore other avenues for action, such as the identification and recognition of good business practices and awareness-raising initiatives involving the private sector. Amongst the issues deserving particular attention in the study, delegations mentioned the effective implementation of the UN Guiding Principles, the prevention of human rights violations, possible gaps in access to effective remedies, extraterritorial issues and social rights.

7.3 Human rights in culturally diverse societies

23. The CDDH agreed to hold, at its 76th meeting, an exchange of views with a specialist on issues relating to human rights in culturally diverse societies. It also instructed the Secretariat to submit, at the same meeting, a preliminary study taking stock of existing instruments of the Council of Europe and other international bodies.

Item 8: Bioethics (DH-BIO)

Reference document Document prepared by the Secretariat CDDH(2012)006 CDDH(2012)12

- 24. The CDDH confirmed the designation of Prof. Eugenius GEFENAS (Lithuania) as Chairperson of the Committee on Bioethics (DH-BIO) for a mandate until 31 December 2012 and noted the exchange of views that the Bureau had with him on the preparation of the 1st Committee meeting (20-22 June 2012). It considered that it would be most useful for the Chairperson of the DH-BIO to participate in the CDDH meeting in March 2013 in order to report on the progress of work.⁴
- 25. The CDDH underlined the importance of the issues dealt by the DH-BIO and commended the excellent way it started its work. The CDDH hoped to achieve productive work in this field, carried out in a spirit of co-operation with the DH-BIO. It noted that, in accordance to the DH-BIO terms of reference, this committee is responsible for leading intergovernemental co-operation activities under CDDH supervision, but also for the monitoring of the Oviedo Convention, giving it autonomy in relation to the CDDH. It invited the Secretary of the DH-BIO, Ms Laurence LWOFF, and the CDDH Secretariat, to ensure the best possible co-ordination for the forthcoming meetings of both committees.

⁴ It was noted that, should the Bureau consider it necessary during its next meeting, it could propose to the CDDH to invite the Chairperson of the DH-BIO to the next CDDH meeting (November 2012).

⁵ Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Dignity of the Human Being with regard to the Application of Biology and Medicine: Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine (ECTS 164).

26. The CDDH thanked Ms Brigitte KONZ (Luxembourg) for having represented the CDDH during the Symposium on "Biobanks and Biomedical Collections – An ethical framework for future research", organised by the DH-BIO from 19 to 20 June 2012. In addition, it exchanged views with the DH-BIO Secretary on the current work on predictivity, genetics and insurance and the opportunity to draft a legal instrument on this subject. It also recalled the forthcoming work in the framework of the Oviedo Convention, on a new additional Protocol concerning the protection of Human Rights and dignity of persons with mental disorders in regard of involuntary treatment and placement. Regarding this last point, the CDDH appointed Mr Franck SCHÜRMANN (Switzerland) as its representative to participate in the work of the drafting Group which will be in charge of the preparation of this new protocol.

Item 9: Gender Equality (GEC)

Reference document Draft agenda of the 1st meeting of the GEC (6-8 June 2012) CDDH(2012)006 GEC(2012)OJ1

- 27. The CDDH confirmed the designation of Ms Carlien SCHEELE (The Netherlands) as Chairperson of the Gender Equality Committee (GEC) and exchanged views with her on the results of its 1st meeting (6-8 June 2012). It considered that it would be most useful for Ms Scheele to participate in the next CDDH meeting in November, in order to report on the progress of work. It also invited the new Secretary of the Commission, Ms Liri KOPAÇI DI MICHELE, and the CDDH Secretariat to ensure the best possible co-ordination for the forthcoming meetings of both instances.
- 28. The CDDH stressed the importance of the issue of gender equality and commended the GEC for an excellent start to its work. The CDDH also indicated that it looks forward to working productively and in a spirit of co-operation with GEC on this issue. It noted that, according to the terms of reference of the GEC, standard-setting activities do not represent its main task, which covers above all the implementation of existing standards in order to fill the gap between equality *de jure* and equality *de facto*.

<u>Item 10</u>: CDDH Contribution to the 31st Conference of Council of Europe Ministers of Justice (Vienna, 19-21 September 2012)

Reference document CDDH(2012)006
Secretariat document concerning the 31st Conference of Council of Europe
Ministers of Justice (Vienna, 19-21 September 2012) CDDH(2012)010

29. The CDDH took note of the state of preparations for the 31st Conference of Council of Europe Ministers of Justice on "Responses of justice to urban violence" (Vienna, 19-21 September 2012). It exchanged views on possible comments that it could present on the two draft Resolutions prepared, respectively, by the European Committee on Crime Problems (CDPC) and the Steering Committee on Media and Information

Society (CDMSI). In particular, it considered it useful to make comments on both draft Resolutions from the perspective of the ECHR and the Court's case-law. Concerning draft Resolution No. 1 on juveniles as perpetrators and victims in the context of urban violence, it would be necessary to refer notably to articles 5 and 6; for draft Resolution No. 2 on safeguards for human rights and fundamental freedoms with regard to responses to the use of the Internet for acts of urban violence, references to articles 3, 8, 10, 11 and 15 seemed appropriate. It instructed the Secretariat to prepare draft comments on this basis, to be adopted by electronic means before the end of July 2012. The speech that the President would make at the Conference would be based in particular on these comments.

Item 11: Modernisation the Convention on Data Protection (ECTS 108)

Reference document

Modernisation of Convention 108: new proposals

Draft elements for a reply prepared by the Secretariat following the request of the T-PD Bureau

CDDH(2012)006

T-PD-BUR(2010)01Rev2_en

CDDH(2012)011

30. Following the request by the T-PD Bureau for an opinion on the proposals for modernisation of the Convention for the protection of individuals with regard to automatic processing of data, the CDDH approved, with some amendments, the elements prepared by the Secretariat.

Item 12: Experts representing the CDDH in other bodies

Reference document CDDH(2012)006

- 31. The CDDH took note of the information received from its former representative to the CODEXTER, Mr Fernando IRURZUN (Spain) and its representative at the DH-BIO symposium, Mrs Brigitte KONZ (Luxembourg) (see §25 above). It noted that the CDDH Chairman would participate at the Vienna Conference (see § 29 above).
- 32. As Mr Irurzun would no longer participate in the work of the CDDH, it designated Mrs Isik BATMAZ (Turkey) to represent it in the work of the CODEXTER. Furthermore, the CDDH designated Mr Philippe WERY (Belgium) to present the revised version of the Manual on human rights and the environment at the meeting of the Standing Committee of the Bern Convention on 27 November 2012. The summary table of experts representing the CDDH in other bodies appears at <u>Appendix VII</u>.

Item 13: Working methods of the CDDH and its subordinate bodies

Reference document CDDH(2012)006

33. The CDDH's exchange of views on working methods aimed essentially at ensuring that the DH-BIO and the GEC, as well as their respective Secretariats, are fully

embedded in the framework for their activities established by the Committee of Ministers, so as to ensure efficient and smooth communication between the various bodies, following the example of the relations between the DH-GDR and the CDDH. Alongside the permanent contact between the Secretariats concerned, the CDDH decided that the Chairpersons of GEC and DH-BIO should report to and exchange views with the plenary CDDH and/ or its Bureau at least once a year, and possibly more frequently during their first years of activity.

- 34. The CDDH invited the Secretaries of DH-BIO and GEC to co-ordinate on all practical aspects of their respective meetings with the Secretariat of the CDDH. This mainly concerns the calendar of respective meetings, communication in due course of all relevant work and information documents⁶ and, as far as possible, the progressive standardisation of the meeting reports.
- 35. In relation to the sending of documents drawn up by the DH-BIO or the GEC to the Committee of Ministers or other instances, the CDDH noted that, in the framework decided by the Committee of Ministers, it falls to the CDDH to carry out this task, except for specific requests addressed to the DH-BIO in its capacity as body responsible for the follow-up to the Oviedo Convention.⁷

Item 14: Calendar of meetings

Reference document CDDH(2012)006

36. The CDDH examined the draft calendar prepared by the Secretariat in coordination with the Secretariats of the GEC and DH-BIO for the respective meetings for the remainder of the biennium. It was understood that this document represented a reference point that the CDDH could thereafter refine and, if necessary, modify, including at the request of the bodies concerned. The CDDH intended to maintain constant control over the calendar of all of its subordinate and associated bodies, this being the only way of ensuring that the results expected by the Committee of Ministers reached it in good time and in accordance with the desired procedure. The draft calendar, as presently adopted, appears at Appendix VIII.

Item 15: Other Business

.

⁶ In particular, the CDDH Secretariat will communicate to the CDDH members the password permitting access to the DH-BIO's restricted site. Alongside the meeting reports, this site contains notably documents that compile information on developments occurring in member States, in other international organisations and in other Council of Europe bodies, including thematic references to the Court's recent case-law.

Convention for the protection of Human Rights and Dignity of the Human Being with regard to the Application of Biology and Medicine: Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine (ECTS 164).

15.1 Report of the Secretary General on the review of Council of Europe conventions

Reference document

Report of the Secretary General on the review of Council of Europe
conventions

Executive summary of the report of the Secretary General

Abridged report of the 43rd CAHDI meeting (29-30 March 2012)

CDDH(2012)006

SG/Inf(2012)12

Addendum

CAHDI(2012)10

37. The CDDH noted that the decision taken by the Deputies at their 1146th meeting of 20 June 2012 concerning the work in progress relating to the review of Council of Europe conventions does not at this stage require any particular action by the CDDH.

15.2 Follow-up to Committee of Ministers' Recommendations

Reference document CDDH(2012)006

- 38. The CDDH took note of the decision of the Committee of Ministers' Rapporteur Group on Human Rights (GR-H) to instruct the Secretariat, under the supervision of the CDDH, to elaborate a questionnaire on the implementation of Recommendation CM/Rec(2010)4 on human rights of members of the armed forces for transmission to member States and other relevant stakeholders, and to submit to the Committee of Ministers the results of the examination of the implementation of the Recommendation by 30 June 2013 at the latest.
- 39. Subject to the final decision to be taken by the Committee of Ministers in this respect, the CDDH agreed to instruct the Secretariat to draft a questionnaire and to submit it to the CDDH for adoption by written procedure as soon as possible, in order to ensure that member States can submit their replies before the next meeting of the CDDH. At that meeting, the CDDH will decide how to carry out the analysis of the replies, in view of the adoption of a report at its 77th meeting. The CDDH also took note of the possible organisation, subject to availability of resources, of a dedicated event.
- 40. As regards the contents of the questionnaire, the CDDH instructed the Secretariat to draft questions covering all the themes dealt with in the Recommendation; to focus in particular on measures put in place to give effect to the Recommendation; to bear in mind relevant gender equality considerations; and to consult, when preparing the questions, with the experts who had participated in the elaboration of the Recommendation.
- 41. The CDDH also agreed to inform the Committee of Ministers that it would be ready to undertake any work that the Committee of Ministers may, in future, request regarding examination of the implementation of Recommendation CM/Rec(2010)5 on measures to combat discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity.
- 42. The CDDH instructed the Secretariat, should any work be requested by the Committee of Ministers of the CDDH before its next meeting, to circulate proposals for

follow-up (including a possible questionnaire) by written procedure and to follow the same guidance provided for the work on human rights of the members of armed forces when preparing such proposals. It also recommended carrying out this work in consultation with the Directorate of Human Rights and Anti-Discrimination and with the office of the Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights, and taking into account the work of other international actors.

43. A representative of the secretariat of the Directorate of Human Rights and Anti-Discrimination presented the work they are carrying out in this field (www.coe.int/lgbt); the CDDH asked to receive a copy of a study prepared on the relevant case-law of the European Court of Human Rights, as soon as it is available in both languages.

15.3 Detention of irregular migrants and asylum seekers

Reference document CDDH(2012)006

44. The CDDH exchanged views on these issues, the importance of which it underlined. That said, its priorities having already been set for the rest of the biennium, it did not wish, at this stage, to ask the Committee of Ministers to confer upon it any specific work in this field. The matter could be reviewed at a later stage.

15.4 Proceedings of the Brighton Conference

45. A provisional version of the Proceedings of the Brighton Conference was distributed. The various corrections that had been provided to the Secretariat during the meeting would be made to it, as well as any other correction sent by electronic means before 10 July 2012 (haldia.mokeddem@coe.int).

* * *

46. Having been informed that Mrs Inga REINE (Latvia), Mr Dominik MARXER (Liechtenstein), Mr Fernando IRURZUN (Spain) and Mrs Deniz AKCAY (Turkey) would no longer participate in the work of the Steering Committee, the CDDH expressed its gratitude to these experts, who had been active and eminent members for several years.

* * *

Appendix I

List of participants

The gender distribution of the 83 attendants in the meeting was as follows: 39 women (47 %), 44 men (53 %).

MEMBERS / MEMBRES

ALBANIA / ALBANIE

Ms Ledina MANDIA, General State Advocate of the Republic of Albania, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

ANDORRA / ANDORRE

Mr Joan FORNER ROVIRA, Government Agent to the European Court of Human Rights, Senior Legal Adviser, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

ARMENIA / ARMENIE

Mr Levon AMIRJANYAN, Chef du département des affaires juridiques, Ministère des affaires étrangères

AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE

Mrs Brigitte OHMS, Deputy Government Agent, Division for International Affairs and General Administrative Affairs, Federal Chancellery

AZERBAIJAN / AZERBAIDJAN

Mr Chingiz ASKAROV, Agent of the Government of the Republic of Azerbaijan at the European Court of Human Rights

BELGIUM / BELGIQUE

Mr Philippe WERY, Chef du Service des droits de l'homme, SPF Justice, Service des Droits de l'Homme

BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE-HERZEGOVINE

Ms Monika MIJIC, Agent of the Council of Ministers of Bosnia and Herzegovina before the European Court of Human Rights

BULGARIA / BULGARIE

Mrs Genka GEORGIEVA, Director of Human Rights Directorate, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Bulgaria

CROATIA / CROATIE

Mrs Romana KUZMANIĆ OLUIĆ, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and European Integration, Directorate for Multilateral Affairs, Department for Human Rights and International Organization

CYPRUS / CHYPRE

Ms Eleonora NICOLAIDES, Senior Councel of the Republic, The Law Office of the Republic of Cyprus

CZECH REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE TCHEQUE

Mr Vit SCHORM, Government Agent, Ministry of Justice

DENMARK / DANEMARK

Mr Rasmus KIEFFER-KRISTENSEN, Legal Adviser, Human Rights Unit, Danish Ministry of Justice

ESTONIA / ESTONIE

Mrs Maris KUURBERG, Government Agent before the European Court of Human Rights, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

FINLAND / FINLANDE

Mr Arto KOSONEN, Government Agent, Director, Unit for Human Rights Court and Conventions, Legal Service, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

FRANCE

Mme Anne-Françoise TISSIER, Sous-directeur des droits de l'homme, Agent du Gouvernement, Ministère des affaires étrangères

GEORGIA / GEORGIE

Mr Levan MESKHORADZE, Governmental Agent of Georgia to the ECHR, Department of State Representation in International Court of Human Rights, Ministry of Justice

GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE

Mr Hans-Jörg BEHRENS, Head of Unit IVC1, Human Rights Protection; Government Agent before the European Court of Human Rights, Bundesministerium der Justiz

GREECE / GRECE

Ms Maria TELALIAN, Head of the Public International Law Section, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

HUNGARY / HONGRIE

Ms Monika WELLER, Co-Agent for the Hungarian Government before the European Court of Human Rights, Section of the European Court of Human Rights, Department of Cooperation on International Crime and Human Rights, Ministry of Public Administration and Justice

ICELAND / ISLANDE

Ms Björg THORARENSEN, Professor of law, Faculty of Law, University of Iceland

IRELAND / IRLANDE

Mr Peter WHITE, Co-Agent for the Government of Ireland, Assistant Legal Adviser, Legal Division, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade

ITALY / ITALIE

Mr Mario REMUS, Conseiller juridique, Service des Affaires Juridiques du Ministère des Affaires Étrangères

LATVIA / LETTONIE

Mrs Kristine LICE, Government Agent, Representative of the Government of Latvia before International Human Rights Organizations, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

LIECHTENSTEIN

CDDH(2012)R75

Mr Dominik MARXER, Deputy Permanent Representative to the Council of Europe, Office for Foreign Affairs

Mr Manuel FRICK, Diplomatic Officer, Office for Foreign Affairs

LITHUANIA / LITUANIE

Mrs Elvyra BALTUTYTE, Agent of the Government of Lithuania to the European Court of Human Rights, Ministry of Justice

LUXEMBOURG

Mme Brigitte KONZ, Conseillère à la Cour d'Appel, Bâtiment CR, Cité Judiciaire

MALTA / MALTE

Dr Hubert THEUMA, Senior Legal Officer, Office of the Attorney

MONACO (Apologised/excusé)

Mr Jean-Laurent RAVERA, Département des Relations Extérieures de Monaco/Cellule Droits de l'Homme, Agent du Gouvernement près la Cour Européenne des Droits de l'Homme

MONTENEGRO

Mr Zoran PAZIN, State Agent to the ECHR

THE NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS

Mr Roeland BÖCKER, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, International Law Division

Mr Martin KUIJER, Senior legal adviser human rights law, Ministry of Justice

NORWAY / NORVEGE

Mrs Audgunn SYSE, Acting Legal Adviser, Norwegian Ministry of Justice and the Police, Legislation Department

Ms Tonje MEINICH, Chairperson CDDH-EU, European and International Affairs, Norwegian Ministry of Justice

POLAND / POLOGNE

Mr Jakub WOLASIEWICZ, Government Agent, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Ms Justyna CHRZANOWSKA, Director of the Department of proceedings before International Human Rights Protection at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Poland

PORTUGAL

Mme Maria de Fátima GRAÇA CARVALHO, Agente du Gouvernement, Procureur-Général adjointe, Procuradoria Geral da Republica

REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA/ REPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA

Mr Lilian APOSTOL, Expert, Ministère de la justice

ROMANIA / ROUMANIE

Ms Irina CAMBREA, Government Agent, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

RUSSIAN FEDERATION / FEDERATION DE RUSSIE

Mr Oleg S. MALGINOV, Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary of the Russian Federation

Ms Maria MOLODTSOVA, Ist Secretary, Department for International Humanitarian Cooperation and Human Rights, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Mr Vladislav ERMAKOV, Deputy to the Permanent Representative, Chancery

SAN MARINO / SAINT-MARIN

Ms Marina MARFORI, Expert Section études legislatifs du Bureau Légal d'Etat

SERBIA / SERBIE

Mr Slavoljub CARIC, Government Agent, Ministry of Justice, Office of the Agent before the ECHR

SLOVAK REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE

Mr Juraj KUBLA, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Slovak Republic, Human Rights Department

SLOVENIA/SLOVENIE

Ms Irena VOGRINCIC, Adviser, Ministry of Justice and Public Administration

Ms Verana KLEMENC, State Attorney, State Attornay's Office

SPAIN / ESPAGNE

Mr Francisco SANZ, , Government Agent, Legal Department for Human Rights, Ministry of Justice

SWEDEN / SUEDE

Ms Gunilla ISAKSSON, Deputy Director, Department for International Law, Human Rights and Treaty Law, Ministry for Foreign Affairs

Ms Helen LINDQUIST, Special Advisor, Department for International Law, Human Rights and Treaty Law, Ministry for Foreign Affairs

SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

Mr Frank SCHÜRMANN, Agent du Gouvernement, Chef de l'unité Droit européen et protection internationale des droits de l'homme, Office fédéral de la justice

Mr Daniel FRANK, Head Human Rights Section, Federal Department of Foreign Affairs, Federal

"THE FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA" / "L'EX-RÉPUBLIQUE YOUGOSLAVE DE MACÉDOINE"

Ms Svetlana GELEVA, Head of Department for Multilateral affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

TURKEY / TURQUIE

Mme Halime Ebru DEMIRCAN, Adjointe au Représentant permanent de la Turquie auprès du Conseil de l'Europe

Ms Gönül ERÖNEN, Adjointe au Représentant permanent de la Turquie auprès du Conseil de l'Europe

CDDH(2012)R75

Mr Bayram TURGUT, Adjoint au Représentant permanent de la Turquie auprès du Conseil de l'Europe

Mme Işık BATMAZ, Legal Expert, Représentation permanente de la Turquie auprès du Conseil de l'Europe

UKRAINE

Mr Yevgen PERELYGIN, Director, Bureau for European Integration, Secretariat of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI

Mr Derek WALTON, <u>Chairman of the CDDH / Président du CDDH</u>, Legal Counsellor, Foreign and Commonwealth Office

Mr Rob LINHAM, Head of Council of Europe Human Rights Policy, Ministry of Justice

Mr Craig BARNEY, Council of Europe Human Rights Policy Officer, Ministry of Justice

PARTICIPANTS

Parliamentary Assembly / Assemblée parlementaire

Mr Andrew DRZEMCZEWSKI, Head of Department, Legal Affairs & Human Rights Department / Chef du Service des questions juridiques et des droits de l'homme

Ms COUTURE-CARRIER, Intern, Legal Affairs & Human Rights Department / Service des questions juridiques et des droits de l'homme

Registry of the European Court of Human Rights / Greffe de la Cour européenne des droits de l'homme

Secretariat of the Committee of Ministers / Secrétariat du Comité des Ministres

<u>European Committee on Legal Co-operation / Comité européen de coopération juridique</u> CDCJ

Mr Pekka NURMI (Apologised/excusé)

Mr Carroll SEAMUS (Apologised/excusé)

<u>Gender Equality Commission / Commission pour l'égalité entre les femmes et les hommes</u> (GEC)

Ms Carlien SCHEELE, Director, Ministry of Education, Culture and Science

<u>Department for the Execution of Judgments of the Court/ Service de l'Exécution des Arrêts de la Cour</u>

<u>Directorate of Legal Advice and Public International Law/ Direction du Conseil juridique et du droit international public / (CAHDI)</u>

Ms Hélène FESTER, Administrator, Secretariat of the Committee of Legal Advisers on Public International Law

Office of the Commissioner for Human Rights of the Council of Europe / Bureau du Commissaire aux droits de l'homme du Conseil de l'Europe

<u>Conference of INGOs of the Council of Europe / Conférence des OING du Conseil de l'Europe</u>

Mr Giuseppe GUARNERI

Mr Gabriel NISSIM, Conférence des OING du Conseil de l'Europe

Union Européenne / European Union

Ms Luisella PAVAN-WOOLFE, Ambassador, Head of the Delegation of the European Union to the Council of Europe

Mr Hannes KRAEMER, Member of the Legal Service of the European Commission, Brussels

Mme Eglantine CUJO, Membre du Service juridique de la Commission européenne, Bruxelles

Mr Kristi RABA, Fundamental Rights and Criminal Justice, DG D – Justice and Home Affairs, General Secretariat of the Council of the European Union

Mr Luis Pablo TARIN MARTIN, Deputy to the Head of Delegation, EU Delegation to Council of Europe

Mr Daniel TODA CASTAN, European Union Delegation to the Council of Europe

OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS

HOLY SEE / SAINT-SIÈGE (Apologised/excusé)

JAPAN / JAPON

Mr Hideaki GUNJI, Consul (Attorney), Consulate-General of Japan, Consulate-General of Japan

MEXICO / €

Ms Lydia MADERO, Observateur Permanent a.i., Permanent Representation of Mexico to the Council of Europe

Ms Andrea BARBOSA, attaché, Permanent Representation of Mexico to the Council of Europe

Non-member State / Pays non-membre

BELARUS

Mr Alexander OPIMAKH, Head of OSCE and Council of Europe Unit, Department of Europe

European Group of National Institutions for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights (NHRI) / Groupe européen des institutions nationales de promotion et de protection des droits de l'Homme (INDH)

Mr Jozef De WITTE, Director of the Belgian Centre for equal opportunities and opposition to racism

Commission nationale consultative des droits de l'homme (CNCDH) (Apologised/excusé)

Non governmental Organisations / Organisations non-gouvernementales

Amnesty International (Apologised/excusé)

International Commission of Jurists (ICJ) / Commission internationale de Juristes (CIJ)

Ms Róisín PILLAY, Senior Legal Advisor, Europe programme, International Commission of Jurists,

Invitees to this meeting / invités à cette réunion

Ms Lene WENDLAND

Adviser on Business and Human Rights, Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights

Prof. Frédéric MEGRET

Chaire de recherche du Canada en droits de la personne et pluralisme juridique

<u>European Trade Union Confederation (ETUC) / Confédération européenne des syndicats (CES)</u>

Mr Klaus LOERCHER, International Trade Union House (ITUH

European Conference of Churches / Conférence des églises européennes (KEK)

Mr Richard FISCHER

Mr John MURRAY

* * *

SECRETARIAT

DG I – Human Rights and Rule of Law / Droits de l'Homme et État de droit Council of Europe / Conseil de l'Europe, F-67075 Strasbourg Cedex

Mr Philippe BOILLAT, Director General / Directeur Général, Directorate General of Human Rights and Rule of Law / Direction Générale droits de l'Homme et Etat de droit

Mr Jörg POLAKIEWICZ, Head of Department / Chef de Service, Human Rights Policy and Development Department / Service des politiques et du développement des droits de l'Homme

Mr Alfonso DE SALAS, Head of Division / Chef de Division, Human Rights Intergovernmental Cooperation Division / Division de la coopération intergouvernementale en matière de droits de l'Homme, Secretary of the CDDH / Secrétaire du CDDH

Mr Daniele CANGEMI, Head of Division / Chef de Division, Human Rights Law and Policy Division / Division du droit et de la politique des droits de l'Homme

Mr David MILNER, Administrator / Administrateur, Human Rights Intergovernmental Cooperation Division / Division de la coopération intergouvernementale en matière de droits de l'Homme

Mr Matthias KLOTH, Administrator, Human Rights Law and Policy Division / Division du droit et de la politique des droits de l'Homme

Mme Virginie FLORES, Lawyer / Juriste, Human Rights Intergovernmental Cooperation Division / Division de la coopération intergouvernementale en matière de droits de l'Homme

Ms Laurence LWOFF, Secretary of DH-BIO / Secrétaire du DH-BIO, Human Rights Directorate / Direction des droits de l'Homme

Ms Maria RUOTANEN, Director / Directrice, Justice and Human Dignity Directorate / Direction de la justice et de la dignité humaine

Ms Liri KOPACI-DI MICHELE, Head of Division / Chef de Division, Gender Equality and violence against women / Égalité entre les femmes et les hommes et violence à l'égard des femmes

Mme Corinne GAVRILOVIC, Assistant / Assistante, Human Rights Intergovernmental Cooperation Division / Division de la coopération intergouvernementale en matière de droits de l'Homme

Mme Aurélie JACQUOT, Assistant / Assistante, Human Rights Intergovernmental Cooperation Division / Division de la coopération intergouvernementale en matière de droits de l'Homme

* * *

INTERPRETERS / INTERPRÈTES

Ms Chloé CHENETIER (Chef d'équipe) Ms Bettina LUDEWIG Mr Christophe TYCZKA

Appendix II

Agenda

<u>ITEM 1</u>: OPENING OF THE MEETING, ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA AND THE ORDER OF BUSINESS

| Draft agenda | CDDH(2012)OJ002 |
|--|-----------------|
| Draft order of business | CDDH(2012)OT002 |
| Reference document | CDDH(2012)006 |
| Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012) | CDDH(2012)R85 |
| Report of the 74 th CDDH meeting (7-10 February 2012) | CDDH(2012)R74 |

ITEM 2: RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY

| Reference document | CDDH(2012)006 |
|---|---------------|
| Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012) | CDDH(2012)R85 |
| Recommendations of the Parliamentary Assembly brought to the attention of | |
| the CDDH for information and possible comments | CDDH(2012)004 |

<u>ITEM 3</u>: FOLLOW-UP TO THE HIGH-LEVEL CONFERENCE ON THE FUTURE OF THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS (BRIGHTON, 18-20 APRIL 2012)

| Reference document | CDDH(2012)006 |
|--|---------------|
| Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012) | CDDH(2012)R85 |
| Report of the 74 th CDDH meeting (7-10 February 2012) | CDDH(2012)R74 |
| Brighton Declaration | CDDH(2012)007 |
| Decisions taken at the 122 nd session of the Committee of Ministers (23 May | CDDH(2012)008 |
| 2012) | |
| Follow-up to the High-level Conference on the future of the European Court of | CDDH(2012)009 |
| Human Rights (Brighton, 18-20 April 2012) (document prepared by the | |
| Secretariat) | |

- 3.1 Exchange of views on the follow-up to be given to the Brighton Declaration and the decisions taken at the 122nd session of the Committee of Ministers (23 May 2012)
- 3.2 Organisation of future work

<u>ITEM 4</u>: WORK UNDERTAKEN BY THE COMMITTEE OF EXPERTS ON A SIMPLIFIED AMENDMENT PROCEDURE (DH-PS)

| Reference document | CDDH(2012)006 |
|--|---------------|
| Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012) | CDDH(2012)R85 |
| Report of the 4th DH-PS meeting (14-16 May 2012) | DH-PS(2012)R4 |
| Draft CDDH Final Report | DH-PS(2012)R4 |
| - | Addendum |

<u>ITEM 5</u>: WORK UNDERTAKEN BY DRAFTING GROUP "A" ON THE REFORM OF THE COURT (GT-GDR-A)

Reference document

Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012)

Report of the 1st GT-GDR-A meeting (14-16 March 2012)

GT-GDR-A(2012)R1

<u>ITEM 6</u>: ACCESSION OF THE EUROPEAN UNION TO THE EUROPEAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS

Reference document CDDH(2012)006 Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012) CDDH(2012)R85

ITEM 7: DEVELOPMENT AND PROMOTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS

7.1 Rights of older persons (CDDH-AGE)

Reference document CDDH(2012)006
Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012) CDDH(2012)R85
Report of the 1st CDDH-AGE meeting (21-23 March 2012) CDDH-AGE(2012)R1

7.2 Corporate social responsibility in the field of human rights

Reference document CDDH(2012)006
Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012) CDDH(2012)R85
Document prepared by the Secretariat CDDH(2012)12

7.3 Human Rights in culturally diverse societies

ITEM 8: BIOETHICS (DH-BIO)

Reference document

Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012)

Draft agenda of the 1st meeting of the DH-BIO (19-22 June 2012)

Programme of the Symposium on Biobanks (19-20 June 2012)

DH-BIO(2012)OJ1

ITEM 9: GENDER EQUALITY (GEC)

Reference document CDDH(2012)006
Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012) CDDH(2012)R85
Draft agenda of the 1st meeting of the GEC (6-8 June 2012) GEC(2012)OJ1
Draft annotated agenda GEC(2012)005

<u>ITEM 10</u>: CDDH CONTRIBUTION TO THE 31ST CONFERENCE OF COUNCIL OF EUROPE MINISTERS OF JUSTICE (VIENNA, 19-21 SEPTEMBER 2012)

Reference document

Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012)

Secretariat document concerning the 31st Conference of Council of Europe

Ministers of Justice (Vienna, 19-21 September 2012)

CDDH(2012)010

<u>ITEM 11</u>: MODERNISATION OF THE DATA PROTECTION CONVENTION (ECTS 108)

Reference document

Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012)

Modernisation of Convention 108: new proposals

Draft elements for a reply prepared by the Secretariat following the

CDDH(2012)006

CDDH(2012)R85

T-PD-BUR(2010)01Rev2_en

request of the T-PD Bureau

CDDH(2012)011

ITEM 12: EXPERTS REPRESENTING THE CDDH IN OTHER BODIES

Reference document CDDH(2012)006
Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012) CDDH(2012)R85

<u>ITEM 13</u>: WORKING METHODS OF THE CDDH AND ITS SUBORDINATE BODIES

Reference document CDDH(2012)006 Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012) CDDH(2012)R85

ITEM 14: CALENDAR OF MEETINGS

Reference document CDDH(2012)006
Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012) CDDH(2012)R85

ITEM 15: OTHER BUSINESS

15.1 Report of the Secretary General on the review of Council of Europe conventions

Reference document

Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012)

Report of the Secretary General on the review of Council of Europe conventions

Executive summary of the report of the Secretary General

Abridged report of the 43rd CAHDI meeting (29-30 March 2012)

CDDH(2012)R85

SG/Inf(2012)12

Addendum

CAHDI(2012)10

15.2 Follow-up to Committee of Ministers' Recommendation (CM/Rec(2010)4) on the human rights of members of the armed forces

Reference document CDDH(2012)006 Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012) CDDH(2012)R85

15.3 Detention of irregular migrants and asylum seekers

Reference document CDDH(2012)006 Report of the 85th CDDH meeting (Paris, 7-8 June 2012) CDDH(2012)R85

* * *

Appendix III

Opinions of the CDDH on PACE Recommendations

Opinion of the CDDH on Recommendation 1994(2012) on an additional protocol to the European Convention on Human Rights on national minorities

- 1. The Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH) notes with interest Recommendation 1994 (2012) "An additional Protocol to the European Convention of Human Rights on national minorities", in which the Parliamentary Assembly asks the Committee of Ministers to envisage drawing up an additional Protocol to the Convention that would establish minimum rights for national minorities. It shares the concerns of the Assembly regarding the importance of the protection of national minorities, which is essential to stability and peace in Europe.
- 2. The CDDH underlines that the Council of Europe has provisions dealing with national minorities. Article 14 of the ECHR requires that enjoyment of the rights and freedoms recognised under the Convention be secured without discrimination on any ground, "association with a national minority" being expressly included in the list of examples given. Protocol No. 12 of the ECHR sets a general prohibition of discrimination. In addition to these provisions, there are the developments that the European Court has introduced through its case-law. There is also a legally-binding instrument on national minorities, namely the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (CTS No.157); the European Charter for regional or minority languages (CTS No. 148) also contributes to this protection.
- 3. The existence of this legal framework leads the CDDH to conclude that a new normative work in this field is not necessary. The CDDH notes above all the absence of consensus on the very notion of "national minority". Consequently, any effort to draft an instrument would inevitably come up against this major difficulty. Regarding, in particular, the elaboration of an additional protocol to the ECHR, the Steering Committee reiterates its opinion that it is not appropriate to accompany the ECHR with protocols setting out a range of rights applicable to specific groups of people.
- 4. That said, the CDDH can but share the wishes expressed by the Parliamentary Assembly regarding the necessity to pursue co-operation with other international organisations in the area of protection of persons belonging to national minorities.

Opinion of the CDDH on Recommendation 1995 (2012) on the International Convention for the Protection of all Persons from Enforced Disappearance

- 1. The Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH) agrees with the Parliamentary Assembly that the Committee of Ministers should express its support for the United Nations International Convention for the Protection of all persons from Enforced Disappearances. As recalled in Resolution 1868 (2012) by the Parliamentary Assembly on the International Convention for the Protection of all Persons from Enforced Disappearances, the problem of enforced disappearances and missing persons constitutes a serious and flagrant human rights violation which is far from resolved, also in Europe. As to date (22 June 2012), amongst the 91 signatories and 33 parties having ratified the United Nations Convention, 35 Council of Europe member States have signed and 9 member States have ratified it. Therefore, the CDDH welcomes the fact that the Parliamentary Assembly, in paragraph 2 of Recommendation 1995(2012), invites the Committee of Ministers to urge all member States of the Council of Europe to sign, ratify and implement the United Nations Convention.
- 2. The CDDH notes that, in the explanatory memorandum to Resolution 1868 (2012) by Mr. Pourgourides (Rapporteur), the activities and instruments within the Council of Europe to combat enforced disappearances are elaborated in detail. This concerns in particular the case-law of the European Court of Human Rights with regard to Articles 2, 3 and 5 of the European Convention on Human Rights, the possibility to indicate interim measures and to urgently notify a High Contracting Party under Rules 39 and 40 of the Rules of the Court, as well as the possibility to conduct its own fact-finding missions. Moreover, the supervision of the execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights by the Committee of Ministers in cases of enforced disappearances is mentioned as well as the Committee of Ministers' Guidelines on the Eradication of Impunity for Serious Human Rights Violation of March 2011. In this connection, the CDDH would also like to refer to the Recommendation CM/Rec(2009)12 of the Committee of Ministers to member States on principles concerning missing persons and the presumption of death.
- 3. In paragraphs 3-4 of Recommendation 1995(2012), the Parliamentary Assembly lists the issues which, in its opinion, constitutes flaws in the United Nations Convention. It invites the Committee of Ministers to consider launching the process of preparing the negotiation, in the framework of the Council of Europe, of a European convention for the protection of all persons from enforced disappearance. The CDDH is of the opinion that, since the United Nations Convention only entered into force on 23 December 2010 and its monitoring mechanism the Committee on Enforced Disappearances has only started to fully operate in November 2011 with two annual sessions, it appears premature at this stage to assess the effectiveness of the United Nations Convention system and to draw any conclusions with regard to launching a process of negotiation of a European convention. The CDDH reiterates in this respect that any possible future work on this issue must avoid duplication with existing international instruments and should bring real

added-value to the existing standard-setting instruments within the Council of Europe and elsewhere.

- 4. The CDDH takes note of the opinion of the Parliamentary Assembly that the United Nations Convention fails to address certain elements, but also reiterates that the existing instruments of the Council of Europe already go beyond the United Nations Convention, notably with regard to the extension of the temporary jurisdiction (ratione temporis) of the European Court of Human Rights (see the case of Varvana and others v. Turkey [Grand Chamber], no. 16064/90, judgment of 18 September 2009). As far as the Parliamentary Assembly, in paragraph 61 et seq. of the explanatory memorandum to Resolution 1868 (2012), deplores the lack of a preventive role of the United Nations Convention which should be remedied by a European instrument, the CDDH recalls the already existing protection by the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture which, through its on-site visits to all places where persons are deprived of their liberty by public authorities, plays an important deterrent role concerning enforced disappearances. It also notes that the Optional Protocol to the United Nations Convention against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment which entered into force on 22 June 2006, seeks to establish a similar system at the global level.
- 5. Finally, the CDDH does not recommend at this stage to carry out new normative work in this field, but will continue to follow closely the developments of the ongoing work of the Committee on Enforced Disappearances and the ratification and implementation process of the United Nations Convention, also in view of any future consideration of further legal or policy instruments which the Council of Europe might pursue.

* * *

Appendix IV

Decisions taken at the 122nd session of the Committee of Ministers (follow-up to Brighton)

Securing the long-term effectiveness of the supervisory mechanism of the European Convention on Human Rights

Decisions

The Committee of Ministers

- 1. took note of the measures taken to date to implement the Interlaken and Izmir Declarations and invited all the parties concerned to comply with the deadlines set by these documents which have not yet expired;
- 2. welcomed the measures taken by the Court to increase its effectiveness and to deal with the clearly inadmissible applications pending before it, and encouraged the Court to make full use of the potential of Protocol No. 14, while observing that, notwithstanding the encouraging nature of the initial results obtained under Protocol No. 14, this instrument alone did not offer a sustainable and complete solution to the difficulties encountered by the Convention system;
- 3. endorsed the declaration unanimously adopted on the occasion of the High-level Conference on the Future of the European Court of Human Rights, which took place in Brighton on 19 and 20 April 2012, and paid homage to the United Kingdom authorities for this initiative;
- 4. expressed its determination to implement, as a priority, the Brighton Declaration and instructed its Deputies to manage this process;
- 5. asked its Deputies to follow up paragraphs 9f(i), 9g, 20j, 25b (where the procedures for the election of judges were concerned), 29b, 29c and 35b of the Brighton Declaration, if need be through their responsible Rapporteur Groups, and, where paragraphs 29b and 29c were concerned, in co-operation with the Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH);
- 6. instructed the CDDH to submit:
 - a. by 15 April 2013:
 - 1. a draft protocol amending the European Convention on Human Rights on the questions dealt with in paragraphs 12b, 15a, 15c, 25d and 25f of the Brighton Declaration;
 - 2. a draft optional protocol to the European Convention on Human Rights relating to advisory opinions, following up paragraph 12d of the Brighton Declaration;

- 3. its conclusions and possible proposals for action in response to paragraphs 12e and 20d of the Brighton Declaration;
- b. by 15 October 2013:
 - 1. a guide to good practice in respect of domestic remedies and a toolkit to inform public officials about the State's obligations under the Convention, further to paragraph 9f (ii) and (iii) of the Brighton Declaration;
 - 2. its conclusions and possible proposals for action to follow up paragraphs 20c, 20e, 25b (where the re-examination of the functioning of the Advisory Panel of Experts on Candidates for Election as Judge to the Court was concerned) and 29d of the Brighton Declaration;
- c. by 15 March 2015:
 - a report containing its opinions and possible proposals in response to paragraphs 35c to 35f of the Brighton Declaration;
- 7. invited member States to take the measures which the Brighton Declaration requires of them and to report to the Committee of Ministers by 15 March 2014;
- 8. invited the Secretary General to create a special account and to define its specific aim and methods in order to help the Court to deal with its backlog of cases;
- 9. invited the Court and the Secretary General to implement the part of the Brighton Declaration which concerns them directly and to co-operate when this is relevant and to inform the Committee of Ministers of the progress made in this respect by 15 October 2013;
- 10. instructed its Deputies to report to it at the next Session on the measures taken.

Appendix V

Terms of reference on accession of the EU to the ECHR

<u>1145th meeting – 13 June 2012</u>

Item 4.5

Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH) — Report to the Committee of Ministers on the elaboration of legal instruments for the accession of the European Union to the European Convention on Human Rights (CM/Del/Dec(2011)1126/4.1, CM(2011)149)

Decisions

The Deputies

1. instructed the Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH) to pursue negotiations with the European Union, in an ad hoc group⁸ 47+1, with a view to finalising the legal instruments setting out the modalities of accession of the European Union to the European Convention on Human Rights. In view of the urgency of the matter, these terms of reference shall be executed without delay;

2. instructed the CDDH to report directly and regularly to them on the negotiations with the European Union.

_

⁸ This wording shall not be understood as falling within the scope of Article 4 of Resolution CM/Res(2011)24 on intergovernmental committees and subordinate bodies, their terms of reference and working methods.

Appendix VI

Statement made by the Representative of the Russian Federation

First of all I would like to express our gratitude to the participants of the CDDH-UE Working Group for their contribution to the preparation of the draft that was proposed to the CDDH.

We as the Russian Federation based our work of that Group on the following principles:

First. All member States are equal Parties to the Convention after accession of the EU, and all Parties will remain in equal situation with respect to all aspects of the functioning of the Convention. In order to meet this principle we included special provisions for a co-respondent mechanism, for the participation of the EU in the Committee of Ministers, for the election of judges and for voting on the execution of judgments. From our point of view the draft of the Working Group respected this principle.

Secondly. All individuals shall be in an equal situation with respect to the protection ensured by the Convention. They will have the same rights to communicate, to have their communication considered by the Court and to have the execution of Court judgments monitored by the Committee of Ministers. We managed to secure this principle of equality.

Thirdly. The principle of integrity of the Court vis-à-vis all Parties to the Convention in every specific case shall be preserved. It means that internal court procedures of every Party will be in relation to the Court on an equal footing, with due regard to EU specificities.

Fourthly. The integrity of procedures and mechanism s of the Convention shall be preserved, which means that they should be equally applied to all Parties, with due regard to the EU specificities.

It was difficult to reach consensus on all these basic elements, but we would like to say that it had been reached, and that all sides made compromises to reach it. For the Russian Federation, certain elements were very difficult, but we decided to agree to them.

Now, because of the internal problems of the EU, we have received amendments from our European Union colleagues. We are going to study them with great care. But the fact is these amendments reopen the agreed draft. Therefore, we will look at the EU proposals having in mind that we will also have the right to present our own amendments to the draft that was agreed by the CDDH Working Group, as well as to the documents circulated by the EU. We assume that our possible proposals will have the same status as the draft amendments proposed by the EU. We hope as well that future negotiations will really be negotiations between 47 individual member States and the European Commission and not between a « European Union block » and those who are not members of the European Union.

In conclusion, I would like to say that recently, on several occasions, the Russian Federation expressed herself in favour of legal guarantees, which we prefer to political statements and goodwill promises. We hope that our partners will duly respect this approach.

* * *

Appendix VII

Experts representing the CDDH in other bodies

- Committee of Legal Advisers on Public International Law (CAHDI): Mr Roeland BÖCKER (The Netherlands)⁹
- Committee of Experts on Terrorism (CODEXTER): Mrs Isik BATMAZ.
- Consultative Committee of the Convention for the protection of individuals with regard to automatic processing of personal data (T-PD): Mrs Brigitte OHMS (Austria)
- European Commission for the Efficiency of Justice (CEPEJ): Mr Vit SCHORM (Czech Republic)¹⁰
- [Working Group on an additional Protocol on the protection of the human rights and dignity of persons with mental disorder in regard of the involuntary treatment and placement: Mr Franck SCHÜRMANN (Switzerland)]¹¹

Experts representing the CDDH at event organised by other bodies

- Symposium of the DH-BIO Biobanks and biomedical collections, an ethical framework for future research (Strasbourg, 19-20 June 2012): Mrs Brigitte KONZ (Luxembourg)
- Conference of the Ministers of justice of the Council of Europe (Vienna, 19-21 September 2012): M. Derek WALTON (United-Kingdom), CDDH Chairman
- Standing Committee on the Convention on the Conservation of European Wildlife and Natural Habitats (Bern Convention) (Strasbourg, 27 November 2012): Mr Philippe WERY (Belgium)

⁹ If the agenda requires so and subject to his availability. Otherwise, the Secretariat will follow the relevant items of the meeting and will inform the CDDH. The CDDH Secretariat is invited to make sure that the expert receives in due time the invitation and agenda from the concerned Secretariat.

¹⁰ If the agenda requires so and subject to his availability. Otherwise, the Secretariat will follow the relevant items of the meeting and will inform the CDDH. The CDDH Secretariat is invited to make sure that the expert receives in due time the invitation and agenda from the concerned Secretariat. ¹¹ To be set up if needed in the framework of the DH-BIO.

 $\frac{Appendix\ VIII}{Composition\ of\ the\ Bureau\ and\ chairmanship\ of\ subordinate\ bodies}$

| BUREAU DU CDDH | END OF ToR | REFERENCES |
|--|---|--|
| Mr Derek WALTON (United Kingdom), Chairman | 31 December 2012 (elected for 1 year renewable once) | 73 rd meeting (December 2011) |
| Ms Anne-Françoise TISSIER (France), Vice-Chairperson | 31 December 2012 (elected for 1 year renewable once) | 73 rd meeting (December 2011) |
| Mr Vit SCHORM (Czech Republic), Member | 31 December 2012 (elected for 2 years not renewable) | 71 st meeting (November 2010) |
| Mr Frank SCHÜRMANN (Switzerland), Member | 31 December 2012 (elected for 2 years not renewable) | 71 st meeting (November 2010) |
| M. Philippe WERY (Belgium), Member | 31 December 2012 (elected for 2 years renewable once) | 71 st meeting (November 2010) |
| Ms Brigitte KONZ (Luxembourg), Member | 31 December 2013 (elected for 2 years not renewable) | 73 rd meeting (December 2011) |
| Mr Jakub WOLASIEWICZ (Poland), Member | 31 December 2013 (elected for 2 years not renewable) | 73 rd meeting (December 2011) |
| Mr Levon AMIRJANYAN (Armenia), Member | 31 December 2013 (elected for 2 years renewable once) | 73 rd meeting (December 2011) |
| DH-GDR Mr Vit SCHORM (Czech Republic), Chairperson | 31 December 2012 (elected for 1 year renewable once) | 73 rd CDDH meeting (December 2011) |
| GT-GDR-A Ms Brigitte OHMS (Austria), Chairperson | 31 December 2012 (elected for 1 year not renewable) | |
| GT-GDR-B | 31 December 2012 | [To be elected during the 1 st meeting GT-GDR-B meeting 12-14 September 2012] |
| GEC Ms Carlien SCHEELE (The Netherlands) | 31 December 2012 | 75 th CDDH meeting (June 2012) |
| DH-BIO Prof. Eugenijus GEFENAS (Lituania), Chairperson | 31 December 2012 | 75 th CDDH meeting (June 2012) |
| CDDH-AGE Mr Jakub WOLASIEWICZ (Poland), Chairperson | 31 December 2012 (elected for 1 year renewable once | 74 th CDDH meeting (February 2012) |

Appendix IX

Meetings calendar

Calendar of meetings of the CDDH and its subordinate bodies (as adopted by the CDDH during its 75th meeting, 19-22 June 2012)

| 1 st Semester 2012 | |
|---|-----------------------|
| Meeting of the Ad Hoc Working Group on national practices for the selection of candidates for the post of judge at the European Court of Human Rights (CDDH-SC) | 11-13 January |
| 1 st meeting of the Committee of Experts on the Reform of the Court (DH-GDR) | 17-20 January |
| Ouverture de l'année judiciaire – European Court of Human Rights | 27 January |
| 84 th meeting of the Bureau of the Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH-BU) | Paris, 30-31 January |
| 74 th meeting of the Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH) | 7-10 February |
| Ministers' Deputies | 22 February |
| 1 st meeting of the Drafting Group A on the Reform of the Court (GT-GDR-A) | 14-16 March |
| 1 st meeting of the Bureau of the Committee on Bioethics (DH-BIO-BU) | 22-23 March |
| 1 st meeting of the Drafting Group on the Human Rights of the Elderly (CDDH-AGE) | 21-23 March |
| High-level Conference on the future of the European Court of Human Rights | Brighton, 18-20 April |
| 4 th meeting of the Committee of Experts on a Simplified Amendment Procedure (DH-PS) | 14-16 May |
| 1 st meeting of the Gender Equality Commission (GEC) | 6-8 June |
| 85 th meeting of the Bureau of the Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH-BU) | Paris, 7-8 June |
| 1 st meeting of the Committee on Bioethics (DH-BIO) | 19-22 June |
| 75 th meeting of the Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH) | 19-22 June |

| Second Semester 2012 | |
|--|---------------------------|
| 2 nd meeting of the Drafting Group A on the Reform of the Court (GT-GDR-A) | 5-7 September |
| 1 st meeting of the Drafting Group B on the Reform of the Court (GT-GDR-B) | 12-14 September |
| 1 st meeting of the Ad Hoc Group on the accession of EU on ECHR | 17-19 September |
| 31 st Council of Europe Conference of Ministers of Justice – « responses of justice to urban violence » | Vienna 19-21 September |
| 2 nd meeting of the Drafting Group on the Human Rights of the Elderly (CDDH-AGE) | 24-26 September |
| Workshop organised by the Albanian Chairmanship of the CM on certain aspects of the implementation of the ECHR at national level | October, 1 day ½ |
| 2 nd meeting of the Drafting Group B on the Reform of the Court (GT-GDR-B) | 10-12 October |
| 2 nd meeting of the Bureau of the Committee on Bioethics (DH-BIO-BU) | 18-19 October |
| VI Warsaw Seminar "The implementation of the ECHR in the domestic legal order" | 19 October |
| 2 nd meeting of the Committee of Experts on the Reform of the Court (DH-GDR) | 29-31 October |
| 2 nd meeting of the Ad Hoc Group on the accession of EU on ECHR | 7-9 November |
| 2 nd meeting of the Gender Equality Commission (GEC) | 14-16 November |
| 86 th meeting of the Bureau of the Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH-BU) | Paris, 15-16 November |
| 76 th meeting of the Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH) | 27-30 November |
| 2 nd meeting of the Committee on Bioethics (DH-BIO) | 4 -7 December |
| 1 st meeting of Drafting Group C on the Reform of the Court (GT-GDR-C) | 12-14 December |

| First Semester 2013 | |
|--|--------------------------------------|
| 3 rd meeting of Drafting Group B on the Reform of the Court (GT-GDR-B) (if necessary) | 9-11 January |
| 2 nd meeting of Drafting Group C on the Reform of the Court (GT-GDR-C) | 30 January - 1 February |
| 3 rd meeting of the Committee of experts on the Reform of the Court (DH-GDR) | 13-15 February |
| 87 th meeting of the Bureau of the Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH-BU) | Paris 7-8 March |
| 77 th meeting of the Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH) | 19-22 March |
| 3 rd meeting of the Bureau of the Committee on Bioethics (DH-BIO-BU) | [April] |
| 1 st meeting of Drafting Group D on the Reform of the Court (GT-GDR-D) | 10-12 April |
| 3rd meeting of the Gender Equality Commission (GEC) | [End of April – beginning of May] |
| 1 st meeting of Drafting Group E on the Reform of the Court (GT-GDR-E) | 15-17 May |
| 2 nd meeting of Drafting Group D on the Reform of the Court (GT-GDR-D) | 22-24 May |
| 3 rd meeting of the Committee on Bioethics (DH-BIO) | 27-30 May / 3-6 June |
| 4 th meeting of the Committee of experts on the Reform of the Court (DH-GDR) | 5-7 June |
| 88 th meeting of the Bureau of the Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH-BU) | Paris, 13-14 June |
| 78 th meeting of the Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH) | 25-28 June |

| Second Semester 2013 | |
|---|--------------------|
| 2 nd meeting of Drafting Group E on the Reform of the Court (GT-GDR-E) | 4-6 September |
| 5 th meeting of the Committee of experts on the Reform of the Court (DH-GDR) | 18-20 September |
| 4 th meeting of the Gender Equality Commission (GEC) | [end of September] |

| 89 th meeting of the Bureau of the Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH-BU) | [Paris, 30 September – 1 October |
|---|-------------------------------------|
| | or 7-8 November] |
| 79 th meeting of the Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH) | [8-11 October or 26-29 November] |
| 4 th meeting of the Bureau of the Committee on Bioethics (DH-BIO-BU) | [October] |
| 4 ^e meeting of the Committee on Bioethics (DH-BIO) | [end of November] |