



Project Cybercrime@Octopus

C-PROC
Bucharest, Romania

Version 9 June 2015

Implementation of the Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime on Xenophobia and Racism: Results of ECRI monitoring

www.coe.int/cybercrime



Note:

The Budapest Convention on Cybercrime is supplemented by the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalisation of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems (ETS 189).

The European Commission Against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI, www.coe.int/ecri), among other things, monitors compliance by member States of the Council of Europe with this Protocol.

ECRI is a human rights body of the Council of Europe, composed of independent experts, which monitors problems of racism, xenophobia, antisemitism, intolerance and discrimination on grounds such as "race", national/ethnic origin, colour, citizenship, religion and language (racial discrimination); it prepares reports and issues recommendations to member States.

The following are extracts from ECRI reports related to the Protocol on Xenophobia and Racism.

Contact

Alexander Seger
Head of Cybercrime Programme Office (C-PROC)
Directorate General of Human Rights and Rule of Law
Council of Europe, Strasbourg, France
Tel +33-3-9021-4506
Fax +33-3-9021-5650
Email: alexander.seger@coe.int

Disclaimer

This technical report does not necessarily represent official positions of the Council of Europe, of Parties to treaties referred to or of the donors to capacity building projects.

Extracts of ECRI reports

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
Albania	Fifth report on Albania (adopted on 19 March 2015)	Albania has ratified protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime and the Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems respectfully. 27 November 2008.	In recent years, there have been several incidents of hate speech by high-level politicians, which have had a negative impact on public discourse. The Internet has been increasingly used for spreading racism, intolerance and bullying in the region. However, no reliable data on hate crime is available with many cases going unreported. There is no information about self-regulation and systematic monitoring of the Internet. In Albania, there is a lack of coherent systems of data collection on the rights of various minority groups. Further, there is a lack of the implementation of the criminal law provisions on racism, discrimination and intolerance. Thus, it is difficult for authorities to monitor the effectiveness/improvements of certain groups.	Despite the amendments to the Criminal Court, made in connection with the ratification of the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, neither the police nor the media monitor Internet to counter online hate speech in Albania. The Albanian authorities concur with ECRI in identifying the need to base legislative reforms and policy initiatives on a comprehensive data analysis, in order to fine-tune governmental and non-governmental initiatives to the specificities of differing situations. Hence, the Albanian authorities consider that the multi-faceted challenge of good governance involves the digitization of accumulated information, the integration and analysis of available statistical data, and the serious investment for the collection of systematic and comprehensive data in the future.
Andorra	Fourth report on Andorra (adopted on 21 March 2012)	Andorra has not yet signed nor ratified the Convention on Cybercrime or the Additional protocol on the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic violence.	In Andorra, the criminal legislation in place relating to racism and intolerance is not exhaustive and does not include a provision prohibiting public incitement to violence, hatred and discrimination. There is no comprehensive legislation against racial discrimination; the application of the civil and administrative law provisions prohibiting discrimination is not monitored. No specific training on racism and racial discrimination is provided to judges, prosecutors and lawyers. There is no body with special capacity to combat racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia, anti-Semitism and intolerance at national level. The Plan for Equality has been stagnating and is not on the Government's agenda. Further, Andorra lacks a comprehensive data collection system, capable of assessing the situation of the various communities living in the principality.	The ECRI reiterates its recommendation that the Andorran authorities must ratify the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic violence committed through computer systems. The ECRI notes that the Andorran authorities do not intend to ratify the new protocol. In ECRI's view, its ratification would be instrumental in addressing and prosecuting cases of hate speech over the internet. Given the high percentage of migrant population in Andorra, ratification of this instrument would signal a firm commitment towards the development of an integration policy and respect of the rights of this section of society.

¹ Note: this refers to the status at the time of adoption of the report. Some States have since signed or ratified the Budapest Convention or its Protocol (see Appendix for the latest status).

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
Armenia	Third report on Armenia (adopted on 7 December 2010)	Armenia has not yet signed nor ratified the Convention on Cybercrime or the Additional protocol on the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic violence.	In Armenia, there is no comprehensive civil and administrative legislation against racial discrimination and no provisions in the Criminal Code prohibiting organizations that promote racism. No changes have been made to the Law on Alternative Service. The first restrictive Bill on freedom of conscience and religious organizations, which has been the subject of widespread domestic and international criticism, has had its first reading in Parliament. Further, there is no system for the collection of ethnic data.	ECRI claims new criminal offences should be introduced to combat organizations promoting racism. The criminal law should be effectively applied to all cases of racist violence and incitement thereto. Comprehensive civil and administrative legislation should be drafted against racial discrimination. In Armenia, the authorities should begin systematically collecting ethnic data and statistics on offences motivated by religious hatred and civil- and administrative-law actions for racial discrimination. Further, A new self-regulatory Code of Ethics should be adopted for the media with clear provisions against racism and related intolerance. Training must be organized for the State TV and Radio Commission on how to balance freedom of expression with minorities' protection.
Austria	Fourth report on Austria (adopted on 15 December 2009)	Austria has not yet ratified protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime and the Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems respectfully.	The criminal legislation on racist or neo-nazi behavior applies o offenses committed via Internet, and Internet access providers can themselves be prosecuted for the content of the sites hosted on their servers. In Austria, the Internet is monitored by the Federal Agency for State Protection and Counter-Terrorism of the Ministry of the Interior. This agency has set up a facility to enable users to report any neo-Nazi, racist or anti-Semitic material published on the Internet. Austrians can also report to the ISPA, which works with the Ministry of the Interior and service providers. The Federal Criminal Police Office and the Federal Agency for State Protection and Counter-Terrorism also help to monitor the Internet in Austria. There have been relatively few cases of the Internet being used to disseminate racist, xenophobic or anti-Semitic comments and material. Some NGOs, however, point to signs that the problem may have intensified in recent years.	ECRI encourages the Austrian authorities to pursue their efforts to preventing the internet from being used to disseminate racist, xenophobic, or anti-Semitic comments and material, and recommends that they maintain a high level of vigilance in this respect. It draws their attention to its General Policy RecommendationNo.6 on combating the dissemination of racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic material to the internet. The ECRI also reiterates its strong recommendation that the Austrian authorities introduce a comprehensive and coherent data collection system that would make it possible to assess the situation with regards to the different minority groups in Austria and to determine the scale of any manifestations of racism and direct and indirect racial discrimination.

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
Azerbaijan	Third report on Azerbaijan (adopted on 23 March 2011)	Azerbaijan ratified the Convention on Cybercrime on March 15 th 2010, thereby eliminating any obstacles to the ratification of the Additional Protocol, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems. The authorities have indicated that the Additional Protocol is currently being translated and assessed for the ratification process.	Azerbaijan created a free Internet site containing all Azerbaijan's legislation, so as to make this legislation more easily accessible by the general public; this site has reportedly been consulted by over 20000 persons since its launch. However, no information is available concerning a heightened awareness among the general public of the criminal law provisions prohibiting offences of a racist nature and acts of racial discrimination.	ECRI Strongly encourages Azerbaijan to ratify the Additional Protocol as soon as possible, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems. An Internet portal had been set up in Azerbaijan, making it possible to consult the case law of the courts of first instance, the courts of appeal and the Supreme Court. However, ECRI fails to see how this system could help identify possible instances of discrimination against people belonging to vulnerable groups in their dealings with the judicial system. No other information is available regarding the collecting of data, which would make it possible to identify such discrimination.
Belgium	Fifth report on Belgium (adopted on 4 December 2013)	Belgium has not yet ratified protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime and the Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems respectfully.	In Belgium, there has been a sharp increase in racist webpages and discussion that can be accessed from Belgian sites. Despite the measures taken, all the governmental and non-governmental observers raise concern. In 2011, The Centre received 248 files of which 90% concerned websites disseminating hate speech against immigrants in Belgium. A cyber-hate unit was established to develop a methodology to combat and analyze claims received with the aim of providing an appropriate response according to the type of cyber-hate. The ECRI regrets in particular that most of the recommendations addressed by the Centre to the authorities to counter hate speech on the Internet have not been implemented so far.	The ECRI recommends that the Belgian authorities step up their efforts to counteract the presence of racist expressions on the internet, in line with the recommendations of its General Policy Recommendation No. 6. The ECRI reiterates its recommendation to ratify the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems. The authorities should ensure that the new regulations for collecting data on racist and homo/transphobic incidents are applied in practice. Belgian authorities should step up their efforts to counteract the presence of racist expression on the Internet.

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
Bosnia and Herzegovina	Second report on Bosnia and Herzegovina (adopted on 7 December 2010)	Bosnia and Herzegovina has ratified the Convention on Cybercrime and its Additional Protocol, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	Bosnia and Herzegovina, together with the Communications Regulatory Agency, has taken necessary measures against the dissemination of electronic media and new communication technologies to decrease racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems. ECRI is still concerned that hate speech in the media is on the rise and that nationalistic and inflammatory language are increasingly used. The ECRI is increasingly concerned of media instrumentalization by politicians -who use messages of national, ethnic or religious intolerance as a means to gain influence.	The ECRI reiterates its recommendations that the law should explicitly provide that racist motivations constitute an aggravating circumstance in respect of all offences. Furthermore the ECRI encourages authorities at the relevant levels to enact law to strengthen criminal law provisions against hate crimes, hate speech, discrimination, cybercrime, and holocaust denial. The ECRI recommends measuring and identifying current minority groups to contribute to more inclusivity to the next census. The collection of such data must be carried out with due respect to the principles of confidentiality, informed consent and voluntary self-identification.
Bulgaria	Fifth report on Bulgaria (adopted on 19 June 2014)	Bulgaria has not yet ratified the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	The authorities in Bulgaria have not introduced a provision in the Criminal Code making racist motivation an aggravating circumstance for all criminal offences. Bulgarian legislation does not provide for an obligation to suppress public financing of organizations or political parties, which promote racism. Hate speech or violence targeting sexual orientation or gender identity is not recognized as an offence in the Criminal Code. In Bulgaria, racist and intolerant hate speech in political discourse is escalating. In the media and on Internet, expressions of racism and xenophobia against foreigners, Turks and Muslims are commonplace. As well as abusive language when referring to Roma. There is also a significant amount of hate speech targeting sexual orientation. A growing number of ultra-nationalist/fascist groups and political parties operate in Bulgaria.	The ECRI notes that the situation concerning hate speech on the Internet and in the media has deteriorated since its last report. Expressions of racism, xenophobia, etc. against many different minority populations occur often. In Bulgaria, the criminal law provisions to combat hate speech are rarely invoked nor successful. This sends a strong message to the public that hate speech is not serious and can be engaged in with impunity. ECRI strongly recommends that the authorities take urgent steps to ensure that anyone who engages in hate speech as defined in Articles 162 (1) and 164 (1) of the Criminal Code is duly prosecuted and punished.
Croatia	Third report on Croatia (adopted on 17 December 2004)	The Convention on Cybercrime was ratified by Croatia on 17 October 2002. The Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and	Croatia is in the process of ratifying the additional protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems. ECRI encourages the Croatian authority to make every effort to ensure that this process is completed as soon as possible.	The ECRI encourages the Croatian authorities to consider ways of setting up a coherent and comprehensive data collection system to assess the racial discrimination of various minority groups in Croatia. The data collection system will have to comply with domestic law, European regulations, and recommendations on data protection and protection of privacy, as stated in ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No.1 on combating racism, xenophobia,

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
		xenophobic nature committed through computer systems was signed on 26 March 2003 and the procedure for ratification is underway.	ECRI strongly encourages the Croatian authorities to pursue their efforts to reform and improve the judicial system in order to ensure that all victims of racism, intolerance and/or racial discrimination have access to a swift and effective remedy.	anti-Semitism and intolerance. When data is collected, the Croatian authorities must respect the anonymity and dignity of the persons questioned and obtain their full consent. The system for collecting data on racism and racial discrimination should also take into account equality between women and men, especially in the light of the possibility of double or multiple discrimination.
Cyprus	Fourth report on Cyprus (adopted on 23 March 2011)	The Convention on Cybercrime was ratified In March 2006. The Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems was signed, yet there is no case law yet invoking this law.	There are no reports or data-indicating criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed online within Cyprus.	While ECRI welcomes the ratification by Cyprus of the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime concerning the criminalization of acts of racist or xenophobic nature committed through computer systems, it notes that the legislation has not yet been applied. The authorities are encouraged also to draw inspiration from ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No. 6 on combating the dissemination of racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic material via the Internet.
Czech Republic	Fourth report on the Czech Republic (adopted on 2 April 2009)	Czech Republic has signed but not yet ratified the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	In the Czech Republic, racist and xenophobic discourse is common on the Internet. This applies not only to the websites of extreme right-wing parties but also to other less well known groups peddling negative messages about foreigners. Further, occasional violent anti-Semitic crimes against person or property are reported: anti-Semitic discourse is present on the internet, and is often difficult to combat due to the use of foreign servers. The ECRI welcomes the active steps taken by the authorities to put an end to the dissemination of racist and xenophobic ideas on the internet in the Czech Republic. The ECRI also encourages the Czech authorities to continue vigorously prosecuting persons responsible for publishing and disseminating racist material via the internet.	The ECRI reiterates its call for the ratification by the Czech Republic of the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist or xenophobic nature committed through computer systems. The Czech authorities have indicated that the non-recognition of corporate criminal liability in domestic law prevents ratification of the Convention, without which the Additional Protocol cannot be ratified. These problems were officially brought to the government's attention on 30 March 2009 Further, the ECRI reiterates its recommendation on establishing a monitoring system to collect information about the situation of various minority communities, the extent and causes of discrimination, and the evaluation of actions intended to combat. Such monitoring should also take into consideration the gender dimension, particularly from the viewpoint of possible double or multiple

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
				discrimination. It should be carried out with due respect to the principles of data protection and privacy and should be based on a system of voluntary self-identification, with a clear explanation of the reasons for which information is collected.
Denmark	Third report on Denmark (adopted on 16 December 2005)	Denmark ratified the Additional Protocol to the Convention on cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems, in June 2005	In recent years the Director of Public Prosecutions has brought charges for violation of section 266 b (2) of the Danish Criminal Code when statements compromised by section 266 b (1) may be characterized as propaganda. Most of these cases mainly concerned dissemination of discriminating statements on the internet. Further, there is no established system in Denmark for collecting information on complaints of racism and racial discrimination.	ECRI strongly recommends that the Danish Government provide basic and on-going training to police officers on issues pertaining to racism and racial discrimination. ECRI also recommends that disaggregated data be collected on the number of complaints of police misconduct filed by members of minority groups and that such complaints be duly followed up.
Estonia	Fourth report on Estonia (adopted on 15 December 2009)	Estonia has signed but not yet ratified the Convention on Cybercrime's Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	On 28 January 2003, Estonia signed the Additional Protocol to the Convention on cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems, but it has not yet been ratified. Reports indicate that racism, xenophobia and anti-Semitism on the internet are an immense problem in Estonia. ECRI has been informed that the law allows for preventing hate speech on the internet and that steps have been taken in this regard. The ratification of the Additional protocol to the convention on cybercrime will be a further step in the right direction.	ECRI recommends that Estonia make a declaration under Article 14 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination. ECRI reiterates its recommendation that the Estonian authorities make every effort to prosecute and punish media which incite racial hatred online. ECRI strongly recommends that the Estonian authorities consider ways of establishing a coherent, comprehensive data collection system in order to monitor the situation of minorities by means of information. Data should be collected in different public policy areas and the authorities should ensure full respect for the principles of confidentiality, informed consent and voluntary self-identification of people as belonging to a particular group. This system should also take into consideration the possible existence of double or multiple discrimination.
Finland	Fourth report on Finland (adopted on 15 December 2006)	Finland ratified the Convention on Cybercrime on 24 May 2007, entering into force on 1 September 2007. On 25 May 2011, Finland	In March 2010, the police launched an online service for reporting, for example, racist or xenophobic material on the Internet. The authorities have also informed ECRI that virtual community police officers are operating on the Internet and facilitate contact with the police. In addition, the Ministry of Transport and	ECRI recommends that the Finnish authorities take all necessary measures to combat racism on the Internet. This can be completed through conducting awareness campaigns and ensuring the implementation of relevant legislation, in accordance with the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
		ratified the Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems, which entered into effect that same year.	Communication and the Finnish Federation for Communication and Teleinformatics have jointly prepared a code of ethics for Internet providers.	systems. ECRI further recommends granting the police the resources needed to combat racism on the Internet. ECRI therefore hopes that the Finnish authorities will do their utmost to tackle the problem of racism on the Internet
France	Fourth report on France (adopted on 29 April 2010)	France ratified the Convention on Cybercrime on January 10 th 2006. Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist or xenophobic nature committed through computer systems was also ratified in May 2006.	The situation in France concerning racism on the Internet is a serious cause for concern. There has reportedly been a significant increase in the web pages and discussion boards with racist content accessible from French Internet sites. A number of remarks by politicians, including by elected persons and members of the government, in particular on questions of immigration and integration, have been perceived as encouragements to expression of racism and, particularly, xenophobia. Some French media sometimes convey racist prejudices and stereotypes. According to a number of sources, the situation in France concerning racism on the Internet is a serious cause for concern.	ECRI encourages the French authorities to pursue, without interfering in editorial independence, their efforts to raise media awareness of the need to ensure that reports by the media and the content of discussion boards on their Internet sites do not create an atmosphere of hostility towards and rejection of members of minority groups. It recommends that they initiate a debate with the media and the relevant civil society organizations on the best means of doing so, in particular by encouraging consideration of the possibility of including in media codes of ethics standards for the written press a commitment to not contribute to the dissemination of stereotypes and racist prejudice. ECRI strongly encourages the French authorities to pursue their efforts aimed at establishing a comprehensive, consistent system for collecting data making it possible to assess the situation regarding the various minority groups in France and to determine the extent of manifestations of racism and direct or indirect racial discrimination in different fields of life.
Georgia	Third report on Georgia (adopted on 28 April 2010)	Georgia signed the Convention on Cybercrime on 1 April 2008. The authorities are in the process of revising their legislation in order to ratify the Convention as soon as possible.	Although racism in public discourse has deteriorated since the August 2008 armed conflict in Georgia, no changes have been brought to the Criminal Code with regard to provisions to combat racism and intolerance since the adoption of ECRI's second report. The Georgian authorities have informed ECRI that they have no intention either to introduce a general aggravating circumstance or to add new offences to the current provisions to combat racism and intolerance.	ECRI recommends that Georgia ratify the Convention on Cybercrime, as well as sign and ratify its Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems. ECRI recommends that the Georgian authorities monitor the situation as concerns manifestations of stereotypes, prejudice and misconceptions of minority groups and in particular ethnic and religious minorities, in political discourse and in the media. Further, ECRI strongly

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
				encourages the Georgian authorities to establish a comprehensive and consistent system for collecting data making it possible to assess the situation regarding the various minority groups in Georgia and to determine the extent of racism and direct or indirect racial discrimination in different fields of life.
Germany	Fifth report on Germany (adopted on 5 December 2013)	Germany ratified the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime in 2012. The authorities are currently considering the possibilities for including in the guidelines for criminal proceedings an obligation to investigate the presence of a "racist, xenophobic or other particularly reprehensible" motive.	Germany has ratified the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, which came into force on October 2011. Since reunification, the level of violence motivated by racism and xenophobia has increased online. Further, there is no reliable statistical tool for measuring the scale of violence and hate speech. The high rate of under-reporting offences involving racism reflects a lack of confidence on the part of vulnerable groups in the effectiveness of criminal proceedings brought by the police and the prosecution services. There is still a lack of support for victims of racist acts or racial discrimination within Germany.	Despite repeated recommendations from ECRI, Germany has still not ratified Protocol No. 12 to the European Convention on Human Rights. In 2012, the administration failed in further including racist motivation in the Criminal Code as an aggravating circumstance. In the field of incitement to hatred, there is a considerable degree of impunity.
Greece	Fifth report on Greece (adopted on 10 December 2014)	Greece has not signed nor ratified the Additional Protocol to the Convention on cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	Various interlocutors informed the ECRI's delegation that the widespread problem of hate speech had increased substantially since 2009. This can be seen in the rise of parties like the Golden Dawn. Hate speech has been directed against migrants, Muslims and Roma, Jews and LGBT persons in Greece.	The ECRI recommends that Greece ratify the Additional Protocol to the European Convention on Cybercrime, as stated in the 2014- ECRI recommends that Law 927/1979 is always applied to cases of hate speech in the media. ECRI also recommends that the Greek authorities set up a national monitoring mechanism for incidents of hate speech. This should also include, but not be limited to, a centralized database for court cases. Furthermore, it recommends that Greece ratify the Additional Protocol to the European Convention on Cybercrime, as stated in the 2014-2016 Human Rights National Action Plan.

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
Hungary	Fourth report on Hungary (adopted on 20 June 2008)	Hungary has not signed nor ratified the Additional Protocol to the Convention on cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	Hungarian authorities have indicated that certain acts covered by the Additional Protocol are not currently punishable under Hungarian law. They have also indicated that, despite their legislative efforts in this direction, the present constitutional position with respect to the balance to be found between freedom of expression and the prohibition of hate speech make it impossible to predict when the protocol may be ratified. Further, Hungary has seen a sharp rise in racism and anti-Semitism online.	The ECRI urges the Hungarian authorities to find a solution as soon as possible to ratify the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist or xenophobic nature committed through computer systems. Because of the lack of statistics relating to the application of relevant provisions of the Criminal Code and the lack of relevant data disaggregated by ethnicity, no specific figures are available regarding racist violence in Hungary.
Iceland	Fourth report on Iceland (adopted on 6 December 2011)	Iceland signed the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime on October 2003. Today, a bill is being drafted and is due to be submitted to Parliament.	ECRI regrets that no efforts have been made to monitor racism and discrimination towards Muslims. Media, including the Internet, and publications, a television channel and several websites are known to disseminate hate speech against Muslims. As a result, Muslims in Iceland feel that Islamophobia has become institutionalized, and that the situation is worse than five years ago.	ECRI recommends that the authorities invite media professionals to adopt provisions in their codes of self-regulation concerning the manner of reporting on the citizenship or ethnicity of suspects in criminal cases so as to avoid breeding a climate of hostility towards members of vulnerable groups. ECRI also recommends that the authorities take steps to monitor the Internet and prevent it from being used to disseminate racist or xenophobic comments and material. It draws their attention to its General Policy Recommendation No. 6 on combating the dissemination of racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic material via the Internet.
Ireland	Fourth report on Ireland (adopted on 6 December 2011)	Ireland has not signed the protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	The National Consultative Committee on Racism and Interculturalism (NCCRI) was closed down in December 2008. The expertise gathered by the NCCRI, the bridge between authorities and the civil society and the unique reporting system about racist incidents were lost. The National Action Plan Against Racism (2005-2008) adopted as a follow-up to the United Nations World Conference Against Racism held in 2001, has not been renewed. Further, Ireland does not have a protection determination procedure for persons in need of a protection status.	ECRI strongly encourages the Irish authorities to improve and to supplement the existing arrangements for collecting data on racist incidents and the follow-up given to them by the criminal justice system. In this respect, it draws the authorities' attention to the section of its General Policy Recommendation No. 11 on combating racism and racial discrimination in policing which concerns the role of the police in combating racist offences and monitoring racist incidents.

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
Italy	Fourth report on Italy (adopted on 6 December 2011)	Italy ratified the Convention on Cybercrime on June 5 th 2008, thus removing an obstacle to the ratification of its Additional Protocol, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems. It has not yet ratified the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime	The Italian authorities have recognized the urgent need to combat all expressions of racism and intolerance on the Internet. The use of racist and xenophobic discourse in politics appears to be increasing, targeting Africans, Muslims, Roma, Romanians, asylum seekers and migrants. Sensationalist articles continue to appear in the media and many Internet sites contain messages of racial hatred and even incitement to racist violence.	The ECRI strongly encourages Italian authorities to continue their efforts to combat the dissemination of racist and xenophobic ideas online. It draws their attention to its General Policy Recommendation No. 6 on combating the dissemination of racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic material via the Internet, which suggests a series of measures that the authorities can take to this end.
Latvia	Fourth report on Latvia (adopted on 9 December 2011)	Latvia has not yet signed nor ratified the Convention on Cybercrime or the Additional protocol on the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic violence.	With the co-financing of the EU Commission two activities on media diversity and on monitoring hate speech on the Internet have been organized in Latvia. ECRI, however, notes that, in addition to problems related to racial stereotyping, another important issue that needs to be tackled is the deep divide between media addressing the majority of the population and media addressing Russian speakers.	ECRI recommends that the Latvian authorities create a law-enforcement unit with dedicated capacity to monitor the Internet for instances of racism or racial discrimination. It also recommends that the Latvian authorities encourage the setting up of a self-regulatory mechanism by the media, which would ensure, inter alia, respect for the principles underlying ECRI's mandate.
Liechtenstein	Fourth report on Liechtenstein (adopted on 5 December 2012)	Liechtenstein has signed the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems. The ratification of this	Article 283 of the Criminal Code does not punish racist acts motivated on grounds of citizenship and language. Persons working in the criminal justice system do not receive special training on the application of the criminal law provisions aimed at combating racist offences in Liechtenstein. Liechtenstein lacks a comprehensive civil and administrative legal framework aimed at combating racial discrimination in all fields.	ECRI Reiterates its recommendation that Liechtenstein signs and or ratify the Convention on Cybercrime and its Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems. ECRI recommended that the authorities of Liechtenstein collect statistical data on the implementation of criminal law provisions against racism and that they extend this data collection so as to cover Article 33-5 of the Criminal Code.

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
		instrument was scheduled to be completed in 2012.		
Lithuania	Fourth report on Lithuania (adopted on 22 June 2011)	Lithuanian authorities ratified the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime on 12 October 2006, which entered into force on 1 February 2007.	Racist comments on the internet constitute one of the leading problems in Lithuania. Although the Police Department has a cybercrime unit, which also deals with hate crimes, this unit does not monitor the Internet for hate speech systematically. Instead, it reacts to complaints received.	ECRI recommends that the cybercrime unit of the Police Department be reinforced and that its competencies be extended to include the systematic monitoring of the internet for racist comments. Further, ECRI recommends that all persons working within the criminal justice system – members of the police force, the prosecution service and the judiciary – as well as the Inspector of Journalist Ethics pay special attention to the application of the newly introduced provisions, as well as other provisions against racial discrimination and incitement to racial hatred online. ECRI recommends that all instances of racial discrimination and incitement to racial hatred, including in the press and on the internet, be thoroughly investigated and punished.
Luxembourg	Fourth report on Luxembourg (adopted on 8 December 2011)	Luxembourg has not ratified the Convention on Cybercrime or its Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems. However the Luxembourg authorities have informed ECRI that there is a draft law concerning the ratification of these instruments which is scheduled to be introduced at the beginning of 2012.	ECRI was informed that there is no overt racism in Luxembourg, but instead is found on the internet. In 2010, 22 cases of racism or anti-Semitism were seen on the internet and 6 were reported to the police. ECRI does not know what action was taken. In March 2010, the CET organized a round table on "combatting racist content on the internet". Positive initiatives have been made to increase awareness.	ECRI recommends that Luxembourg ratify at the earliest opportunity the Convention on Cybercrime and its Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems. ECRI also strongly recommends that the government continue to conduct public awareness campaigns on the adverse consequences of racism and Xenophobia

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
Malta	Fourth report on Malta (adopted on 20 June 2013)	Maltese authorities have not yet signed nor ratified the European Convention on Nationality (signed on 29 October 2003) or the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime (signed on 28 January 2003).	The ECRI recommended that the Maltese authorities improve the application of the provisions in force against racism and racial discrimination online. The ECRI further recommends that all those involved in the criminal justice systems are equipped with knowledge are sensitized on the importance of countering racism and racially motivated conduct. In Malta, there is a cybercrime unit within the police. However, this unit focuses chiefly on child pornography	ECRI reiterates its recommendation that Malta must sign and ratify Protocol No. 12 to the European Convention on Human Rights and the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.
Republic of Moldova	Fourth report on the Republic of Moldova (adopted on 20 June 2013)	Moldova ratified the Convention on Cybercrime on 12 May 2009. The Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime will also be ratified once national legislation has been brought into line with European standards.	Racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic online content is increasing in the Republic of Moldova. Further, the ECRI has been informed of the creation, following ratification of the Convention on Cybercrime, of a new cybercrime investigation center.	The ECRI recommends that the authorities train and instruct the staff of the police center for investigation and detecting racist propaganda online. Moldova must also begin compiling statistics and assuring the application of the legislation on the elimination of racism and racial discrimination to such content.
Monaco	Second report on Monaco (adopted on 8 December 2010)	Monaco has not yet signed nor ratified the Convention on Cybercrime or its Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	In Monaco, Draft laws are being prepared to better combat racist attitudes and threats disseminated through Internet. The authorities in Monaco have also begun a working group to prepare the process of ratification of the Convention on Cybercrime, which may be regarded as a first step.	The ECRI recommends that the authorities sign and ratify the Convention on Cybercrime and its Additional Protocol. ECRI encourages the Monegasque authorities to pass the bills on sport and offences relating to computer systems, drawing on the principles set out in its General Policy Recommendations No. 12 on combating racism and racial discrimination in the field of sport and No. 6 on combating the dissemination of racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic material via the Internet.

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
Montenegro	Report on Montenegro (adopted on 8 December 2011)	Since independence in June 2006, Montenegro has ratified the Convention on Cybercrime and its Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	A Law on the Prohibition of Discrimination has been adopted establishing the Protector of Human Rights and Freedoms as the anti-discrimination body with competence in both the public and the private sphere. There is no systematic collection of disaggregated ethnic data, no authentic representation of national/ethnic minorities in Parliament and proportionate representation in public services, state bodies and local self-government has not been achieved.	ECRI recommends that the necessary steps must be taken in order for the amendments to the Law on Minority Rights and Freedoms to be applied in Montenegro.
Netherlands	Fourth report on the Netherlands (adopted on 20 June 2013)	Netherlands has ratified the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime on 22 July 2010, which entered into force on 1 November 2010.	Dutch authorities must promote a more vigorous prosecution and sentencing practice in respect to offences committed through the Internet. The authorities have cut funding of the Complaints Bureau for Discrimination, which receives complaints about racist offences committed through the Internet. There also is no comprehensive Action Plan in the Netherlands for Combating Racism at national level.	The ECRI reiterates its recommendation to the Dutch authorities to continue to support the work of the Complaints Bureau for Discrimination on the Internet (MDI), including by ensuring that adequate resources are available to this organization to carry out its work effectively. Further, A national strategy and policy against racism and racial discrimination (including employment, education, access to services and access to public places) must be developed.
Norway	Fifth report on Norway (adopted on 10 December 2014)	Norway has not signed the protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime or the Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems	In May 2014, Norway included the human right to equal treatment in its Constitution. Four new Anti-Discrimination Acts entered into force on 1 January 2014. The criminal provisions against hate speech on the Internet have also been strengthened. The police statistics in Norway do not currently provide a clear picture of the extent of hate speech and racist violence. The police do not systematically monitor racist content and the activity of racist groups on the Internet. As a result, many such incidents are not reported.	ECRI strongly recommends the Norwegian police begin collecting, documenting, and prosecuting hate speech on the Internet. ECRI also strongly recommends the authorities to give one or more police unit's responsibility for combating hate speech on the Internet along with appropriate technical and human resources.

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
Poland	Fifth report on Poland (adopted on 20 March 2015)	Poland has not signed the protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime or the Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems	In Poland, hate speech on the Internet specifically targets Muslim and LGBT communities. Hate Speech in Poland has not decreased since the ECRI's last report. Racist and xenophobic comments have become a common occurrence on online discussion forums.	ECRI recommends that the Polish authorities must extend their mandate to include the monitoring of illegal activities endorsing Racist and xenophobic expressions online.
Portugal	Fourth report on Portugal (adopted on 21 March 2013)	Portugal has signed and ratified the Convention on Cybercrime and its Additional Protocol on 24 March 2010. Both of which entered into force in Portugal on 1 July 2010.	ECRI notes that, according to NGO reports, there has been an increase in racist websites in recent years, targeting particularly Roma and immigrant communities. The criminal police have a cybercrime department, which has the power to close down websites disseminating illegal content, including material of a racist or xenophobic nature. However, the authorities have not cooperated with the provisions of the Cybercrime Convention	ECRI recommends that the authorities take action to ensure that the cybercrime department steps up its monitoring of the internet to prevent it from being used to disseminate more racist or xenophobic comments and materials; drawing attention to the General Policy Recommendation No. 6 on combatting material on the internet.
Romania	Fourth report on Romania (adopted on 19 March 2014)	Romania ratified the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime on 16 July 2009. This entered into force in November 2009. Romania, however, reserves "the right not to apply the provisions of Article 5 paragraph 1 of the Protocol, concerning insults made through a computer system on racist and xenophobic grounds".	The provisions of the Criminal Code as well as those of GEO No. 31/2002 regarding racist offences are still weakly applied.	ECRI recommends that the Romanian authorities withdraw the reservation to Article 5 paragraph 1 of the Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
The Russian Federation	Fourth report on the Russian Federation (adopted on 20 June 2013)	The Russian Federation has not signed nor ratified the protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime or the Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	Ratification of the Convention on Cybercrime is under discussion. In view of the serious problems faced by the Russian Federation concerning racist discourse on the Internet, ratification would extensively increase the possibility of international cooperation. Although police intensified a crackdown on online extremists in 2011, opening 67 criminal cases and closing down 47 websites, ECRI notes also that the Federal List of Extremist Materials includes Internet websites or certain web pages which Internet service providers have been instructed by a court to block.	ECRI reiterates its recommendation that the Russian Federation ratifies Protocol No. 12 to the European Convention on Human Rights and that it signs and ratifies the Convention on Cybercrime and its Additional Protocol. ECRI strongly encourages the Russian Federation authorities to continue their efforts to prevent the Internet from being used to disseminate racist and xenophobic comments and material and to prosecute the perpetrators of such acts. It draws the attention of the authorities to its General Policy Recommendation No. 6 on combating the dissemination of racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic material via the Internet.
San Marino	Fourth report on San Marino (adopted on 21 March 2013)	San Marino has not signed nor ratified the protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime or the Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	With regard to the Convention on Cybercrime, San Marino began examining the treaty with a view to its possible ratification. ECRI has also been informed that the new package law on organized crime and financial crime has brought domestic law closer to the requirements of the Cybercrime Convention. However, the ratification of this instrument would require further important amendments to relevant domestic legislation.	ECRI recommends that San Marino sign and ratify the Convention on the Participation of Foreigners in Public Life at Local Level. ECRI also strongly encourages San Marino to sign and ratify the Convention on Cybercrime and its Additional Protocol.
Serbia	Second report on Serbia (adopted on 23 March 2011)	Serbia ratified the Convention on Cybercrime and its Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist or xenophobic nature committed through computer systems on 14 April 2009 and these instruments entered into force in Serbia on 1 August	There is not much information on acts of a racist or xenophobic nature committed through computer systems in Serbia.	ECRI recommends that the Serbian authorities consider ways of establishing a coherent, comprehensive data collection system in order to monitor the situation of minority groups by means of information broken down according, for instance, to ethnic origin, language, religion and nationality. Data should be collected in different public policy areas and the authorities should ensure full respect for the principles of confidentiality, informed consent and voluntary self-identification of people as belonging to a particular group. This system should also take into consideration the possible existence of double or multiple discrimination.

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
		2009.		
Slovakia	Fifth report on Slovakia (adopted on 19 June 2014)	Slovakia has signed but not ratified the protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime or the Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	In Slovakia, offences of hate speech and racist violence are recurrent in traditional media and online. Despite a specific recommendation contained in ECRI's fourth report, Slovakia has not yet ratified the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems. The authorities have informed ECRI that the Additional Protocol will be signed as soon as the Criminal Code is amended providing for criminal liability of legal persons for acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	ECRI reiterates its recommendation to ratify the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.
Slovenia	Fourth report on Slovenia (adopted on 17 June 2014)	Slovenia has not signed nor ratified the protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime or the Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	Hate speech on the Internet has increased, targeting mainly Roma, LGBT people and Muslims. Racist and xenophobic rhetoric used by political figures often goes unchecked. The Slovenian hotline "Spletno Oko" (Web Eye) was launched in March 2007 for the anonymous reporting of illegal content found on the Internet, including racist hate speech.	ECRI encourages the authorities to continue monitoring the internet to prevent it from being used to disseminate racist comments and materials. Moreover, monitoring should continue to prosecute and punish those who incite racial hatred, violence or intolerance.
Spain	Conclusions on Spain (adopted on 5 December 2013)	Spain has not signed nor ratified the protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime or the Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	A Spanish Comprehensive Strategy against racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance was approved by the Council of Ministers on 4 November 2011. This document provides for the compilation of data on acts of racism and racial discrimination. As a result, changes to the Crime Statistics System have permitted police to record data on the number of complaints and type of offences linked to racism, xenophobia or related intolerance since 2011. Racist incidents, moreover, are now defined as "any incident which is perceived to be racist by the	ECRI recommends that Spain complete the ratification process for the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime. It also reiterates its recommendation for Spain to ratify the European Social Charter (Revised), the European Convention on Nationality, the Convention on the Participation of Foreigners in Public Life at Local Level and the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families. They also need to take care to ensure that new legislation does not compromise these efforts.

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
			victim or any other person". The Ministry of Interior is responsible for publication of this data.	
Sweden	Fourth report on Sweden (adopted on 19 June 2012)	Sweden has not signed nor ratified the protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime or the Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	The Swedish government has increased support to tackle racial discrimination through long-term funding initiatives online. ECRI notes with interest that the Swedish government is planning to study the scope of legislative amendments required by ratification of the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems. ECRI encourages the authorities to complete this study and expedite any legislative changes needed as well as ratification of the Convention on Cybercrime, which is a prerequisite for ratifying its additional protocol. In this respect, ECRI stresses that this protocol directly concerns an aspect of the fight against racism and intolerance that is of growing importance.	ECRI again recommends that Sweden ratify the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems, and the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families. ECRI recommends that the Swedish authorities continue and step up their efforts to combat racist forms of expression on the Internet.
Switzerland	Fifth report on Switzerland (adopted on 19 June 2014)	Switzerland has not signed nor ratified the protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime or the Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	A significant share of hate speech is disseminated via the Internet in Switzerland. The ECRI is pleased to note that a number of online newspapers have adopted self-regulatory measures, such as more systematic moderation of comments, abolition of anonymity for posters and the automatic closure of the accounts of persons who resort to racist discourse.	The system of police recording and following up of racist, homophobic or transphobic incidents should be improved and a police department should be tasked with actively combating hate speech on the Internet. ECRI recommends that the Swiss authorities give one or more police units, preferably the National Co-ordination Unit to Fight Internet Crime, responsibility for actively combating hate speech on the Internet, along with appropriate technical and human resources.
"The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia"	Fourth report on "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (adopted on	"The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" has ratified the protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime on 14 November 2005, but	The authorities indicated that they had noted no cases of use of the Internet for disseminating racist or hate-based content via sites hosted in the country. They pointed out that the Ministry of the Interior had a unit to combat cybercrime, which nonetheless did not specifically monitor the situation regarding racism or incitement of hatred	ECRI recommends that the authorities step up their vigilance concerning use of the Internet for disseminating racist or hate-based content. It recommends in particular that they establish a surveillance system, in co-operation with access providers and without interfering in the latter's independence, and that they monitor the situation. It draws their attention to its General Policy Recommendation No. 6

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
	28 April 2010)	has not yet ratified the Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	on the Internet.	on combating the dissemination of racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic material via the Internet.
Turkey	Fourth report on Turkey (adopted on 10 December 2010)	Turkey has not ratified the protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime or the Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	Regretfully, the Convention on Cybercrime and its Additional Protocol on the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer networks has not changed since ECRI's third report. Further, No coherent, comprehensive system of data collection is yet in place to assess the situation of the various minority groups or the scale of racism and racial discrimination in Turkey.	ECRI recommends that Turkey ratify the Convention on Cybercrime and its Additional Protocol on the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer networks. Further Turkey must begin collecting data on minority groups. The data collection system must comply with domestic law and European regulations and recommendations on data protection and the protection of privacy, as indicated in ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No. 1 on combating racism, xenophobia, anti-Semitism and intolerance. It should in particular be implemented with due regard for the principles of confidentiality, informed consent and the voluntary self-identification of persons as belonging to a particular group. The system for collecting data on racism and racial discrimination should also take into consideration the possible existence of cases of double or multiple discrimination.
Ukraine	Fourth report on Ukraine (adopted on 9 December 2011)	Ukraine has not ratified the protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime or the Additional Protocol concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	Some political parties and candidates engage in xenophobic, anti-Semitic or anti-Tatar rhetoric. There are websites that constantly publish anti-Semitic, racist and xenophobic material; virulent hate speech against Roma has also been reported on Internet forums. Journalists and the media reportedly do little to combat racism, xenophobia and racial discrimination. Overall, tolerance towards Jews, Russians and Roma appears to have significantly declined in Ukraine since 2000 and prejudices are also reflected in daily life against other groups, who experience problems in accessing goods and services.	ECRI recommends that the Ukrainian authorities take specific steps to prevent the Internet from being used to disseminate racist, xenophobic or anti-Semitic comments and material. It draws their attention to its General Policy Recommendation No. 6 on combating the dissemination of racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic material via the Internet, which refers to a series of measures that the authorities could take in this respect, and emphasizes in particular in the present Ukrainian context the need for the authorities to increase their vigilance in this respect and to prosecute persons responsible for publishing and disseminating racist material via the Internet.

Country	Report accessed	Signed/Ratified ¹	Progress Assessment	ECRI Recommendations
United Kingdom	Fourth report on the United Kingdom (adopted on 15 December 2009)	The United Kingdom has not signed or ratified the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.	Public discourse about Muslims is frequently negative, whether in the mainstream (especially tabloid) press, on the internet, or in the discourse of political parties.	It recommends that the United Kingdom take all necessary measures to sign and ratify the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalization of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.

Appendix: Protocol on Xenophobia and Racism (ETS 189) – Status of signatures, ratifications, accessions

[Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalisation of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems](#)
[CETS No.: 189](#)

Status as at 9 June 2015

	Signature	Ratification	Entry into force
Albania	26/5/2003	26/11/2004	1/3/2006
Andorra	23/4/2013		
Armenia	28/1/2003	12/10/2006	1/2/2007
Austria	30/1/2003		
Azerbaijan			
Belgium	28/1/2003		
Bosnia and Herzegovina	9/2/2005	19/5/2006	1/9/2006
Bulgaria			
Croatia	26/3/2003	4/7/2008	1/11/2008
Cyprus	19/1/2005	23/6/2005	1/3/2006
Czech Republic	17/5/2013	7/8/2014	1/12/2014
Denmark	11/2/2004	21/6/2005	1/3/2006
Estonia	28/1/2003		
Finland	28/1/2003	20/5/2011	1/9/2011
France	28/1/2003	10/1/2006	1/5/2006
Georgia			
Germany	28/1/2003	10/6/2011	1/10/2011
Greece	28/1/2003		
Hungary			
Iceland	9/10/2003		
Ireland			
Italy	9/11/2011		
Latvia	5/5/2004	14/2/2007	1/6/2007
Liechtenstein	17/11/2008		
Lithuania	7/4/2005	12/10/2006	1/2/2007
Luxembourg	28/1/2003	16/10/2014	1/2/2015
Malta	28/1/2003		
Moldova	25/4/2003		
Monaco			
Montenegro	7/4/2005	3/3/2010	1/7/2010
Netherlands	28/1/2003	22/7/2010	1/11/2010
Norway	29/4/2008	29/4/2008	1/8/2008
Poland	21/7/2003	20/2/2015	1/6/2015
Portugal	17/3/2003	24/3/2010	1/7/2010
Romania	9/10/2003	16/7/2009	1/11/2009
Russia			
San Marino			

Serbia	7/4/2005	14/4/2009	1/8/2009
Slovakia			
Slovenia	26/2/2004	8/9/2004	1/3/2006
Spain	27/11/2013	18/12/2014	1/4/2015
Sweden	28/1/2003		
Switzerland	9/10/2003		
The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia	14/11/2005	14/11/2005	1/3/2006
Turkey			
Ukraine	8/4/2005	21/12/2006	1/4/2007
United Kingdom			

Non-members of the Council of Europe

	Signature	Ratification	Entry into force
Argentina			
Australia			
Canada	8/7/2005		
Chile			
Colombia			
Costa Rica			
Dominican Republic			
Israel			
Japan			
Mauritius			
Mexico			
Morocco			
Panama			
Paraguay			
Peru			
Philippines			
Senegal			
South Africa	4/4/2008		
Sri Lanka			
Tonga			
United States of America			

Total number of signatures not followed by ratifications:	14
Total number of ratifications/accessions:	24