

PC-OC (2012) 03

English only

http://www.coe.int/tcj/

Strasbourg, 29 March 2012 [PC-OC/Documents 2012/ PC-OC(2012) 03 ]

## EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON CRIME PROBLEMS (CDPC)

#### <u>COMMITTEE OF EXPERTS</u> ON THE OPERATION OF EUROPEAN CONVENTIONS ON CO-OPERATION IN CRIMINAL MATTERS (PC-OC)

Provisional Index of Case Law by the European Court of Human Rights of Relevance for Application of the European Conventions on International Judicial Co-operation in Criminal Matters

# Provisional Index<sup>1</sup> of Case Law by the European Court of Human Rights of Relevance for Application of the European Conventions on International Judicial Co-operation in Criminal Matters

2

# IMPORTANT NOTES:

- The following index is not binding and/or exhaustive and is to be used only for reference and as a supplementary tool to simplify orientation of practitioners.
- In the index of keywords, the keywords, as well as the cases related to each keyword are arranged alphabetically.
- Texts of decisions of the Court can be found in the HUDOC database (see below).
- Some English translations of the Court's judgments, delivered in French, available in the HUDOC database are incomplete and omit parts of the French text.

# Index of keywords with relevant case law:

Keyword	Case Title	Application No.
Additional Protocol, Article 2 – see transfer of s	sentenced persons (Additional Protocol, Article 2)	
Additional Protocol, Article 3 – see transfer of sentenced persons (Additional Protocol, Article 3)		
admissibility of evidence – see mutual assistance (admissibility of evidence)		
assurances	Abdulazhon Isakov v. Russia	14049/08

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>) Summaries of the judgments and decisions will be added later.

Al-Moayad v. Germany	35865/03
Babar Ahmad and others v. United Kingdom	24027/07, 11949/08 & 36742/08
Baysakov and others v. Ukraine	54131/08
Ben Khemais v. Italy	246/07
Chahal v. United Kingdom	22414/93
Chentiev and Ibragimov v. Slovakia	21022/08 & 51946/08
Cipriani v. Italy	22142/07
Dzhaksybergenov (aka Jaxybergenov) v.	12343/10
Ukraine	
Gasayev v. Spain	48514/06
Harkins and Edwards v. United Kingdom	9146/07 & 32650/07
Khaydarov v. Russia	21055/09
Khodzhayev v. Russia	52466/08
Klein v. Russia	24268/08
Mamatkulov and Askarov v. Turkey	46827/99 & 46951/99
Nivette v. France	44190/98
O. v. Italy	37257/06
Othman (Abu Qatada) v. United Kingdom	8139/09
Ryabikin v. Russia	8320/04
Saadi v. Italy	37201/06
Sellem v. Italy	12584/08
Shamayev and others v. Georgia and Russia	36378/02
Soering v. United Kingdom	14038/88
Soldatenko v. Ukraine	2440/07
Toumi v. Italy	25716/09
Trabelsi v. Italy	50163/08
Abdolkhani and Karimnia v. Turkey (No. 1)	30471/08
A. H. Khan v. United Kingdom	6222/10

asylum

	Al Hanchi v. Bosnia and Herzegovina	48205/09
	Charahili v. Turkey	46605/07
	Collins and Akaziebie v. Sweden	23944/05
	Čonka v. Belgium	51564/99
	Cruz Varas v. Sweden	15576/89
	Dubovik v. Ukraine	33210/07 & 41866/08
	Eminbeyli v. Russia	42443/02
	Iskandarov v. Russia	17185/05
	Ismoilov and others v. Russia	2947/06
	Jabari v. Turkey	40035/98
	J. H. v. United Kingdom	48839/09
	Kaboulov v. Ukraine	41015/04
	Keshmiri v. Turkey	36370/08
	Khaydarov v. Russia	21055/09
	Khodzhayev v. Russia	52466/08
	Mamatkulov and Askarov v. Turkey	46827/99 & 46951/99
	Mokallal v. Ukraine	19246/10
	N. v. Finland	38885/02
	Othman (Abu Qatada) v. United Kingdom	8139/09
	Ryabikin v. Russia	8320/04
	Sufi and Elmi v. United Kingdom	8319/07 & 11449/07
	Sultani v. France	45223/05
	T. I. v. United Kingdom	43844/98
	Vilvarajah and others v. United Kingdom	13163/87 & 13164/87 & 13165/87 &
		13447/87 & 13448/87
	Y. P. and L. P. v. France	32476/06
conversion of sentence - see transfer of sentence	red persons (conversion of sentence)	
cruel treatment (see ill-treatment)		

custody (judicial review)	Abdolkhani and Karimnia v. Turkey (No. 1)	30471/08
	Abdulazhon Isakov v. Russia	14049/08
	Chahal v. United Kingdom	22414/93
	Čonka v. Belgium	51564/99
	Dubovik v. Ukraine	33210/07 & 41866/08
	Elmuratov v. Russia	66317/09
	Eminbeyli v. Russia	42443/02
	Garabayev v. Russia	38411/02
	Ismoilov and others v. Russia	2947/06
	Kaboulov v. Ukraine	41015/04
	Khaydarov v. Russia	21055/09
	Khodzhayev v. Russia	52466/08
	Khudyakova v. Russia	13476/04
	Kolompar v. Belgium	11613/85
	Lynas v. Switzerland	7317/75
	M. S. v. Belgium	50012/08
	Nasrulloyev v. Russia	656/06
	Öcalan v. Turkey	46221/99
	Ryabikin v. Russia	8320/04
	Sanchez-Reisse v. Switzerland	9862/82
	Shamayev and others v. Georgia and Russia	36378/02
	Shchebet v. Russia	16074/07
	Soldatenko v. Ukraine	2440/07
	Stephens v. Malta	11956/07
	Tehrani v. Turkey	32940/08 & 41626/08 & 43616/08
	Zandbergs v. Latvia	71092/01
custody (lawfulness)	Abdolkhani and Karimnia v. Turkey (No. 1)	30471/08
	Abdulazhon Isakov v. Russia	14049/08

Adamov v. Switzerland	3052/06
Al Husin v. Bosnia and Herzegovina	3727/08
Al-Moayad v. Germany	35865/03
Bozano v. Switzerland	9009/80
Chahal v. United Kingdom	22414/93
Čonka v. Belgium	51564/99
Dubovik v. Ukraine	33210/07 & 41866/08
Elmuratov v. Russia	66317/09
Eminbeyli v. Russia	42443/02
Garabayev v. Russia	38411/02
Iskandarov v. Russia	17185/05
Ismoilov and others v. Russia	2947/06
K. v. Belgium	10819/84
Kaboulov v. Ukraine	41015/04
Kafkaris v. Cyprus	21906/04
Khaydarov v. Russia	21055/09
Khodzhayev v. Russia	52466/08
Khudyakova v. Russia	13476/04
Kolompar v. Belgium	11613/85
Lynas v. Switzerland	7317/75
Mokallal v. Ukraine	19246/10
M. S. v. Belgium	50012/08
Nasrulloyev v. Russia	656/06
Öcalan v. Turkey	46221/99
Ramirez Sanchez v. France	28780/95
Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia	25965/04
Ryabikin v. Russia	8320/04
Shamayev and others v. Georgia and Russia	36378/02
Shchebet v. Russia	16074/07
Soldatenko v. Ukraine	2440/07

	Stephens v. Malta	11956/07
	Tehrani v. Turkey	32940/08 & 41626/08 & 43616/08
	Yoh-Ekale Mwanje v. Belgium	10486/10
custody (length)	Abdulazhon Isakov v. Russia	14049/08
	Chahal v. United Kingdom	22414/93
	Kalashnikov v. Russia	47095/99
	Khudyakova v. Russia	13476/04
	Kolompar v. Belgium	11613/85
	Lynas v. Switzerland	7317/75
	Quinn v. France	18580/91
	Stephens v. Malta	11956/07
	Zandbergs v. Latvia	71092/01
custody (right to be informed of the reasons	Abdolkhani and Karimnia v. Turkey (No. 1)	30471/08
for arrest)	Čonka v. Belgium	51564/99
	Eminbeyli v. Russia	42443/02
	K. v. Belgium	10819/84
	Khudyakova v. Russia	13476/04
	Shamayev and others v. Georgia and Russia	36378/02
death penalty	Babar Ahmad and others v. United Kingdom	24027/07, 11949/08 & 36742/08
	Baysakov and others v. Ukraine	54131/08
	Chentiev and Ibragimov v. Slovakia	21022/08 & 51946/08
	Cipriani v. Italy	22142/07
	Gasayev v. Spain	48514/06
	Kaboulov v. Ukraine	41015/04
	Öcalan v. Turkey	46221/99
	Shamayev and others v. Georgia and Russia	36378/02
	Soering v. United Kingdom	14038/88
discrimination	Kafkaris v. Cyprus	21906/04
	Veermäe v. Finland	38704/03
disguised extradition - see relation between extra	radition and deportation	
early release - see transfer of sentenced persons		

expulsion <sup>2</sup>	Abdolkhani and Karimnia v. Turkey (No. 1)	30471/08
	A. H. Khan v. United Kingdom	6222/10
	Al Hanchi v. Bosnia and Herzegovina	48205/09
	Al Husin v. Bosnia and Herzegovina	3727/08
	Antwi and others v. Norway	26940/10
	Aoulmi v. France	50278/99
	Ben Khemais v. Italy	246/07
	Boultif v. Switzerland	54273/00
	Bozano v. Switzerland	9009/80
	Chahal v. United Kingdom	22414/93
	Charahili v. Turkey	46605/07
	Collins and Akaziebie v. Sweden	23944/05
	Čonka v. Belgium	51564/99
	Cruz Varas v. Sweden	15576/89
	D. v. United Kingdom	30240/96
	Hirsi Jamaa and Others v. Italy	27765/09
	Jabari v. Turkey	40035/98
	J. H. v. United Kingdom	48839/09
	Kaushal and others v. Bulgaria	1537/08
	Keshmiri v. Turkey	36370/08
	M. S. v. Belgium	50012/08
	Müslim v. Turkey	53566/99
	N. v. Finland	38885/02
	Nasri v. France	19465/92
	O. v. Italy	37257/06
	Öcalan v. Turkey	46221/99
	Othman (Abu Qatada) v. United Kingdom	8139/09
	Ramirez Sanchez v. France	28780/95
	Saadi v. Italy	37201/06

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>) Keyword "expulsion" includes also other forms of deportation, such as refusal to renew residence permit.

	Sellem v. Italy	12584/08
	Sufi and Elmi v. United Kingdom	8319/07 & 11449/07
	Sultani v. France	45223/05
	Tehrani v. Turkey	32940/08 & 41626/08 & 43616/08
	T. I. v. United Kingdom	43844/98
	Toumi v. Italy	25716/09
	Trabelsi v. Italy	50163/08
	Veermäe v. Finland	38704/03
	Vilvarajah and others v. United Kingdom	13163/87 & 13164/87 & 13165/87 &
		13447/87 & 13448/87
	Yoh-Ekale Mwanje v. Belgium	10486/10
	Y. P. and L. P. v. France	32476/06
extradition (custody)	Abdulazhon Isakov v. Russia	14049/08
	Adamov v. Switzerland	3052/06
	Al-Moayad v. Germany	35865/03
	Dubovik v. Ukraine	33210/07 & 41866/08
	Eminbeyli v. Russia	42443/02
	Garabayev v. Russia	38411/02
	Iskandarov v. Russia	17185/05
	Ismoilov and others v. Russia	2947/06
	K. v. Belgium	10819/84
	Kaboulov v. Ukraine	41015/04
	Khaydarov v. Russia	21055/09
	Khodzhayev v. Russia	52466/08
	Khudyakova v. Russia	13476/04
	Kolompar v. Belgium	11613/85
	Mokallal v. Ukraine	19246/10
	Nasrulloyev v. Russia	656/06
	Lynas v. Switzerland	7317/75
	Öcalan v. Turkey	46221/99

	Quinn v. France	18580/91
	Ryabikin v. Russia	8320/04
	Sanchez-Reisse v. Switzerland	9862/82
	Shamayev and others v. Georgia and Russia	36378/02
	Shchebet v. Russia	16074/07
	Soldatenko v. Ukraine	2440/07
	Stephens v. Malta	11956/07
	Zandbergs v. Latvia	71092/01
extradition (documents in support of)	Lynas v. Switzerland	7317/75
extradition (effective remedies)	Abdulazhon Isakov v. Russia	14049/08
	Baysakov and others v. Ukraine	54131/08
	Elmuratov v. Russia	66317/09
	Garabayev v. Russia	38411/02
	Shamayev and others v. Georgia and Russia	36378/02
extradition (grounds for refusal)	Abdulazhon Isakov v. Russia	14049/08
	Ahorugeze v. Sweden	37075/09
	Al-Moayad v. Germany	35865/03
	Babar Ahmad and others v. United Kingdom	24027/07, 11949/08 & 36742/08
	Baysakov and others v. Ukraine	54131/08
	Chentiev and Ibragimov v. Slovakia	21022/08 & 51946/08
	Cipriani v. Italy	22142/07
	Dzhaksybergenov (aka Jaxybergenov) v.	12343/10
	Ukraine	
	Einhorn v. France	71555/01
	Elmuratov v. Russia	66317/09
	Garabayev v. Russia	38411/02
	Gasayev v. Spain	48514/06
	Harkins and Edwards v. United Kingdom	9146/07 & 32650/07
	Iskandarov v. Russia	17185/05

	Ismoilov and others v. Russia	2947/06
	Kaboulov v. Ukraine	41015/04
	Khaydarov v. Russia	21055/09
	Khodzhayev v. Russia	52466/08
	Klein v. Russia	24268/08
	Mamatkulov and Askarov v. Turkey	46827/99 & 46951/99
	Nivette v. France	44190/98
	Ryabikin v. Russia	8320/04
	Shamayev and others v. Georgia and Russia	36378/02
	Soering v. United Kingdom	14038/88
	Soldatenko v. Ukraine	2440/07
fair trial	Al Husin v. Bosnia and Herzegovina	3727/08
	Al-Moayad v. Germany	35865/03
	A. M. v. Italy	37019/97
	Babar Ahmad and others v. United Kingdom	24027/07, 11949/08 & 36742/08
	Csoszánszki v. Sweden	22318/02
	Dzhaksybergenov (aka Jaxybergenov) v.	12343/10
	Ukraine	
	Einhorn v. France	71555/01
	Kalashnikov v. Russia	47095/99
	Lynas v. Switzerland	7317/75
	Mamatkulov and Askarov v. Turkey	46827/99 & 46951/99
	Marcello Viola v. Italy	45106/04
	Öcalan v. Turkey	46221/99
	Othman (Abu Qatada) v. United Kingdom	8139/09
	Selmouni v. France	25803/94
	Smith v. Germany	27801/05
	Solakov v. FYROM	47023/99
	Somogyi v. Italy	67972/01

	Stojkovic v. France and Belgium	25303/08
	Van Ingen v. Belgium	9987/03
	Veermäe v. Finland	38704/03
	Zhukovskiy v. Ukraine	31240/03
family life (separation of family)	A. H. Khan v. United Kingdom	6222/10
	Antwi and others v. Norway	26940/10
	Aoulmi v. France	50278/99
	Boultif v. Switzerland	54273/00
	Cruz Varas v. Sweden	15576/89
	Kaushal and others v. Bulgaria	1537/08
	N. v. Finland	38885/02
	Nasri v. France	19465/92
hearing witnesses – see mutual assistance		
ill-treatment <sup>3</sup>	Abdolkhani and Karimnia v. Turkey (No. 1)	30471/08
	Abdulazhon Isakov v. Russia	14049/08
	Ahorugeze v. Sweden	37075/09
	Al Hanchi v. Bosnia and Herzegovina	48205/09
	Al Husin v. Bosnia and Herzegovina	3727/08
	Al-Moayad v. Germany	35865/03
	Aoulmi v. France	50278/99
	Babar Ahmad and others v. United Kingdom	24027/07, 11949/08 & 36742/08
	Baysakov and others v. Ukraine	54131/08
	Ben Khemais v. Italy	246/07
	Chahal v. United Kingdom	22414/93
	Charahili v. Turkey	46605/07
	Chentiev and Ibragimov v. Slovakia	21022/08 & 51946/08
	Cipriani v. Italy	22142/07
	Collins and Akaziebie v. Sweden	23944/05

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>) Keyword "ill-treatment" includes torture and other forms of cruel or inhumane treatment covered by Article 3 of the Convention.

Čonka v. Belgium	51564/99
Cruz Varas v. Sweden	15576/89
D. v. United Kingdom	30240/96
Dzhaksybergenov (aka Jaxybergenov) v.	12343/10
Ukraine	
Einhorn v. France	71555/01
Elmuratov v. Russia	66317/09
Garabayev v. Russia	38411/02
Gasayev v. Spain	48514/06
Grori v. Albania	25336/04
Harkins and Edwards v. United Kingdom	9146/07 & 32650/07
Hirsi Jamaa and Others v. Italy	27765/09
Iskandarov v. Russia	17185/05
Ismoilov and others v. Russia	2947/06
Jabari v. Turkey	40035/98
J. H. v. United Kingdom	48839/09
Kaboulov v. Ukraine	41015/04
Kalashnikov v. Russia	47095/99
Keshmiri v. Turkey	36370/08
Khaydarov v. Russia	21055/09
Khodzhayev v. Russia	52466/08
Khudyakova v. Russia	13476/04
Klein v. Russia	24268/08
Lynas v. Switzerland	7317/75
Mamatkulov and Askarov v. Turkey	46827/99 & 46951/99
M. S. v. Belgium	50012/08
Müslim v. Turkey	53566/99
N. v. Finland	38885/02
Nivette v. France	44190/98
O. v. Italy	37257/06
Othman (Abu Qatada) v. United Kingdom	8139/09

	Ryabikin v. Russia	8320/04
	Saadi v. Italy	37201/06
	Samaras and Others v. Greece	11463/09
	Sellem v. Italy	12584/08
	Selmouni v. France	25803/94
	Shamayev and others v. Georgia and Russia	36378/02
	Shchebet v. Russia	16074/07
	Soering v. United Kingdom	14038/88
	Soldatenko v. Ukraine	2440/07
	Sufi and Elmi v. United Kingdom	8319/07 & 11449/07
	Sultani v. France	45223/05
	Tehrani v. Turkey	32940/08 & 41626/08 & 43616/08
	T. I. v. United Kingdom	43844/98
	Toumi v. Italy	25716/09
	Trabelsi v. Italy	50163/08
	Veermäe v. Finland	38704/03
	Vilvarajah and others v. United Kingdom	13163/87 & 13164/87 & 13165/87 &
		13447/87 & 13448/87
	Yoh-Ekale Mwanje v. Belgium	10486/10
	Y. P. and L. P. v. France	32476/06
immunity of a witness – see <i>mutual assistance</i>	(hearing witnesses)	
inhumane treatment – see <i>ill-treatment</i>		
interim measure	Al-Moayad v. Germany	35865/03
	Aoulmi v. France	50278/99
	Ben Khemais v. Italy	246/07
	Cruz Varas v. Sweden	15576/89
	Grori v. Albania	25336/04
	Khodzhayev v. Russia	52466/08
	Lynas v. Switzerland	7317/75
	Mamatkulov and Askarov v. Turkey	46827/99 & 46951/99
	Shamayev and others v. Georgia and Russia	36378/02

	Toumi v. Italy	25716/09
	Trabelsi v. Italy	50163/08
	Yoh-Ekale Mwanje v. Belgium	10486/10
international validity of criminal judgments - s	ee transfer of enforcement of sentence	
lawfulness of custody - see custody (lawfulness	5)	
length of custody – see <i>custody (length)</i>		
life sentence <sup>4</sup>	Babar Ahmad and others v. United Kingdom	24027/07, 11949/08 & 36742/08
	Harkins and Edwards v. United Kingdom	9146/07 & 32650/07
	Kafkaris v. Cyprus	21906/04
	Nivette v. France	44190/98
	Vinter and others v. United Kingdom	66069/09 & 130/10 & 3896/10
mutual assistance	Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia	25965/04
mutual assistance (admissibility of evidence)	A. M. v. Italy	37019/97
	Solakov v. FYROM	47023/99
	Van Ingen v. Belgium	9987/03
	Zhukovskiy v. Ukraine	31240/03
mutual assistance (hearing witnesses)	Adamov v. Switzerland	3052/06
	A. M. v. Italy	37019/97
	Marcello Viola v. Italy	45106/04
	Solakov v. FYROM	47023/99
	Stojkovic v. France and Belgium	25303/08
	Zhukovskiy v. Ukraine	31240/03
mutual assistance (service of documents)	Somogyi v. Italy	67972/01
mutual assistance (videoconference)	Marcello Viola v. Italy	45106/04
nationality	Abdulazhon Isakov v. Russia	14049/08
	Veermäe v. Finland	38704/03
non bis in idem – see <i>ne bis in idem</i>		
nullum crimen sine lege – see nulla poena sine	lege	
nulla poena sine lege	Csoszánszki v. Sweden	22318/02

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>) Keyword "life sentence" includes also other forms of extremely long sentences.

obligation to investigate – see <i>obligation to pros</i>	secute	
obligation to prosecute <sup>5</sup>	Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia	25965/04
parole - see transfer of sentenced persons (early	release)	
presumption of innocence	Ismoilov and others v. Russia	2947/06
refugee – see <i>asylum</i>		
relation between extradition and deportation	Bozano v. Switzerland	9009/80
	Öcalan v. Turkey	46221/99
	Ramirez Sanchez v. France	28780/95
release on parole - see transfer of sentenced per	sons (early release)	
res iudicata – see ne bis in idem		
separation of family – see family life (separation	n of family)	
service of documents - see mutual assistance (s	ervice of documents)	
torture – see <i>ill-treatment</i>		
right of access to court	Smith v. Germany	27801/05
transfer of enforcement of sentence <sup>6</sup>	Garkavyy v. Ukraine	25978/07
	Grori v. Albania	25336/04
transfer of proceedings	Garkavyy v. Ukraine	25978/07
transfer of sentenced persons	Selmouni v. France	25803/94
	Smith v. Germany	27801/05
transfer of sentenced persons (Additional	Garkavyy v. Ukraine	25978/07
Protocol, Article 2)		
transfer of sentenced persons (Additional	Csoszánszki v. Sweden	22318/02
Protocol, Article 3)	Veermäe v. Finland	38704/03
transfer of sentenced persons (conversion of	Csoszánszki v. Sweden	22318/02
sentence)	Veermäe v. Finland	38704/03
transfer of sentenced persons (early release)	Csoszánszki v. Sweden	22318/02

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>) Keyword "obligation to prosecute" means also "obligation to investigate".
<sup>6</sup>) Keyword "transfer of enforcement of sentence" covers transfers of enforcement of sentences both under Article 2 of the Additional Protocol to the Convention on Transfer of Sentenced Persons and under the European Convention on the International Validity of Criminal Judgments.

	Veermäe v. Finland	38704/03		
videoconference – see mutual assistance (videoconference)				
witness immunity – see <i>mutual assistance (hearing witnesses)</i>				

## The HUDOC database

The search page to the database of the case law of the European Court of Human Rights can be accessed at this address: <u>http://cmiskp.echr.coe.int/tkp197/search.asp?skin=hudoc-en</u>.

To search for a judgment or a decision in the HUDOC database effectively, it is recommended

- that in the "ECHR Document Collections" column on the left, all boxes under the "HUDOC Collection" are ticked off (in order to search not only for judgments but also for decisions); and
- that under "Language", both English and French are ticked off (some judgments and decisions are in French version only or in English version only).

Your web browser needs to be set to allow "cookies", too [see your web browser's settings (privacy settings) if errors occur after attempted search].