

REGULAR SELECTIVE INFORMATION FLOW

for the attention of the National Human Rights Structures

Issue#144

[1 – 30 September 2016]

CONTENTS

(click on a title to reach it)

[Introduction \(p.2\)](#)

[Index by country \(p.3\)](#)

[PART I - GENERAL INFORMATION \(p.4\)](#)

[§1 - European Court of Human Rights \(p.5\)](#)

[A. Judgments \(p.5\)](#)

[1. Judgments deemed of particular importance to the NHRs \(p.5\)](#)

[2. Other judgments \(p.13\)](#)

[B. Decisions on admissibility \(p.17\)](#)

[C. Communicated cases \(p.18\)](#)

[§2 - Recommendations & Resolutions \(p.18\)](#)

[A. Recommendations \(p.18\)](#)

[B. Resolutions \(p.18\)](#)

[§3 - Other information of general importance \(p.23\)](#)

[A. Information from the Committee of Ministers \(p.23\)](#)

[B. Information from the Parliamentary Assembly \(p.23\)](#)

[C. Information from the Commissioner of Human Rights \(p.25\)](#)

[D. Information from the Council of Europe monitoring mechanisms \(p.25\)](#)

[PART II - INFORMATION BY COUNTRY \(p.27\)](#)

Information **selected** by the « Versailles St-Quentin Institutions Publiques » research centre (Versailles St-Quentin-en-Yvelines University, France), under the responsibility of the Directorate of Human Rights (DG I) of the Council of Europe
For any queries, please contact: eugen.cibotaru@coe.int

Introduction

This Issue is part of the "Regular Selective Information Flow" (RSIF). Its purpose is to keep the National Human Rights Structures permanently updated of Council of Europe norms and activities by way of regular transfer of information, which the Directorate of Human Rights carefully selects and tries to present in a user-friendly manner. The information is sent to the Contact Persons in the NHRs who are kindly asked to dispatch it within their offices.

Each Issue covers one month and is sent by the Directorate of Human Rights (DG I) to the Contact Persons a fortnight after the end of each observation period. This means that all information contained in any given issue is between four to eight weeks old.

The selection of the information included in the Issues is made by the "Versailles-St-Quentin Institutions Publiques" research centre (VIP – University of Versailles-St-Quentin-en-Yvelines, France) under the responsibility of the Directorate of Human Rights. It is based on what is deemed relevant to the work of the NHRs (including Ombudsman Institutions, National Human Rights Commissions and Institutes, Anti-discrimination Bodies). A particular effort is made to render the selection as targeted and short as possible. Readers are expressly encouraged to give any feedback that may allow for the improvement of the format and the contents of this tool.

The preparation of the RSIF has been supported as from 2013 by the "Versailles St-Quentin Institutions Publiques" research centre of the University of Versailles St-Quentin-en-Yvelines (Paris Saclay). It is entrusted to Vincent Couronne, Priscille Descolas, Léa Guémené, Camille Joly, Pavlos Aimilios Marinatos, Clara Michel, Albane Surville and Alex Vezina under the supervision of Laure Clément-Wilz, European Law Professor.

Index by Country

ALBANIA, 26	LATVIA, 11, 53
ARMENIA, 27	LITHUANIA, 54 , 55
AUSTRIA, 29	MALTA, 56
AZERBAIJAN, 30	MONTENEGRO, 60
BELGIUM, 5, 31	POLAND, 12, 16, 62
BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA, 32	PORTUGAL, 68
BULGARIA, 33 , 35	REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA, 11, 59
CROATIA, 11, 36	ROMANIA, 71 , 74
CZECH REPUBLIC, 37	RUSSIA, 6, 8, 12, 16, 75 , 99
DENMARK, 15	SAN MARINO, 19, 100
FRANCE, 1, 2, 8, 38 , 39	SERBIA, 12, 101
GEORGIA, 40	SLOVAK REPUBLIC, 102
GERMANY, 4, 5, 11, 15, 41	SPAIN, 8, 15, 105
GREECE, 9, 42 , 50	SWEDEN, 106
HUNGARY, 47	SWITZERLAND, 16, 107
ICELAND, 48	TURKEY, 6, 9, 10, 12, 15, 110 , 111
ITALY, 7, 8, 9, 11, 49 , 51	UKRAINE, 3, 4, 13, 16, 112
KOSOVO, 52	UNITED KINGDOM, 7, 10, 13

PartOne

GENERAL INFORMATION

This part presents a selection of information of general importance for the National Human Rights Structures.

This information was issued during the period under observation (1-30 **september** 2016) by the European Court of Human Rights, the European Committee of Social Rights, the Committee of Ministers, the Parliamentary Assembly and other Council of Europe monitoring mechanisms.

PartOne

§1 - EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

A. Judgments

1. Judgments deemed of particular interest to the NHRs

The judgments presented under this heading are the ones for which a separate press release is issued by the Registry of the Court as well as other judgments considered relevant for the work of the NHRs. They correspond also to the themes addressed in the Peer-to-Peer Workshops. The judgments are thematically grouped. The information, except for the comments drafted by the Directorate of Human Rights, is based on the [press releases of the Registry of the Court](#).

Some judgments are only available in French.

Please note that the Chamber judgments referred to hereunder become final in the circumstances set out in Article 44 § 2 of the Convention: “a) when the parties declare that they will not request that the case be referred to the Grand Chamber; or b) three months after the date of the judgment, if reference of the case to the Grand Chamber has not been requested; or c) when the panel of the Grand Chamber rejects the request to refer under Article 43”.

Note on the Importance Level:

According to the explanation available on the Court’s website, the following importance levels are given by the Court:

1 = High importance, Judgments, which the Court considers, make a significant contribution to the development, clarification or modification of its case law, either generally or in relation to a particular state.

2 = Medium importance, Judgments, which do not make a significant contribution to the case law but nevertheless do not merely apply existing case law.

3 = Low importance, Judgments with little legal interest - those applying existing case-law, friendly settlements and striking out judgments (unless these have any particular point of interest).

Each judgment presented in section 1 and 2 is accompanied by the indication of the importance level.

- **Right to life (Art. 2)**

[MIKHNO V. UKRAINE](#) (No. 32514/12) - Importance 2 - 01 September 2016 – [SVITLANA ATAMANYUK AND OTHERS V. UKRAINE](#) (Nos. 36314/06, 36285/06, 36290/06, 36311/06) - Importance 2 - 01 September 2016 - No violation of Article 2 – Satisfactory response of the domestic authorities to military air show crash - Violation of Article 6 § 1 and Article 13 – Delay caused by the non-enforcement of the final judgment

The cases concerned the complaints of relatives of persons who were killed when the aircraft crashed into spectators at an air show and exploded. The applicants alleged that the proceeding had lasted too long and they had no effective remedies. The applicants in the second case complained that the procedure of the identifying the crash victims’ bodies cause them emotional distress.

[Article 2](#)

The Court concluded that the investigation into the accident in both cases had been sufficiently independent, adequate and prompt and that the applicants had been given necessary access to the proceedings. The Court did not find any arbitrariness in the domestic decisions. Moreover, the Court considered that the investigation had also been prompt. The Court found that the circumstances of the accident had been addressed satisfactorily at the national level, with the applicants having been adequately compensated and those responsible having been identified and punished following an effective investigation.

Therefore, there had been no violation of Article 2 of the Convention.

Article 3

The Court rejected the complaints about the organisation of the procedure to identify the crash victims' bodies as manifestly ill-founded for non-exhaustion of domestic remedies and for being lodged out of time.

Article 6

The Court considered that there was no basis for the allegation that the claims for damages had lacked independence and impartiality. The Court did not consider that any special relationship had existed between the defendants and the judges, or that there was any other substantiated argument showing that the judges lacked independence or were biased. The Court therefore rejected that part of the applicants' complaint under Article 6 § 1 as manifestly ill-founded. However, the Court noted that in the first case the proceedings concerning claim for damages had lasted ten years and that that delay had mostly been caused by the non-enforcement of the final judgment in her favour. The domestic authorities did not provide any explanation whatsoever for that delay.

Therefore, the Court found that there had been a violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention.

Article 41 (Just satisfaction)

The Court held that the Ukraine was to pay the first applicant EUR 3,600 in respect of non-pecuniary damage and EUR 360 for legal fees.

- **III-treatment / Conditions of detention / Deportation (Art. 3)**

WENNER V. GERMANY (No. 62303/13) - Importance 1 - 1 September 2016 - Violation of Article 3 - Domestic authorities' failure to propose an appropriate therapy for long-term addict in detention

The case concerned the complaint by a long-term heroin addict that he had been denied drug substitution therapy in prison.

The Court first reiterated that Article 3 of the Convention imposes on the State a positive obligation to ensure that a person is detained under conditions which are compatible with respect for human dignity. The Court stated in this context that it was essential for a prisoner suffering from a serious illness to undergo an adequate assessment of his or her current state of health, by a specialist in the disease in question, in order to be provided with appropriate treatment. In this case, it was contested between the parties whether the drug substitution therapy was to be regarded as a necessary medical treatment. The Court observed that the applicant was a manifest and long-term opioid addict and that his drug addiction had been treated with medically prescribed drug substitution therapy for 17 years prior to his detention. The Court also noted that the applicant's state of health while in detention had been characterised by the chronic pain he suffered independently of previous physical withdrawal symptoms, and that his previous drug substitution treatment had been interrupted against his will. Furthermore, an external doctor commissioned by the prison authorities had suggested that the prison medical service reconsider providing him with drug substitution treatment which he had received prior to his imprisonment. The Court stated that the physical and mental strain the applicant had suffered as a result of his health condition as such could, in principle, attain the threshold of Article 3. It considered that domestic authorities had not provided convincing evidence showing that the applicant's state of

health and the appropriate treatment had been adequately assessed and that he had accordingly received adequate medical care in detention.
There had accordingly been a violation of Article 3 of the Convention.

Article 41 (Just satisfaction)

The Court rejected the applicant's claim in respect of his alleged pecuniary damage and it considered that the finding of a violation of Article 3 constituted in itself sufficient just satisfaction for any non pecuniary damage suffered. Furthermore, the Court held that Germany was to pay the applicant EUR 1,801.05 in respect of costs and expenses.

W.D. v. BELGIUM (IN FRENCH ONLY) (No. 73548/13) - Importance 1 - 06 September 2016 - Violation of Article 3 - Domestic authorities failure to ensure the provision of the sufficient and suitable treatment to offender - Violation of Article 5 § 1 – Broken link between the purpose and the practical conditions of detention - Violation of Article 5 § 4 and Article 13, in conjunction with Article 3 – The domestic authorities failure to provide with a remedy capable of affording redress for the situation of preventing the continuation of the alleged violations

The case concerned the applicant suffering from mental disorders who was detained indefinitely in a prison psychiatric wing without any appropriate treatment or any realistic prospect of reintegrating into society.

Article 3

The Court observed that the applicant had not been given suitable treatment for his mental disorders during his detention. In the Court's view, the fact that the applicant had attended pre-therapy was not enough for a detainee to examine and a diagnosis made. Proper treatment for the problem diagnosed and suitable medical supervision should be provided. In the Court's view, the applicant's detention without any therapeutic support or any prospect of social reintegration had had a negative impact on his psychological well-being. The Court pointed out that the obligation deriving from the Convention was not limited to protecting society against the potential dangers posed by offenders with mental disorders, but also required suitable treatment to be provided to such offenders to help them to reintegrate into society as successfully as possible.

Therefore, the Court concluded that there had been a violation of Article 3 of Convention.

Article 5 § 1

The Court concluded that the applicant's continued detention in a psychiatric wing was regarded by the authorities themselves as a "transitional" solution until an appropriate facility could be found to cater for his needs; that keeping the applicant in a prison environment was known to be unsuitable from a therapeutic perspective; and that the reason why he remained there was the structural lack of alternatives. The Court further noted that in the context of urgent proceedings, the applicant had expressed his wishes with a view to bringing about an improvement in his condition.

Therefore, there had been a violation of Article 5 § 1 of the Convention.

Article 5 § 4 and Article 13, in conjunction with Article 3

The Court took the view that in the case of offenders with mental disorders, who often had not been given regular independent psychiatric counselling, it was impossible to expect them to be able to identify the "appropriate solution" themselves. The Court observed that the decision that ordered the applicant's admission to an outside facility had still not been implemented. The Court observed the structural nature of the specific problem encountered in domestic authorities: the lack of suitable places in a non-prison environment, the lack of qualified staff in prison psychiatric wings. The Court considered that monetary compensation would not have satisfied the requirement of an effective remedy in the applicant's particular case.

Therefore, there had been a violation of Article 5 § 4 and of Article 13, in conjunction with Article 3, of the Convention.

Article 41 (Just satisfaction)

The Court held that the Belgium was to pay the applicant EUR 16,000 in respect of non-pecuniary damage.

A.Ş. v. TURKEY ([IN FRENCH ONLY](#)) - No. 58271/10 - Importance 3 - 13 September 2016 - Violation of Article 3 - Ineffective legal enforcement measures to protect a minor detainee against degrading treatment due to a requirement to file a complaint before starting criminal proceedings

The case concerned the sexual assault and physical violence to which the applicant, who was a minor, was subjected while in pre-trial detention.

The Court first recognised that the impugned attacks towards the applicant had been of an inhuman and degrading nature. The Court examined whether the domestic authorities had complied with their positive obligations under Article 3. As to the sexual assault, the Court noted that the prison authorities had opened an internal investigation as soon as they had become aware of the events, that the applicant had been taken to hospital immediately to undergo a medical examination, that statements had been taken from all those involved and that disciplinary action had been taken against the applicant's assailant. Consequently, the Court considered that those measures had afforded the applicant effective and sufficient protection against the infringement of his physical integrity linked to the sexual assault. With regard to the physical violence, the Court noted that the applicant had not wished to file a complaint, and therefore, that there had been no proceedings. Nevertheless, the Court recalled that prisoners are in a vulnerable situation and that the authorities have a duty to protect them, especially if they are minor. It took the view that by requiring the applicant to lodge a formal complaint as a prerequisite for the bringing of criminal proceedings, without taking into account his particular vulnerability, domestic criminal law had rendered ineffective the legal enforcement measures designed to protect individuals against treatment contrary to Article 3 of the Convention in the present case.

The Court therefore found a violation of that provision.

Just satisfaction (Article 41)

The Court held that Turkey was to pay the applicant EUR 10,000 in respect of non-pecuniary damage. It rejected the claim for reimbursement of costs and expenses as the applicant had not demonstrated, on the basis of the relevant supporting documents, that these had been actually and necessarily incurred and were reasonable as to quantum.

[Kondrulin v. RUSSIA](#) (No. 12987/1) - Importance 3 - 20 September 2016 - Violation of Article 34 - Domestic authorities' failure to provide with medical examination - Violation of Article 3 - Domestic authorities' failure to provide with sufficient medical care

The case concerned the inadequate medical care in detention of the applicant, who died from cancer while serving his sentence. The NGO's lawyers represented the applicant against the domestic authorities. The Court noted that in such cases when the applicant died and was represented by the NGO's lawyer not leaving it open to associations to represent victims ran the risk of allowing a State to escape accountability under the ECHR.

Article 34

The Court concluded that neither the medical reports nor the certificates submitted by the domestic authorities had contained any analysis of the adequacy of the applicant's medical treatment or the compatibility of the conditions of his detention with his state of health.

Consequently, the Court concluded that the domestic authorities breached their obligation under Article 34.

Article 3

The Court found the evidence submitted by the domestic authorities unconvincing and insufficient to show conclusively that the applicant had received adequate medical treatment for his illnesses while in detention. Moreover, it was particularly concerned about the fact that even after the applicant's doctor had acknowledged in open court that his patient's health was incompatible with the conditions of his detention in the prison hospital, his transfer to an appropriate facility had not been arranged.

Article 41 (Just satisfaction)

No award was made for either damages or costs and expenses.

- **Right to a fair trial (Art. 6)**

IBRAHIM AND OTHERS V. THE UNITED KINGDOM (Nos. 50541/08, 50571/08, 50573/08, 40351/09) - Importance 1 - 13 September 2016 - No violation of Article 6 §§ 1 and 3 (c) of the rights of three applicants – Compelling reasons for the temporary restrictions on the right to legal advice - Violation of Article 6 §§ 1 and 3 (c) in respect of the fourth applicant - Delaying access to lawyers during police questioning of the witness

The case concerned the first three applicants with Somali nationality and the applicant with British nationality who was born in Somalia. They were involved in detonation of bombs on the London transport system in 2005. The applicants complained about their lack of access to lawyers during their initial police questioning.

The Court was convinced that the first three applicant's initial police interrogation was an urgent need to avert further suicide attacks. The Court noted that the police had adhered strictly to the law. The applicants had been told the reasons for the decision to restrict their access to legal advice and had been informed of their right to silence and their right to legal advice. In conclusion, the Court was satisfied that the proceedings as a whole in respect of each of the first three applicants had been fair. There had therefore been no violation of Article 6 §§ 1 and 3 (c) of the Convention.

The Court was not convinced that the domestic authorities had demonstrated compelling reasons for restricting the fourth applicant's access to legal advice and failing to inform him of his right to remain silent. The Court reiterated that, unlike the first three applicants, there was no legal basis for the decision not to caution the fourth applicant or to offer him legal advice, because the police had deliberately decided to keep questioning him as a witness. The Court emphasised that the threat posed by terrorism could only be neutralised by the effective investigation, prosecution and punishment of all those involved in terrorism. However, the Court concluded that the domestic authorities had failed to show that the overall fairness of the trial had not been irretrievably prejudiced by the decision not to caution him and to restrict his access to legal advice.

Therefore, there had been a violation of Article 6 §§ 1 and 3 (c) of the Convention as concerns the fourth applicant.

Article 41 (Just satisfaction)

The Court held that the United Kingdom was to pay the fourth applicant EUR 16,000 in respect of costs and expenses.

TREVISANATO V. ITALY (No. 32610/07) - Importance 2 - 15 September 2016 - No violation of Article 6 § 1 – Lack of excessive formalism in dismissing appeal for being incomplete

The case concerned the applicant's allegation of a violation of his right of access to a court on account of excessive formalism on the part the Court of Cassation.

The Court observed that the domestic code of civil procedure protects the party's interest and preserves the role of the Court of Cassation in ensuring the uniform interpretation of the law. Nevertheless, the Court found on a number of occasions that an excessively formalistic interpretation of the conditions of an appeal might breach the right of access to a court. The Court noted that the applicant indeed failed to set out the point of law to the ground of appeal. The inadmissibility decision could not therefore be regarded as an excessively formalistic interpretation of the ordinary rules such as to preclude an examination on the merits of the applicant's case. In addition, the Court observed that the rule applied by the Court of Cassation was not judge-made but had been introduced by the legislature, which the applicant's lawyer should have been aware about.

Therefore, there had been no violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention.

KARELIN V. RUSSIA (No. 926/08) - Importance 2 - 20 September 2016 - Violation of Article 6 – Subversion of administrative offence proceedings by the absence of a prosecuting party

The case concerned the applicant's allegation of the absence of any prosecuting party authority or official in the proceedings.

The Court noted that the lack of a prosecuting party could undermine the impartiality of a trial. That could cause the court to confuse the roles of prosecutor and judge, and gave legitimate grounds to doubt its impartiality. The Court noted that the domestic Code of Administrative Offences did not require a prosecutor. However, the Court accepted that a police officer, who had compiled the offence record and attended the trial, had not become party to the proceedings. The lack of any such party had impacted the presumption of innocence.

Therefore, the Court held that there had been a violation of Article 6 of the Convention.

Article 41 (Just satisfaction)

The Court held that Russia was to pay the applicant EUR 2,500 in respect of non-pecuniary damage.

HERNANDEZ ROYO V. SPAIN (IN FRENCH ONLY) - No. 16033/12 - Importance 3 - 20 September 2016 - No violation of Article 6 - No failure of domestic authorities to offer the applicants with the opportunity to be heard in the appeal stage of their trial

The case concerned the fact that the applicants had been convicted at the appeal stage, without evidence having been heard from them in person, after they had been acquitted at first instance.

The Court first reiterated that a hearing was required where the appellate court conducted a fresh assessment of the facts held to be established at first instance and re-examined them, thereby going beyond the purely legal aspects of the case. The Court noted that during the appeal hearing, the applicants' representative had omitted to ask that his clients be examined, which would have enabled them to challenge the statements made by the witnesses. The Court also noted that the domestic appeal court had summoned the applicants in person to appear at the public hearing, but they had not expressed any wish to intervene.

The Court therefore held that there had been no violation of Article 6 § 1 of the Convention.

- **No punishment without law (Art. 7)**

X AND Y V. FRANCE (IN FRENCH ONLY) (No. 48158/11) - Importance 3 - 01 September 2016 - No violation of Article 7 - Foreseeable imposed penalties

The case concerned the applicants who were stock market professionals, on whom stock market authority disciplinary imposed sanctions. They alleged that those sanctions were illegal.

The Court reiterated that the administrative and disciplinary sanctions system and procedure should be unified. Nonetheless, the Court considered that the domestic authorities succeeded in legally classifying the breaches committed by the applicants. The Court found that the law applicable at the relevant time had been sufficiently foreseeable for the applicants to have known that their professional responsibility could be engaged by the fact of continuing to purchase stock exchange rights without reasonably foreseeable cover right up to the end of the subscription period.

Therefore, there had been no violation of Article 7 of the Convention.

- **Right to respect for private and family life (Art. 8)**

GIORGIONI V. ITALY (IN FRENCH ONLY) - No. 43299/12 - Importance 2 - 15 September 2016 - Violation of Article 8 - Domestic authorities' failure to ensure a full exercise of a father's right of contact with his child

The case concerned the effectiveness of the measures taken by the domestic authorities to ensure that a father could exercise fully his contact rights in respect of his son despite a situation of conflict with the child's mother.

The Court first noted that the applicant had sought to establish contact with his son and that, despite the court decisions granting him contact rights, he had been able to exercise those rights only to a limited extent owing to the opposition of the child's mother. The Court took the view that a lack of cooperation between separated parents did not exempt the competent authorities from doing everything in their power to enable the family tie to be maintained. They had subsequently tolerated, for around four years, a situation in which the mother's behaviour prevented the establishment of a meaningful relationship between father and son.

The Court therefore held that there had been a violation of the right to respect for family life.

Article 41 (Just satisfaction)

The Court held that the finding of a violation constituted in itself sufficient just satisfaction for any non-pecuniary damage sustained, and that Italy was to pay the applicant EUR 10,000 in respect of costs and expenses.

- **Freedom of thought, conscience and religion (Art. 9)**

Papavasylakis v. GREECE ([IN FRENCH ONLY](#)) - No. 66899/14 - Importance 2 - 15 September 2016 - Violation of Article 9 - Domestic authorities' failure to provide a conscientious objector with procedural efficiency and equal representation during his interview for exemption of military service

The case concerned the domestic authorities' refusal to grant the applicant the status of conscientious objector and to allow him to do alternative civilian work instead of military service.

The Court first noted that domestic law provided that the Special Board, when it examined applications for exemption from military service for conscientious objectors, had to be composed of a majority of civilians, especially of a chairman, two university professors, and two high-ranking army officers. In this case, the Court observed that only two officers and the chairman were present. In the Court's view, the applicant could thus have legitimately feared that, not being a member of a religious community, he would not succeed in conveying his ideological beliefs to career officers with senior positions in the military hierarchy. The Court held that domestic authorities must have ensured conditions of equal representation in this case and that this procedure did not afford the safeguards of impartiality and independence.

There had thus been a violation of Article 9 of the Convention.

Article 41 (Just satisfaction)

The Court held that Greece was to pay the applicant EUR 2,000 in respect of non-pecuniary damage and EUR 3,000 in respect of costs and expenses.

- **Freedom of expression (Art. 10)**

[SEMIR GUZEL V. TURKEY](#) (No. 29483/09) - Importance 2 - 13 September 2016 - Violation of Article 10 - Domestic authorities' interference with the applicant's right to express defiance by permitting the use of Kurdish language in a congress

The case concerned the prosecution of a politician because he had permitted participants at a congress of his political party to speak in Kurdish, despite the warnings of the domestic authorities.

The Court first observed that the applicant had acted in this way because he believed in the ethical and legal right of the congress delegates to speak in Kurdish. The Court took the view that it was a form of expression which was protected under Article 10 of the Convention, namely the expression of

defiance towards an authority representing the State. The Court then observed that the applicant had been directly affected by the measures taken by the domestic authorities, as he had been sentenced to one year's imprisonment and that he had continued to face the threat of such a sanction for nearly seven years. The Court found that that interference had not been "prescribed by law". In particular, the law under which the applicant had been prosecuted established that political parties could "not remain indifferent" to the use of Kurdish in a political context – but without being precise as to what form of indifference or inaction could be the basis of a criminal prosecution of an individual. Accordingly, the Court held that there had been a violation of Article 10 of the Convention.

Article 41 (Just satisfaction)

The Court held that Turkey was to pay the applicant EUR 7,500 in respect of non-pecuniary damage and EUR 2000 in respect of costs and expenses.

- **Article 1 of Protocol No. 1**

BRITISH GURKHA WELFARE SOCIETY AND OTHERS V. THE UNITED KINGDOM (No. 44818/11) - Importance 2 - 15 September 2016 - No violation of Article 14 read together with Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 - Non-discriminatory pension scheme

The case concerned the allegation of applicants of the fact that their pension entitlements had been less favourable than those of non-Gurkha soldiers who also served the domestic authorities. Gurkha soldiers alleged that that had amounted to a difference in treatment based on nationality, race and age.

The Court reiterated that under the European Convention there was no guarantee to a pension of a particular amount. However, if a Contracting State created a pension scheme, it had to exclude any discrimination. The Court found that the applicants had undoubtedly been treated differently from other soldiers. However, the Court considered that such a distinction had been objectively and reasonably justified. The Court found that the existing scheme is the best to meet the need of the applicants. Finally, the Court found no support for the applicant's argument that pension should not be index-linked to their expected country of retirement.

Consequently, there had been no violation of Article 14 taken in conjunction with Article 1 of Protocol No.1.

2. Other judgments issued in the period under observation

You will find in the column “Key Words” of the table below a short description of the topics dealt with in the judgment.

For more detailed information, please refer to the cases.

STATE	DATE	CASE TITLE	IMP.	CONCLUSION	KEY WORDS
CROATIA	6 September 2016	CINDRIC AND BESLIC (No. 72152/13)	2	No violation of Art. 2 (procedural)	Domestic authorities' failure to conduct an effective investigation into the death of the applicants' parents
				Violation of Art. 1 of Prot. No. 1	Domestic courts' order obliging the applicants to pay the costs of the relevant state's representation in the civil proceedings in which they sought damages in connection with the killing of their parents amounted to a disproportionate burden on them given their financial situation
				Violation of Art. 6 § 1	Domestic courts' order obliging the applicants to bear the full costs of the relevant state's representation amounted to a disproportionate restriction of the applicants' right of access to a court
GERMANY	1 September 2016	MARC BRAUER (No. 24062/13)	2	Violation of Art. 6 § 1	Restriction of the applicant's right of access to a court
	15 September 2016	JOHANSEN (No. 17914/10)	3	No violation of Art. 6 § 1	Proportionate limitation on the applicant's right of access to court as she was awarded sufficient opportunity to lodge an objection against the penal order within the statutory time-limit
ITALY	1 September 2016	HUZUNEANU (IN FRENCH ONLY) (No. 36043/08)	3	Violation of Art. 6	Applicant's inability to obtain the reopening of criminal proceedings against him despite the fact that he did not have effective knowledge of the proceedings
LATVIA	1 September 2016	UPITE (No. 7636/08)	2	No violation of Art. 6	No breach of the principle of impartiality given that the applicant's complaints concerning the impartiality of the domestic judge were not objectively justified
THE REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	20 September 2016	NICHIFOR (No. 52205/10)	3	Violation of Art. 6 § 1	Unfairness of proceedings

POLAND	13 September 2016	SIEMASZKO AND OLSZYNSKI (IN FRENCH ONLY) (Nos. 60975/08 AND 35410/09)	3	Violation of Art. 1 of Prot. No. 1	Domestic prison administration obliged the applicants to place sums from their prison earnings into a deposit account with the lowest interest rate on the market (0,1%)
RUSSIA	13 September 2016	ANDREY MEDVEDEV (No. 75737/13) KIRILLOVA (No. 50775/13)	3	Violation of Art. 1 of Prot. No. 1 (in both cases)	Domestic authorities' failure to strike a fair balance between the demands of the general interest of the community and the applicants' property rights on account of the deprivation of their flat without compensation or replacement housing
				Violation of Art. 8 (concerning the first case)	Domestic authorities' failure to provide the applicant with permanent or even temporary accommodation
SERBIA	13 September 2016	KRGOVIC (No. 29430/06)	3	Violation of Art. 6 § 1	Domestic authorities' failure to enforce a final court judgment in the applicant's favour
	20 September 2016	ZDRAVKOVIC (No. 28181/11)	3	No violation of Art. 6 § 1	Reasonable length of proceedings given the complexity of the case and the child's refusal to live with the applicant or even to maintain contact with her
TURKEY	6 September 2016	ALIMOV (No. 14344/13)	1	Violation of Art. 5 §§ 1, 2, 4 and 5	Unlawful detention of the applicant on account of the absence of clear domestic legal provisions, failure to inform the applicant of the reasons for the deprivation of his liberty, lack of a prompt judicial review of the lawfulness of his detention and lack of compensation
				Violation of Art. 3 (substantive)	Poor conditions of detention (severe overcrowding, lack of access to outdoor exercise)
				Violation of Art. 13 in conjunction with Art. 3	Lack of an effective remedy concerning the inadequate conditions of detention
		ALTIN AND KILIC (IN FRENCH ONLY) (No. 15225/08)	3	No violation of Art. 2 (substantive)	Justified use of lethal force
Violation of Art. 2 (procedural)	Ineffective investigation into the killing of the applicants' brothers during a police operation				
TURKEY		DONDU GUNEL (IN FRENCH ONLY) (No. 34673/07)	3	Violation of Art. 2 (procedural)	Domestic authorities' failure to conduct an effective investigation into the circumstances of the applicant's son's death

		ERKENOV (No. 18152/11)	2	Violation of Art. 5 §§ 1, 2, 4 and 5	Unlawful detention of the applicant on account of the absence of clear domestic legal provisions, failure to inform the applicant of the reasons for the deprivation of his liberty, lack of a prompt judicial review of the lawfulness of his detention and lack of compensation
		YASEMIN DOGAN (IN FRENCH ONLY) (No. 40860/04)	3	No violation of Art. 2 (substantive)	Domestic authorities' inability to foresee, in the absence of an objective reason, the existence of a suicide risk
	Violation of Art. 2 (procedural)			Ineffective investigation into the circumstances of the applicant's husband's suicide	
	13 September 2016	SIDIKA IMREN (No. 47384/11)	3	Violation of Art. 2 (positive obligations, procedural)	Domestic authorities' failure to provide an adequate and timely response in relation to the applicant's daughter's death
		USTDAG (IN FRENCH ONLY) (No. 41642/08)	3	No violation of Art. 2 (positive obligations, substantive)	Domestic authorities' inability to foresee and prevent the accident which caused lethal injuries to the applicants' son
Violation of Art. 2 (procedural)	Ineffective investigation in that respect				
20 September 2016	GUZELAYDIN (IN FRENCH ONLY) (No. 26470/10)	3	Violation of Art. 2 (procedural)	Ineffective investigation into the circumstances of the applicant's son's death	
UKRAINE	15 September 2016	KHAMROEV AND OTHERS (No. 41651/10)	3	Violation of Art. 5 § 1	Unlawfulness of the first applicant's detention pending extradition (lack of legal basis)
				Violation of Art. 5 § 1	Domestic authorities' failure to conduct the proceeding for the applicants' extradition with the requisite diligence
THE UNITED KINGDOM	1 September 2016	V.M. (No. 49734/12)	3	Violation of Art. 5 § 1	Domestic authorities' failure to conduct the proceedings with the requisite diligence in order to ensure that the applicant, whose mental health was deteriorated while in detention, would be detained for the shortest period of time possible

	15 September 2016	SIMON PRICE (No. 15602/07)	3	No violation of Art. 6 § 1 read in conjunction with Art. 6 § 3 (d)	Fairness of proceedings despite the applicant's inability to question the absent-witness evidence given the existence of other substantial incriminating evidence and of the procedural safeguards
--	----------------------	---	---	--	---

B. The decision on admissibility

Those decisions are published with a slight delay of two to three weeks on the Court's website. Therefore the decisions listed below cover the period **from 1 to 30 June 2016**. Those decisions are selected to provide the NHRs with potentially useful information on the reasons of the inadmissibility of certain applications addressed to the Court and/or on the friendly settlements reached.

STATE	DATE	CASE TITLE	ALLEGED VIOLATION	DECISION
DENMARK	28 June 2016	N.A. AND OTHERS (No. 15636/16)	Art. 3 (incompatible situation of the asylum-seeking applicant and her daughters because of a removal), Art. 8 (breach of the right not to be separated from the father of the second child)	Partly inadmissible as manifestly ill-founded (concerning claim under Art. 3), partly inadmissible for non-exhaustion of domestic remedies (concerning claim under Art. 8)
GERMANY	7 June 2016	FINDIKOGLU (No. 20672/15)	Art. 3 (applicant's extradition exposed him to a disproportionately long prison sentence), Art. 6 (unfairness of the extradition proceedings caused by the breach of the principle of equality of arms)	Partly inadmissible as manifestly ill-founded (concerning claim under Art. 3), partly incompatible <i>ratione materiae</i> with the provision of the Convention (concerning claim under Art. 6)
SPAIN	21 June 2016	G.J. (No. 59172/12)	Art. 3 and Art. 4 (failure of the domestic authorities to carry out an appropriate identification procedure), Art. 8 (violation of the applicant's rights to family and private life), Art. 13 in conjunction with Art. 3, Art. 4 and Art. 8 (no representative had been available to act on the applicant's behalf before the national courts and the Court), Art. 1 of Protocol No. 12 (female victims of trafficking are subjected to intersectional discrimination by domestic authorities on account of their race, gender and social origin)	Incompatible <i>ratione personae</i> with the provisions of the Convention (the representative of the applicant has no standing to lodge the application)
TURKEY	28 June 2016	BOUDRAA (No. 1009/16)	Mainly Art. 3 (failure of the administrative authorities to carry out a risk assessment before ordering the applicant deportation, failure of the Constitutional Court to examine the circumstances in which his deportation had been ordered)	Partly incompatible <i>ratione personae</i> with the provisions of the Convention (the applicant cannot be considered to be a victim in relation to his complaints under the procedural limb of Art. 3)

C. The communicated cases

The European Court of Human Rights publishes on a weekly basis a list of the communicated cases on its website. These are cases concerning individual applications which are pending before the Court. They are communicated by the Court to the respondent State's Government with a statement of facts, the applicant's complaints and the questions put by the Court to the Government concerned. The decision to communicate a case lies with one of the Court's Chambers which is in charge of the case. A **selection** of those cases **covering the period from 1 to 30 July** is proposed below.

NB: The statements of facts and complaints have been prepared by the Registry (solely in one of the official languages) on the basis of the applicant's submissions. The Court cannot be held responsible for the veracity of the information contained therein.

STATE	DATE OF DECISION TO COMMUNICATE	CASE TITLE	KEY WORDS OF QUESTIONS SUBMITTED TO THE PARTIES
POLAND	7 July 2016	ZWIERZ (No. 69950/14)	The applicant complains that flaws in the organisation of public hospitals and omissions by the doctors were the direct cause of her husband's death.
	8 July 2016	ŻELAWSKI (No. 16103/15)	The applicant complains that his placement in a social care home constituted an unlawful deprivation of liberty.
RUSSIA	13 July 2016	TAGANOVA AND ESARTIA (No. 48656/06)	The applicants complain that they have been arbitrarily deprived of their rights to home and to a peaceful enjoyment of their property by secessionists.
SWITZERLAND	22 July 2016	M.O. (No. 41282/16)	The applicant complains that after a possible detention he would be returned to an indefinite military service in his home country, which has to be equated to slavery/forced labour.
UKRAINE	5 July 2016	IOPPA (No. 73776/14)	The applicants claim that the domestic authorities failed to protect their relatives' life by not completely closing the airspace above the ongoing armed conflict in the region through which the plane passed.

PartOne

§2 - RECOMMENDATIONS & RESOLUTIONS

A. Recommendations

[No work deemed relevant for the NHRs for the period under observation]

B. Resolutions

AUTHOR	DATE	TEXT NUMBER	SUBJECT MATTER	DECISION
CM	14 September 2016	(2016)4	The consolidated financial statements of the Council of Europe for the year ended 31 December 2015	CM approved the consolidated financial statements of the Council of Europe for the year ended 31 December 2015. Furthermore, CM decided that discharge is hereby given to the Secretary General in respect of his financial management for the year 2015.
CM	14 September 2016	(2016)5	The budgetary management accounts of the General Budget of the Council of Europe for the year ended 31 December 2015	CM approved the budgetary management accounts of the General Budget of the Council of Europe for the year ended 31 December 2015.
CM	14 September 2016	(2016)6	The budgetary management accounts of the European Pharmacopoeia for the year ended 31 December 2015	CM approved the budgetary management accounts of the European Pharmacopoeia for the year ended 31 December 2015

CM	14 September 2016	(2016)7	The budgetary management accounts of the Partial Agreement on the Council of Europe Development Bank for the year ended 31 December 2015	CM approved the budgetary management accounts of the Partial Agreement on the Council of Europe Development Bank for the year ended 31 December 2015
CM	14 September 2016	(2016)8	The budgetary management accounts of the Enlarged Partial Agreement on the Co- operation Group to Combat Drug Abuse and Illicit Trafficking in Drugs (Pompidou Group) for the year ended 31 December 2015	CM approved the budgetary management accounts of the Enlarged Partial Agreement on the Co-operation Group to Combat Drug Abuse and Illicit Trafficking in Drugs (Pompidou Group) for the year ended 31 December 2015.
CM	14 September 2016	(2016)9	The budgetary management accounts of the Partial Agreement on the Co- operation Group for the Prevention of, Protection Against, and Organisation of Relief in Major Natural and Technological Disasters (EUR-OPA) for the year ended 31 December 2015	CM approved the budgetary management accounts of the Partial Agreement on the Co-operation Group for the Prevention of, Protection Against, and Organisation of Relief in Major Natural and Technological Disasters (EUR-OPA) for the year ended 31 December 2015
CM	14 September 2016	(2016)10	The budgetary management accounts of the Enlarged Agreement on the European Commission for Democracy through Law (Venice Commission) for the year ended 31 December 2015	CM approved the budgetary management accounts of the Enlarged Agreement on the European Commission for Democracy through Law (Venice Commission) for the year ended 31 December 2015.
CM	14 September 2016	(2016)11	The budgetary management accounts of the Enlarged Partial Agreement on Youth Mobility through the Youth Card for the year ended 31 December 2015	CM approved the budgetary management accounts of the Enlarged Partial Agreement on Youth Mobility through the Youth Card for the year ended 31 December 2015.

<p>CM</p>	<p>14 September 2016</p>	<p>(2016)11</p>	<p>The implementation of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities by San Marino</p>	<p>CM recommended to pursue an open and comprehensive approach towards the integration of society by strengthening legislative, administrative and other measures aimed at the promotion of tolerance and intercultural respect among the majority population; increase awareness-raising activities to avert potential racial discrimination and intolerance. Furthermore, CM amended the current legislative framework to provide comprehensive protection from all forms of discrimination, as well as civil and administrative remedies; step up awareness-raising among the public at large on the existing legal framework; establish an independent body to monitor racism and discrimination.</p>
<p>CM</p>	<p>14 September 2016</p>	<p>(2016)12</p>	<p>The budgetary management accounts of the Enlarged Partial Agreement establishing the European Centre for Modern Languages (Graz) for the year ended 31 December 2015</p>	<p>CM approved the budgetary management accounts of the Enlarged Partial Agreement establishing the European Centre for Modern Languages (Graz) for the year ended 31 December 2015.</p>
<p>CM</p>	<p>14 September 2016</p>	<p>(2016)13</p>	<p>The budgetary management accounts of the Enlarged Agreement on the "Group of States against Corruption – GRECO" for the year ended 31 December 2015</p>	<p>CM decided that the Secretary General is hereby discharged from financial responsibility in respect of the financial year 2015.</p>
<p>CM</p>	<p>14 September 2016</p>	<p>(2016)14</p>	<p>The budgetary management accounts of the Enlarged Partial Agreement on Sport (EPAS) for the year ended 31 December 2015</p>	<p>CM decided that the Secretary General is hereby discharged from responsibility for the management of the financial year 2015.</p>

<p>CM</p>	<p>14 September 2016</p>	<p>(2016)15</p>	<p>The budgetary management accounts of the Enlarged Partial Agreement on Cultural Routes for the year ended 31 December 2015</p>	<p>CM decided that the Secretary General is hereby discharged from responsibility for the management of the financial year 2015.</p>
<p>CM</p>	<p>14 September 2016</p>	<p>(2016)16</p>	<p>The financial statements and the budgetary management accounts of the Enlarged Partial Agreement establishing the European Centre for Global Interdependence and Solidarity (North-South Centre) for the year ended 31 December 2015</p>	<p>CM decided that the discharge is hereby given to the Secretary General in respect of his management of the Enlarged Partial Agreement establishing the European Centre for Global Interdependence and Solidarity (North-South Centre) for the year from 1 January to 31 December 2015.</p>
<p>CM</p>	<p>14 September 2016</p>	<p>(2016)17</p>	<p>The financial statements and the budgetary management accounts of the Partial Agreement of the European Support Fund for the Co-production and Distribution of Creative Cinematographic and Audiovisual Works "Eurimages" for the year ended 31 December 2015</p>	<p>CM decided that the discharge is hereby given to the Secretary General in respect of his management of the Partial Agreement on the European Support Fund for the Co-production and Distribution of Creative Cinematographic and Audiovisual Works "Eurimages" for the financial year from 1 January to 31 December 2015.</p>

PartOne

§3 - OTHER INFORMATION OF GENERAL IMPORTANCE

A. Information from the Committee of Ministers

[No work deemed relevant for the NHRSs for the period under observation]

B. Information from the Parliamentary Assembly

■ **The fight against impunity for genocide crimes against humanity and war crimes (08.09.2016)**

The Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights restated its full support for the International Criminal Court. Thus, the Committee urged the Council of Europe member states, its observer states, the Assembly's observer states and states having partner for democracy status with the Assembly to reassert their commitment to the ICC by signing and ratifying without further delay the Rome Statute, the Kampala amendments and the Agreement on the Privileges and Immunities of the ICC.

Furthermore, the Committee called on them to enact effective legislation implementing the Rome Statute, in particular by incorporating the crimes and general principles of law defined therein into their domestic criminal legislation and establishing procedures for full and effective co-operation with the Court. Lastly, the Committee called on states to provide the ICC with effective budgetary resources to enable it to fulfill its tasks in an independent and efficient manner and to make meaningful contributions to the Trust Fund for Victims, thereby signaling that the ICC is delivering. ([Read more - adopted report](#))

■ **Milena Santerini: 'In combating radicalisation we must uphold fundamental freedoms' (09.09.2016)**

PACE general rapporteur on the fight against racism and intolerance and co-ordinator of the No Hate Parliamentary Alliance expressed that « it is essential to strike a balance between the fight against radicalisation and respect for fundamental freedoms ». ([Read more - announcement of the Seminar](#))

■ **'Prevention must lie at the heart of the fight against female genital mutilation' (09.09.2016)**

The Committee on Equality and Non-Discrimination of the PACE believe that prevention must lie « at the heart of all efforts to eradicate female genital mutilation » and must involve all the players concerned, whether the communities that practice it, grass roots organisations, social and education services, the police, the justice system or healthcare professionals. ([Read more - adopted report](#))

■ **'Academic achievement and access to employment are key factors for Roma integration' (09.09.2016)**

The Committee on Equality and Non-Discrimination of the PACE believe that academic achievement and access to employment are key factors for the social integration of Roma and Travellers. ([Read more - adopted report](#))

■ **Defending human rights: a priority issue in today's Europe (12.09.2016)**

The PACE President pointed to the unprecedented crises faced by Europe: terrorist attacks, war at its frontiers, frozen conflicts, the refugee and migrant crisis and the rise of extremism. Thus, PACE President expressed that « the Council of Europe is needed now more than ever to take up those challenges and play its role in human rights protection ». Furthermore, PACE President called for the strengthening of the bridges between the organisation, national agencies and citizens and the consolidation of synergies with the other regional and international organisations. ([Read more - speech](#))

■ **'The only way to protect ourselves is to privilege dialogue over confrontation' (15.09.2016)**

The PACE President expressed that the only way to protect states from terrorism and to move forward is to be aware of our inter-dependence and to focus on what unites us rather than what divides us, privileging dialogue over confrontation. ([Read more - opening speech by Pedro Agramunt - video of the debate](#))

■ **Anne Brasseur: 'Let's be stronger than racism, fear and hate' (16.09.2016)**

Ms Brasseur called on parliaments, in order to mobilise them against hateful and racist societies, to draw together a red line and say no to hate speech. Furthermore, Anne Brasseur expressed that the parliaments should provide space in public debates to voice of minorities and those that are targets of hate speech. Finally, Anne Brasseur encouraged parliaments to promote access to social rights and strengthen human rights education. ([Read more - theme 3 – Mobilisation of Parliaments against hate for inclusive and non-racist societies](#) - [No Hate Parliamentary Alliance](#) - [video of the debate \(morning\)](#) - [interview with Anne Brasseur](#))

■ **Call for 'leadership and vision' from parliaments in tackling Europe's challenges (16.09.2016)**

PACE President made an appeal to parliaments across the continent to show "leadership and vision" in tackling the current challenges faced by Europe's democracies. The PACE President called on his fellow parliamentarians to support the organisation of a fourth Summit of Council of Europe Heads of State and Government, to give "fresh impetus" to the organisation's work and its co-operation with member states. ([Read more - European Conference of Presidents of Parliament](#) - [conclusions by Pedro Agramunt](#))

■ **Surrogacy: governments should consider drawing up guidelines to safeguard children's rights (21.09.2016)**

The Committee on Social affairs of the PACE recommended that the Committee of Ministers of Ministers of the organisation consider the desirability and feasibility of "drawing up European guidelines to safeguard children's rights in relation to surrogacy arrangements." ([read more - report containing adopted text](#))

■ **Tax avoidance and evasion pose a threat to social justice (21.09.2016)**

The PACE Committee on Social affairs said it was very much concerned by the scope of tax avoidance and evasion. The Committee encouraged member states to step up efforts to meet international standards and to implement rules governing the exchange of financial account information. Furthermore, the Committee called on governments to encourage companies and individuals to keep their assets in their country of residence by providing stable national tax systems and limiting "red-tape" bureaucracy. Finally, in order to combat money laundering, the Committee recommended the establishment of effective and independent national financial intelligence units, free of any political interference, and the enhanced surveillance of the accounts and transactions of "Politically Exposed Persons" who have held important public positions in another country. ([Read more - draft text adopted and report](#))

■ Promoting migrants in the labour market to overcome Europe’s “demographic winter” (22.09.2016)

The PACE Migration Committee stressed that faced with the lowest fertility rates and the oldest population in the world, the Council of Europe member states should devise “forward-looking migration policies to attract qualified migrants”. Thus, Committee considered that Europe should eliminate from national legislation all obstacles which currently prevent refugees from entering the labour market rapidly, create access to employment for regular migrants and facilitate the recognition of migrants’ educational qualifications and vocational skills. Furthermore, PACE Committee expressed that social measures should be adopted to “encourage couples to have many children as they wish” and policies should be devised to help them reconcile work and family life. ([Read more](#) - [draft resolution and report](#))

■ Committee called for the protection of unaccompanied minors in Europe to be harmonised (22.09.2016)

PACE Migration Committee called on European governments to improve the protection of unaccompanied migrant minors and to avoid them going missing. The Committee said that the present migration and refugee crisis had exacerbated the challenges of how to threat and assist these children on the move, and “generated new problems with the realisation that large numbers of children are going missing at different stages of their journey”, especially directly after arrival at reception centers. ([Read more](#) - [draft resolution and report](#))

■ ‘European leaders must act to protect children in Aleppo’ (29.09.2016)

PACE rapporteur has called on European governments to step up their action to protect and support children concerned by the armed conflict in Syria, in particular in Aleppo. ([Read more](#) - [Committee calls for the protection of unaccompanied minors in Europe to be harmonised](#))

C. Information for the Commissioner for Human Rights

[No work deemed relevant for the NHRs for the period under observation]

D. Information from the monitoring mechanisms

■ GRETA: Forthcoming election of GRETA members (19.09.2016)

The terms of office of 13 of the 15 members of the GRETA will expire on 31 December 2016. The election to fill the vacant seats will be held at the 19th meeting of the Committee of the Parties of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings on 4 November 2016 in Strasbourg. The deadline for nominating candidates for membership in GRETA was 4 September 2016.

■ MONEYVAL’s annual report: anti-terrorist financing measures not fully exploited yet (26.09.2016)

[Read more](#)

■ FCNM: Election of three experts eligible to serve on the Advisory Committee (23.09.2016)

[Read more](#)

Publication of the Tenth activity report (28.09.2016)

At the 1266th meeting of the Committee of Ministers, on 28 September 2016, there was an exchange of views with Mr Francesco Palermo, former President of the Advisory Committee, who presented the 10th activity report covering the period from 1 June 2014 to 31 May 2016 ([Read more](#)).

PartTwo

INFORMATION BY COUNTRY

This part presents a selection of information which is deemed to be mainly relevant for only one country.

Please, refer to the index above (p.3) to find the country you are interested in. Only countries concerned by at least one piece of information issued during the period under observation are listed below.

Albania

A. Execution of the judgements of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
DAUTI 19206/05	03 May 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)210	Examination closed
LASKA AND LIKA 12315/04	20 July 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)272	Examination closed
KAÇIU AND KOTORRI 33192/07+	9 December 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)272	Examination closed
BERHANI 847/05	4 October 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)272	Examination closed
SHKALLA 26866/05	10 August 2011	CM/ResDH(2016)272	Examination closed

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
CAKA GROUP 44023/02	8 March 2010	CM/Del/OJ/DH(2014)1193/2	unfair criminal proceedings	To assess the information provided by the Albanian authorities and to identify the outstanding questions. To examine the proposal to adopt a final resolution in two cases.
DYBEKU GROUP 41153/06	2 June 2008	CM/Del/OJ/DH(2014)1208/1	unlawful detention and poor conditions of detention; failure to comply with interim measures indicated by the Court	To examine the proposal to adopt a final resolution.

■ CM: Resolution on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities – Election of an expert to serve on the Advisory Committee in respect of Albania, 21 September 2016

CM declared elected to the list of experts eligible to serve on the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities on 21 September 2016: Ms Evis ALIMEHMETI, in respect of Albania. [Resolution \(2016\)12](#)

Armenia

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
KHACHATRYAN AND OTHERS (No. 23978/06)	27 February 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)184	Examination closed
SAHAKYAN (No. 66256/11)	10 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)184	Examination closed
POGHOSYAN AND BAGHDASARYAN (No. 22999/06)	12 September 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)184	Examination closed
GALSTYAN (No. 26986/03)	15 February 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)185	Examination closed
AMIRYAN (No. 31553/03)	13 April 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)185	Examination closed
ASHUGHYAN (No. 33268/03)	1st December 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)185	Examination closed
GASPARYAN No. 1 (No. 35944/03)	13 April 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)185	Examination closed
SAPEYAN (No. 35738/03)	13 April 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)185	Examination closed
GASPARYAN No. 2 (No. 22571/05)	16 April 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)185	Examination closed

HAKOBYAN AND OTHERS (No. 34320/04)	10 July 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)185	Examination closed
SAGHATELYAN (No. 7984/06)	20 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)211	Examination closed
GHUYUMCHYAN (No. 53862/07)	21 April 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)241	Examination closed
TOVMASYAN (No. 11578/08)	21 April 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)242	Examination closed

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Austria

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
DONNER (No. 32407/04)	22 May 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)212	Examination closed
MEIDL (No. 33951/05)	15 September 2011	CM/ResDH(2016)212	Examination closed
TUMA (No. 22833/07)	18 January 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)212	Examination closed
POLZ (No. 24941/08)	25 January 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)212	Examination closed
STAUDER AND GABL (No. 10711/09)	13 November 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)212	Examination closed
WALLNÖFER (No. 64346/09)	11 June 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)212	Examination closed

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Azerbaijan

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
ILGAR MAMMADOV 15172/13	13 October 2014	CM/Del/Dec/ 2016)1259/H 46-3	Arrest and pre-trial detention to punish the applicant for having criticised the government, in breach of Article 18 taken in conjunction with Article 5.	To assess the current situation.
NAMAT ALIYEV GROUP 18705/06	8 July 2010	CM/Del/Dec/ 2015)1243/H 46-2	Various irregularities in the context of the 2005 and 2010 parliamentary elections and lack of safeguards against arbitrariness.	To follow up the decision adopted at the 1243 rd meeting.

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Belgium

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
YOH-EKALE MWANJE (No. 10486/10)	20 March 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)213	Examination closed
ANAKOMBA YULA (No. 45413/07)	10 June 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)243	Examination closed

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
TRABELSI 140/10	16 February 2015	CM/Del/Dec(2016)1259/H46-7	Extradition in 2013 of the applicant from Belgium to the United States, where he risks an irreducible life sentence; failure to comply with the Court's interim measure.	To follow up the decision adopted at the 1259 th meeting.
VASILESCU 64682/12	20 April 2015	CM/Notes/1265/H46-6	Structural problem concerning prison overcrowding and conditions of detention.	To assess the action plan submitted by the authorities on 07/07/2016.

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Bosnia and Herzegovina

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
Savka JOKIĆ 40356/11	15 March 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)244	Examination closed

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
ĐOKIĆ MAGO AND OTHERS 12959/05	24 September 2012	CM/Notes/12 65/H46-7	Inability for members of the former Yugoslav People's Army ("YPA") to repossess their pre-war apartments in the aftermath of the war in Bosnia and Herzegovina.	To assess the information provided by the authorities of Bosnia and Herzegovina and to identify the outstanding questions.

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Bulgaria

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
SARKIZOV AND OTHERS 37981/06+	24 September 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)214	Examination closed
DANEV 9411/05	2 December 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)245	Examination closed
Vasil Dimitrov FILEV and Magdalina Dimitrova ZLATANOVA 8905/09	12 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)246	Examination closed
Nikola Boyanov HADZHISTAMOV AND OTHERS 8083/11	26 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)246	Examination closed
Georgi Dimitrov MARASHLIEV AND Gelka Dimitrova GYORCHEVA 27999/10	12 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)246	Examination closed
Boris Grigorov OROV 46290/11	12 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)246	Examination closed

Stoyan Dimitrov PELTEKOV AND OTHERS 40464/08	12 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)246	Examination closed
VLAEVI 272/05+	2 December 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)274	Examination closed
KARANDJA 69180/01	7 January 2011	CM/ResDH(2016)274	Examination closed
TZEKOV 45500/99	23 May 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)274	Examination closed
VASIL SASHOV PETROV 63106/00	10 September 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)274	Examination closed
DIMOV AND OTHERS 30086/05	6 February 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)274	Examination closed
FILIPOVI 24867/04	29 April 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)274	Examination closed

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
NACHOVA AND OTHERS 43577/98+	6 July 2005	CM/Del/Dec(2012)1157/7	Excessive use of firearms by police officers during arrests; ineffective investigations	To identify the outstanding questions in the <i>Nachova</i> case. To examine the proposal to adopt a final resolution in the other cases.

<p>UNITED MACEDONIAN ORGANISATION ILINDEN AND OTHERS</p> <p>59491/00</p>	<p>19 April 2006</p>	<p>CM/Del/OJ/D H(2014)1214 /5</p>	<p>Unjustified refusals of the courts to register an association aiming at achieving "the recognition of the Macedonian minority in Bulgaria".</p>	<p>To assess the latest refusals to register the applicant association and one similar organisation, as well as the additional measures currently implemented by the authorities.</p>
<p>VELIKOVA</p> <p>41488/98</p>	<p>4 October 2000</p>	<p>CM/Del/Dec(2013)1164/7</p>	<p>Excessive use of force by members of the law enforcement agencies; ineffective investigations</p>	<p>To assess the progress achieved and to identify the outstanding issues.</p>

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Croatia

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
PAVLOVIĆ AND OTHERS (No. 13274/11)	2 July 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)186	Examination closed
TOPČIĆ-ROSENBERG (No. 22999/06)	24 March 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)187	Examination closed
Darko KLOBUČAR AND 2 OTHER APPLICATIONS (No. 1067/15)	1st March 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)247	Examination closed

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
STATILEO 12027/10	10 October 2014	CM/Notes/1265/H46-11	Statutory limitations on use of property by landlords, including through the rent control scheme for flats subject to protected leases	To assess the information provided by the Croatian authorities and to identify the outstanding questions.

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Czech Republic

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
T. 19315/11	17 October 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)248	Examination closed

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

France

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
CORBET AND OTHERS (No. 7494/11+)	19 June 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)215	Examination closed
DARRAJ (No. 34588/07)	4 February 2011	CM/ResDH(2016)216	Examination closed
Salah AOUAQ (No. 52825/12)	8 July 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)217	Examination closed
Michel AMIOT (No. 20790/14)	16 December 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)217	Examination closed
Asier BORRERO TORIBIO (No. 40288/15)	1st March 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)217	Examination closed
Iurgi GARITAGOITIA SALEGUI (No. 40285/15)	1st March 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)217	Examination closed
El Moez KHEMIRI (No. 44445/14)	10 February 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)217	Examination closed

HENRY KISMOUN (No. 32265/10)	5 March 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)218	Examination closed
PALMERO (No. 77362/11)	30 January 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)219	Examination closed
HENRIOUD (No. 21444/11)	5 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)249	Examination closed
TETU (No. 60983/09)	22 December 2011	CM/ResDH(2016)250	Examination closed
MATHURIN (No. 63648/12)	5 September 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)250	Examination closed

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

■ CPT: Second evaluation visit of GRETA (13.09.2016)

A delegation of the GRETA carried out an evaluation visit to France from 5 to 9 September 2016. The visit provided an opportunity to assess progress in the implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings since the first evaluation visit by GRETA in 2012 ([Read more](#)).

Georgia

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
ALIEV 522/04	13 April 2009	CM/Notes/12 65/H46-12	Poor conditions of detention	To assess the action plan submitted by the authorities.

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Germany

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
HERRMANN (No. 9300/07)	26 June 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)188	Examination closed

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Greece

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
MEÏDANIS (No. 33977/06)	1st December 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)189	Examination closed
FAKIRIDOU AND SCHINA (No. 6789/06)	14 February 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)190	Examination closed
Stavros KARATZOUNIS (No. 6886/15)	20 octobre 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)220	Examination closed
Michail KEKELIDZE (No. 5478/15)	15 December 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)220	Examination closed
NIKOLAOS ANAGNOSTOU (No. 3490/15)	6 October 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)251	Examination closed
DIONYSIOS ASKOTIRIS AND ANNA ASKOTIRI AND 8 OTHER APPLICATIONS (No. 24681/10+)	22 September 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)251	Examination closed
FATEH BARZI AND OTHERS (No. 47739/14)	17 November 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)251	Examination closed

CATALIN-NIKOLAE CIOCAN AND OTHERS (No. 41806/13)	6 October 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)251	Examination closed
KATERINA AND SOPHIA GEORGIOU (No. 76879/11)	23 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)251	Examination closed
EDMOND HALIMLLARI (No. 9/15)	17 November 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)251	Examination closed
TSOTNE IOSELIANI (No. 43506/14)	17 November 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)251	Examination closed
LEONIDAS KOUTSIDIS AND OTHERS (No. 23259/13)	6 October 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)251	Examination closed
KOBA KRAVELIDZE (No. 43442/14)	17 November 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)251	Examination closed
ARSLAN MIRZA (No. 11961/15)	15 December 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)251	Examination closed
AMALIA MOUTAFI (No. 46817/11)	17 February 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)251	Examination closed

<p>GEORGIOS PAPADIMAS (No. 11609/15)</p>	<p>15 December 2015</p>	<p>CM/ResDH(2016)251</p>	<p>Examination closed</p>
<p>ARISTIDES PARASKAKIS (No. 72636/12)</p>	<p>20 October 2015</p>	<p>CM/ResDH(2016)251</p>	<p>Examination closed</p>
<p>MARSEL RAMADANI (No. 43491/14)</p>	<p>17 November 2015</p>	<p>CM/ResDH(2016)251</p>	<p>Examination closed</p>
<p>MISHA SARUKHANYAN (No. 16882/15)</p>	<p>17 November 2015</p>	<p>CM/ResDH(2016)251</p>	<p>Examination closed</p>
<p>APOSTOLOS GEORGIOS SOFOS AND OTHERS (No. 15675/11)</p>	<p>17 February 2015</p>	<p>CM/ResDH(2016)251</p>	<p>Examination closed</p>

KONSTANTINOS STAMATIADIS (No. 12830/15)	15 December 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)251	Examination closed
STYLIANOS TESSIS AND 2 OTHER APPLICATIONS (No. 9770/10)	8 September 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)251	Examination closed
ATHANASIOS TSOLAKIS (No. 62950/09)	8 September 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)251	Examination closed
VALLIANATOS AND OTHERS (No. 29381/09)	7 November 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)275	Examination closed

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
S.D. GROUP 53541/07	11 September 2009	CM/Notes/12 65/H46-13	Unlawful detention of asylum seekers and migrants pending execution of deportation orders	To assess the information provided by the Greek authorities. To examine the proposal to transfer this group in the standard procedure.

<p>VALLIANATOS AND OTHERS</p> <p>29381/09+</p>	<p>7 November 2013</p>	<p>CM/Notes/12 65/H46-14</p>	<p>Discrimination against same-sex couples excluded from the scope of the law establishing civil unions</p>	<p>To examine the proposal to adopt a final resolution.</p>
--	----------------------------	--	---	---

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Hungary

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

■ FCNM: Publication of the 4th Advisory Committee Opinion (19.09.2016)

The FCNM has published its Fourth Opinion on Hungary together with the government comments ([Read the news](#)).

Iceland

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

■ PACE: President praised Iceland's commitment to Council of Europe values and standards (28.09.2016)

PACE President praised the Icelandic authorities for the extent of their fulfillment of Council of Europe standards. Furthermore, PACE President noted that there are still some Council of Europe conventions that Iceland could benefit from ratifying, including the Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence Against Women, the Revised Social Charter and the Additional Protocol to the European Social Charter Providing for a System of Collective Complaints. ([Read more](#) - [PACE President makes official visit to Iceland](#))

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
HIRSI JAMAA AND OTHERS 27765/09	23 February 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)221	Examination closed
AGOSTINO AND GIOVANNA CALCAGNO 28319/04	16 December 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)252	Examination closed
ADA CAVALLARO 81292/12	20 October 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)252	Examination closed
PASQUALE AND CATERINA DE LUCA 9249/05	21 April 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)252	Examination closed
MARCELLO DELL'ANNA 50521/13	15 December 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)252	Examination closed
ADDOLORATA FISCHETTO AND FORTE 25113/06	15 December 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)252	Examination closed
G.T. AND M.T. 39570/13	26 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)252	Examination closed
GIOVAMBATTISTA LUPIS CRISAFI AND OTHERS 40685/06	20 October 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)252	Examination closed
ANTONIO MAZZEO 16079/05	1st September 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)252	Examination closed
MARIA, MARIO AND BRIGIDA MILAZZO 7917/07	17 March 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)252	Examination closed
MARIA AND OTTAVIA PICCARI	19 May 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)252	Examination closed

26352/04			
EGISTO, FORTUNATO AND GIOVANNA RICCI 13455/07	17 March 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)252	Examination closed
ANTONIO TOTA 36933/04	16 December 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)252	Examination closed
COSTA AND PAVAN 54270/10	11 February 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)276	Examination closed

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
COSTA AND PAVAN 54270/10	11 February 2013	CM/Notes/12/65/H46-15	Inconsistency in the Italian legal system in the field of medically-assisted procreation	To assess the action report presented by the authorities on 15/06/2016. To examine the proposal to adopt a final resolution.
SHARIFI AND OTHERS 16643/09	21 January 2015	CM/Notes/12/65/H46-16	Collective expulsion of asylum seekers to Greece	To assess the revised action plan submitted by the authorities on 13/07/2016.

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRSS during the period under observation]

C. Other information

- GRETA: The committee conducts an urgent procedure visit to Italy (27.09.2016)

A delegation of the GRETA carried out a visit to Italy from 21 to 23 September 2016. The visit, organised pursuant to Rule 7 of the Rules of procedure for evaluating implementation of the Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by the Parties, examined the specific situation of forced returns of victims of trafficking in human beings and identification of victims of trafficking among asylum seekers and migrants. ([Read more](#))

■ **FCNM: Publication of the 4th Advisory Committee Opinion (19.09.2016)**

The FCNM has published its Fourth Opinion on Italy together with the government comments. The comments are also available in Italian. ([Read the opinion](#))

Kosovo*

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

■ CPT: Publication of a report on Kosovo (08.09.2016)

The CPT published the report on its most recent visit to Kosovo* from 15 to 22 April 2015, together with the response of the United Nations Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo (UNMIK) ([Read more](#); [Read the report](#)).

* All references to Kosovo, whether to the territory, institutions or population, in this text shall be understood in full compliance with United Nations Security Council Resolution 1244 (1999) and without prejudice to the status of Kosovo.

Latvia

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
BALTIŅŠ (No. 25282/07)	8 April 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)191	Examination closed
NASSR ALLAH (No. 66166/13)	21 October 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)192	Examination closed
Edgaras KROGERTAS (No. 21476/14)	26 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)222	Examination closed

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Lithuania

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
SIDABRAS AND DŽIAUTAS (No. 55480/00+)	27 October 2004	CM/ResDH(2016)193	Examination closed
RAINYS AND GASPARAVIČIUS (No. 70665/01)	7 July 2005	CM/ResDH(2016)193	Examination closed
SIDABRAS AND OTHERS (No. 50421/08+)	23 September 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)193	Examination closed
CUDAK (No. 15869/02)	23 October 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)194	Examination closed
ŽIČKUS (No. 26652/02)	7 July 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)195	Examination closed

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRSs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

■ CPT: Visit of the Committee (20.09.2016)

A delegation of the CPT carried out a periodic visit to Lithuania from 5 to 15 September 2016. It was the Committee's fifth periodic visit to this country ([Read more](#)).

Malta

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
BRINCAT AND OTHERS (No. 60908/11)	24 October 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)196	Examination closed
SCHEMBRI AND OTHERS (No. 42583/06)	1st February 2011	CM/ResDH(2016)197	Examination closed
FRENDO RANDON AND OTHERS (No. 2226/10)	4 November 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)197	Examination closed
CURMI (No. 2243/10)	9 October 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)197	Examination closed
VASSALLO (No. 57862/09)	6 February 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)197	Examination closed
DEGUARA CARUANA GATTO AND OTHERS (No. 14796/11)	9 October 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)197	Examination closed

AZZOPARDI (No. 28177/12)	6 February 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)197	Examination closed
SALIBA AND OTHERS (No. 20287/10)	22 April 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)199	Examination closed
SUSO MUSA (No. 42337/12)	9 December 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)277	Examination closed
ADEN AHMED (No. 55352/12)	9 December 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)277	Examination closed
LOULED MASSOUD (No. 24340/08)	27 October 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)277	Examination closed
MOXAMED ISMAACIL AND ABDIRAHMAN WARSAME (No. 52160/13)	12 April 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)277	Examination closed
MAHAMED JAMA (No. 10290/13)	2 May 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)277	Examination closed

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
SUSO MUSA GROUP 42337/12	9 December 2013	CM/Notes/12 65/H46-17	Problems related to detention pending asylum and deportation proceedings.	To assess the action report submitted and to examine the proposal to adopt a final resolution.

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Republic of Moldova

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
CIORAP, BECCIEV AND PALADI GROUPS 39806/05	10 March 2009	CM/Notes/12 65/H46-18	Poor conditions of detention, including lack of access to adequate medical care and lack of an effective remedy	To take stock of the measures taken and to identify the outstanding questions in the light of the revised action plan presented by the authorities on 01/07/2016.

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRSs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRSs during the period under observation]

Montenegro

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
MILIĆ AND NIKEZIĆ (No. 54999/10+)	28 July 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)200	Examination closed
MIJANOVIĆ (No. 19580/06)	17 December 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)201	Examination closed
MILIĆ (No. 28359/05)	11 March 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)223	Examination closed
BIJELIĆ (No. 11890/05)	6 November 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)224	Examination closed
MIJUŠKOVIĆ (No. 49337/07)	21 December 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)225	Examination closed

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

■ GRETA: Publication of GRETA's second report on Montenegro (28.09.2016)

Since 2012, Montenegro has made progress in combatting human trafficking in a number of areas, but improvements are needed in helping victims, facilitating their access to compensation, and bringing offenders to justice, said the GRETA in its new evaluation report published today. ([Read more](#))

Netherlands

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
Guran DJINISOV 29741/10	9 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)253	Examination closed
Johan VRINDS 10662/15	2 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)253	Examination closed

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Poland

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
ORCHOWSKI 17885/04	22 January 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)254	Examination closed
NORBERT SIKORSKI 17599/05	22 January 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)254	Examination closed
GRZYWACZEWSKI 18364/06	31 August 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)254	Examination closed
MIROSŁAW ZIELIŃSKI 3390/05	20 December 2011	CM/ResDH(2016)254	Examination closed
WENERSKI No. 2 38719/09	24 October 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)254	Examination closed
OLSZEWSKI 21880/03	2 July 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)254	Examination closed
KARABIN 29254/06	7 January 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)254	Examination closed

RACHWALSKI ET FERENC 47709/99	28 October 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)255	Examination closed
STANKIEWICZ ET AUTRES (n° 2) 48053/11	3 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)256	Examination closed
R.S. 63777/09	21 October 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)257	Examination closed
TOMASZEWSKY 8933/05	15 July 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)258	Examination closed
HUTTEN-CZAPSKA 35014/97	28 April 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)259	Examination closed
Krzysztof CHECHŁACZ 43898/14	15 December 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)260	Examination closed

Marek CHUSTECKI 33558/14	24 November 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)260	Examination closed
Kamil Marcin GARDOCKI 53811/13	8 December 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)260	Examination closed
Grzegorz KACPURA 11361/15	20 October 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)260	Examination closed
Piotr KOZŁOWSKI 25128/15	5 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)260	Examination closed
Marianna PONIEWIERSKA 46536/14	5 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)260	Examination closed
Tomasz RATAJCZAK 1389/15	9 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)260	Examination closed

Grzegorz TALIPSKI 72817/14	26 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)260	Examination closed
MIAŹDŹYK 23592/07	24 April 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)261	Examination closed
A.E. 14480/04	30 June 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)261	Examination closed
KAPRYKOWSKI 23052/05	3 May 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)278	Examination closed
SŁAWOMIR MUSIAŁ 28300/06	5 June 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)278	Examination closed
WENERSKI 44369/02	20 April 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)278	Examination closed

<p>ANDRZEJ WIERZBICKI</p> <p>48/03</p>	<p>19 April 2010</p>	<p>CM/ResDH(2016)278</p>	<p>Examination closed</p>
<p>ROKOSZ</p> <p>15952/09</p>	<p>27 July 2010</p>	<p>CM/ResDH(2016)278</p>	<p>Examination closed</p>
<p>KUPCZAK</p> <p>2627/09</p>	<p>20 June 2011</p>	<p>CM/ResDH(2016)278</p>	<p>Examination closed</p>
<p>MUSIAŁEK AND BACZYŃSKI</p> <p>32798/02</p>	<p>26 October 2011</p>	<p>CM/ResDH(2016)278</p>	<p>Examination closed</p>
<p>D.G.</p> <p>45705/07</p>	<p>12 May 2013</p>	<p>CM/ResDH(2016)278</p>	<p>Examination closed</p>

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
AL NASHIRI GROUP 28761/11	16 February 2015	CM/Del/Dec/ 2016)1259/H 46-21	Violations related to secret rendition operations by the CIA	To follow up the decision adopted at the 1259 th meeting; examination of the urgent individual measures.
KAPRYKOWSKI GROUP 23052/05	3 May 2009	CM/Del/Dec/ 2013)1164/1 8	Poor conditions of detention mainly due to lack of adequate medical care	To assess the information provided in the action report. To examine the proposal to adopt a final resolution.

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Portugal

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
SANTOS SILVA 52246/12	30 April 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)226	Examination closed
FERREIRA ALVES 5340/11	2 April 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)226	Examination closed
SOCIEDADE DE CONSTRUÇÕES MARTINS & VIEIRA, LDA AND OTHERS 56637/10+	30 January 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)226	Examination closed
VALADA MATOS DAS NEVES 73798/13	29 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)226	Examination closed
FERREIRA ALVES 78165/12	30 April 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)226	Examination closed
ASSUNÇÃO CHAVES 61226/08	9 July 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)227	Examination closed
CUNHA MARTINS DA SILVA COUTO 66436/12	30 April 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)262	Examination closed

<p>ÁLVARO BENTO VIEIRA AND ANA MARIA VIEIRA BATISTA 52761/13</p>	17 November 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)263	Examination closed
<p>MANUEL MARTINS CASCALHEIRA 59513/13</p>	17 November 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)263	Examination closed
<p>COOPURB - COOPERATIVA DE CONSTRUÇÃO E HABITAÇÃO C.R.L. 42868/13</p>	20 October 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)263	Examination closed
<p>RUI JORGE ESTEVES DAVID 54872/13</p>	17 November 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)263	Examination closed
<p>FRANCISCO MANUEL MAGALHÃES DUARTE FERREIRA 59685/13</p>	17 November 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)263	Examination closed
<p>JOÃO FRANCISCO MARQUES ALEXANDRE AND JULIA ELISA MARQUES CRUZ ALEXANDRE 59694/13+</p>	17 November 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)263	Examination closed
<p>ANTONIO EUGENIO MARQUES 59459/13</p>	17 November 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)263	Examination closed

<p>MASSA INSOLVENTE DE J. SERRA RAMOS, LDA 28048/13</p>	<p>9 December 2014</p>	<p>CM/ResDH(2016)263</p>	<p>Examination closed</p>
<p>FIRMO NEVES BARRACAS 67064/13</p>	<p>17 November 2015</p>	<p>CM/ResDH(2016)263</p>	<p>Examination closed</p>
<p>ADELINO DIAS SANTOS SARMENTO AND 9 OTHER APPLICATIONS 70712/13</p>	<p>15 March 2016</p>	<p>CM/ResDH(2016)263</p>	<p>Examination closed</p>
<p>STEGARESCU ET BAHRIN 46194/06</p>	<p>4 October 2010</p>	<p>CM/ResDH(2016)264</p>	<p>Examination closed</p>

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Romania

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
NEAGOE (No. 23319/08)	21 October 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)202	Examination closed
CARAIAN (No. 34456/07)	19 October 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)203	Examination closed
Dorin Eugen Ioan CUPEȚIU (No. 72795/13)	3 December 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)228	Examination closed
Decebal Marius NICULA AND 2 OTHER APPLICATIONS (No. 29656/13)	17 December 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)228	Examination closed
IORGA AND OTHERS (No. 26246/05)	25 April 2011	CM/ResDH(2016)265	Examination closed
MARGARETE ALTVATER AND OTHERS (No. 18335/10)	28 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)266	Examination closed
RAMONA DENISA APOSTOL (No. 13438/14)	2 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)266	Examination closed

SILVIU APOSTOLATOS (No. 43097/14)	2 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)266	Examination closed
VASILE SILVIU BOGDAN (No. 78951/11)	23 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)266	Examination closed
MARIA COLȚA (No. 33636/12)	23 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)266	Examination closed
CRISTIANA- CRENGUȚA RADU AND 8 OTHER APPLICATIONS (No. 26349/11)	3 December 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)266	Examination closed
NICOLETA VASILICA FIERARU (No. 76773/13)	3 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)266	Examination closed
ADRIAN GRIGOROF (No. 57448/14)	2 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)266	Examination closed
STERIAN GULI (No. 64454/14)	28 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)266	Examination closed
MANOLE LUPU (No. 42700/13)	2 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)266	Examination closed

GHEORGHE MATEI AND 8 OTHER APPLICATIONS (No. 38037/14)	11 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)266	Examination closed
SIMONA MUREȘAN (No. 35275/14)	23 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)266	Examination closed
IOAN PANDEL AND 13 OTHER APPLICATIONS (No. 45517/13)	28 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)266	Examination closed
GEORGETA PREPELIȚĂ (No. 48213/11)	28 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)266	Examination closed
CĂLIN ROMAN AND OTHERS AND 5 OTHER APPLICATIONS (No. 40208/14)	28 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)266	Examination closed

IOANA TUDOR AND 4 OTHER APPLICATIONS (No. 55129/09)	28 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)266	Examination closed
---	-----------------	-----------------------------------	--------------------

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
PARASCINETI CRISTIAN TEODORESCU GROUP 22883/05	19 September 2012	CM/Notes/12 65/H46-22	Issues related to the procedure and safeguards, living conditions and care afforded to patients detained in psychiatric hospitals	To assess the progress achieved and identify the outstanding issues. To examine the proposal to transfer this group to the enhanced procedure.
CENTRE FOR LEGAL RESOURCES ON BEHALF OF VALENTIN CÂMPEANU 47848/08	17 July 2014	CM/Notes/12 65/H46-21	Deficiencies in the legal protection and medical and social care afforded to a young man with mental disabilities leading to his death in 2004	To assess the revised action plan submitted by the authorities on 07/07/2016.

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRSSs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

■ GRETA: The committee calls on Romania to intensify efforts to prevent trafficking in children (30.09.2016)

In a report, the GRETA calls on Romania to step up its efforts to prevent trafficking in children and to improve the identification and assistance to child victims. ([Read more](#))

Russian Federation

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
Konstantin Gennadyevich GRIB 41174/11	7 April 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)229	Examination closed
Sergey Vasilyevich KOVALEV 24214/05	20 October 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)229	Examination closed
Mikhail Vladimirovich NOSKOV and 4 other applications 7421/09+	22 September 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)229	Examination closed
Sayfitdin Gilmitdinovich RAKHMATULLIN and 2 other applications 20286/12+	22 September 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)229	Examination closed
Lidiya Vladimirovna UVAROVA and Sergey Pavlovich KOROSTYSHEVSKIY 55244/13+	6 October 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)229	Examination closed
Aleksandr Vladimirovich FIRONOV AND 4 OTHER APPLICATIONS 52856/10+	21 April 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)267	Examination closed

Igor Alekseyevich GORSHENIN AND 4 OTHER APPLICATIONS 57401/09	2 June 2015	CM/ResDH(20 16)267	Examination closed
Ruslan Ravilevich KHUZIN 10677/09	25 August 2015	CM/ResDH(20 16)267	Examination closed
Oleg Vadimovich KIBIZOV 13755/11	8 December 2015	CM/ResDH(20 16)267	Examination closed
Galina Petrovna POTAPOVA and Petr Vasilyevich POTAPOV AND 2 OTHER APPLICATIONS 60687/08	15 December 2015	CM/ResDH(20 16)267	Examination closed
Aleksandr Sergeevich REZACHKIN AND Aleksandr Aleksandrovich GALYUS 49956/07+	25 August 2015	CM/ResDH(20 16)267	Examination closed
TIMOFEYEV 58263/00	23 January 2004	CM/ResDH(20 16)268	Examination closed
ABBASOV 11470/03	18 May 2010	CM/ResDH(20 16)268	Examination closed
ABDEYEVY 38405/02	6 June 2008	CM/ResDH(20 16)268	Examination closed
ABDULMANOVA 41564/05	16 January 2009	CM/ResDH(20 16)268	Examination closed

AGIBALOVA AND OTHERS 26724/03	13 July 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
AKASHEV 30616/05	12 September 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ALEKHINA AND OTHERS 22519/02	13 July 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ALEKSENTSEVA LYUDMILA 33706/05	1 May 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ALEKSEYEVA 36153/03	6 July 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ANUFRIYEV 32215/05	15 September 2011	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ARAPOVY 16115/06	29 February 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
AYRAPETYAN 21198/05	12 November 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
AZARYEV 18338/05	14 February 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BAYGAYEV 36398/04	5 October 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BELYATSKAYA 40250/02	11 December 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

BEREZKINA 3509/06	29 February 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BESEDA 45497/04	10 July 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BEZBORODOV 36765/03	20 February 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BOBROVA 24654/03	17 February 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BOGDANOV 3504/02	9 May 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BOLDYREVA 23542/04	6 March 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BOLYUKH 19134/05	31 October 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BRAGINA 20260/04	1st May 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BRATCHIKOVA 66462/01	12 April 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BRONICH 805/03	14 February 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BURDOV No. 2 33509/04	4 May 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

CHERKASHIN 7412/02	7 May 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
CHERNYSHOV AND 11 OTHERS 10415/02	28 December 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
CHISTYAKOV 41395/04	4 March 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
DENISOV 34433/04	6 June 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
DENISOV 21823/03	25 April 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
DEYKINA 33689/05	1st May 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
DOROZHKO 5761/03	26 September 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
DVORYAKOV 28644/06	29 July 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
GALIKHANOVA 15407/05	14 February 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
GALKIN 33459/04	4 January 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
GASAN 43402/02	24 May 2005	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

GAYVORONSKIY 13519/02	25 June 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
GERASIMENKO 24657/03	17 February 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
GERASIMOVA 24669/02	13 January 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
GLEBOV AND GLEBOVA 21777/04	29 February 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
GLUKHOVA AND BRAGINA 28785/04	26 January 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
GLUSHAKOVA No. 2 23287/05	10 August 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
GORLOVA 29898/03	15 May 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
GOROKHOV 40136/02	10 July 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
GRIDIN 4171/04	1 September 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
GRIGORYEVA 21419/04	13 October 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
GURGACH 10122/04	19 June 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

IGUSHEVA 36407/02	9 May 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ISAKOV 20745/04	19 September 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
IVANNIKOVA 24659/03	12 April 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
IVANOV ALEKSANDR 3436/05	8 May 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
IVCHENKO 29411/05	2 January 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KABANOV 37758/03	14 February 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KALEYEV 14521/05	12 November 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KALININ 16086/04	15 January 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KANAYEV 43726/02	27 October 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KAZARTSEV 26410/02	2 February 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

KAZARTSEVA AND OTHERS 13995/02	12 April 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KAZMINA 72374/01	15 September 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KAZMINA NINA AND OTHERS 746/05+	13 April 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KHARITICH 21268/04	6 March 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KHOLODENKO 33617/04	18 December 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KHVOROSTINA AND OTHERS 20098/03	5 July 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KLISHINA AND OTHERS 36074/04	24 July 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KOCHALIDZE 44038/05	10 July 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KOLAYEV 43284/02	3 October 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KOLTSOV 41304/02	24 May 2005	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

KONOVALOV 63501/00	13 September 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KORCHAGIN 19798/04	1 September 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KORCHAGINA AND OTHERS 27295/03	12 April 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KOROLEV 25550/05	12 July 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KOROTKIKH 4543/02	27 June 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KOSTENKO 32845/02	20 June 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KOSTENKO 23490/03	7 May 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KOTLYAROV 750/02	18 March 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KOVALENKO 21410/04	13 October 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KOZEYEV 934/03	30 January 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

KRASEV 731/04	26 September 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KRASNOV 18892/04	22 February 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KRASYUCHENKO 11712/06	11 January 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KRIVONOS 37641/04	6 March 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KUDRINA 27790/03	31 March 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KULKOV AND OTHERS 25114/03+	8 April 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KURYANOV 37643/04	6 June 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KUZMIN 30212/06	28 May 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KUZMINSKIY 40081/03	14 February 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KUZNETSOVA YEVDOKIYA 8355/07	4 March 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

LARIONOV 42431/02	14 February 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
LAVROV 33422/03	17 April 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
LAZAREV 9800/02	5 January 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
LESNOVA 37645/04	24 April 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
LIMASOVY 37354/03	22 October 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
LOSITSKIY 24395/02	14 March 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
LUKINYKH 34822/04	10 July 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
MAGOMEDOV 20111/03	4 March 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
MAKAROVA AND OTHERS 7023/03	24 May 2005	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
MARKOVTSI AND SELIVANOV 756/05+	23 October 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
MARTYNOVA 57807/00	1st December 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

MATVIYETS 38999/05	12 September 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
MIKHAYLOVA AND OTHERS 22534/02	17 February 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
MOROKO 20937/07	1 December 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
MOZHAYEVA 26759/03	4 March 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
NADEZHKIN 42940/02	12 September 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
NARTOVA 33685/05	1 May 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
NEOFITA 3311/06	12 July 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
NIKISHIN 20515/04	12 July 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
NOSOV AND OTHERS 9117/04+	15 April 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
OOO PKG "SIB-YUKASS" 34283/05	2 June 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
OOO PTK "MERKURIY" 3790/05	12 November 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

OOO RUSATOMMET 61651/00	14 September 2005	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
OSHER AND OSHER 31296/02	31 March 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
PANCHISHIN 45291/05	27 November 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
PARFENENKOV 12115/03	24 April 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
PELLYA 16869/08	10 July 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
PETRUSHKO 36494/02	24 May 2005	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
PETUKHOV 40322/02	1 December 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
PLEKHOVA 42752/04	30 April 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
PLOTNIKOVY 43883/02	24 May 2005	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
POGULYAYEV 34150/04	3 July 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
POLITOVA AND POLITOV 34422/03	1 May 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

POLUPANOVA MATRENA 21447/04	13 October 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
PONOMAREV ROMAN 31105/05	4 March 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
PORTNOVA 34428/04	29 July 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
POZNAKHIRINA 25964/02	6 July 2005	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
PRIDATCHENKO AND OTHERS 2191/03+	21 September 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
PROKHOROVA 13869/05	8 January 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
PYLNOV 7111/05	12 October 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
PYRIKOV 2703/02	8 September 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
REYNBAKH 23405/03	29 December 2005	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ROZHNYATOVSKAYA 35002/05	13 March 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
RUSSIKH 44595/05	10 July 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

RYKACHEV AND OTHERS 52283/07+	19 April 2011	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SAIDOV 6558/06	5 October 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SEMOCHKIN 3885/04	4 March 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SHAKIRZYANOV 39888/02	20 February 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SHAMINA 70501/01	13 October 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SHAPOVALOVA 2047/03	12 February 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SHATUNOV 31271/02	1 September 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SHESTOPALOVA AND OTHERS 39866/02	12 April 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SHEVCHENKO 42383/02	10 July 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SHILYAYEV 9647/02	6 January 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SHIRYAYEVA 21417/04	13 October 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

SHITIKOV 10833/03	28 February 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SIDORENKO 3519/05	26 October 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SINITSYNA 2814/04	13 March 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SIVOGRAK AND ZENOV 14758/08	13 September 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SIVOLDAYEVA 3906/06	28 September 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SKACHEDUBOVA 55885/00	1 March 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SMETANKO 6239/04	4 October 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SOMCHENKO 33986/02	31 October 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
STRELTSOV AND OTHER "NOVOCHERKASSK MILITARY PENSIONERS" 8549/06+	29 October 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SUBOCHEVA 2245/05	2 June 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

SUKHOBOKOV 75470/01	13 July 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SUKHORUKOV 23596/04	31 October 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SUNTSOVA 55687/00	17 February 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
TARASOV SERGEY 20518/04	8 May 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
TEREKHOVA 21425/04	13 October 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
TETSEN 11589/04	3 July 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
TIBILOV 38943/04	2 January 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
TIKHOV AND OTHERS 14296/03	27 June 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
TIMISHEV No. 3 18465/05	30 January 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
TKHYEGEPSO AND OTHERS 44387/04+	8 March 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
TOLOKONNIKOVA 24651/03	12 April 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

TROCHEV 6396/05	9 January 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
TRUFANOVA 11756/06	4 March 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
TRUNOV 9769/04	6 June 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
TULSKAYA 43715/05	23 January 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
TYTAR 21779/04	2 February 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
USTALOV 24770/04	2 June 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
VAKULENKO 38035/04	14 February 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
VALENTINA VASILYEVA 7237/03	17 February 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
VASILYEVA 21430/04	13 October 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
VASILYEVA AND OTHERS 8011/02	29 September 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
VERSHININA 3462/04	26 October 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

VESELYASHKIN AND VESELYASHKINA 5555/06	18 March 2009	CM/ResDH(20 16)268	Examination closed
VLADIMIR MELNIKOV 38202/07	17 April 2012	CM/ResDH(20 16)268	Examination closed
VOLOKITIN 374/03	9 February 2007	CM/ResDH(20 16)268	Examination closed
VOLOSKOVA 33707/05	1 May 2007	CM/ResDH(20 16)268	Examination closed
VORONINA 33728/05	1 May 2007	CM/ResDH(20 16)268	Examination closed
VYALYKH 5225/06	22 May 2007	CM/ResDH(20 16)268	Examination closed
VYDRINA 35824/04	29 June 2007	CM/ResDH(20 16)268	Examination closed
WASSERMAN 15021/02	18 February 2005	CM/ResDH(20 16)268	Examination closed
WASSERMAN No. 2 21071/05	29 September 2008	CM/ResDH(20 16)268	Examination closed
YAVORIVSKAYA 34687/02	7 October 2005	CM/ResDH(20 16)268	Examination closed
YELDASHEV 5730/03	12 August 2010	CM/ResDH(20 16)268	Examination closed

YEMELYANOVY AND OTHERS 21264/07+	14 March 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ZACHENKO 33720/05	1 May 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ZAKOMLISTOVA 24277/03	14 May 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ZAUGOLNOVA 1144/03	12 April 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ZHELTKOV 8582/05	14 September 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ZHUKOV ALEKSANDR 35760/04	20 March 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ZHURAVLEV 5249/06	15 April 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ZIABREVA 23567/06	18 March 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ZVEREV AND OTHERS 13296/03	19 October 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
LEVIN 33264/02	2 May 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
AGAPONOVA AND OTHERS 34439/04	7 May 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

ALEKSANDR PONOMAREV 8235/03	6 December 2011	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ALEKSANDR POPOV 38720/03	5 July 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ALEKSENTSEVA AND OTHERS 75025/01+	17 April 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ALMAYEVA 966/03	25 January 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ARULEPP 35774/04	6 February 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BAKHAREV AND OTHERS 32786/04	18 December 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BAKHAREV 21932/03	19 October 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BAZHENOV 37930/02	20 January 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BELOTSERKOVETS 34679/03	1 December 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BELYAYEV 24620/02	25 April 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
BLAGOVESTNYI 72558/01	4 October 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

BUTSEV 1719/02	15 February 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
DENISENKOV 40642/02	15 February 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
DENISOVA 34431/04	18 December 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
DOKOLIN 28488/04	18 December 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
FINKOV 27440/03	8 January 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
FITISOV 41842/04	8 February 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
GLUSHAKOVA 38719/03	12 July 007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
GOROKHOV AND RUSYAYEV 38305/02	12 October 2005	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
GRIBANENKOV 16583/04	18 May 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KUKALO 63995/00	3 February 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
KUKALO No. 2 11319/04	24 October 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

LEDOVKIN 43209/04	21 May 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
LEVIN VIKTOR 35893/04	25 December 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
NAYDENKOV 43282/02	24 September 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
NIKOLAYEV 37927/02	2 June 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
PARKHOMOV 19589/02	20 January 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
PETROV VIKTOR 15890/04	24 October 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
PODYAPOLSKIY 36939/02	12 September 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SHIRYKALOVA 26307/02	27 June 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SILCHENKO 32786/03	28 December 2006	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SIVERIN 24664/02	4 March 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SMELOV 33660/04	2 January 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

SMORODINOVA 37647/04	17 April 2008	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SUSLIN 34938/04	23 January 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
SVITICH 39013/05	31 October 2007	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
VORONIN 40543/04	4 March 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed
ZUBAREV 38845/04	2 January 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)268	Examination closed

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
FINOGENOV AND OTHERS 18299/03+	4 June 2012	CM/Notes/1265/H46-23	Loss of life and injuries caused during a mass hostage-rescue operation at the “Nord-Ost” theatre in Moscow and lack of effective investigation	To take stock of the measures taken and to identify the outstanding questions.
KLYAKHIN GROUP 46082/99	6 June 2005	CM/Del/Dec(2016)1259/H46-28	Various problems relating to pre-trial detention	To follow up the decision adopted at the 1259th meeting (examination of the outstanding individual measures).

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

■ PACE: Russia's non-participation 'benefits neither Russia nor PACE', said President in Moscow (07.09.2016)

PACE President stressed that the non-participation of Russian parliamentarians in PACE «benefits neither Russia nor the Assembly ». Thus, PACE President praised the commitment of Russia and the Russian parliamentarians to the Council of Europe, recalling that this year marked the 20th anniversary of Russia's membership in the Organisation. ([Read more - President and group leaders to visit Moscow](#))

San Marino

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

■ FCNM: Adoption of a Committee of a Minister's resolution (20.09.2016)

[Read more](#)

Serbia

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
JOVANOVIĆ 32299/08	2 January 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)204	Examination closed
Jelica IVANOVIĆ AND 38 OTHER APPLICATIONS 77268/13	8 December 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)269	Examination closed

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
ZORICA JOVANOVIĆ 21794/08	9 September 2013	CM/Del/Dec/ 2016)1250/H 46-23	Failure to provide information as to the fate of new- born babies alleged to have died in maternity wards	To urge the authorities to bring the legislative process to an end without further delay.

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

■ CM: Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities – Election of an expert to the Advisory Committee in respect of Serbia, 21 September 2016

CM declared elected to the list of experts eligible to serve on the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities on 21 September 2016: Mr Goran BAŠIĆ, in respect of Serbia. ([Resolution \(2016\)14](#))

Slovak Republic

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
ALLIANZ - SLOVENSKÁ POISŤOVŇA, A.S. 31587/14	2 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)230	Examination closed
Ján SARKOCY 27788/14	15 March 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)230	Examination closed
Peter SUCHÁR 34820/15	15 March 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)230	Examination closed
ŽIAREC, POĽNOHOSPODÁRSKE DRUŽSTVO 25962/14	9 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)230	Examination closed
MAJCHRÁK 21463/08	23 January 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)231	Examination closed
YEGOROV 27112/11	2 September 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)232	Examination closed
KORMOŠ 46092/06	8 March 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)233	Examination closed

BRUNCKO 33937/06	3 February 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)233	Examination closed
KOVÁČIK 50903/06	29 February 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)233	Examination closed
PETROV 64195/10	2 March 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)233	Examination closed
WINKLER 25416/07	17 October 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)233	Examination closed
ŽÚBOR 7711/06	3 February 2012	CM/ResDH(2016)233	Examination closed
MASLÁK 15259/11	28 July 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)234	Examination closed

MASLÁK AND OTHERS 11037/12	16 October 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)234	Examination closed
LÓPEZ GUIÓ 10280/12	13 October 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)235	Examination closed
HOHOLM 35632/13	1st June 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)236	Examination closed
VRABEC AND OTHERS 31312/08	26 June 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)237	Examination closed

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Spain

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
MANZANAS MARTIN (No. 17966/10)	5 March 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)205	Examination closed
VARELA GEIS (No. 61005/09)	5 June 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)238	Examination closed

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Sweden

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
KARIN ANDERSSON AND OTHERS 29878/09	25 December 2014	CM/ResDH(2016)239	Examination closed

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

Switzerland

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
BORER 22493/06	10 September 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)240	Examination closed

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

“The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia”

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
Rami FETAOVSKI 71962/10	23 February 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)270	Examination closed
Pece JANEV AND 2 OTHER APPLICATIONS 13847/11	15 December 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)270	Examination closed
Zorica LAZAREVSKA 61228/12	15 March 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)270	Examination closed
Ružica and Pavle MILENKOVSKI 31786/15	26 January 2016	CM/ResDH(2016)270	Examination closed
Olivera PEHČEVSKA AND 3 OTHER APPLICATIONS 17900/15	15 December 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)270	Examination closed

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
EL-MASRI 39630/09	13 December 2012	CM/Del/Dec(2015)1243/H 46-19	Violations related to a “secret rendition” operation by the CIA	To urge the authorities to provide information on the outstanding issues.

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

.

Turkey

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	CONCLUSION
ADIRBELLI AND OTHERS (No. 20775/03)	2 March 2009	CM/ResDH(2016)206	Examination closed
ATO (No. 29873/02)	8 September 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)207	Examination closed
ERYILMAZ (No. 32322/02)	10 May 2010	CM/ResDH(2016)208	Examination closed
ALKAYA (No. 42811/06)	9 January 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)209	Examination closed
Lokman ASLAN (No. 10730/09)	13 January 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)271	Examination closed
EROĞLU AND OTHERS (No. 35702/08+)	24 May 2011	CM/ResDH(2016)271	Examination closed
GÜRAKIN (No. 20518/08)	26 March 2013	CM/ResDH(2016)271	Examination closed
Hüseyin KAHRAMAN (No. 76649/12)	19 May 2015	CM/ResDH(2016)271	Examination closed

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
BATI AND OTHERS GROUP 33097/96	3 September 2009	CM/Del/Dec(2015) 1243/H46-23	Ill-treatment by the police and the gendarmarie; ineffective investigations	To follow up the decision adopted at the 1243rd meeting.
CYPRUS v. TURKEY 25781/94	12 May 2014	CM/Del/Dec(2015) 1230/22	14 violations in relation to the situation in the northern part of Cyprus	To continue the debate on the cluster of property rights of enclaved persons, in accordance with the decision adopted at the 1243rd meeting (December 2015).
GÖZEL AND ÖZER GROUP 43453/04	6 October 2010	CM/Del/Dec(2015) 1230/22	Unjustified interferences with freedom of expression, owing notably to criminal convictions	To follow up the decision adopted at the 1230 th meeting.
XENIDES-ARETIS GROUP 46347/99	23 May 2007	CM/Del/Dec(2016) 1259/H46-37	Continuous denial of access to property in the northern part of Cyprus	To continue the debate on the payment of the just satisfaction.

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

■ CPT: Visit of the Committee (07.09.2016)

A delegation of the CPT carried out an ad hoc visit to Turkey from 29 August to 6 September 2016.
([Read more](#))

Ukraine

A. Execution of the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

CASE	DATE	RESOLUTION	VIOLATION	CONCLUSION
KAVERZIN 23893/03	15 August 2012	CM/Del/OJ/DH(2014)1201/24	Ill-treatment by the police ; ineffective investigations	To to ensure the acceleration of the pending investigations.
AFANASYEV GROUP 38722/02	5 July 2005	CM/Del/OJ/DH(2014)1201/24	Ill-treatment by the police ; ineffective investigations	To to ensure the acceleration of the pending investigations.
KARABET AND OTHERS 38906/07	17 April 2013	CM/Del/Dec(2016)1259-rev	Ill-treatment/torture by police and lack of effective investigation	To to ensure the acceleration of the pending investigations.
BELOUSOV 4494/07	7 February 2014	CM/Del/Dec(2016)1259-rev	Ill-treatment / torture by police and lack of effective investigation	To take stock of the measures taken and to identify the outstanding questions.
KHARCHENKO 40107/02	10 May 2011	CM/Del/Dec(2013)1164/33	Shortcomings with respect to the system of detention on remand	Notes the recent information provided by the Ukrainian authorities, including at the meeting itself, related to the implementation of the reform strategy announced in November 2011.
CHANYEV 46193/13	9 January 2015	CM/Del/Dec(2016)1259-rev	Unlawful arrests, unlawful and lengthy detention on remand, notably lack of court order for detention between the end of investigation and trial	Notes the recent information provided by the Ukrainian authorities, including at the meeting itself, related to the implementation of the reform strategy announced in November 2011.

KORNEYKOVA 39884/05	19 April 2012	CM/Del/Dec(2013)1164/33	Unlawful arrests and unlawful and lengthy detention on remand	To take stock of the measures taken and to identify the outstanding questions.
YURIY NIKOLAYEVICH IVANOV 40450/04	15 January 2010	CM/Del/Dec(2016)1259/H46-41	Non-enforcement of domestic court decisions against the State or State owned enterprises	To follow up the decision adopted at the 1259th meeting.
IVANOV + ZHOVNER GROUP 56848/00	29 September 2004	CM/Del/Dec(2016)1259/H46-41	Non-enforcement of domestic court decisions against the State or State owned enterprises	To follow up the decision adopted at the 1259th meeting.

B. Resolutions, signatures and ratifications

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]

C. Other information

[No work deemed relevant for NHRs during the period under observation]