

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Strasbourg, 16 December 2016

DH-BIO/abr RAP 10

COMMITTEE ON BIOETHICS

(DH-BIO)

10th MEETING

Strasbourg, 5-8 December 2016

ABRIDGED REPORT

I. Adoption of the agenda

1. The Committee on Bioethics (DH-BIO) held its 10th meeting in Strasbourg from 5 to 8 December 2016. The agenda of the meeting and the list of participants appear in Appendix I and Appendix II to this abridged report.

II. Chart of signatures and ratifications of the Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine, the Protocol on the Prohibition of Cloning Human Beings, the Protocol concerning Transplantation of Organs and Tissues of Human Origin, the Protocol concerning Biomedical Research and the Protocol concerning Genetic Testing for Health Purposes

2. The DH-BIO took note of the information sent in written form on the current process towards signature and/or ratification of the Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine (Oviedo Convention) and/or its Additional Protocols in some member and observer states.

III. Developments in the field of bioethics

3. The DH-BIO took note of the developments in the field of bioethics within the member states, as well as in international organisations. It was also informed of the relevant developments in other Council of Europe bodies.

IV. Additional Protocol on the protection of the human rights and dignity of persons with mental disorder with regard to involuntary placement and involuntary treatment

4. The DH-BIO took note of the reply of the Committee of Ministers to Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 2091 (2016) 'The case against a Council of Europe legal instrument on involuntary measures in psychiatry'.
5. On the basis of the above, the DH-BIO confirmed the decision to resume the work on the Additional Protocol in the light of the comments received during the public consultation, and of any new additional comments which delegations might wish to submit by 22 December 2016.
6. The current chair of the drafting group agreed to chair its next meeting, but following her election as chair of the DH-BIO, a new chair would then need to be designated for the drafting group.
7. The DH-BIO agreed with the proposal of inviting to participate in the relevant session of the next plenary meeting the following disability rights INGOs which are participating in the work of the Ad Hoc Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disability (CAHDPH): European Association of Service Providers for Persons with Disabilities (EASPD), European Disability Forum (EDF) and Rehabilitation International (RI).

V. Cooperation activities

8. The DH-BIO was informed about the outcome of the two seminars on issues around the decision making process regarding medical treatment in end-of-life situations which had taken place in cooperation with the Armenian authorities (7 October 2016) and the Turkish authorities (25 October 2016) respectively. The DH-BIO welcomed the

fact that the seminars were an occasion to publicize and raise awareness on the Guide on the decision-making process regarding medical treatment in end-of-life situations.

9. The importance of an integrated approach between cooperation and intergovernmental activities was underlined.
10. The DH-BIO was informed of a request made by the Russian Federation for the organisation of a seminar in 2017 within the framework of the cooperation activities.

VI. Emerging Technologies

11. The DH-BIO took note of the draft questionnaire on public discourse presented by the Bureau on the basis of a document prepared by the consultant, and appreciated the work achieved.
12. Delegations pointed out the difficulty to provide the level of information requested in part B of the questionnaire. Agreement was reached on the need to simplify the questionnaire. The objective should be to collect information on the general approach and place of public debate in the country concerned and identify successful initiatives of public debate on which some more specific information would be collected. This information would then help informing the further work of the committee on the public debate and discourse with regard to new scientific and technological developments.
13. In the light of these considerations Delegations were invited to send comments by 13 January 2017 on the proposed scope for the questions, in particular those which appeared in part B, indicating which they considered to be pertinent, and which might be too detailed.
14. The Bureau, in cooperation with the Secretariat, was entrusted with the task of revising the draft questionnaire in the light of the comments from the delegations with a view to submit a revised version at the next plenary meeting for approval.

VII. Prohibition of financial gain

15. The Chair of the Ad Hoc Group introduced the document on 'Guiding Elements for the interpretation of Article 21 of the Oviedo Convention'.
16. The DH-BIO appreciated the work of the ad hoc group and the general approach taken in the document. Specific comments were made, in particular, on paragraphs 24, 35-36 and 43 (last indent).
17. Delegations were invited to send any additional comments they may have (in particular on the above paragraphs) by 13 January 2017.
18. The DH-BIO agreed that the document prepared by the Ad Hoc Group should be finalized as a guide, which together with the DH-BIO, the CD-P-TO and the CD-P-TS would be invited to adopt.
19. The Bureau in consultation with the Chair of the ad hoc group and in cooperation with the Secretariat was entrusted with the task of revising the document in the light of the comments made by delegations with a view to its finalisation at its 11th plenary meeting.

VIII. Study on children's rights

20. The DH-BIO took note of the study on children's rights presented by one of its authors, and appreciated the work achieved. It subsequently held an exchange of views on topics raised in the study.
21. As agreed, the study would now serve as a basis for a follow-up study which will aim at examining existing legal provisions at international level relevant to the protection of children rights to see whether they provide appropriate protection with regard to the issues identified. This second study will be presented for discussion at the 11th plenary of the DH-BIO.

IX. International conference on the occasion of the 20th anniversary of the Oviedo Convention

22. The DH-BIO took note of the proposed programme for the conference. It agreed on the need for a two days conference and supported the proposed structure subject to the refinement of the first session in the light of the suggestions made by some delegations.
23. Delegations were reminded of the importance of forwarding the questionnaire section on relevance and challenges to relevant national bodies/institutions and submitting replies to the questionnaire by 20 January 2017, in particular on this section, to allow finalisation of the programme.
24. Delegations were also invited to identify possible speakers for the different sessions.

X. Working methods and future activities of the DH-BIO

High level seminar on "International case law in Bioethics : insight and foresight"

25. The DH-BIO held an exchange of views on the outcome of the seminar on 'International case-law in Bioethics: Insight and foresight', held on 5 December, which would contribute to the preparation of the 20th anniversary of the Oviedo Convention.

Programme of activities for the 2018-2019 biennium

26. The DH-BIO held an exchange of views on the document prepared by the Bureau for the activity programme in the next biennium 2018-2019. It supported the general line of the proposals, including the one on the elaboration of a Strategic Action Plan informing the work of the committee in the mid-term.
27. Delegations were invited to make comments by 13 January 2017, with a view to the preparation of a revised version by the Bureau in cooperation with the Secretariat.

XI. Election to the Bureau

28. Following the end of term of Dr Mark Bale (United Kingdom) as chair of DH-BIO, the DH-BIO elected by acclamation Dr Beatrice Ioan (Romania) as chair, and Ms Tesi Aschan (Sweden) as vice-chair for a term of office of one year beginning on 1 January 2017, renewable once.
29. Dr Givi Javashvili (Georgia) and Ms Maria Concepcion Martin Arribas (Spain) were re-elected by acclamation for a second term of office of two years.
30. The DH-BIO further elected Dr Ritva Halila (Finland) and Prof. Miguel Oliveira da Silva (Portugal) as members of the Bureau for a term of office of two years, renewable once.

XII. Relations with other international bodies

31. The DH-BIO took note of the document prepared by the Secretariat with the list of meetings with other international organisations.

XIII. Date of next meetings

32. The DH-BIO agreed on the following dates for its next meetings to be held in Strasbourg:
 - 11th meeting of the DH-BIO: 6-8 June 2017
 - 12th meeting of the DH-BIO: 24-27 October 2017 (24-25 October: International conference on the occasion of the 20th anniversary of the Oviedo Convention)

XIV. Cooperation with other Committees







33. The Secretariats of the European Committee on Organ Transplantation (CD-P-TO), the European Committee on Blood Transfusion (CD-P-TS) and the Consultative Committee of the Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data (T-PD) referred to a number of current activities being developed by their respective committee which were of relevance for the DH-BIO.
34. The possibility of a joint session of the Bureaus of the T-PD and the DH-BIO would be considered in the context of the preparation of the activity proposals for the next biennium with a view to identify issues of common interest for possible further cooperation.

XV. Other business

35. The DH-BIO took note of the compilations of replies to the questionnaire on medically assisted procreation, including surrogacy. Delegations having not yet sent replies were invited to send their updated or new information, if possible, by 13 January 2017. Delegations were also invited to keep the Secretariat informed about any new developments in this field so as to keep the document up to date.
36. Following an invitation from the OECD for closer collaboration of its Working Party on Biotechnology, Nanotechnology and Converging Technologies with the DH-BIO, the latter agreed to designate Dr Mark Bale (UK) as its representative to participate in the meetings of this OECD Working Party.
37. Following the election of Dr Beatrice Ioan as chair of the DH-BIO, DH-BIO members interested in acting as rapporteur on gender equality were invited to inform the Secretariat.

APPENDIX I
Agenda of the 10th meeting of the DH-BIO

LIST OF ITEMS

1. Adoption of the draft agenda
-  2. Chart of signatures and ratifications of the Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine, the Protocol on the Prohibition of Cloning Human Beings, the Protocol concerning Transplantation of Organs and Tissues of Human Origin, the Protocol concerning Biomedical Research and the Protocol concerning Genetic Testing for Health Purposes
-  3. Developments in the field of bioethics
-  4. Additional Protocol on the protection of the human rights and dignity of persons with mental disorders with regard to involuntary placement and involuntary treatment
-  5. Cooperation activities
6. Emerging technologies
7. Prohibition of financial gain
8. Study on children's rights
9. International Conference marking the 20th anniversary of the Oviedo Convention
10. Working methods and future activities of the DH-BIO
11. Election to the Bureau
-  12. Relations with other international bodies
13. Dates of the next meetings
-  14. Cooperation with other committees
15. Other business
16. Decisions taken by the DH-BIO at its 10th meeting


MONDAY 5 DECEMBER (9.30 – 18.00)






International case-law in Bioethics: Insight and foresight


High level seminar organised by the Committee on Bioethics (DH-BIO)
under the auspices of the Cypriot Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers

Press room, European Court of Human Rights
Council of Europe, Allée des Droits de l'Homme, Strasbourg (France)

TUESDAY 6 DECEMBER MORNING (9.30 – 13.00)

09.30	1. Adoption of the draft Agenda	
	Essential documents	
	<i>DH-BIO(2016)OT+OJ2 Prov2</i>	<i>Draft Order of Business and Draft Agenda</i>
	<u>DH-BIO/BU RAP(2016)2</u>	<i>Meeting Report of the Bureau (Paris, 19-21 October 2016)</i>
	10. Working methods and future activities of the DH-BIO <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Brief exchange on the outcome of the seminar <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Delegations are invited to give a brief feedback on the seminar held on 5 December 	
	2. Chart of signatures and ratifications of the Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine, the Protocol on the Prohibition of Cloning Human Beings, the Protocol concerning Transplantation of Organs and Tissues of Human Origin, the Protocol concerning Biomedical Research and the Protocol concerning Genetic Testing for Health Purposes	
	<u>DH-BIO/INF(2016)5</u>	<i>Chart of signatures and ratifications</i>

	3. Developments in the field of bioethics	
	Delegations, including observers, are invited to send information in writing.	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Developments in member states and other states b. Developments in the field of bioethics in international organisations c. Developments in other Council of Europe bodies d. Developments at the European Court of Human Rights 	
	Essential documents	
	a. DH-BIO/INF(2016)15	<i>Developments in the field of bioethics in member states and other states</i>
	b.	<i>Developments in the field of bioethics in international organisations</i>
	c. DH-BIO(2016)25	<i>Developments in the field of bioethics in other Council of Europe bodies</i>
	d. DH-BIO/INF(2016)14	<i>Developments in the field of bioethics in the European Court of Human Rights</i>
	12. Relations with other international bodies	
	DH-BIO(2016)28	<i>Relations with other international organisations: list of meetings</i>
	5. Cooperation activities	
	a. Seminar on the decision making process regarding medical treatment in end-of-life situations, in cooperation with the National Center of Bioethics, 7 October 2016, Yerevan (Armenia)	
	b. End of life care symposium in cooperation with Acibadem University, 25 October 2016, Istanbul (Turkey)	
	Useful documents	
	a.	Programme of the Seminar in Armenia
	b.	Programme of the Seminar in Turkey
		Conclusions report of the End of life care symposium
10.00	8. Study on children's rights	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Presentation of the study on children rights challenges raised by developments in the field of biology and medicine (Dr Jameson Garland, Uppsala University, Sweden) - Exchange of views with DH-BIO delegations on the study 	
	Essential documents	
		Study on children's rights, Uppsala University (draft)
	Useful documents	
	Strategy for the Rights of the Child (2016-2021)	

TUESDAY 6 DECEMBER AFTERNOON (14.30 – 18.00)		
14.30 	14. Cooperation with other committees	
	a) European Committee on Organ Transplantation (CD-P-TO) b) European Committee on Blood Transfusion (CD-P-TS)	
	a) CD-P-TO	
	PA/PH/TO (16) 5	<i>Terms of Reference of the CD-P-TO</i>
	PA/PH/TO (15) 8 R 6	<i>Recommendations/guidance for the evaluation, donation and follow-up of non-resident living donors</i>
	PA/PH/TO (16) 52	<i>Draft report – 18th meeting of the CD-P-TO</i>
	b) CD-P-TS	
	PA/PH/TS (15) 54	<i>Terms of Reference of the CD-P-TS</i>
	7. Prohibition of financial gain	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Presentation of the Document prepared by the Ad hoc group - Exchange of views on the document with a view to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • its revision and, where appropriate, finalisation; • consider the form/status to be given to the document with a view to a decision. 	
	Essential document	
	DH-BIO/FIN GAIN (2016)4	<i>Guiding Elements prepared by the Ad hoc Working group on the prohibition of financial gain</i>
	DH-BIO(2016)26	<i>Comments from delegations on Guiding Elements prepared by the Ad hoc Working group on the prohibition of financial gain (doc DH-BIO/FIN GAIN(2016)4)</i>
	Useful documents	
	DH-BIO/FIN GAIN RAP(2016)3	<i>Report of the third meeting of the Ad hoc Working group on the prohibition of financial gain (Paris, 10-11 October 2016)</i>
	DH-BIO/FIN GAIN RAP(2016)2	<i>Report of the second meeting of the Ad hoc Working group on the prohibition of financial gain (Paris, 27-28 June 2016)</i>
	DH-BIO/FIN GAIN RAP(2016)1	<i>Report of the 1st meeting of the Ad hoc Working group on the prohibition of financial gain</i>
	DH-BIO(2015)19	<i>Follow up to the statement on prohibition of financial gain:</i>


		<i>proposal from the Bureau</i>
	DH-BIO(2015)12REV	<i>Follow up to the Statement on the prohibition of financial gain. Information</i>

WEDNESDAY 7 DECEMBER MORNING (9.00 – 13.00)

	6. Emerging technologies <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Presentation of a questionnaire project on public debates; - Discussion on the draft with a view to its finalisation; - Discussion on the way to proceed for the launching of the questionnaire at national level with a view to a decision. 	
	Essential document	
	DH-BIO(2016)24	<i>Questionnaire Project. Public Debates and Consultations in Bioethics</i>
	Useful documents	
	DH-BIO/RAP 9	<i>Report of the 9th meeting of the DH-BIO (para 21 to 27)</i>
	DH-BIO(2016)9 REV	<i>Proposals by the Strategic Group</i>
	Report from the Rapporteurs of the Conference on emerging technologies and human rights rapporteurs to the DH-BIO	
	Proceedings of the Conference	
	Study of the Rathenau Instituut	
	Report of the Center for the study of sciences and humanities, Bergen University	

	9. International Conference marking the 20th anniversary of the Oviedo Convention <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Presentation of the draft programme - Discussion on the draft programme with a view to its finalisation 	
	Essential document	
	DH-BIO(2016)23	<i>Concept note on the programme of conference to be organised on the occasion of the 20th Anniversary of the Oviedo Convention</i>
	Useful document	
	DH-BIO/INF(2016)12	<i>Questionnaire on the impact of the Oviedo Convention and related legal instruments, their relevance and challenges</i>

WEDNESDAY 7 DECEMBER AFTERNOON (14.30 – 18.00)

14.30 	4. Additional Protocol on the protection of the human rights and dignity of persons with mental disorders with regard to involuntary placement and involuntary treatment	
--	---	--

	Essential document	
		<i>Decision of the Committee of Ministers in reply to PACE Recommendation 2091 (2016)</i>
	Useful document	
	<i>Recommendation 2091 (2016)</i>	<i>The case against a Council of Europe legal instrument on involuntary measures in psychiatry</i>

14. Cooperation with other committees		
c) <i>Consultative Committee of the Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data (T-PD)</i> - <i>Exchange of information on activities of common relevance</i>		
Useful documents		
<i>DH-BIO (2016) 15 REV</i>	<i>Comments from the DH-BIO on the Draft Recommendation (doc. T-PD(2016)04rev)</i>	
<i>T-PD(2016)04rev</i>	<i>Draft Recommendation on the Protection of Health Data</i>	
<i>DH-BIO(2016)27</i>	<i>Cooperation of the DH-BIO with other Committees / Administrative entities of the Council of Europe</i>	
<i>DH-BIO(2016)25</i>	<i>Developments in the field of bioethics in other Council of Europe bodies</i>	

10. Working methods and future activities of the DH-BIO	
b) Preparation of biennium 2018-2019 - Examination of the draft proposals with a view to their finalisation	
Essential document	
<i>DH-BIO(2016)21</i>	Draft proposals for biennium 2018-2019
Useful document	
<i>DH-BIO/INF(2016)9</i>	<i>Terms of reference of the DH-BIO for 2016-2017</i>

THURSDAY 8 DECEMBER MORNING (9.00-13.00)

11. Elections to the Bureau		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Election of the Chair, and Vice Chair for a one year term renewable once; - Subject to the outcome of the Chair and Vice Chair election, election of four Bu25 - Bureau members (three Bureau members are re-eligible). 		
Submission for nominations should be sent in writing to the Secretariat by 14.00 on Wednesday 7 December 2016.		

	Useful document	
	DH-BIO(2016)22	<i>Bureau election</i>
	13. Dates of the next meetings	
	<p>Dates proposed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 11th meeting of the DH-BIO: 6 - 8 June 2017 (alternative 29 – 31 May 2017) - 12th meeting of the DH-BIO: 21 (20) – 24 (23) November 2017 (to be confirmed) 	
	15. Other business	
	<p>a. Questionnaire on medically assisted procreation, including surrogacy</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Updated and complementary replies on surrogacy, sent by delegations. <p>b. Gender equality</p>	
	Essential documents	
	DH-BIO/INF(2016)4	<i>Updated Questionnaire on Medically Assisted Procreation (MAP). Replies of delegations</i>
	DH-BIO/INF (2016) 4 Addendum	<i>Replies to the questionnaire on surrogacy</i>
	16. Decisions taken by the DH-BIO at its 10th meeting	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Approval of the list of decisions 	
	DOCUMENTS FOR POSSIBLE UPDATE BY DELEGATIONS	
	Delegations are invited to provide where appropriate updated information of the following documents	
	DH-BIO/INF(2015)6	<i>Background document on preimplantation and prenatal genetic testing -legislation</i>
	DH-BIO(2016)20	<i>Legislative developments on nuclear transfer and their relationship with Article 18.2 of the Convention</i>
	USEFUL DOCUMENTS FOR SEVERAL ITEMS	
	DH-BIO/RAP 9	<i>Report of the 9th meeting of the DH-BIO</i>
	DH-BIO/BU RAP(2016)2	<i>Meeting Report of the Bureau (Paris, 19-21 October 2016)</i>
	GENERAL INFORMATION DOCUMENTS	
	CM/RES(2011)24	<i>Resolution on intergovernmental committees and subordinate bodies, their terms of reference and working methods</i>
	DH-BIO/INF(2016)8	<i>Information document on the DH-BIO</i>
	DH-BIO/INF(2016)16	<i>Texts of the Council of Europe on bioethical matters, Volume I</i>
	DH-BIO/INF(2016)16	<i>Texts of the Council of Europe on bioethical</i>

		<i>matters, Volume II</i>
	<i>Please click on the respective link to open the Convention and its Protocols</i>	<i>Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine (ETS 164)</i>
		<i>Explanatory Report to the Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine</i>
		<i>Additional Protocol to the Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine on the Prohibition of Cloning Human Beings (ETS 168)</i>
		<i>Additional Protocol to the Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine concerning Transplantation of Organs and Tissues of Human Origin (ETS 186)</i>
		<i>Additional Protocol to the Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine concerning Biomedical Research (CETS 195)</i>
		<i>Additional Protocol concerning Genetic Testing for Health Purposes (CETS 203)</i>

APPENDIX II List of participants

List of participants / Liste des participants

MEMBER STATES / ETATS MEMBRES

Albania/Albanie - **apologised/excusé**

Andorra/Andorre – Mme Imma RODRIGUEZ, Carrer Pau Casals 2, 3r 1a. AD 500-ANDORRA LA VELLA **apologised/excusée**

Armenia/Arménie – Mr Igor MADOYAN, Phd, President of National Center of Bioethics, n.24, ave Sayat-Nova, apt. 14, entrance 1, 0001 YEREVAN

Austria/Autriche – Mag. Martina ERLEBACH, juge, référendaire de la section civile, droit national de la famille, département I 1, 1070 Vienne, Museumstraße 7

Dr Renate FALLY-KAUSEK, Medical Officer, Federal Ministry of Health, Department III/8– Health of children and young people, gender aspects, nutrition, Radetzkystrasse 2, A-1030 WIEN

Ms. Patrizia D'ACERNO, Austrian Bioethics Commission, Ballhausplatz 2, 1010 Wien **apologised/excusée**

Azerbaijan/Azerbaïdjan – Dr Alamadar MAMMADOV CHARKAZ (PhD), Head of lab Structure and Expression of Genome of FPBP of Institute Botany of ANAS, 3. AZ1073, Baku, 40 Badamdar highway, Institute of Botany **apologised/excusé**

Belgium/Belgique – Mme Régine WILMOTTE, Juriste au sein de la direction générale des Etablissements de Soins du Service public fédéral « Santé publique », Place Victor Horta 40, boîte 10, 1060 Bruxelles

Bosnia and Herzegovina/Bosnie-Herzégovine – Dr. Serifa GODINJAK, Head of Department for European Integration and International Cooperation, Sector for Health, Ministry of Civil Affairs, Trg BiH 1, 71000 Sarajevo

Bulgaria/Bulgarie – Ms Sylvia TOMOVA, Ministry of Health, Legal Directorate, Chief Legal Advisor, Place St Nedelia 5, Sofia 1000

Croatia/Croatie – Dr. Vanja NIKOLAC, Head of Service, Service for blood, tissues and cells inspection, Ministry of Health, Ksaver 200a, 10 000 Zagreb

Cyprus/Chypre – Prof. Constantinos N. PHELLAS, Chair of the Cyprus National Bioethics Committee, University of Nicosia, 46, Makedonitissas Ave. P.O. Box 24005, 1700 Nicosia

Czech Republic/République Tchèque – Prof. Pavel MARTASEK, Professor of Medicine, Expert on Genetics, Dept. of Pediatrics, Center for Applied Genomics, 1st School of Medicine, Charles University, Ke Karlovu 2, Building D /2nd floor, 128 08 PRAGUE 2

Denmark/Danemark – Rikke Skadehauge SEERUP, Ministry of Health, Fuldmægtig, Sygehuspolitik **apologised/excusée**

Ms Kirstine F. HINDSBERGER, Ministry of Health, 6, Holbergsgade, DK-1057 Copenhagen K **apologised/excusée**

Estonia/Estonie – Prof Hele EVERAUS, Head of the Clinic, Haematology and Oncology Clinic, Tartu University, Tartu University Hospital, Puusepa 8, 51014 Tartu

Finland/Finlande – Mia SPOLANDER, Legal Officer, Ministry for Foreign Affairs, Unit for Human Rights Courts and Conventions (OIK-40), P.O. Box 411, (Laivastokatu 22), 00023 Valtioneuvosto

Ritva HALILA, M.D., Ph.D., docent, Senior Medical Officer, General Secretary, National Advisory Board on Social Welfare and Health Care Ethics (ETENE), Ministry of Social Affairs and Health, P.O. Box 33 (Meritullinkatu 10), FI-00023 Government

Katja KUUPPELOMÄKI, Legal Officer, Unit for Human Rights Courts and Conventions Legal Service, Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland, P.O.Box 411, FI-00023 Government **apologised/excusée**

France – Marie-Aude RECHER, Bureau du droit des personnes et de la famille (C1), Direction des affaires civiles et du Sceau, Ministère de la Justice, Paris

Mme Isabelle ERNY, Attachée principale d'administration centrale, Ministère de la Santé, Direction Générale de la Santé, Secrétariat Général, Division droit, éthique et appui juridique, 14 avenue Duquesne, 75350 Paris 07 SP

Dr Jacques MONTAGUT, Directeur de l'IFREARES, 20 route de Revel, 31400 Toulouse **apologised/excuse**

Marie-Noémie PRIVET, Ministère des affaires étrangères et du développement international, Direction des affaires juridiques, Sous-direction des droits de l'Homme, 57, bd des Invalides, 75007 Paris

Georgia/Géorgie – Dr Givi JAVASHVILI, Head of Family Medicine Department, State Medical Academy of Georgia, Chairman of the National Council on Bioethics, 29 I. Chachavadze Avenue, 0179 Tbilisi

Germany/Allemagne – Mr Volker SCHÖFISCH, Federal Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection, Division III B 6, Mohrenstraße 37, D-10117 Berlin

Prof. Dr. Elmar DOPPELFELD (Honorary chair of the "Permanent Working Party of Research Ethics Committees in Germany Inc."), Lenaustraße 15, D-50858 Köln

Prof. Dr. Dr. Thomas HEINEMANN, Philosophical-Theological University of Vallendar (PTHV), Pallottistraße 3, D-56179 Vallendar

Dr. Ingo HÄRTEL, Federal Ministry of Health, Division 317, Friedrichstraße 108, D-10117 Berlin

Dr. Stefan OSSEGE, Federal Ministry of Education and Research, Division 612, Friedrichstraße 130 B, D-10117 Berlin

Greece/Grèce – Dr Stamatia GARANIS-PAPADATOS, Lecturer, National School of Public Health, 196 Alexandras Avenue, 11521 Athens

Hungary/Hongrie - Prof. Ernő BÁCSY, MD, PhD, DSc, advisor of the Presidency, Medical Research Council of Hungary (ETT), H-1051 Budapest, Arany János utca 6-8, Hungary

Iceland/Islande – Ms. Thorunn STEINSDOTTIR, Legal Advisor, Ministry of Welfare, Hafnarhúsinu við Tryggvagötu, 101 Reykjavik **apologised/excusée**

Ireland/Irlande – Mr Paul IVORY, Bioethics Officer, CMO's Office, Department of Health, Hawkins Street, Dublin 2

Italy/Italie - Laura PALAZZANI, Lumsa, Facoltà di giurisprudenza, via Pompeo Magno 22, 00192 Roma

Prof. Assunta MORRESI, Prof. Associato di Chimica Fisica, Dipartimento di Chimica, Biologia e Biotecnologie, Università degli Studi di Perugia, V. Elce di Sotto, 8, 06123 PERUGIA **apologised/excusée**

Latvia/Lettonie – Dr.Vents SĪLIS, Assistant Professor at Riga Stradins University, Department of Humanities, Dzirciema street 16, Riga, LV- 1007

Liechtenstein

apologised/excusé

Lithuania/Lituanie – Dr Eugenijus GEFENAS, Chairman of Lithuanian Bioethics Committee, Associate Professor at Vilnius University, Lithuanian Bioethics Committee, Vilnius str.33, LT-2001 VILNIUS

Luxembourg – Mr Jean-Claude MILMEISTER, Chargé d'études, Diplômé en biologie et en bioéthique, Commission Consultative Nationale d'Éthique pour les Sciences de la Vie et de la Santé (C.N.E.), 18-20, montée de la Pétrusse, L-2327 Luxembourg

Mr Mike SCHWEBAG, Médiateur Santé, Service national d'information et de médiation santé, 73, rue Adolphe Fischer (4e étage), L-1520 Luxembourg

apologised/excusé

Malta/Malte - Prof. Pierre MALLIA MD PhD, CBiol MPhil MA(Law) DipICGP MMCDF MRCP FRCGP, Professor of Family Medicine, Bioethics & Patients' Rights, Chairperson, National Health Ethics Committee, Dept. of Health, Chairperson, Bioethics Consultative Committee, Ministry of Health, Coordinator, Bioethics Research Programme, Univ. of Malta, President, Malta College of Family Doctors

Republic of Moldova/République de Moldova – Mr. Andrei ȘVEȚ, Head of the Legal Department, Ministry of Health

Rodica GRAMMA, MD, PhD, associate professor, School of Public Health Management, Director of Department of International Relations and European Integration of the State University of Medicine and Pharmacy "Nicolae Testemitanu", Chisinau

apologised/excusée

Monaco -

apologised/excusé

Montenegro/Monténégro – Ms Olivera MILJANOVIC, Prim. doc., Director of the Centre for Medical Genetics and Immunology, Medical Centre of Montenegro, Krusevac bb, 81000 Podgorica

Netherlands/Pays-Bas – Ms. Joyce BROUWERS-VERSTAPPEN, (Senior) Beleidsmedewerker, Afdeling Ethiek, directie Publieke Gezondheid, Ministry of Health, Welfare and Sport, Parnassusplein 5, The Hague

apologised/excusée

Norway/Norvège – Mrs Anne FORUS, Senior Adviser, ph.d, Biotechnology and health legislation department, Division of specialised health care services, Norwegian Directorate of Health, P.O.Box 7000, St Olavs plass, N-0130 Oslo

Camilla Closs WALMANN, Senior Adviser, Department for Biotechnology and Health Law, Norwegian Directorate of Health, P.O.Box 7000 St Olavs plass, N-0130 Oslo

Tjaarke HOPEN, (5 and 6 December 2016) Norwegian Ministry of Health, Department of Health Legislation, P.O. box 8011 Dep, N- 0030 Oslo

Poland/Pologne – Ms Mariola GROCHULSKA, Département des droits de l'homme, Ministère de la Justice, Al. Ujazdowskie 11, 00-950 WARSAW

Portugal - Prof. Miguel OLIVEIRA DA SILVA, Medical Ethics Full Teacher at Lisbon Faculty of Medicine Av. Prof. Egas Moniz 1640-028, Lisboa

Romania/Roumanie – Mr. Gheorghe BORCEAN, President de L'Ordre des Medecins et Prof. Ass.a L'Universite de Medecine et Pharmacie " Victor Babes" de Timisoara, Vice-President of the Romanian College of Physicians, Spitalul Municipal Caransebes, str. Gradinilor nr. 36^a, CARANSEBES, jud. CARAS-SEVERIN 325400

Mrs Beatrice Gabriela IOAN, Associate Professor, President of the Bioethics Commission of the Romanian College of Physicians, Institutul de Medicina Legala, str. Bunavestire nr. 4, IASI

Russia/Russie – Mr Boris YUDIN, Director, Institute of Human Studies, Russian Academy of Sciences, Volkhonka 14, MOSCOW 119992

San Marino/Saint-Marin - Dr. Luisa BORGIA, Vice-President of the National Ethics Committee, Contrada Le Grazie, n.3, 62029 Tolentino (MC)

Serbia/Serbie - Prof. Dr Zvonko MAGIC, Head of the Institute for Medical Research in the MMA (Military Medical Academy), professor of the human genetics at the Medical Faculty and Cochairmen of the National Committee for bioethics of UNESCO Commission of Serbia, Serbian Academy of Sciences and Arts, 11000 Belgrade

Slovakia/Slovaquie – Assoc. Prof. Jozef GLASA, MD, PhD, PhD; Institute of Pharmacology and Clinical Pharmacology, Slovak Medical University; National Reference Centre for Management of Chronic Hepatitis; Institute of Medical Ethics and Bioethics n.f.*; Ethics Committee, Ministry of Health SR; Limbová 12, 83303 Bratislava

Slovenia/Slovénie – Urh GROSELJ, MD,MA, University Children's Hospital, University Medical Center Ljubljana, Bohoriceva 20, 1000 Ljubljana

Spain/Espagne – M^a Concepción MARTIN ARRIBAS, Subdirección General de Investigación en Terapia Celular y Medicina Regenerativa – Instituto de Salud Carlos III – ISCIII, Avda. Monforte de Lemos 5, 28029 Madrid

Carlos ALONSO BEDATE, Centro de Biología Molecular, Member of the National Committee for Bioethics, C/ Alberto Aguilera, 21. 28015 Madrid

Prof. Carlos M. ROMEO – CASABONA, Professor of Penal Law, Head, Inter-University Chair in Law and the Human Genome, Avda. de las Universidades 24; 48007 Bilbao

Sweden/Suède – Mrs Tesi ASCHAN, Legal Adviser, The National Board of Health and Welfare, Socialstyrelsen, 106 30 Stockholm

Switzerland/Suisse – Dr Martin GÖTZ, Office fédérale de la santé publique, Division Biomédecine, collaborateur scientifique, Seilerstrasse 8, 3003 Bern

Mme Nadine KELLER, Collaboratrice scientifique, Département fédéral de l'intérieur – DFI, Office fédéral de la santé publique – OFSP, Section Sécurité biologique et génétique humaine, Seilerstrasse 8, 3003 Berne
apologised/excusée

"The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia"/"l'ex-République yougoslave de Macédoine" –
apologised/excuse

Turkey/Turquie – Prof. Ergun ÖZSUNAY, Professor of Civil, Comparative Law and EU Private law, Istanbul Culture University, Faculty of Law, İstiklal cad. 245, Tunca Apt. Daire 7, 34430 Istanbul
apologised/excuse

Ukraine - Prof Zoreslava SHKIRYAK-NYZHNYK, Vice-president of Bioethics Committee of National Academy of Medical Sciences, Chief of the Department of Family Health Problems, Academy of Postgraduate Education, Institute of Paediatrics, Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Mayborody str., 8, 04050 Kyiv

United Kingdom/Royaume-Uni - Dr Mark BALE, Deputy Director, Health Science & Bioethics Division, Department of Health, Richmond House, Whitehall, London SW1A 2NS

Peter MILLS, Assistant Director, Nuffield Council on Bioethics, 28 Bedford Square, London WC1B 3JS

INVITED EXPERTS / EXPERTS INVITES

Ms. Adeline NERON, Doctorante EHESS/IFRIS, Centre Alexandre-Koyré, Paris, France

Mr Jameson GARLAND, Uppsala University, Department of Law, Sweden

PARTICIPANTS

CDCJ – Mr Rodrigo RODRIGUEZ, Prof. dr en droit, avocat, Département fédéral de justice et police DFJP, Office fédéral de la Justice OFJ, Domaine de direction Droit privé, Bundesrain 20, 3003 Bern

CDDH – Mr Alfonso de SALAS, Secretary of the CDDH **apologised/excusé**

Mme Brigitte KONZ, Juge de Paix directrice, Cité judiciaire, Plateau du St Esprit, Bâtiment JP - L-1475 Luxembourg **apologised/excusée**

CD-P-TS – Dr. Guy RAUTMANN, Secretary of the European Committee on Blood Transfusion (CD-P-TS), European Directorate for the Quality of Medicines and HealthCare, Department of Biological Standardisation and OMCL Network

Ms Marie Laure HECQUET Scientific Programme Officer, Blood Transfusion

CD-P-TO – Ms Marta LOPEZ FRAGA, Secretary of the CD-P-TO

T-PD – Ms. Sophie KWASNY, Administrator

CAHDPH - Ms. Ita MIRIANASHVILI, Head of Section, Rights of persons with disabilities **apologised/excusée**

PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY/ASSEMBLÉE PARLEMENTAIRE – Ms/Mme Guguli MAGRADZE, Member of the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development/Membre de la Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et du développement durable, Member of the Parliament of Georgia

Ms Aysegul ELVERIS, Administrator

OFFICE OF THE COMMISSIONER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS / BUREAU DU COMMISSAIRE AUX DROITS DE L'HOMME - Mr Hasan BERMEK, Adviser, Council of Europe, F-67075 Strasbourg Cedex

CONFERENCE OF INGOS/ CONFÉRENCE DES OING - Mr Michel AGUILAR, Chair of the Human Rights Committee of the Conference of INGOs / Président de la Commission Droits de l'homme de la Conférence des OING

Mr Thierry MATHIEU, Vice-Chair of the Democracy, Social Cohesion and Global Challenges Committee of the Conference of INGOs, Member of the International Association for Research in Hospital Hygiene / Vice-Président de la Commission démocratie, cohésion sociale et enjeux mondiaux de la Conférence des OING et membre de l'Association Internationale pour la Recherche en Hygiène Hospitalière (AIRHH)

OTHER PARTICIPANTS / AUTRES PARTICIPANTS

EUROPEAN COMMISSION/COMMISSION EUROPEENNE – Dr Jim DRATWA, Head of Ethics and Head of the EGE Secretariat, Member of the Bureau of European Policy Advisers (BEPA), European Commission, Rue de la Loi 200 Wetsstraat, BERL 8/358, B-1049 Brussels **apologised/excusé**

Canada – Dr. Peter MONETTE, Manager of Bioethics, Department of Health Canada, Science Policy Directorate, Strategic Policy Branch, Health Canada, Brooke Claxton Building, 70 promenade Colombine Driveway, Tunney's Pasture, Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0K9 , Postal Locator: 0909C

apologised/excused

Holy See/Saint-Siège – Mgr. Jacques SUAUDEAU, Cure Saint Bruno, 5 Place Saint Bruno, 38500 Voiron, France

Japan/Japon – Mr Takaaki SHINTAKU, Consul, Attorney Consulat Général du Japon à Strasbourg, 20, place des Halles, 67 000 STRASBOURG

apologised/excused

Mexico/Mexique – Dr. Manuel H RUIZ DE CHÁVEZ, President of the Council of the National Commission of Bioethics. Calz. Arenal No. 134, Col. Arenal-Tepepan, Deleg. Tlalpan, Mexico D. F., Mexico

USA/Etats-Unis d'Amérique –

apologised/excused

UNESCO – Mrs. Dafna FEINHOLZ KLIP, Section de la bioéthique, Division de l'éthique des sciences et des technologies, UNESCO, 1 rue Miollis, 75732 Paris Cedex 15

apologised/excused

April Philippa TASH, Programme Specialist, Bioethics and Ethics of Science and Technology Section, Social and Human Sciences Sector, United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), 7 place de Fontenoy (office 3.118), F-75352 Paris 07 France SP

OECD/OCDE – Mr David WINICKOFF, STI/STP

Mr Ken GUY, Head of the Science and Technology Policy Division, Directorate for Science, Technology and Innovation

apologised/excused

World Health Organisation/Organisation Mondiale de la Santé (WHO/OMS) – Dr Abha SAXENA (MD), Coordinator, Global Health Ethics, Secretary, Research Ethics Review Committee (ERC), HIS/KER, Cluster of Health Systems and Innovation, World Health Organization, 20, Avenue Appia, CH- 1211, Geneva 27, Switzerland

Dr Andreas REIS, Technical Officer, HIS/KER, Cluster of Health Systems and Innovation, World Health Organization, 20, Avenue Appia, CH- 1211, Geneva 27, Switzerland

apologised/excused

OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS

Australia - Samantha ROBERTSON, Executive Director, Research Translation, National Health and Medical Research Council (NHMRC), Postal Address: National Health and Medical Research Council, GPO Box 1421, Canberra ACT 2601

apologised/excused

European Science Foundation/Fondation Européenne de la Science (ESF) –apologised/excused

KEK – Conference of European Churches/Conférence des Eglises Européennes – Julija Vidovic, Conférence des Eglises européennes, 8, rue du Fossé des Treize, 67000 Strasbourg

SECRETARIAT

**BIOETHICS UNIT
UNITE DE LA BIOETHIQUE**

Ms Laurence LWOFF, Secretary of the DH-BIO / Secrétaire du DH-BIO, Tel: +33 (0) 388 41 22 68, Email: laurence.lwoff@coe.int

Mr Ramon PRIETO SUAREZ, Administrator / Administrateur, Tel: +33 (0) 388 41 29 93, Email: ramon.prieto-suarez@coe.int

Ms Katrin UERPMANN, Administrator / Administratrice, Tel: +33 (0) 390 21 43 25, Email: katrin.uerpmann@coe.int

Ms Anna MIKHEDENKO, Project Officer / Chargée de projet, Tel: +33 (0) 390 21 60 49, Email: anna.mikhedenko@coe.int

Ms Tatiana WINTER, Assistant / Assistante, Tel: +33 (0) 388 41 33 67, Email: tatiana.winter@coe.int

Ms Catherine FORNÉ, Assistant / Assistante, Tel: +33 (0) 388 41 22 20, Email: catherine.forne@coe.int

Ms. Eloise GENNET, Trainee / Stagiaire

CHILDREN'S RIGHTS POLICIES COORDINATION

Ms Regina JENSDOTTIR, Head of children's rights policies coordination Division

**SOGI
(SEXUAL ORIENTATION AND GENDER IDENTITY)**

Ms. Tikli OIKARINEN, Administrator

INTERPRETERS / INTERPRETES

Sarah ADLINGTON
Amanda BEDDOWS
Bettina LUDEWIG
Christine TRAPP